

Social Mobility and Education in Britain

Building upon extensive research into modern British society, this book traces out trends in social mobility and their relation to educational inequalities, with surprising results. Contrary to what is widely supposed, Bukodi and Goldthorpe's findings show there has been no overall decline in social mobility – though downward mobility is tending to rise and upward mobility to fall – and Britain is not a distinctively low mobility society. However, the inequalities of mobility chances among individuals, in relation to their social origins, have not been reduced and remain in some respects extreme. Exposing the widespread misconceptions that prevail in political and policy circles, this book shows that educational policy alone cannot break the link between inequality of condition and inequality of opportunity. It will appeal to students, researchers, policy makers, and anyone interested in the issues surrounding social inequality, social mobility and education.

ERZSÉBET BUKODI is an Associate Professor in Quantitative Social Policy and Professorial Fellow of Nuffield College, Oxford. She is also a Senior Research Fellow at the Institute for New Economic Thinking, The Oxford Martin School.

JOHN H. GOLDTHORPE is an Emeritus Fellow of Nuffield College Oxford, a Fellow of the British Academy, a Member of the Royal Swedish Academy of Sciences, and an Honorary Fellow of the Royal Statistical Society. He has written extensively on social class and social mobility since the 1960s.





Social Mobility and Education in Britain

Research, Politics and Policy

ERZSÉBET BUKODI
University of Oxford

JOHN H. GOLDTHORPE
University of Oxford





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108474962

DOI: 10.1017/9781108567404

© Erzsébet Bukodi and John H. Goldthorpe 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

Printed and bound in Great Britain by Clays Ltd, Elcograf S.p.A.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-47496-2 Hardback ISBN 978-1-108-46821-3 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

List	t of Figures	page vi
List	t of Tables	ix
Ack	enowledgements	xi
	Introduction	1
1	Social Class as the Context of Social Mobility	13
2	Class Mobility in Absolute Terms: The End of the Golden Age	34
3	Class Mobility in Relative Terms: Resistance to Change	52
4	The Pattern of Social Fluidity within the Class Structure: Hierarchy, Inheritance and Status Effects	71
5	Education and Social Mobility: The OED Triangle	90
6	Social Origins, Ability and Educational Attainment: Is there a Wastage of Talent?	108
7	Education and the Labour Market: Is Education Now Class Destiny?	128
8	Origins versus Education: Are there 'Glass Floors' and 'Glass Ceilings'?	152
9	Lifelong Learning: Compensation or Cumulative Advantag	e? 169
10	Social Mobility in Britain in Comparative Perspective: Is Britain a Low Mobility Society?	188
	Conclusions	207
Ref	erences	225
Ind	ex	240

V



Figures

1.1	Derivation of NS-SEC, /-class version	page 21
1.2	Relative risk of being unemployed by class position of	
	last employment, Class 1 as reference, with 95%	2.5
	confidence intervals	25
1.3	Variable components of average gross weekly	
	earnings, men in full-time employment	27
1.4	Median gross weekly earnings by social class and age,	
	full-time male employees	28
1.5	Median gross weekly earnings by social class and age,	
	full-time female employees	29
1.6	Household median net financial wealth by social class	
	and age of head of household	30
1.7	Age-standardised mortality rates per 100,000	
	population aged 25 to 64 by social class, England and	
	Wales, 2008–10	32
2.1	Class distributions (%) of economically active	-
	population, 1951–2011	36
22	Total mobility rates and upward and downward	
,	components, men born 1908–1947, interviewed	
	in 1972	38
2 3	Total mobility rate and upward and downward	30
2.3	components, men born in 1946, 1958 and 1970 at	
	± /	40
2.4	ages 27 and 38, and born 1980–4 at age 27	40
2.4	Total mobility rate and upward and downward	
	components, women born in 1946, 1958 and 1970 at	4.2
	ages 27 and 38, and born 1980–4 at age 27	42
3.1	UNIDIFF parameters for 1946, 1958 and 1970 cohorts,	
	men at age 38, with 95% confidence intervals	59
3.2	UNIDIFF parameters for 1946, 1958 and 1970	
	cohorts, women at age 38, with 95%	
	confidence intervals	60

vi



List	of Figures	vi
4.1	Hierarchy, inheritance and status affinity effects, men	
	and women 'full-timers'	79
4.2	Symmetrical odds ratios under the topological model	
	for men and women 'full-timers'	81
5.1	The OED triangle: requirements for education to create	
	greater social fluidity	91
5.2	The OED triangle: typical results from	
	sociological research	93
5.3	Association between class of origin and level of	
	qualification by cohort: UNIDIFF parameters with	
	95% confidence intervals	99
5.4	Association between level of qualification and class of	
	destination by cohort: UNIDIFF parameters with 95%	
	confidence intervals	100
6.1	Estimated probabilities (%) of attaining upper	
	secondary or higher level of qualification by parental	
	group, cognitive ability quintile and cohort	117
6.2	Estimated probabilities (%) of attaining degree-level	
	qualification by parental group, cognitive ability	120
7 1	quintile and cohort	120
/.1	Illustrative cases of costs of matching	132
7 2	class sequences Distribution (%) of class trajectory types across	132
1.2	cohorts, men	140
7 3	Distribution (%) of class trajectory types across	170
7.5	cohorts, women	141
ጸ 1	Estimated probabilities of men working full-time being	171
0.1	found in different class positions at age 38 by parental	
	class (left panel) and parental groups defined by class,	
	status and education (right panel), by level of	
	qualification at labour market entry (%)	158
9.1	Estimated probability of attaining further	
	qualifications by class of origin and age, men	174
9.2	Estimated probability of attaining further	
	qualifications by class of origin and age, women	175
9.3	Estimated probability of men moving up to Class 1 in	
	the course of their working lives by class of origin and	
	age, for men obtaining or not obtaining new academic	
	qualifications in past three years	181



viii List of Figures

9.4	Estimated probability of women moving up to Classes	
	1 and 2 in the course of their working lives by class of	
	origin and age, for women obtaining or not obtaining	
	new academic qualifications in past three years	182
10.1	Total mobility rate (%), with 95% confidence	
	interval, by country, men aged 25-64	194
10.2	Total mobility rate (%), with 95% confidence	
	interval, by country, women aged 25-64, in full-time	
	employment	195
10.3	Ratio of upward mobility to downward mobility by	
	country, men aged 25-64	197
10.4	Ratio of upward mobility to downward mobility	
	by country, women aged 25–64, in	
	full-time employment	198
10.5	Country differences in relative rates of social	
	mobility, men aged 25-64	201
10.6	Country differences in relative rates of social mobility,	
	women aged 25–64, in full-time employment	202



1.1 NS-SEC 7-class version and representative

Tables

	occupations	page 22
3.1	The odds ratio for Omega	53
3.2	Class mobility in Omega; results from three	
	successive surveys	54
4.1	Hierarchy effects for the 7 x 7 mobility table	73
4.2	Inheritance effects for the 7 x 7 mobility table	75
4.3	Status affinity effects for the 7 x 7 mobility table	76
5.1	Distribution (%) of male cohort members by	
	highest level of educational qualification	
	(absolute measure)	96
5.2	Collapses of eight categories of educational	
	qualifications to produce relative levels	97
6.1	Effects of cognitive ability and of parental class, status	
	and education on the probability of attaining two	
	educational thresholds	112
6.2	Composition of parental groups and distribution	
	across cohorts	116
7.1	Typology of class trajectories, men	136
7.2	Typology of class trajectories, women	138
7.3	Effects of relative level of qualification at labour	
	market entry, class of origin and cognitive ability on	
	probability of following different types of class	
	trajectory, men	144
7.4	Effects of relative level of qualification at labour	
	market entry, class of origin and cognitive ability on	
	probability of following different types of class	
	trajectory, women	145
8.1	Effects of social origins and of change in relative level	
	of qualification on class position at age 38, by relative	
	level of qualification at labour market entry	155

ix



x List of Tables

8.2	Effects of cognitive ability, locus of control, parental	
	help, change in relative level of qualification and social	
	origins on class position at age 38, by relative level of	
	qualification at labour market entry	162
9.1	Effect of class of origin on the probability of obtaining	
	further qualifications	172
9.2	Effect of further qualifications on the probability of	
	upward and downward worklife mobility, men	178
9.3	Effect of further qualifications on the probability of	
	upward and downward worklife mobility, women	179



Acknowledgements

The research on which our book is primarily based derives from the following projects, for each of which Erzsébet Bukodi was principal investigator: 'The Role of Education in Intergenerational Social Mobility', supported by the Economic and Social Research Council, grant ES/1038187/1; 'Social Origins, Cognitive Ability and Educational Attainment: A Life-Course Perspective', supported by the Nuffield Foundation, grant EDU/42195; and 'Social Inequalities in Education in Historical and Comparative Perspective: The Changing Effects of Different Components of Social Origins', supported by the Oxford University Press John Fell Research Fund, grant 122/673. We are duly grateful to the funding bodies that made our research possible. The projects were based in the Department of Social Policy and Intervention, University of Oxford, and we wish to acknowledge the support of the Department and, especially, the help of the Finance and Research Administration in ensuring that the projects ran smoothly.

In addition, the research reported on in Chapter 10 resulted from Erzsébet Bukodi's participation in the Employment, Equity and Growth Programme at the Oxford Martin School Institute for New Economic Thinking, supported by the Resolution Foundation and directed by Professor Brian Nolan, whom we wish to thank for his valuable co-operation.

We are both fortunate to be Fellows of Nuffield College, Oxford, and we have benefited greatly from the research allowances made to us by the College, from the excellent services of its library and IT staff, and from the enriching intellectual and social environment that the College provides.

Finally, we would wish to acknowledge, with our warmest thanks, the contributions of the following colleagues who at various times were members of the research teams working on the several projects: Bastian Betthäuser, Mollie Bourne, Ferdinand Eibl, Heather Joshi, Magda Karyda, Jouni Kuha, Marii Paskov, Nhat An Trinh and Lorraine

xi



xii

Acknowledgements

Waller. Other colleagues who significantly contributed to the research and in co-authoring papers were Robert Erikson, Alexi Gugushvili and Brendan Halpin. And we also received helpful information, advice and commentary from – among others whom we may have regretfully forgotten – Richard Breen, Tak-Wing Chan, David Cox, Geoff Evans, Duncan Gallie, Colin Mills, Madeline Nightingale and Brian Nolan.