CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47357-6 — Brexitland
Maria Sobolewska , Robert Ford
Frontmatter
More Information

BREXITLAND

Long-term social and demographic changes – and the conflicts they create – continue to transform British politics. In this accessible and authoritative book Sobolewska and Ford show how deep the roots of this polarisation and volatility run, drawing out decades of educational expansion and rising ethnic diversity as key drivers in the emergence of new divides within the British electorate over immigration, identity and diversity. They argue that choices made by political parties from the 1960s onwards have mobilised these divisions into politics, first through conflicts over immigration, then through conflicts over the European Union, culminating in the 2016 EU Referendum. Providing a comprehensive and far-reaching view of a country in turmoil, *Brexitland* explains how and why this happened, for students, researchers and anyone who wants to better understand the remarkable political times in which we live.

Maria Sobolewska FRSA is a Professor of Political Science, and Deputy Director of the Cathie Marsh Institute for Social Research, at the University of Manchester. She writes about race and ethnicity in British politics, from elections to political representation. She is co-author of *The Political Integration of Ethnic Minorities in Britain* (2013).

Robert Ford FRSA is a Professor of Political Science at the University of Manchester. He is an expert on immigration, public opinion and party politics in Britain. His first book, *Revolt on the Right* (2013), was named Political Book of the Year in 2015. He writes regularly on British electoral politics for national and international media outlets.

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47357-6 — Brexitland
Maria Sobolewska , Robert Ford
Frontmatter
More Information

'A sharp, accessible investigation of the key fault lines of modern British politics: education, immigration, age and identity.'

Helen Lewis, author of Difficult Women

'Maria Sobolewska and Robert Ford have produced the best account I have read of our cultural civil wars. The work is not just an explanation of the way we live now, but of how we reached a state of institutionalised rage and why peace will be so hard to find.'

Nick Cohen, The Spectator *and* The Observer

'Brexitland *brilliantly unpicks the old and new forces that shaped our brittle political age. Who is exploiting the anger? And is it with us for good? A fascinating and convincing study: essential reading for anyone wanting to understand why tolerance of the other side in British politics seems to have disappeared. How did our political background turn so ugly and intolerant?* Brexitland *delves deep into decades of history and attitudes to race and ethnic identity to answer that question and does it with style. Sobolewska and Ford have written the new political bible of our times: how did we stop debating and start shouting? Can normal service resume?* Brexitland *is a razor sharp and compelling answer to those questions.'*

Gary Gibbon, Channel 4 News

'A brilliant, original, powerful book. For Remainers, Brexiters or indeed anyone interested in why divided Britain cut itself adrift from the EU, this is unmissable. It is also totally riveting.'

Toby Helm, The Observer

'Whether we like it or not, we are all living in Brexitland. In the forensic detail Sobolewska and Ford plot the long road of social change which led us here. En route they look ahead to where the UK's explosive culture wars would take us next. Essential reading for those not wearing blinkers.'

Adam Boulton, Sky News

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47357-6 — Brexitland
Maria Sobolewska , Robert Ford
Frontmatter
More Information

Brexitland

Identity, Diversity and the Reshaping of British Politics

MARIA SOBOLEWSKA
University of Manchester

ROBERT FORD
University of Manchester

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47357-6 — Brexitland
Maria Sobolewska , Robert Ford
Frontmatter
More Information

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108473576
DOI: 10.1017/9781108562485

© Maria Sobolewska and Robert Ford 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020
3rd printing 2020

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ Books Ltd. Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-47357-6 Hardback
ISBN 978-1-108-46190-0 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47357-6 — Brexitland
Maria Sobolewska , Robert Ford
Frontmatter
More Information

CONTENTS

List of figures and tables *page* x
Acknowledgements xv

1 INTRODUCTION: HOW BRITAIN BECAME BREXITLAND 1
Brexit is not Year Zero 1
Part I Demographic change and the emergence of new political divides over identity 4
Part II Identity conflicts from New Labour to the Coalition 8
Part III Brexitland 11
Inevitable limitations and omissions 15
Conclusion 16

PART I DEMOGRAPHIC CHANGE AND THE EMERGENCE OF NEW POLITICAL DIVIDES OVER IDENTITY 19

2 SOCIAL CHANGE, ETHNOCENTRISM AND THE EMERGENCE OF NEW IDENTITY DIVIDES 21
Introduction 21
Education: university expansion and the rise of the graduate class 24
Racial diversity and immigration: the rise of multiracial Britain 27
Ethnocentrism: how educational and ethnic divides translate into political conflicts 33
From demographic change to political conflict: conviction liberals, necessity liberals and identity conservatives 43
Educational expansion and the rise of conviction liberals 43

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47357-6 — Brexitland
Maria Sobolewska , Robert Ford
Frontmatter
More Information

Ethnic diversity and necessity liberal ethnic minorities 44
Decline and backlash: identity conservatives 46
Identity polarisation: generations and geography 48
From demographic change to political change: is demography destiny? 54

3 DIVIDED OVER DIVERSITY: IDENTITY CONSERVATIVES AND IDENTITY LIBERALS 57
Introduction 57
Identity conservatives: ethnocentrism as a political agenda 59
Graduate conviction liberals: social norms and the politics of anti-racism 66
Ethnic minority necessity liberals: discrimination, linked fate and strategic alliances 70
Why identity conflicts are polarising: a clash of social norms 72
Conclusion 82

4 LEGACIES OF EMPIRE: COMMONWEALTH IMMIGRATION AND THE HISTORICAL ROOTS OF IDENTITY POLITICS DIVIDES 85
Introduction 85
The origins of the first wave: the entanglement of citizenship and Empire 88
Public opposition to migration in the first wave 90
The elite–mass divide on immigration in the first wave 95
The political activation of ethnocentrism: Enoch Powell and 'Rivers of Blood' 98
After Powell: the consolidation of an identity politics divide 107
Mobilisation on the left: entrenching anti-racism norms 113
Conclusion: why did liberal immigration policies persist for so long? 115

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47357-6 — Brexitland
Maria Sobolewska , Robert Ford
Frontmatter
More Information

PART II IDENTITY CONFLICTS FROM NEW LABOUR TO THE COALITION 119

5 THE LONG DIVORCE: PARTIES AND VOTERS PARTING WAYS 121
Introduction 121
Parties leaving voters: centralisation and professionalisation 124
Voters leaving parties: de-alignment and disengagement 135
A flag to rally around: the second wave of immigration and the activation of identity politics 142
Ethnocentric activation: how immigration mobilised identity divides into politics 146
Conclusion 153

6 THE IDENTITY CONSERVATIVE INSURGENCY AND THE RISE OF UKIP 156
Introduction 156
Riding on reputation: the Conservatives and immigration under New Labour 159
Early warning signs: the BNP and UKIP under New Labour 164
Betrayal: the failure of the immigration pledge and the opening of the electoral market 169
Mobilising the backlash: UKIP during the Coalition 175
Hijacking the agenda: UKIP's impact on the Conservatives 181
Conclusion: how UKIP changed politics without winning at Westminster 186

7 CHANGE WITHOUT RECOVERY: HOW THE COALITION CATALYSED LABOUR'S DEMOGRAPHIC TRANSFORMATION 189
Introduction 189
Red to purple: UKIP's challenge to Labour during the Coalition 192

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47357-6 — Brexitland
Maria Sobolewska , Robert Ford
Frontmatter
More Information

The Liberal Democrats' collapse and Labour's consolidation of white graduates 197
The past versus the future: the geographical conundrum created by Labour's changing electoral coalition 203
A more demanding electorate? 208
Conclusion 212

PART III BREXITLAND 215

8 BREXITLAND AWAKENED: IDENTITY POLITICS AND THE EU REFERENDUM 217
Introduction 217
Setting up the storm: the 2015 general election 221
Framing the choice: the referendum campaign 224
Brexitland awakens: identity divides and 2016 vote choices 229
Two tribes go to war: the emergence of Brexit political identities 237
Conclusion 248

9 DANCING TO A DIFFERENT TUNE: IDENTITY POLITICS AND POLITICAL CHANGE IN SCOTLAND, 2007–19 250
Introduction 250
The demographic roots of 'exit' politics: Scotland and England compared 253
Mobilising support for the exit option 262
Why 'Yes' failed but 'Leave' succeeded 269
Two stones thrown in the pond: the impact of two referendums in quick succession 273
Conclusion 280

10 BREXITLAND AFTER BREXIT: THE ELECTORAL FALLOUT FROM THE EU REFERENDUM 284
Introduction 284
A Brexit re-alignment? Identity conflicts in the 2017 and 2019 elections 286

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47357-6 — Brexitland
Maria Sobolewska , Robert Ford
Frontmatter
More Information

The ghosts of elections past: reputations and temptations 304
Paths through Brexitland: three scenarios for the future of British politics 311
Conclusion: unstable coalitions, uncertain outcomes 321

11 CONCLUSION: THE NEW POLITICS OF BREXITLAND 323
The road to Brexitland 323
Global Brexitland 326
Identity conflicts beyond party politics 332
The future study of identity politics 336
What next for Brexitland? 338

Bibliography 345
Index 381

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47357-6 — Brexitland
Maria Sobolewska , Robert Ford
Frontmatter
More Information

FIGURES AND TABLES

Figures

2.1 Share of respondents who report having no formal qualifications and who report having an undergraduate degree or more *page* 26
2.2 Ethnic minority population of the UK, 1951–2011 28
2.3 Migrant populations resident in Britain by broad region of origin, 2005–17 31
2.4 Share of under forties and over seventies belonging to the core identity conservative and identity liberal demographic groups, 1986–2016 49
2.5 Local authority change in ethnic diversity 2001–11 by starting levels of ethnic diversity in 2001, England and Wales 52
3.1 Share of people in different generations expressing ethnocentric views (percentages) 61
3.2 Ethnocentric national identity among white school leavers, white graduates and ethnic minorities (percentages) 62
3.3 Share of white graduates and school leavers accepting the idea of an ethnic minority in-law 66
3.4 Share of respondents who would dismiss an employee for different forms of rudeness to a customer (percentages) 74
3.5 Predicted probability of dismissing the employee and of taking no action by levels of motivation to control prejudice 75
3.6 Views about the benefits of diversity, with and without 'political correctness' counter-argument (percentages) 81
4.1 Opposition to immigration and support for migration restrictions, 1961–6 (percentages) 91
4.2 'Do you think on the whole this country has benefitted or been harmed through immigrants coming to settle here from the Commonwealth/Ireland?' 93

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47357-6 — Brexitland
Maria Sobolewska , Robert Ford
Frontmatter
More Information

4.3 Support for Powellite positions on immigration before and after 'Rivers of Blood' speech in April 1968 100
4.4 Voters' perceptions of Conservative and Labour immigration policies, 1970 102
4.5 Prevalence of misperceptions about Conservative and Labour migration policies in 1970 and 1974 (percentages) 106
4.6 Conservative advantage and Labour disadvantage in party identification among ethnocentric voters 112
5.1 Economic ideology in the Labour and Conservative manifestos, 1945–2017 126
5.2 Spending by Conservatives and Labour in safe seats as a share of maximum legal limit, 1959–2010 (percentages) 127
5.3 Educational background of Conservative, Labour and Liberal Democrat candidates, 1992–2015 (percentages) 131
5.4 Percentage of voters and candidates who feel equal opportunities for ethnic minorities have 'gone too far', 1992 and 2005 133
5.5 Partisan attachments in the British electorate, 1987–2010 137
5.6 Generational differences in partisanship among identity conservatives and identity liberals, 2006–10 138
5.7 Turnout among white school leavers and among graduates and ethnic minorities, 1992–2010 140
5.8 Share of respondents naming migration as one of the most important problems, 1997–2018 (percentages) 144
5.9 Public sentiment about immigration, 1995–2013 148
5.10 Predicted probability of naming immigration as the most important problem facing the country, 2001, 2005, 2010 151
5.11 Voter ratings of Labour's performance in 2005 on asylum and other issues by sentiment towards immigrants 152
6.1 Ratings of the Labour government and Conservative opposition on immigration, 2010 (difference in percentages) 160
6.2 Predicted likelihood of switching from Labour to the Conservatives by attitudes to immigration 163

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47357-6 — Brexitland
Maria Sobolewska , Robert Ford
Frontmatter
More Information

6.3 'Which party is best able to handle immigration?' 2005–14 172
6.4 Net approve–disapprove ratings for handling of migration, Conservatives and Labour, 2004–13 173
6.5 UKIP support among white school leavers, and among graduates and ethnic minorities in England and Wales, 2010–15 177
6.6 Identity conservative attitudes and UKIP support, 2014 178
6.7 Identity conservatism and predicted probability of switching to UKIP in 2014 among 2010 Conservative, Labour and Liberal Democrat voters 179
7.1 2014 vote preferences of 2010 Conservative voters, by views of national austerity cuts 194
7.2 2014 vote preferences of 2010 Labour voters, by salience to immigration 196
7.3 Rates of switching to Labour and UKIP in 2014 among 2010 Liberal Democrat voters (percentages) 199
7.4 Share of Labour voters in England and Wales who are white school leavers and graduates/ethnic minorities 204
7.5 Views of the cultural impact of immigration among Labour voters, 2005–16 (percentages) 205
7.6 Share of different groups of 2015 Labour voters who expressed little or no Labour partisanship (percentages) 210
7.7 Probability of ever voting for the Liberal Democrats among different groups of Labour 2015 voters, 2014–17 211
8.1 Identity conservative attitudes and Euroscepticism in 2003 225
8.2 Impact of various motivations on voting for Conservatives vs Labour in 2015 and for Leave vs Remain in 2016, England and Wales only 230
8.3 Relationship between economic perceptions and vote choices between Labour and the Conservatives in 2015 and between Leave and Remain in 2016 232
8.4 Views about immigration and vote preference between Labour and the Conservatives in 2015, and between Leave and Remain in 2016 in England and Wales 233
8.5 Demographic divides in support for Conservatives vs Labour in 2015 and Leave vs Remain in 2016 in England and Wales 235

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47357-6 — Brexitland
Maria Sobolewska , Robert Ford
Frontmatter
More Information

8.6 Share of voters describing 'Leavers' and 'Remainers' as working class, old or young (percentages) 240
8.7 Expressions of emotional attachment to parties and referendum sides, autumn 2016 (percentages) 242
8.8 Share of Leave and Remain voters rating each Brexit tribe as 'intolerant' and 'reasonable' (percentages) 243
8.9 Relative impact of neighbour characteristics on probability of being welcomed (above 0) or shunned (below 0) as a new neighbour (average marginal effect) 244
8.10 Change in views about Britain's economic performance between spring 2016 and spring 2017 by strength of Leave or Remain identity, England and Wales 246
9.1 Ethnocentric attitudes in Scotland and England (percentages) 255
9.2 English identification with Europe and Scottish identification with Britain (percentages) 258
9.3 Generational distribution of volunteered European identity in England and strong British identity in Scotland (percentages) 260
9.4 Support for exit options before and after the referendums among white school leavers and graduates/ethnic minorities (percentages) 266
9.5 Change in support for the exit options before and after the Independence and EU referendums (percentages) 267
9.6 Change in support for exit option before and after referendum campaign by level of union identity 268
9.7 Generational distribution of support for the two exit options 272
9.8 Change in support for the SNP and Conservatives 2015–17 by referendum choice combinations 277
9.9 Combinations of independence and Brexit positions among voters in Scotland in 2017 and 2019 (percentages) 278
10.1 Changes in Conservative and Labour support, 2015–17, in England and Wales among 'Remain' and 'Leave' voters 291
10.2 Conservative and Labour support among Leave and Remain voters, 2015–19 (percentages) 294

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47357-6 — Brexitland
Maria Sobolewska , Robert Ford
Frontmatter
More Information

10.3 Changes in support for the Conservatives and Labour, 2015–19, by views about the cultural impact of immigration 296
10.4 Economic perceptions and vote choices, 2015–19 298
10.5 Attitudes to immigration and vote choices, 2015–19 299
10.6 Political disaffection and vote preferences, 2015–19 301
10.7 Average vote changes, 2015–19, in the eighteen 'red wall' seats which elected their first Conservative MPs since at least 1945 in the 2019 general election 302
10.8 Party support in 2019 among Leave voters and Remain voters (percentages) 314

Tables

3.1 Ethnocentrism and views on political issues involving group conflict *page* 63
3.2 Positive views of out-groups and attachment to anti-prejudice social norms among white graduates and white school leavers 68
4.1 Education gradients in attitudes to immigration and race among white respondents 1964–84 94
9.1 Scottish Angloscepticism and English Euroscepticism compared 256

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47357-6 — Brexitland
Maria Sobolewska , Robert Ford
Frontmatter
More Information

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

They say it takes a village to raise a child. It takes a village to write a book too. There are many people to thank, but, first and foremost, we would like to thank all of the survey respondents who have, over decades, sacrificed their precious time so that we can understand better what people think, and how people decide what to do when they arrive in the polling stations. Second, we would like to thank our children for their immense patience through many months of the book-writing process. Zofia and Adam: we promise we can now make our dinner-table conversations a Brexit-free zone. We would also like to thank the ESRC for their generous grant funding (ES/R000522/122/1), and UK in a Changing Europe for their support of our research (in particular, Anand Menon). We also want to thank Matthew Goodwin, who was our co-investigator on the grant. Thanks are owed to our many colleagues who have listened and offered feedback over almost two years of presentations, including the audiences at various conferences, and seminars at the Universities of Montreal, Toronto, Durham, RHUL, QMUL, UCL, Oxford and, of course, Manchester University. In particular, we would like to thank Ron Johnston, who very kindly allowed us to use his graph on party campaign spending, and whose recent death has saddened us immensely towards the very end of this project. He has been one of the smartest, loveliest and most generous colleagues. We feel very lucky to have known him. Special mention also goes to the current British Election Study (BES) team – Geoff Evans, Ed Fieldhouse, Jane Green, Jon Mellon, Chris Prosser, Herman Schmitt and Cees Van Der Eijk – for allowing us to ask questions of the sub-sample of BES online panel respondents for our survey, and for providing the rich and detailed survey data without which this book would not be possible. Thanks also go to YouGov for their diligent efforts fielding many

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47357-6 — Brexitland
Maria Sobolewska , Robert Ford
Frontmatter
More Information

academic surveys, including the BES online panel and our own more modest surveys. Other colleagues who also have our thanks for their collaboration, comments and thoughts on the various aspects of the work that went into this book are Ben Ansell, Tim Bale, Steve Ballinger, Andrew Barclay, Neema Begum, Matthew Bevington, Sara Binzer-Hobolt, Scott Blinder, Rosie Campbell, Leonardo Carella, Nick Cohen, Phil Cowley, Sir John Curtice, Chris Curtis, Rafaela Dancygier, Eldad Davidov, John Denham, Peter Thisted Dinesen, Michael Donnelley, Bobby Duffy, Patrick English, Justin Fisher, Steve Fisher, Peter Geohagen, Justin Gest, Eva Green, Ruth Grove-White, Armen Hakhverdian, Alison Harrell, John Harris, Anthony Heath, Marc Helbling, Toby Helm, Ailsa Henderson, Frederik Hjorth, Dan Hopkins, Jennifer Hudson, Elisabeth Ivarsflaten, Laurence Janta-Lipinski, Will Jennings, Sunder Katwala, Gavin Kelly, Michael Kenny, Omar Khan, Anouk Kootstra, Laurence Lessard-Phillips, Nick Lowles, Kitty Lymperopoulou, Nicole Martin, Rahsaan Maxwell, Adam McDonnell, Rebecca McKee, Iain McLean, Alison Park, Akash Paun, Nick Pearce, Jonathan Portes, Alice Ramos, Carolin Rapp, Harvey Redgrave, Jill Rutter, Shamit Saggar, Peter Schmidt, Paul Sniderman, Will Somerville, Ingrid Storm, Paula Surridge, Joe Twyman, Menno Van Setten, Alan Wager, Ian Warren, Paul Webster, Anthony Wells, Stuart Wilks-Heeg, Jennifer Williams and Robert Yates. Your ideas, questions and praise have been inspirational, as has all your own work, from which we learnt so much. We are sorry for the delays this book has produced on the projects we have with some of you – these will be our priority now! We also owe a huge debt to the vibrant and exciting intellectual community in the Democracy and Elections research cluster, with its ever-growing body of talented young people. We are so proud to be part of such a lively and talented group. We would like to thank, in particular, James Griffith for his help with the book's index.

We also want to thank the immensely patient, meticulous and supportive staff at Cambridge University Press – in particular, John Haslam, Tobias Ginsberg, Robert Judkins and our copy-editor Lyn Flight. We also thank our anonymous reviewers

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47357-6 — Brexitland
Maria Sobolewska , Robert Ford
Frontmatter
More Information

and the reader for their positive comments and helpful advice on improving the manuscript. Obviously, any remaining errors are our sole responsibility.

One needs to remain sane to be able to complete a long project such as a book, and especially so if the book is about the ever-shifting sands of British politics. For keeping us sane and happy throughout, no matter how many elections we had thrown at us and needed to add to the book, we would like to thank our friends and family, who, much like our children, had to put up with many arguments about Brexit, and a fair amount of moaning. You know who you are – we thank you for your friendship, help with school runs, fun holidays and all the wine and beer. In particular, we'd like to thank Vikki and Malcolm, especially for looking after our kids at a crucial book-writing moment – without you, this book would have never seen the light of day – and Rachel for volunteering to be the 'general-audience guinea pig'. Malcolm, you are also thanked in footnote 73. Maria's mum is also to be thanked for all her help, and we are hoping her book will come out not long after ours! Rob's mum and brothers have our gratitude for patiently enduring many long evenings of political discussion over the years.

We would like to dedicate this book to the memory of both of our late fathers, Joe Ford and Marek Sobolewski, in whose long shadows we labour, and on whose shoulders we stand.

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org