

Rediscovering Economic Policy as a Discipline

Government interventions in market failures can encounter objections from those who doubt their efficacy. Acocella, a leading expert on economic policy, counters these unfounded criticisms, making the convincing case for the foundation, coordination and reach of government action through economic policy. Arguing for the governmental potential to devise democratic, fair and effective institutions and policies, this book also demonstrates the validity of the principles outlined by Frisch and Tinbergen, amongst others, for controlling the economy, in a strategic context, equivalent to the rational expectations assumption. Demonstrating how unconventional monetary policies and other policies (such as macro-prudential regulation, new fiscal rules and new forms of international policy coordination) can offer an effective response to the multiplicity of current economic issues, the recent financial crisis arguably indicates that economic policy must once again take centre stage as the applied complement to mainstream economic theory.

Nicola Acocella is Emeritus Professor of Economic Policy, Sapienza University, Rome. His fields of specialisation include welfare economics, theory of economic policy, policy games, and monetary and fiscal policy, amongst others. He has published in prominent journals and authored a number of books, including *Economic Policy in the Age of Globalisation* (2005), and, with Giovanni di Bartolomeo and Andrew Hughes Hallett, *Macroeconomic Paradigms and Economic Policy* (Cambridge, 2016).

Federico Caffè Lectures

This series of annual lectures was initiated to honour the memory of Federico Caffè. They are jointly sponsored by the Department of Public Economics at the University of Rome, where Caffè held a chair from 1959 to 1987, and the Bank of Italy, where he served for many years as an advisor. The publication of the lectures will provide a vehicle for leading scholars in the economics profession, and for the interested general reader, to reflect on the pressing economic and social issues of the times.

Rediscovering Economic Policy as a Discipline

Nicola Acocella

Sapienza University of Rome



Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47049-0 — Rediscovering Economic Policy as a Discipline
Nicola Acocella
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.
It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in
the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest
international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108470490
DOI: 10.1017/9781108556705

© Nicola Acocella 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed and bound in Great Britain by Clays Ltd, Elcograf S.p.A.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Acocella, Nicola, 1939– author.

Title: Rediscovering economic policy as a discipline / Nicola Acocella,
Sapienza Università di Roma.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY: Cambridge
University Press, 2018. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2017061451 | ISBN 9781108470490 (hardback)

Subjects: LCSH: Economic policy. | Economics.

Classification: LCC HD87 .A2856 2018 | DDC 338.9–dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2017061451>

ISBN 978-1-108-47049-0 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-45491-9 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or
accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to
in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such
websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47049-0 — Rediscovering Economic Policy as a Discipline
Nicola Acocella
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

To Federico Caffè, anticipator of economic policy
as a discipline, educator of thousands of students
and my mentor

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47049-0 — Rediscovering Economic Policy as a Discipline
Nicola Acocella
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	page xi
<i>List of Tables</i>	xiii
<i>Preface</i>	xv
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xix
Part I Economic Policy As a Discipline	1
1 Introduction	3
1.1 The Core of Economic Policy and Its Two Pillars: The ‘Logic’ and the ‘Theory’ of Economic Policy	3
1.2 Overview of the Development of the Discipline	4
1.3 The ‘Invisible Hand’ and the ‘Night-Watchman’ State	8
1.4 The Seeds for the Birth of the Logic of Economic Policy	11
1.5 The Theory of Economic Policy and the Link between the Two Pillars	17
1.6 The Classical Theory of Economic Policy with Fixed and Flexible Targets	24
1.7 Linking the Two Pillars	33
1.8 Why Did Economic Policy As a Discipline First Develop in Scandinavia and the Netherlands – And How Did It Develop Elsewhere?	35
1.9 Economic Policy in Italy since the 1960s	45
1.10 Conclusions	48

viii Contents

2	Progressive Dismantling and Demise of the Classical Theory of Economic Policy	55
2.1	Why Economic Policy Did Not Pass Over to Other Countries or Survive	55
2.2	Preconditions for the Existence of an Economic Discipline: The Core of Economic Policy under Attack	57
2.3	Minor Failures: The Identity of Policymakers	60
2.4	Vital Failures and the First Pillar: The Impossibility of a Democratic Social Welfare	62
2.5	Vital Failures and the Second Pillar: The Ineffectiveness of Policy Action	68
2.6	The Need for Rules and Constraints: Independent (and Conservative) Central Banks and Authorities to Limit Discretionary Policy Action	80
2.7	Waiting for a Reevaluation of Policy Effectiveness	82
3	Re-establishing the First Pillar and a Silent Revolution for the Effectiveness of Policy Action	83
3.1	Possibilities of a Democratic Social-Welfare Ordering: The Need for a ‘Theory of Justice’	83
3.2	Rip van Winkle and the Rebuttal of the Theoretical Convictions of the 1970s and 1980s on the Ineffectiveness of Economic Policy	90
3.3	The Surprise Effect	92
3.4	The Non-Vertical Long-Run Phillips Curve	93
3.5	The Optimal Inflation Rate	97
3.6	Political Independence of Central Banks	102
3.7	Conservative Central Banks and Alternative Ways of Governing Inflation	108
3.8	The Changing Value of Multipliers and Fiscal Policy	111
3.9	An Application of Values of Multipliers: Inconsistency of the EMU Institutions	119
3.10	What Have We Learned from the Crisis?	123
4	Reevaluation of the Classical Approach to Economic Policy: Re-establishing the Second Pillar	125
4.1	Introduction	125

	Contents	ix
4.2	Equivalence of Rational Expectations to a Strategic Game	127
4.3	An Example of Conflicts Rather Than Passive Subordination and the Need for a Theory of Conflicts	133
4.4	Conditions for Controllability in a Static Strategic Setting with Two or Multiple Players	135
4.5	Notions and Conditions of Controllability in a Dynamic Strategic Setting	152
4.6	Summary and Open Issues	164
Part II Economic Policy in the Present Tense		167
5	The Challenges of the Financial Crisis, Rising Inequality, Secular Stagnation and Globalisation: Economic Policy As a Lame Duck?	169
5.1	The 'Bad News': New Economic and Social Issues – The Great Recession	170
5.2	The Crisis As a Pivot: The Limits to Fiscal and Monetary Policy and the Need to Devise New Policy Tools	176
5.3	The 'Good News': New Monetary Policies and Macro-Prudential Instruments for Dealing with Crises	178
5.4	Searching for New Rules of Fiscal Policy	191
5.5	Coordinating Macroeconomic Policies: Down in the Trenches or Clearing Clouds for the Future?	202
5.6	Fighting Inequalities	208
5.7	Dealing with Secular Stagnation	226
5.8	Finding an International Equilibrium in Times of Globalisation and Redesign of International Institutions	235
6	One Step Forward towards Realism in Theories Relevant to Effective and Accountable Policymaking	253
6.1	Searching for the Right Signals in a Market Economy to Prevent Crises and to Manage Them	254
6.2	Signals, Transparency and Forward Guidance	262
6.3	The Issue of Knowledge Sharing of Models and Policy Effectiveness	278

x Contents

6.4	How to Enrich the Classical Conception of Economic Policy As a Discipline	281
6.5	Complementing and Refining the Abstract Theory of Policymaking	293
7	Why Can Economic Policy Be a Useful Discipline?	295
7.1	Institutions As the Ring Connecting the Three Parts of Economic Policy	295
7.2	Social Choice and Institutions for Building a Fair Society	298
7.3	Conflicts and Coordination in a Democratic Society	304
7.4	The Central Role of Education for Democracy	309
7.5	Institutions for Building a Well-Functioning Society	313
7.6	The Many Reasons Why the Theory of Economic Policy Has an Impact on Institutions	315
7.7	For a Democratic, Fair and Efficient Society: A Restatement of the Need for a Unitary Discipline of Economic Policy	324
	<i>References</i>	326
	<i>Author Index</i>	391
	<i>Subject Index</i>	398

Figures

1.1	Fixed-target approach	<i>page</i> 30
1.2	Flexible-target approach	31
3.1	Optimal inflation rates with and without fiscal transfers	100
4.1	A timeline for dynamic policy problems	154
5.1	Evolution of the unemployment rate in OECD countries, 2008–2018	174
5.2	NEETs in major OECD countries, 2007–2014	175
5.3	International and global inequality, 1952–2011	213
5.4	Top 1 per cent income shares in Anglo-Saxon countries, 1910–2010	215
5.5	Top 1 per cent income shares in Continental Europe and Japan, 1910–2010	216
5.6	Top 1 per cent income shares in emerging countries, 1910–2010	217
5.7	Real income growth by percentile of global income distribution, 1988–2008	218
5.8	Wage shares as a per cent of GDP, various countries, 1980, 1990, 2010	219
5.9	Adjusted share of labour income in GDP in selected G20 countries, 1991–2013	219
5.10	Financialisation. Average value of market capitalisation in the stock exchange (per cent of GDP) in thirty-four OECD countries, 1990–2013	222
5.11	Rate of return versus growth rate at the world level, from antiquity until 2100	224

xii List of Figures

5.12	Components of growth in per-capita real GDP, 1987–2007	232
5.13	Stock and flows of inward foreign direct investment as a share of global output by country group (per cent), 1970–2014	238
5.14	Global current account surpluses and deficits as a share of world output (per cent), 1980–2014	242

Tables

3.1	Public consumption, other public expenditures and total revenues, selected OECD countries (1998–2008)	<i>page</i> 99
5.1	Recent and projected growth rates for real GDP, 2007–17	172
5.2	Recent and projected growth rates for employment, 2007–17	173
5.3	Marginal income tax rates, selected countries (1900–2013)	220
5.4	Globalisation waves in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries	237
5.5	Growth of real GDP per capita at purchasing power parity, selected regions and economies, 1951–2015	240

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-47049-0 — Rediscovering Economic Policy as a Discipline
Nicola Acocella
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Preface

In the process to specialisation of the unitary economic science that had developed since Adam Smith's *Wealth of Nations* (1776), at least three economic disciplines have arisen over time, each with some degree of autonomy, albeit linked one to the other. Adam Smith's analysis contained the seeds for all future developments. First, it was economic analysis, which progressively proceeded towards a highly abstract set of principles, after other economic disciplines had developed. Then, public finance emerged as a necessary step for designing the main task of a modern state, i.e. to levy taxes to meet public expenditures. This discipline arose by the end of the nineteenth century, but some bricks were laid well before. Economic policy – which had a limited role for Adam Smith and other classical writers – arose only later, as we will see.

What differentiates the various disciplines is their different degree of abstraction or remoteness from reality, economic analysis being the most theoretical one, followed by economic policy, encompassing the action of government in all economic areas and, then, public finance, confined to the action of government for taxes and expenditures.

The seeds of economic policy were laid from the end of the nineteenth century to World War II, but the discipline can be said to have been 'officially' established only by the end of

xvi Preface

the 1950s. Market failures were first identified through a microeconomic lens only, by what is now termed ‘social choice and welfare theory’, and then, by Kalecki, Frisch, Keynes and others, also in macroeconomic terms. As I will say, market failures represent the ‘logic of economic policy’, which justifies the existence of government action in many areas to correct or substitute the market for its failures. It constitutes what I call the ‘first pillar’ of the discipline.

Facing the numerous government tasks arising from market failures – and thus the rise of multiple targets – requires a number of effective policy tools as well as a coordination of their use to guarantee the attainment of goals. This is done in the ‘theory of economic policy’, which constitutes my ‘second pillar’ of the discipline of economic policy.

Economic policy has also a third branch, applying the concepts of its two pillars to given historical and institutional contexts. I call it ‘applied economic policy’.

This book is organised as follows: Chapter 1 traces the development of economic policy as a discipline, which concluded in the 1950s. Chapter 2 deals with the progressive dismantling and the demise of this conception of economic policy for a long time. Specifically, the discipline as sketched in Chapter 1 became obsolete as a result of many critiques addressed to it. Some of these critiques were ‘minor’, as they could rather easily be incorporated in the realm of the classical version of economic policy.

‘Vital’ critiques, instead, referred to the central aspects of the two pillars and threatened their foundations and, thus, their validity. If they are unaddressed, the whole discipline – or at least a part of it – collapses. The first such vital critique was advanced by Arrow in 1950–51 and concerned the impossibility of defining social targets starting from individuals’ preferences (Arrow’s critique). This critique threatened the possibility of tying government goals to the preferences of the citizens and, thus, the possibility of their democratic derivation.

Preface **xvii**

The second vital critique referred to the ineffectiveness of macroeconomic policy action and derived from the introduction of ‘rational expectations’ in the 1970s. Rational expectations implied that any government action could be foreseen and neutralised by the private sector. This deprived government action of a set of relevant macroeconomic policies, even if it retained some degree of acceptance of microeconomic policy intervention as a way to influence the structure of the economy.

These critiques were not addressed for too long, which led to the demise of the discipline. Chapter 3 investigates the long process of rehabilitation of economic policy as a discipline. After a couple of decades, the first critique was overcome, which required an appeal to the need for a theory of justice. The rehabilitation of the second pillar needed even longer. It passed through a silent and slow revolution, laying down various pieces that contributed to clarifying the rationale – and conditions – for the effectiveness of public policy. Around a decade ago, this finally led to a statement of the theory of economic policy in a strategic setting, rather than in a parametric context, as in the classical theory.

Chapter 4 describes the content and methodology of the theory of economic policy in a strategic context. It indicates static and dynamic conditions for the controllability and stabilisability of an economy that go back to the well-known Tinbergen rule of the existence of at least so many instruments as targets. The theory also states the conditions for the existence of an equilibrium or multiple equilibria when more than one agent satisfies the rule. It can therefore be depicted as a theory of conflicts among agents having competing targets or target values and their resolution – thus a ‘theory of conflicts’ and a ‘theory of consent’. It is thus useful for model and institution building, i.e. it can help both researchers – in devising suitable models – and policymakers – in successfully coping with real problems, which imply total or partial convergence of interests and/or

xviii Preface

conflicts. It also deals with announcements that can help in finding one equilibrium out of many.

Chapters 5 and 6 apply the tools developed by the theory of economic policy in a strategic context. Chapter 5 provides several practical examples on how the theory works. It applies the theory of economic policy to a number of fields, in particular, to the main current problems, the economic crisis, inequality, stagnation and globalisation. Chapter 6 reveals the helpfulness of the new theory of economic policy in laying down signals that provide sufficient information for pointing out economic conditions in general and imbalances in particular that can be useful for preventing crises. The chapter also discusses the realistic assumptions and the political economy concepts that should be incorporated into economic policy for effective policy action.

Finally, Chapter 7 explains the crucial role of institutions when conceiving economic policy as an autonomous discipline. In fact, institutions underlie and link together the two pillars of economic policy, as well as the third part of the discipline, applied economic policy. Institutions thus constitute the glue of the three parts of economic policy, the logic of economic policy (notably social choice and welfare theory), the theory of economic policy and the applications of these two pillars to a given situation.

Acknowledgements

In preparing this book, I was greatly assisted by the advice and criticism of many friends and colleagues. Some parts of this book draw on the results of my previous research, such as many of my papers and books, sometimes jointly authored with others. I therefore thank the co-authors with whom I wrote: Giovanni Di Bartolomeo, Douglas A. Hibbs, Andrew Hughes Hallett, Giovanni Paolo Piacquadio and Patrizio Tirelli. Giovanni Di Bartolomeo and I first devised the new theory of economic policy that overcame radical objections to the classical theory, reestablishing what I call the ‘second pillar’ of economic policy as a discipline. I still remember how excited we were when we realised the innovative character and deep implications of the new theory.

Joint works are all cited in the relevant parts of this book where they are used and are included in the References. In some cases, the parts drawn from these papers are rather long, and I have asked permission from the co-authors to reproduce them. Anyway, the sources of these parts are not only quoted, as usually, but explicit mention of them is made at the beginnings of the relevant sections.

I must thank the friends and colleagues who have read the whole manuscript or parts of it and suggested a number of changes, in some case of perspective. Among them I must recall Alberto Baffigi, Guido Candela, Giovanni Di

xx Acknowledgements

Bartolomeo, Andrew Hughes Hallett, Reinhard Neck, Michele Raitano, Roberto Schiattarella, Mario Tiberi and Ignazio Visco.

I am grateful to the members of the committee selecting the contributors to the Federico Caffè Lectures and the Bank of Italy for supporting the initiative. Cambridge University Press did a great job in preparing this book to be published. I am grateful, in particular, to Phil Good, who took over the editorship of the Federico Caffè Lectures from Chris Harrison, who first supported the initiative of a dedicated series. As in the past, Veronica Fedeli helped me in carefully checking and editing the whole manuscript.

Finally, I am mostly grateful to Federico Caffè, my mentor, whose memory this book intends to honour. He first introduced me to the wonderful world of economic policy as a discipline.