

## SOVEREIGNTY IN CHINA

This book provides a comprehensive history of the emergence and the use of the concept of sovereignty in China from the year 1840 to the present. It contributes to broadening the history of modern China by looking at the way the notion of sovereignty was gradually articulated by key Chinese intellectuals, diplomats, and political figures in the unfolding of the history of international law in China, rehabilitates Chinese agency, and shows how China challenged Western Eurocentric assumptions about the progress of international law. It puts the history of international law in a global perspective, interrogating the widely held belief of international law as universal order and exploring the ways in which its history is closely anchored to a European experience that fails to take into account how the encounter with other non-European realities has influenced its formation.

MARIA ADELE CARRAI is a sinologist and political scientist with a strong interest in conceptual history and history of international law. She is a Marie Curie Postdoctoral Fellow at KU Leuven and a Fellow at Harvard University Asia Center. She completed a PhD in Law in 2016 at the University of Hong Kong, where she received the Award for Outstanding Postgraduate Research Student for 2015–2016, the HKPHD Fellowship, and the Swire Scholarship. She was a fellow at Columbia University (2019), Princeton-Harvard China and the World Fellow (2017–2018), New York University (2016–2017), and the European University Institute (2015–2017). Her research has appeared in various peer-reviewed journals, and she has spoken in a variety of forums.

CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN INTERNATIONAL AND  
COMPARATIVE LAW: 141

Established in 1946, this series produces high quality, reflective and innovative scholarship in the field of public international law. It publishes works on international law that are of a theoretical, historical, cross-disciplinary or doctrinal nature. The series also welcomes books providing insights from private international law, comparative law and transnational studies which inform international legal thought and practice more generally.

The series seeks to publish views from diverse legal traditions and perspectives, and of any geographical origin. In this respect it invites studies offering regional perspectives on core problematiques of international law, and in the same vein, it appreciates contrasts and debates between diverging approaches. Accordingly, books offering new or less orthodox perspectives are very much welcome. Works of a generalist character are greatly valued and the series is also open to studies on specific areas, institutions or problems. Translations of the most outstanding works published in other languages are also considered.

After seventy years, Cambridge Studies in International and Comparative Law sets the standard for international legal scholarship and will continue to define the discipline as it evolves in the years to come.

*Series Editors*

Larissa van den Herik

*Professor of Public International Law, Grotius Centre for International  
Legal Studies, Leiden University*

Jean d'Aspremont

*Professor of International Law, University of Manchester and Sciences  
Po Law School*

*A list of books in the series can be found at the end of this volume.*

# SOVEREIGNTY IN CHINA

A Genealogy of a Concept since 1840

MARIA ADELE CARRAI

*European University Institute, Florence*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
 978-1-108-47419-1 — Sovereignty in China  
 Maria Adele Carrai  
 Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

**CAMBRIDGE**  
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom  
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
 314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,  
 New Delhi – 110025, India  
 79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
 Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781108474191](http://www.cambridge.org/9781108474191)  
 DOI: 10.1017/9781108564861

© Cambridge University Press 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

Printed and bound in Great Britain by Clays Ltd, Elcograf S.p.A.

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

Names: Carrai, Maria Adele, author.

Title: Sovereignty in China : a genealogy of a concept since 1840 / Maria Adele Carrai, European University Institute, Florence.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY, USA : Cambridge University Press, 2019. | Series: Cambridge studies in international and comparative law ; 141 | Includes bibliographical references and index. | based on author's thesis (doctoral – University of Hong Kong, 2016) issued under title: A genealogy of sovereignty in modern China, 1840 – today.

Identifiers: LCCN 2019008509 | ISBN 9781108474191 (hardback)

Subjects: LCSH: China – International status. | Sovereignty. | Constitutional history – China – 19th century. | Constitutional history – China – 20th century.

Classification: LCC KZ4350 .C37 2019 | DDC 320.1/50951–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019008509>

ISBN 978-1-108-47419-1 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-47419-1 — Sovereignty in China  
Maria Adele Carrai  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

*To Oladapo*

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-47419-1 — Sovereignty in China  
Maria Adele Carrai  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

## CONTENTS

*List of Figures* page x  
*Acknowledgments* xi

Introduction 1  
 Sovereignty and China: Past, Present, and Future 1  
 The Method of Conceptual History 9  
 Outline and Contribution 14

**1. International Law and the Sinocentric Ritual System: A  
 Nineteenth-Century Clash of Normative  
 Orders 18**

Narrating China within the History of International  
 Law 18

A Clash of Imaginaries: Sovereignty and the Universalization  
 of International Law 23

The Chinese Normative Order: *Tianrenheyi* and the  
 Correlative Cosmology 33

Ritual Justice and the Tributary System within a Sacred  
 Empire 39

Conclusion 44

**2. Secularizing a Sacred Empire: Early Translations and Uses  
 of International Law 47**

Translating Emmerich de Vattel through a Secularized  
 Geography: 1830s–1860s 47

- The Second Opium War and the Translation of W. A. P. Martin's *Wanguo Gongfa* 57
- The New “Sovereign Power” of China in the International Arena, 1870–1895 66
- Li Hongzhang and the Legacies of an Empire: The Tributaries and Border Security 73
- Conclusion 81
- 3. China's Struggle for Survival and the New Darwinist Conception of International Society (1895–1911) 82**
- China Is Cut Up Like a Melon 82
- National Salvation: Sovereignty and China's Redemption 87
- Evolutionary *Tian* and the New Interpretation of International Society 94
- International Law and Faith in Progress 98
- Conclusion 107
- 4. China Rejoining the World and Its Fictional Sovereignty, 1912–1949 109**
- China's Right to Exist and the Abolition of the Unequal Treaties 109
- Orchestrating Sovereignty in the Frontiers with a Focus on Tibet 123
- China in the League of Nations and the United Nations 142
- Conclusion 150



5. **From Proletarian Revolution to Peaceful Coexistence:  
Sovereignty in the PRC, 1949–1989** 152
  - National Unification, International Law, and the Evolving  
Soviet Ideology 152
  - The Five Principles of Peaceful Coexistence 158
  - Taiwan, the United Nations, and International  
Recognition 167
  - China Opens Up and the “One Country, Two Systems”  
Solution to Sovereignty 175
  - Conclusion 181
  
6. **Historical Legacies, Globalization, and Chinese  
Sovereignty since 1989** 183
  - The Failed End of History and the Myth of Chinese Absolute  
Sovereignty 183
  - The Enduring Struggle for Territorial Unity and the New  
Maritime Frontiers 194
  - Globalization and the Redefinition of  
Sovereignty 204
  - The Rule of International Law and International  
Order 212
  - Conclusion 217
  
7. **Conclusion** 220
  - Bibliography* 227
  - Index* 264

## FIGURES

- 2.1. Xu Jiyu's representation of the hemispheres, 1847, in  
瀛環志略, 徐繼畲, 掃葉山房 (1898), courtesy of  
Harvard-Yenching Library *page 55*
- 3.1. *Shiju quantu* 時局全圖, "The Map of the Current Situation,"  
*E'shi jingwen* 俄事警聞, December 15, 1903 86
- 4.1. The right to exist for Qian Tai 115
- 4.2. The right to exist for Qiu Zuming 116

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

In the course of writing my first book and my academic peregrinations through various academic institutions, I had the good fortune to meet brilliant scholars who provided valuable comments and feedback. I will proceed chronologically from Hong Kong, where this project began in 2012.

First of all, I would like to express profound and sincere gratitude to Albert Hung-yea Chen, my PhD supervisor, for his steadfast and valuable support, trust, and guidance throughout my PhD studies. At the University of Hong Kong, I also received indispensable comments and strong support from Isaac Yue, who helped me with Qing Chinese texts; Ci Jiwei, with whom I had enriching conversations about philosophy and methods; Anthony Carty, who inspired my interest in critical histories of international law; Simon N. M. Young, for his kindness and his comments; Paul Evans, for his help and comments during the last phase of my work; and Jason Buhi and Michael West for their support as both friends and colleagues during my PhD. A heartfelt “thank you” also goes to Michael Ng and Zhao Yun for reading my work, pointing me to sources, giving me the chance to present at the Symposium on Chinese Legal Reform and the Global Legal Order, at the Centre for Chinese Law, and for their inspirational work on legal history. Special thanks also to John Lagerwey, who introduced me to the religious traditions of China and has always provided help and support; Flora Sapio, with whom I discussed the theoretical part of my research and who allowed me to present it at Oxford University in 2013; Billy So, for his insights into legal history and his article on evolutionary Tian, which helped me frame Chapter 3; Sophie Zhuo Yang, who translated my work into Chinese and with whom I have had enriching discussions on issues of translation and commensurability; Qu Wensheng (Kevin), who discussed Chinese legal philosophy and history with me; Shahla Ali, who has supported me almost unconditionally during my PhD and after; Lam Hok Chung, who pointed out Chinese legal sources and whose meticulous work on

the introduction of international law to China was of great help to me; Ni Shifeng, for reading my work and being a good friend; Puk Wing Kin, who inspired me with his classes on Chinese history at the Chinese University of Hong Kong; and Jae Lim for his continual support and encouragement. Special thanks also to Luigi Nuzzo, a dear friend and great critical reader.

I am also thankful for the support of the Government of Hong Kong, which funded my studies there with a generous Hong Kong PhD Fellowship, and the Swire Group, which enabled me to reside in the beautiful and peaceful Robert Black College for three years, and which sponsored many of my conference travels. I am also grateful to the Max Planck Institute for Comparative Public Law and International Law and its director, Anne Peters, who allowed me to spend time at the Institute in the summer of 2014, during my PhD studies, and granted me access to the library and its rich collection; Peter Macalister-Smith, the librarian, who helped me identify useful, rare material and very thoughtfully guided me through the Archives; Rudolf Wagner, who generously gave me access to essential databases and allowed me to present my very initial work at Heidelberg University's Cluster for Excellence; Stefan and Charlotte Kroll, with whom I had great discussions on conceptual history; intellectual historian Peng Guoxiang, who read part of my Chapter 2 and helped me with its Chinese publication; and Giovanni Zampetti, who read and commented on my work.

During my time as visiting scholar at New York University School of Law in 2014–15 and as Global Houser Fellow in 2016–17, I was fortunate to receive helpful feedback on my research from Benedict Kingsbury, who kindly gave comments on several occasions; Jerome Cohen, who also gave precious and wise comments and whose work on Chinese legal history remains a source of inspiration; Ira Belkin, who taught me about criminal justice in China and provided comments to Chapter 5; Robert House, who served as commentator, especially to parts of Chapter 6 and the Conclusion; Thomas Streinz, Sergio Verdugo, Stef Feyen, Christopher Roberts, Aaron Halegua, and Bartosz Marciniak, who gave me their delightful friendship and read my work over and over again, providing valuable comments; Kevin E. Davis, who helped me choose the book's title and gave support; Pasquale Pasquino, who read parts of my work and with whom I had fruitful talks about China's political system; Teemu Ruskola, who provided inspiration through his work on legal orientalism and inspiring discussions on legal history; John A. Ferejohn, Christopher Sprigman, and Gráinne de Búrca, whose support was

wonderful and kind; Mattias Kumm, who discussed constitutionalism in China with me on various occasions, and Peter Lindseth for his helpful comments on my work. I am profoundly grateful to them all. Much thanks is also due to the coordinator of the program of visiting scholars, Karin Loevy, and to the Global Hauser Program, which facilitated exchanges among scholars.

I owe sincere thanks to Nehal Bhuta and J. H. H. Weiler, for their support and enlightening conversations during my Max Weber Fellowship at the European University Institute in 2015–17. A special “thank you” to my colleagues Ida Koivisto, Anna Chadwick, Or Bassock, Bilyana Petkova, Guy Aitchison, Paul Bauer, Jonas Bergan Draege, Florian Hertel, and Allan Zysset. I am also thankful to Dirk Moses, for his comments on my work and book proposal, and Giovanni Sartor, Claudio Corradetti, and Richard Bellamy, for allowing me to present my work on China’s global constitutionalism, which was relevant for Chapter 6. I am also extremely appreciative of Jan Wouters, and the Leuven Center for Global Governance, which has given me two great years of support, and in particular supported my application for the Marie Curie Fellowship Grant ([PEGASUS]<sup>2</sup> Marie Skłodowska-Curie Fellowships No 665501), which has provided financial assistance over the past few years. A particular “thank you” also to Jean-Christophe Defraigne, with whom I discussed Chapter 6, and Axel Marx, who has also been very encouraging.

I am immensely grateful to the Princeton-Harvard China and the World Program for its bringing together China scholars in such a rare collegial and friendly environment; in particular, to Thomas Christensen and Iain Johnston, who have been so fantastically supportive, and to the Carnegie Endowment for continuing to fund the program. Special thanks also to my colleagues, in particular Andrew Chubbs, Cheng-Chwee Kuik, Isaac Kardon, Yelin Tang, Wendy Leutert, and Joseph Torigian, and to the executive director, Daniel Suchenski. At Princeton I benefited from conversations with Ethan Kapstein, Nadège Rolland, Aaron Friedberg, and Wolfgang F. Danspeckgruber, who very generously dedicated time to discussing issues related to Chinese political economy and foreign policy with me.

At Harvard I owe deep thanks to William P. Alford and the East Asian Legal Studies Program. Not only did he invite me to present my work in the International Law Workshop, where I received productive comments and questions from bright students, but he also gave his generous support throughout. Gratitude is also due to Anne Orford and Gabriella Blum,

who commented on my work at Harvard. Thank you to the Fairbank Center, its director Michael Szonyi and its fantastic crew, in particular Nick Drake and James Evans, for their support. I am also grateful for the comments of colleagues at the Fairbank Center, in particular Frederic D. Grant, Xiaoqian Hu, Chanping Liang, Fanmei Wang, and Wuping Zhao. I would also like to thank Karen Thornber and the Asia Center and the brilliant people working there, who provided an excellent space for completing my research, and librarian Nancy Hill. I offer thanks as well to Marc C. Elliot, for having read the book's first three chapters and provided suggestions on how to improve them; William Kirby for his suggestions on my more recent work and for having allowed me to join some of his classes at Harvard Business School; Mark Wu for having commented on my work on contemporary China; and Odd Arne Westad for his comments and suggestions. Profound thanks also to the network of the Institute for Global Law and Policy, and David Kennedy, for his valuable comments and suggestions, and to Luca Bonadiman, Michael Hennessy, Love Ronnelid, Andrea Leiter, and Roxana Vatanparast. I am also very grateful to Nargis Kassenova, Eugenio Menegon, Benedict Cruz, Arnulf Becker Lorca, and Golnoosh Hakimdavar, for their support.

Li Chen, Timothy Brooks, Pär Cassel, Yu Xingzhong, Martti Koskenniemi, Matthew Craven, Gerry Simpson, Milos Vec, Monica García-Salmones, Nicola di Cosmo, and Matthew Erie, either by reading my work in progress or in other ways, have supported me during the research and book-writing process, and to them I express my thanks. I am indebted too to Rune Svarverud for having provided an image I was no longer able to find, and for his inspiring work on the translation of international law in China.

At Columbia University, I would like to thank Benjamin Liebman, who hosted me at the Center for Chinese Legal Studies as a visiting scholar in 2017; Madeline Zelin, who has been very encouraging and whose serious work on Chinese legal history I profoundly admire. I am also much obliged to the Weatherhead East Asian Institute and its current director Eugenia Lean, for allowing me to present my work and do research there, to Gray Tuttle providing material about Tibet, and Andrew J. Nathan for the insightful conversations we had about China's foreign policy. A huge "thank you" also to David Freedberg and Barbara Faedda of the Italian Academy, and the wonderful colleagues I had the opportunity to work with there. I am immensely grateful for getting a chance to spend time in such a remarkable and inspiring intellectual environment.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

XV

At Cambridge University Press, I am grateful to Finola O’Sullivan, Tom Randall, and Robert Judkins for their expert work as editors, and to Joseph Dahm for his meticulous copyediting work.

Last but not least, a great thank you to Federico Masini, a constant source of inspiration for my China studies, who taught me to have a balanced approach toward China, and to my friends, family, and loved ones for their constant support.

