

Building Participatory Institutions in Latin America

While prior studies have shown the importance of participatory institutions in strengthening civil society and in improving policy outcomes, we know much less about why some participatory institutions take root while others do not. This book explains the divergent trajectories of nationally mandated participatory institutions' 'stickiness' by highlighting the powerful and lasting impacts of their origins in different policy-reform projects. Mayka argues that participatory institutions take root when they are bundled into sweeping policy reforms, which upend the status quo and mobilize unexpected coalitions behind participatory institution building. In contrast, participatory institutions created through reforms focused on deepening democracy are easy for entrenched interests to dismantle and sideline. *Building Participatory Institutions in Latin America* draws on rich case studies of participatory institutions in Brazil and Colombia across three policy areas, offering the first cross-national comparative study of participatory institutions mandated at the national level.

LINDSAY MAYKA is Assistant Professor of Government at Colby College, Maine. Previously, she was a Democracy Fellow at the Ash Center for Democratic Governance and Innovation at the Harvard Kennedy School and a Visiting Scholar at the University of California, Berkeley's School of Social Welfare. Mayka's research has appeared in the *Journal of Democracy*, *Latin American Politics and Society*, and the *Journal of Comparative Politics*.

Building Participatory Institutions in Latin America

Reform Coalitions and Institutional Change

LINDSAY MAYKA

Colby College, Maine



Cambridge University Press
 978-1-108-47087-2 — Building Participatory Institutions in Latin America
 Lindsay Mayka
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
 New Delhi – 110025, India
 79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.
 It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of
 education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
 Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108470872
 DOI: 10.1017/9781108598927

© Lindsay Mayka 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
 and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
 no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
 permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays Ltd, Elcograf S.p.A.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Mayka, Lindsay, 1980– author.

TITLE: Building participatory institutions in Latin America : reform coalitions
 and institutional change / Lindsay Mayka.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2018. |
 Includes bibliographic references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2018042457 | ISBN 9781108470872

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Political participation – Latin America. | Local government – Latin
 America – Citizen participation. | Political culture – Latin America. |
 Latin America – Politics and government.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC JL966 .M42 2018 | DDC 323/.042098–dc23
 LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2018042457>

ISBN 978-1-108-47087-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of
 URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication
 and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain,
 accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47087-2 — Building Participatory Institutions in Latin America
Lindsay Mayka
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

For Dan

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> viii
<i>List of Tables</i>	ix
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	x
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xiv
1 Introduction: The Puzzle of Participatory Institution Building	i
2 Theoretical Framework: Participatory Institution Building through Sweeping Sectoral Reform and Policy Entrepreneurs	37
3 The Origins of Participatory Reforms in Brazil and Colombia	74
4 Brazil's Health Councils: Successful Institution Building through Sweeping Reform	98
5 Brazil's Social Assistance Councils: The Advances of a Broad but Divided Coalition Mobilized through Sweeping Reform	140
6 Colombia's Planning Councils: The Limits to Participatory Institution Building without Sweeping Sectoral Reform	183
7 Colombia's Health Committees: Failed Participatory Institution Building in the Absence of Policy Entrepreneurs	222
8 Conclusion: Lessons for Institutional Change, Interest Representation, and Accountability	252
<i>References</i>	270
<i>Index</i>	295

Figures

1.1	Organizational Forms for Nationally Mandated Participatory Institutions	<i>page</i> 11
1.2	National Participatory Institutions in Brazil and Colombia, 1990–2010	28
1.3	Municipal Compliance with Participatory Mandates in Brazil and Colombia	30
2.1	Compliance with Basic Formal Requirements for Brazilian Health and Social Assistance Councils, 2009	44
2.2	Argument: Participatory Institution Building through Sweeping Reform and Activation by Policy Entrepreneurs	52
2.3	State Effectiveness in Select Latin American Countries, 2014	68
2.4	Civic Engagement in Brazil and Colombia, 2010	71
3.1	Colombian Public Opinion on the Need for Political Reform, 1988	83
4.1	Brazilian Municipal Compliance with Mandate for Health Councils, 1990–2007	99
4.2	Compliance with Mandatory Features of Brazil’s Health Councils, 2009	103
5.1	Brazilian Municipal Compliance with Mandate for Social Assistance Councils, 1994–2009	141
5.2	Compliance with Mandatory Features of Brazil’s Social Assistance Councils, 2009	145
6.1	Compliance with Mandatory Features of Colombia’s Municipal Planning Councils, 2001	214
8.1	Explaining Participatory Institution Building: Brazilian Health, Brazilian Social Assistance, Colombian Planning, and Colombian Health Sectors	256

Tables

2.1 Outcomes of Participatory Institution Building: Brazilian and Colombian Cases	<i>page</i> 49
2.2 Explaining Participatory Institution Building in the Brazilian and Colombian Cases	63
4.1 Sweeping Reform in Brazil's Health Sector	106
4.2 Stakeholder Interests in Brazil's Sweeping Health Reform	110
5.1 Sweeping Reform in Brazil's Social Assistance Sector	148
5.2 Stakeholder Interests in Brazil's Sweeping Social Assistance Reform	152
6.1 Procedural Reform in Colombia's Planning Sector	191
7.1 Sweeping Reform in Colombia's Health Sector	228
7.2 Stakeholder Interests in Colombia's Sweeping Health Reform	235

Acknowledgments

This book would not have been possible without the intellectual, professional, and personal support provided by friends and colleagues. The book began as my doctoral dissertation at UC Berkeley, where I had the fortune of being advised by Ruth Berins Collier and David Collier. Ruth supported this project with enthusiasm from the very beginning, long before I was able to articulate clearly why this topic was important. She has been involved integrally at every step of the way, from my first year seminar in Latin American politics to the development of the prospectus, field research, and writing stages. David's guidance throughout the years has shaped how I approach research questions, and I am grateful for his tireless advocacy for high-quality qualitative research in the field of political science. Other faculty at Berkeley shaped my ideas throughout the course of this book project. Chris Ansell served as the chair of my prospectus committee and has contributed valuable suggestions about the project's framing and overall causal logic. Kim Voss and Margaret Weir gave helpful input at the start of the project. Ann Keller was crucial in helping me connect policy reform literature from American politics to the Latin American context. During book revisions, Alison Post provided encouragement and thoughts about how to highlight the book's contributions.

Fellow graduate students at Berkeley had an indelible impact on the development of this project. Berkeley's group of Latin Americanists provided support, friendship, and feedback at various stages along the way. I am grateful to Benjamin Allen, Mauricio Benítez, Taylor Boas, Christopher Chambers-Ju, Adam Cohon, Miguel de Figueiredo, Tasha Fairfield, Candelaria Garay, Eugenia Giraudy, Veronica Herrera, Danny Hidalgo, Samuel Handlin, Maiah Jaskoski, Diana Kapiszewski, Benjamin Lessing, Olivia Miljanic, Simeon Nichter, Lucas Novaes,

Acknowledgments

xi

Brian Palmer-Rubin, Wendy Sinek, and Mekoce Walker. Two friends – Jessica Rich and Neal Richardson – merit special mention for shaping my views about Latin American politics, and for being excellent friends over the years. I also benefited from the support of other Berkeley comparativists, including Celeste Arrington, Margaret Boittin, Jennifer Brass, Betsy Carter, Crystal Chang Cohen, Sarah Garding, Jody Laporte, Danielle Lussier, Brendan McSherry, and Sara Newland.

I am grateful to scholars who have provided feedback on this book's ideas and writing, including Rebecca Abers, Matthew Amengual, Santiago Anria, Sarah Chartock, Kent Eaton, Tulia Falletti, Christopher Gibson, Benjamin Goldfrank, Wendy Hunter, Stephanie McNulty, Alfred Montero, Sara Niedzwiecki, Phil Oxhorn, Erica Simmons, Amy Erica Smith, Mariela Szwarcberg, Kathy Thelen, Michael Touchton, Brian Wampler, and Deborah Yashar. I am particularly grateful to the scholars who participated in a book conference at Harvard's Ash Center, including Ruth Collier, Candelaria Garay, Yanilda González, Frances Hagopian, Alisha Holland, Steven Levitsky, and Kenneth Roberts. The long process of developing and revising the manuscript was made easier through the camaraderie of those in our online writing group, including Nadia El-Shaarawi, Francesca Jensenius, Alice Kang, Sara Newland, Jessica Rich, and Amy Ritterbusch. Material from this book also appeared in *Comparative Politics* and *Latin American Politics and Society*. I would like to extend gratitude to the editors and staff of these journals for giving me permission to use this material in this book. I also appreciate the terrific feedback I received from anonymous reviewers and editors from each journal.

The last year of my PhD was completed as a Democracy Fellow at the Harvard Kennedy School's Ash Center for Democratic Governance and Innovation, which served a wonderful intellectual environment that emphasizes the practical and normative implications of our research for the real world. I am thankful to Archon Fung for creating such a supportive and stimulating environment, and to my colleagues there, including Sean Gray, Tara Grillos, Quinton Mayne, Viviane Petinelli, Laura Roth, Hollie Russon-Gilman, Emma Saunders-Hastings, Shauna Shames, Paolo Spada, and Kivanc Ulusoy.

This book would not have been possible without the generosity of Brazilians and Colombians who took the time to explain their perspectives and experiences, as well as to provide data and documents. While many interview respondents are cited in the text, numerous others

shaped my understanding of participatory institutions, policy reform, and politics in general in Brazil and Colombia. In Brazil, I benefited from the counsel of Adrián Gurza Lavalle and Vera Schattan at CEBRAP, and Rebecca Abers at Universidade de Brasília. In Colombia, Daniel Coronell, Carlos Alberto Garzón Flores, Bertha Niño Martínez, and Jaime Ramírez helped me better understand the complexities of Colombian politics, and put me in touch with many useful contacts.

At Colby College, I have benefited from the support and advice of a number of colleagues. In the Government Department and Latin American Studies program, I would like to thank Tony Corrado, Guilain Denoeux, Ben Fallaw, Patrice Franko, Raynee Gutting, Walter Hatch, Carrie LeVan, Cal Mackenzie, Sandy Maisel, Luis Millones, Jorge Olivares, Joe Reisert, Ken Rodman, Betty Sasaki, Laura Seay, Dan Shea, Winifred Tate, and Jennifer Yoder. Across the college, I have appreciated the friendship of Dean Albritton, Natalie Áviles, Michael Donihue, Nadia El-Shaarawi, Samara Gunter, Adam Howard, Dale Kocevski, Dan LaFave, Elizabeth McGrath, Ian Mullins, Laurie Osborne, Allecia Reid, Stacey Sheriff, and Andreas Waldkirch.

Along the way, I benefited from the contributions of a number of research assistants, including Paulo Duran in Brazil, and Solón Arguello, John Bengston, Leah Breen, Emily Boyce, Stephan Chaikovsky, Victoria Cheff, Cam Coval, Nellie LaValle, Greg Morano, Caroline Tegeler, and Cathy Zhao at Colby College. I appreciate Sarah Grey's aid in developing the book's index. At Cambridge University Press, I have had the excellent fortune of working with Sara Doskow and Danielle Menz, as well as Helen Belgian, Sarah Payne, and Sri Hari Sugumaran.

This project would not have been possible without financial support from donors. Fieldwork was funded by the Social Science Research Council, the Fulbright program, UC Berkeley's Graduate Division, UC Berkeley's Center for Latin American Studies, and Colby College's Social Science Division. The UC Berkeley political science department, Harvard Kennedy School's Ash Center for Democratic Governance and Innovation, and Colby College provided financial assistance to support my writing. The Ash Center at Harvard provided generous support for a book conference. UC Berkeley's School of Social Welfare and political science department provided me with an institutional home while completing the final revisions during a sabbatical from Colby.

A number of friends gave personal support at some of the more challenging times of the project, while also ensuring that my life did not only revolve around political science. Ruth Graham has been a dear friend

Acknowledgments

xiii

for nearly two decades, and I am a better person because of our friendship. Fieldwork in Brazil proved to be delightful due to the companionship of Alessandro Angelini, Nadir França, Jenna Goodward, Yuri Kasahara, Kathleen Millar, Tricia Perry, Jessica Rich, Neal Richardson, Natália Salgado Bueno, Laura Scheiber, Jenee Slocum, and Kristin Wylie. In Colombia, Candice Camargo, Amy Ritterbusch, and Renata Stepanov added immeasurably to my time in that beautiful country.

I would not be where I am today without the support of my family. My mother pushed me to go beyond what was easy and encouraged my intellectual curiosity. Moreover, she instilled in me from an early age that we all bear a responsibility to address injustices in the world. It is because of these values that I became interested in Latin America in the first place, and why I find the struggles for democracy and social inclusion so compelling. I am also grateful for the love of my siblings – Jennifer, Mary, and Patrick. There are not enough words to express my gratitude to my husband, Dan Burke. Not an academic, Dan has gone above and beyond in reading and commenting on my work and bearing through my political science ramblings. Dan has been a cheerleader when I doubted myself, a taskmaster when I needed to write, and a distractor when I needed to stop thinking about my work. Finally, I am beyond thankful for my lovely daughter, Linnea Rose, whose arrival brought immeasurable light and love into my world.

Abbreviations

ABESS	<i>Associação Brasileira de Escolas de Ensino de Serviço Social</i> – Brazilian Association of Social Work Schools
ABI	<i>Associação Brasileira de Imprensa</i> – Brazilian Press Association
ACEMI	<i>Asociación Colombiana de Empresas de Medicina Integral</i> – Colombian Association of Insurance Companies
ACHC	<i>Asociación Colombiana de Hospitales y Clínicas</i> – Colombian Association of Hospitals and Clinics
AD M-19	<i>Acción Democrática/Movimiento 19 de Abril</i> – Democratic Action/April 19th Movement (Colombia)
ANASSELBA	<i>Associação Nacional dos Servidores da Legião Brasileira de Assistência</i> – National Association of LBA Workers (Brazil)
ANDI	<i>Asociación Nacional de Industriales/Asociación Nacional de Empresarios de Colombia</i> – Colombian National Association of Industry
ANIF	<i>Asociación Nacional de Instituciones Financieras</i> – National Association of Financial Institutions (Colombia)
ANUC	<i>Asociación Nacional de Usuarios Campesino</i> – National Association of Peasant Beneficiaries (Colombia)

List of Abbreviations

xv

APAEs	<i>Associação de Pais e Amigos dos Excepcionais</i> – Associations of Parents and Friends of the Exceptional
ARENA	<i>Aliança Renovadora Nacional</i> – National Renovation Alliance (Brazil)
ASCOFAME	<i>Asociación Colombiana de Facultades de Medicina</i> – Colombian Medical School Association
Asmedas	<i>Asociación Médica Sindical Colombiana</i> – Colombian Doctors Union
ASOBANCARIA	<i>Asociación Bancaria y de Entidades Financieras de Colombia</i> – Colombian Banking Association
BPC	<i>Benefício de Prestação Continuada</i> – Non-Contributory Pension (Brazil)
CEB	<i>Comunidade Eclesial de Base</i> – Ecclesial Base Communities (Brazil)
CFESS	<i>Conselho Federal de Serviço Social</i> – Federal Social Work Council (Brazil)
CNAS	<i>Conselho Nacional de Assistência Social</i> – National Social Assistance Council (Brazil)
CNBB	<i>Conferência Nacional dos Bispos do Brasil</i> – National Conference of Brazilian Bishops
CNDM	<i>Conselho Nacional dos Direitos da Mulher</i> – National Council for the Rights of Women (Brazil)
CNP	<i>Consejo Nacional de Planeación</i> – National Planning Council (Colombia)
CNS	<i>Conselho Nacional de Saúde</i> – National Health Council (Brazil)
CNSS	<i>Conselho Nacional de Serviço Social</i> – National Social Welfare Council (Brazil)
CNSSS	<i>Consejo Nacional de Seguridad Social en Salud</i> – National Health Council (Colombia)
CNTSS	<i>Confederação Nacional dos Trabalhadores em Seguridade Social</i> – National Confederation of Social Security Workers (Brazil)
COGEMAS	<i>Colegiado Nacional de Gestores Municipais de Assistência Social</i> – National Collegiate of Municipal Social Assistance Administrators
CONAMA	<i>Conselho Nacional do Meio Ambiente</i> – National Environmental Council (Brazil)

Conasems	<i>Conselho Nacional de Secretarias Municipais de Saúde</i> – Council of Municipal Secretariats of Health (Brazil)
CONASS	<i>Conselho Nacional de Secretários de Saúde</i> – Council of State Secretaries of Health (Brazil)
Copacos	<i>Comités de Participación Ciudadana en Salud</i> – Community Participation in Health Committees (Colombia)
CRAS	<i>Centros de Referência de Assistência Social</i> – Social Assistance Referral Center
CREAS	<i>Centros de Referência Especializado de Assistência Social</i> – Specialized Social Assistance Reference Center
CTSSS	<i>Consejos Territoriales de Seguridad Social en Salud</i> – Municipal Health Councils (Colombia)
DNP	<i>Departamento Nacional de Planeación</i> – National Planning Department (Colombia)
EBAS	<i>Entidades Benéficas de Assistência Social</i> – Nonprofit Organizations in Social Assistance (Brazil)
ELN	<i>Ejército de Liberación Nacional</i> – National Liberation Army (Colombia)
EPS	<i>Entidades Promotoras de Salud</i> – Health Promotion Agencies for Contributory Regime (Colombia)
ESS	<i>Empresas Solidarias de Salud</i> – Health Solidarity Agencies for Subsidized Regime (Colombia)
FARC	<i>Fuerzas Armadas Revolucionarias de Colombia</i> – Revolutionary Armed Forces of Colombia
FENTAS	<i>Fórum de Entidades Nacionais de Trabalhadores da Área da Saúde</i> – Forum of National Agency Health Workers (Brazil)
FOSYGA	<i>Fondo de Solidaridad y Garantía</i> – National Health Fund (Colombia)
FUNRURAL	<i>Fundo de Assistência ao Trabalhador Rural</i> – Rural Workers Assistance Fund (Brazil)
INAMPS	<i>Instituto Nacional de Assistência Médica e Previdência Social</i> – National Institute for Medical Care and Social Security (Brazil)

List of Abbreviations

xvii

INPS	<i>Instituto Nacional de Previdência Social</i> – National Social Security Institute (Brazil)
IPEA	<i>Instituto de Pesquisa Econômica Aplicada</i> – Applied Economic Research Institute (Brazil)
IPS	<i>Instituciones Prestadoras de Servicios</i> – Service Delivery Institutes (Colombia)
ISS	<i>Instituto de Seguros Sociales</i> – Social Insurance Institute (Colombia)
JAC	<i>Junta de Acción Comunal</i> – Community Action Board (Colombia)
LBA	<i>Legião Brasileira de Assistência</i> – Brazilian Social Assistance League
LOAS	<i>Lei Orgânica de Assistência Social</i> – Social Assistance Charter (Brazil)
M-19	<i>Movimiento 19 de Abril</i> – April 19th Movement (Colombia)
MDB	<i>Movimento Democrático Brasileiro</i> – Brazilian Democratic Movement
MDS	<i>Ministerio de Desenvolvimento Social e Combate à Fome</i> – Ministry of Social Development and Combating Hunger (Brazil)
MOPS	<i>Movimento Popular da Saúde</i> – Popular Health Movement (Brazil)
MPAS	<i>Ministerio de Previdência e Assistência Social</i> – Ministry of Pensions and Social Assistance (Brazil)
MSN	<i>Movimiento de Salvación Nacional</i> – Movement of National Salvation (Colombia)
NGO	Nongovernmental organization
OAB	<i>Ordem dos Advogados do Brasil</i> – Brazilian Bar Association
OPEC	Organization of the Petroleum Exporting Countries
PARS	<i>Programa de Apoyo a la Reforma de Salud</i> – Health Reform Support Program (Colombia)
PDS	<i>Partido Democrático Social</i> – Social Democratic Party (Brazil)
PIASS	<i>Programa de Interiorização das Ações de Saúde e Saneamento</i> – Program of Interiorization of Health and Sanitation Actions (Brazil)

PMDB	<i>Partido do Movimento Democrático Brasileiro</i> – Party of the Brazilian Democratic Movement
POS	<i>Plan Obligatorio de Salud</i> – Obligatory Health Plan (Colombia)
POT	<i>Planes de Ordenamiento Territorial</i> – Plans for Territorial Organization (Colombia)
PSDB	<i>Partido Social Democrático Brasileiro</i> – Brazilian Social Democratic Party
PT	<i>Partido dos Trabalhadores</i> – Workers’ Party (Brazil)
SGEP	<i>Secretaria de Gestão Estratégica e Participativa</i> – Secretariat for Strategic and Participatory Management (Brazil)
SGSSS	<i>Sistema General de Seguridad Social en Salud</i> – General System of Social Security in Health (Colombia)
Sindasaúde	<i>Sindicato dos Trabalhadores em Saúde</i> – Health Workers Union (Brazil)
SintraISS	<i>Sindicato Nacional de Trabajadores del Instituto de Seguros Sociales</i> – ISS Workers Union (Colombia)
SIOPS	<i>Sistema de Informações sobre Orçamentos Públicos em Saúde</i> – Public Health Budgets Information System (Brazil)
Sisbén	<i>Sistema de Identificación de Potenciales Beneficiarios de Programas Sociales</i> – System to Identify Potential Beneficiaries of Social Programs (Colombia)
Sispar	<i>Sistema de Planeación Participativa</i> – Participatory Planning System
SNS	<i>Sistema Nacional de Salud</i> – National Health System (Colombia)
SUAS	<i>Sistema Único de Assistência Social</i> – Unified Social Assistance System (Brazil)
SUS	<i>Sistema Único de Saúde</i> – Unified Health System (Brazil)
TAI	Transparency and Accountability Initiative
UnB	<i>Universidade de Brasília</i> – University of Brasília (Brazil)
UPC	<i>Unidad de Pago por Capacitación</i> – Per-Capita Payment (Colombia)