

### ST. PAUL'S OUTSIDE THE WALLS



This volume examines one of Rome's most influential churches: the principal basilica dedicated to St. Paul. Nicola Camerlenghi traces nearly two thousand years of physical transformations to the church, from before its construction in the fourth century to its reconstruction following a fire in 1823. By recounting this long history, he restores the building to its rightful place as a central, active participant in epochal political and religious shifts in Rome and across Christendom, as well as a protagonist in Western art and architectural history. Camerlenghi also examines how buildings in general trigger memories and anchor meaning, and how and why buildings endure, evolve, and remain relevant in cultural contexts far removed from the moment of their inception. At its core, Saint Paul's exemplifies the concept of building as a process, not a product: a process deeply interlinked with religion, institutions, history, cultural memory, and the arts. This study also includes state-of-the-art digital reconstructions synthesizing a wealth of historical evidence to visualize and analyze the earlier (now lost) stages of the building's history, offering glimpses into heretofore unexamined parts of its long, rich life.

Nicola Camerlenghi is Assistant Professor of Art History at Dartmouth College. He is a native of Italy and Switzerland, and previously he was a fellow at the Bibliotheca Hertziana and the Swiss Institute in Rome. His collaborative projects in the digital humanities have been awarded grants from the Kress Foundation and can be found at www.mappingrome.com. His website associated with the Basilica of St. Paul's can be found at https://Dartgo.org/virtualbasilica or through the permanent URL https://nzt.net/ark:/81428/v81593.





ST. PAUL'S
OUTSIDE
THE WALLS

A Roman Basilica, from Antiquity to the Modern Era

Nicola Camerlenghi

Dartmouth College





# **CAMBRIDGE**UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108429511

DOI: 10.1017/9781108567237

© Nicola Camerlenghi 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed and bound in Great Britain by Clays Ltd, Elcograf S.p.A.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

 $Library\ of\ Congress\ Cataloging-in-Publication\ Data$ 

NAMES: Camerlenghi, Nicola Maria, 1975- author.

TITLE: St. Paul's outside the Walls: a Roman basilica, from antiquity to the modern era / Nicola Camerlenghi, Dartmouth College, New Hampshire.

DESCRIPTION: New York: Cambridge University Press, 2018. | Includes bibliographical references and index | Outgrowth of the author's thesis (Ph. D.–Princeton University) under the title: The life of the Basilica of San Paolo Fuori Le Mura in Rome.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2018006535 ISBN 9781108429511 (hardback)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: San Paolo fuori le mura (Church : Rome, Italy)-History.

Basilicas-Italy-Rome-History. | Rome (Italy)-Buildings, structures, etc.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC NA5620.S8 C36 2018 | DDC 726.09456/32-DC23

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2018006535

ISBN 978-1-108-42951-1 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

.....

This publication is made possible in part from the Barr Ferree Foundation Fund for Publications, Department of Art and Archaeology, Princeton University.



# CONTENTS

List of Figures Acknowledgments	page ix xxiii
Introduction: The Life of St. Paul's Basilica across the <i>Longue Durée</i>	1
CHAPTER 1	.1
Paul's Place in Rome: Tomb, Trophy, and the Basilica of t	the
Constantinian Dynasty (ca. 67–386)	23
The Necropolis along the Ostian Road	24
Early Evidence for the Shrine and Cult of Paul	28
The Basilica of the Constantinian Dynasty	31
Constantinian Patronage	37
Closing Observations	38
CHAPTER 2	
The Basilica of the Theodosian Dynasty (386–410)	41
Rome, the "Generation of Paul," and the Theodosian Dynasty	42
The Basilica	45
Closing Observations	80

 $\sim v$ 



#### $vi \sim$ contents

CHAPTER 3	
The Early Transformations (410–700)	82
Transformations under Pope Leo the Great	83
The Consolidation of Papal Influence at St. Paul's and a New	
Lease on Life	102
The Gregorian Transformations: For Clergy and for Pilgrims	105
The Basilica and Its Vicinity during the Seventh Century	112
Closing Observations	116
CHAPTER 4	
A Fortress of Faith during the Heart of the Middle Ages	
(700–1050)	119
Liturgical Renewal under Gregory II and Gregory III	120
Reforms and Staying the Course under the Republic of Peter and the	
Carolingians	127
Fortification	133
Monastic Revivals and the Imperial Turn	136
Closing Observations	139
CHAPTER 5	
The Advent, Apogee, and End of St. Paul's Golden Age	
(1050–1423)	141
Reforms and Primacy across Christendom	142
The Monastic Moment	159
Jubilees, Papal Absence, and the End of the Golden Age	172
Closing Observations	180
CHAPTER 6	0
Rebirth and Modernization (1423–1655)	181
Physical and Spiritual Rebirth at the Dawn of the Roman	_
Renaissance	182
Liturgical and Devotional Changes (1490–1609)	186
Baroque Masters: Maderno, Mochi, Bernini, and Borromini	0
at St. Paul's	208
Closing Observations	215
CHAPTER 7	
Restoring and Reconstructing St. Paul's during the Long	
Eighteenth Century (1655–1823)	217
A Repository of Art and Artifacts	218
Restoration of Existing Features	223



	contents ~ vii
Reconstructions and New Constructions	230
Closing Observations	243
Epilogue: The Basilica Is Dead, Long Live the Basilica!	246
Appendix A Reconciling the Evidence and Making	
the Model	269
Appendix B Carolingian-Era Patronage	287
Notes	290
Bibliography	342
Index	366





# **FIGURES**

I.1	Filippo Bombelli, St. Paul's during the Fire of 1823, oil on canvas,	
	$73 \times 61  \mathrm{cm}$ , 1823.	page 2
I.2	Giovanni Paolo Panini, Interior of St. Paul's, oil on canvas,	
	$75 \times 103$ cm, ca. 1750.	3
I.3	View up the nave toward the apse, 2016.	5
I.4	View of the faithful and some discoveries from the 2002	
	excavations, including the Constantinian apse (curving wall under	
	the glass floor) and the sarcophagus of Paul (far right, behind	
	the grate).	6
I.5	Fra Paolino Veneto, detail of St. Paul's (north is at top) from a	
	view of Rome in Chronologia Magna, manuscript, ca. 1323.	7
I.6	Stefano Du Pérac, detail of St. Paul's, from Antonio Lafreri's Nova	
	urbis Romae descriptio, engraving, 1577.	8
I.7	Israël Silvestre, S. Paolo, from Les Églises des stationes de Rome,	
	Tav. 9, engraving, 5 $\times$ 12 cm, 1648.	8
I.8	Anonymous, Basilica di S. Paolo sulla via Ostiense, engraving,	
	$_{35}$ $ imes$ $_{51}$ cm, last quarter of the eighteenth century.	9
I.9	Giovanni Battista Silvestri, Incendio della Basilica di San Paolo,	
	from Gli avanzi della Basilica di S. Paolo, lithograph,	
	19.5 × 28 cm, 1825.	10
I.10	Composite plan of St. Paul's apse, transept, and the eastern end of	
	the nave (404–2018).	11

 $\sim$  ix



#### $x \succ$ list of figures

I.11	Composite section cut E/W through St. Paul's apse, transept and the	
	eastern end of the nave (404–2018).	12
I.12	Reconstructed plans and sections of St. Paul's apse, transept, and	
	the eastern end of the nave (404–2018).	13
1.1	Gaspare Vanvitelli, The Church of San Paolo Fuori le Mura, Rome	
	from across the River Tiber, oil on canvas, $42.5 \times 67$ cm, ca. 1700.	24
1.2	Aerial view of the vicinity of the current basilica, with historic and	
	topographical overlays.	25
1.3	Giuseppe Lugli, remains of the necropolis along the Ostian Road,	
	ca. 1919.	26
1.4	Composite reconstructed view of the finds and stratigraphy around	
•	Paul's grave as known through nineteenth-century excavations	
	reported by Luigi Moreschi (trenches labeled NE, SE, NW, SW)	
	and Paolo Belloni (cross-hatched apse of the Constantinian basilica).	27
1.5	Reconstructed view of part of the Vatican necropolis including St.	
	Peter's trophy (against the red wall) with a clearing for pilgrims	
	(in gray) and the Constantinian apse (with hatching), ca. 320s.	30
1.6	Virginio Vespignani, opus reticulatum structure as depicted on the	
	lower half of the sheet during the 1838 excavations.	31
1.7	Reconstructed view of St. Peter's shrine in the Constantinian	
	basilica.	31
1.8	Map of Rome and its surroundings with important early Christian	
	basilicas, ca. 400.	33
1.9	Comparative view of the Constantinian basilicas at St. Paul's, St.	
	Peter's, and the Lateran.	34
1.10	Four sarcophagi originally housed in the Constantinian basilica of	
	Paul before being moved into the Theodosian one, white marble,	
	mid-fourth century.	36
2.1	Reconstructed plan with a detail of its possible relation to its	
	Constantinian predecessor, ca. 404.	46
2.2	Comparative view of the Constantinian basilicas of St. Peter and	
	at the Lateran, alongside the Theodosian basilica of St. Paul.	47
2.3	Reconstructed view of the colonnaded walkway along the Ostian	
	Road and its revamped offshoot (iter vetus) mentioned in the	
	letter of 386.	48
2.4	Bowl Base with Saints Peter and Paul Flanking a Column with the	
	Christogram of Christ, glass and gold leaf, 9.9 × 0.6 cm, late 300s.	49
	Reconstructed view of the Theodosian atrium, ca. 404.	50
2.6	Capital from the Theodosian narthex now in the Cortile del	
	Belvedere, Vatican City.	50
2.7	Matteo Greuter, central detail from S. Paolo basilica sive templum	
	divi Pauli in via ostiensi, from Giovanni Maggi's Le nove chiese di	
	Roma, engraving, ca. 1651.	51



2.8	Giovanni Colonna da Tivoli, plan of St. Paul's, pen and ink	
	drawing with wash over a graphite sketch, 1554.	52
2.9	Reconstructed view of the interior from the main door, ca. 404.	53
2.10	Gian Giacomo Machiavelli, sketched pastiche of an imagined	
	composite capital at St. Paul's, preparatory study for Seroux	
	d'Agincourt's L'Histoire de l'Art of 1823, $37 \times 25.2$ cm, 1790s.	54
2.11	Antonio Acquaroni, view up the nave following the fire, colored	
	etching, 49 × 58 cm, 1823.	55
2.12	Gian Giacomo Machiavelli, sketch of a flat-leaf composite capital,	
	preparatory study for Seroux d'Agincourt's L'Histoire de l'Art	
	of 1823, 35.8 $\times$ 22.6 cm, 1790s.	56
2.13	Giovanni Paolo Panini, detail of colorful arcades from Interior of	
	St. Paul's, oil on canvas, ca. 1750.	57
2.14	Measurements and modularity of the Theodosian basilica.	57
2.15	Francesco Barbazza, Prospetto esteriore della Basilica di S. Paolo	
	sulla Via Ostiense, from Francesco Panini's Vedute delle quattro	
	principali basiliche, etching, 47.5 × 69 cm, 1775.	59
2.16	Reconstructed section through the Theodosian basilica indicating	
	the possibility of a suspended ceiling in the side aisles.	59
2.17	Angelo Uggeri, detail of painted frieze and ceiling support holes	
	from In pristinum, from Uggeri's Della Basilica di S. Paolo sulla	
	Via Ostiense, final plate, engraving, 27.5 $\times$ 20 cm, 1823.	60
2.18	Angelo Uggeri, section across the nave looking toward the	
	triumphal arch, graphite and wash with annotations in black ink,	
	34 × 23.5 cm, 1825–1826.	61
2.19	Antonio Acquaroni, detail of ceiling attachments in transept,	
	preparatory watercolor for an etching, 37.5 $ imes$ 57.3 cm, 1823.	62
2.20	Giovanni Paolo Panini, detail showing unsavory gap above	
	triumphal arch, from <i>Interior of St. Paul's</i> , oil on canvas, ca. 1750.	63
2.21	Reconstructed view of natural lighting conditions in the	
	Theodosian transept.	64
2.22	Pietro Ruga (etcher), Andrea Alippi (surveyor), Carlo Ruspi	
	(designer), II. Spaccato della Basilica Ostiense sulla linea B,	
	from N. M. Nicolai, Della basilica di S. Paolo, plate 2,	
	etching, 1815.	65
	Reconstructed section looking toward the south, ca. 404.	66
	Reconstructed section looking toward the north, ca. 404.	67
2.25	Anonymous, Meeting of Peter and Paul from the northern nave	
	wall, watercolor, 1630s.	69
2.26	Portrait of Pope Innocent I from the southern nave wall,	
	fresco, ca. 404.	70
2.27	Anonymous, differing layouts of papal portraits on southern and	
	northern nave walls, graphite drawing, 1630s.	71



#### $xii \succ$ list of figures

2.28	Comparison of cones of view from the main door with and	
	without columns at the triumphal arch.	74
2.29	Reconstructed view of a hypothetical canopy around Paul's	
	sarcophagus (in red) with properly positioned floor inscription of	
	Gaudentius and underground sarcophagi (labeled "N" and "O"),	
	ca. 404.	75
2.30	Reconstructed view of a hypothetical canopy and enclosure	
	around Paul's sarcophagus, ca. 404.	76
2.31	Virginio Vespignani, drawing of burials "N" and "O" as reported	
	during excavations from the 1850s.	78
2.32	Pietro Ruga (etcher), Andrea Alippi (surveyor and designer),	
	detail of the mausoleum, from Pianta della Basilica di S. Paolo sulla	
	Via Ostiense, from N. M. Nicolai, Della basilica di S. Paolo, plate 1,	
	etching, 1815.	79
3.1	Inscription of Pope Leo the Great's repairs, ICUR, n.s. 2, 4783,	
	marble, 136 $\times$ 264 $\times$ 6.5–4 cm, 440–461.	84
3.2	Reconstructed view of the elevated transept and reconfigured	
	presbytery of Pope Leo the Great, ca. 461.	85
3.3	Virginio Vespignani, inscribed slabs that formed Pope Leo's mensa	
	as seen during the 1838 excavations.	86
3.4	Modern plaster cast of "PAULO APOSTOLOMART" slabs	
	scaled and overlaid onto "Vespignani Sketchbook," fol. 11r.	87
3.5	Reconstructed view of the altar and presbytery of Pope Leo the	
	Great, ca. 461.	87
3.6	Virginio Vespignani, excavation report from 1838 that includes	
	(lower portion of sheet) a frontal view from the north of the	
	"SALVS POPVLI" dedicatory inscription as seen in situ.	88
3.7	Virginio Vespignani, view from above of the grill around the main	
	area and four sarcophagi placed in its vicinity.	88
3.8	Virginio Vespignani, section and plan views of the main altar as	
	seen during the 1838 excavations that brought about its	
	dismantlement.	89
3.9	Inscribed altar with colonnettes at Sant'Alessandro outside Rome,	
	first quarter of the fifth century.	90
3.10	Paolo Belloni, plan with a hypothetical reconstructed view of the	
	Constantinian basilica.	91
3.11	The triumphal arch as it appears today following its nineteenth-	
	century restoration that retained the inscription of Galla Placidia	
	and Pope Leo (by 461) as well as a distich by Honorius added to	
	its top only in 1734.	93
3.12	Angelo Uggeri, triumphal arch and its repairs, engraving,	
	$18 \times 25 \mathrm{cm},  1827.$	95



list of figures  $\sim$   $\alpha$ 

3.13	Giovanni Ciampini, triumphal arch, from Vetera monimenta, plate	
	68, engraving, 1690.	96
3.14	Reconstructed view of the counter-façade with Pope Leo the Great's	
	marble inscription and his frescos – as they are known to us from	
	seventeenth-century watercolors – ca. 461.	97
3.15	Gian Giacomo Machiavelli, sketch of counter-façade frescos that	
	include later retouching, preparatory study for Seroux	
	d'Agincourt's L'Histoire de l'Art of 1823, 23.5 $\times$ 36.2 cm, ca. 1790s.	98
3.16	Reconstructed views of the counter-façade.	98
3.17	Antonio Acquaroni, detail of counter-façade, preparatory	
	watercolor for an etching, $37.5 \times 57.3$ cm, $1823$ .	99
3.18	Reconstructed view of Pope Gregory the Great's presbytery from	
	the northeast, ca. 604.	107
2.10	Reconstructed view of Pope Gregory the Great's presbytery and	,
3.19	crypt from the north east along with archaeological finds below	
	grade (in blue), ca. 604.	108
2.20	Comparison of Pope Gregory the Great's work at St. Peter's (left)	100
3.20		
	and at St. Paul's (right), ca. 604.	109
3.21	Reconstructed section through Pope Gregory the Great's transept,	
	presbytery, crypt, and confessio, ca. 604.	110
3.22	Inscription recounting the repairs of Eusebius, ICUR n.s. 2, 4794,	
	probably late seventh century.	114
3.23	Pietro Ruga (etcher), Andrea Alippi (surveyor and designer),	
	Pianta della Basilica di S. Paolo sulla Via Ostiense, from N. M.	
	Nicolai Della basilica di S. Paolo, plate 1, etching, 1815.	115
4.1	Aerial view of the 2009 excavations of the eighth-century	
	monastery located south of the basilica's atrium and nave (visible	
	at the top of the image), as they appeared before the construction	
	of the visitor center.	121
4.2	Inscription identifying the remains of St. Timothy, white marble,	
	$35 \times 25.8 \times 3$ –2.4 cm, eighth century.	123
4.3	Virginio Vespignani, sketch of the inscription identifying the	
	remains of Sts. Julian, Celsus, Basilissa, and Marcionilla.	123
4.4	Onofrio Panvinio, detail of the apse from a sketched plan of	
	St. Paul's liturgical furniture and other features, ink on paper,	
	ca. 1560.	123
4.5	Virginio Vespignani, sketched plan of the position of Gregory II's	5
7.3	niched <i>confessio</i> within the vaster framework of Gregory the Great's	
	altar, both of which were built atop the "PAULO	
	APOSTOLOMART" slabs.	125
16	Reconstructed view of Pope Gregory II's altar with its niched <i>confessio</i>	123
4.0	built atop the "PAULO APOSTOLOMART" slabs.	126



#### $xiv \sim$ list of figures

4.7	Pietro Ruga (etcher), Andrea Alippi (surveyor and designer),	
	detail of the bell tower but with late medieval additions to the	
	three uppermost stories, in Prospetto della Basilica di S. Paolo sulla	
	Via Ostiense, from N. M. Nicolai, Della basilica di S. Paolo, plate 5,	
	etching, 1815.	128
4.8	Reconstructed view of Pope Leo III's presbytery (815) around	
	Pope Gregory II's altar (by 730).	129
4.9	Onofrio Panvinio, roughly sketched plan of St. Paul's liturgical	
	furniture and other features, ink on paper, ca. 1560.	130
4.10	Onofrio Panvinio, more refined plan of St. Paul's liturgical	
	furniture and other features, ink on paper, ca. 1560.	130
4.11	Reconstructed view of the apse, transept and presbytery, ca. 815.	131
4.12	Map of the network of fortifications outside ninth-century Rome.	135
4.13	Giacomo Lauro, Ecclesia S. Pavli in Via Ostiensi, from Antiquae	
	urbis splendor, plate 150, engraving, 1612.	136
4.14	Reconstructed view of the tomb of Pope John XIII (d. 972).	138
5.1	Map indicating many of the possessions of the Monastery of	
	St. Paul in north-central Lazio between ca. 1050 and 1282 (left) and	
	between 1300 and 1500 (right).	144
5.2	Carlo Tabanelli, copy of the fragment of the Last Supper scene,	
	originally frescoed around 1070 in the monastery's refectory,	
	watercolor, 1916.	146
	Brass doors formerly on outward-facing main door of St. Paul's, 1070.	147
5.4	Sarcophagus of Pietro di Leone of ancient origins, but reused in	
	1128 and currently in the cloister.	149
5.5	Giuseppe Mochetti (etcher), Andrea Alippi (surveyor), Carlo	
	Ruspi (designer), Confessione di S. Paolo, from N. M. Nicolai Della	
	basilica di S. Paolo, plate 9, etching, 1815.	151
5.6	Virginio Vespignani, sketch of the archaeological excavation east	
	of the main altar as seen from above while it was being dismantled	
	in 1838.	151
5.7	Virginio Vespignani, sketch of the archaeological excavation east	
	of the main altar as seen from the dismantled open-air confessio.	152
5.8	Reconstructed view of the crypt (facing west) with the grate	
	enclosing the "mysterious sarcophagus" and an altar of	
	hypothetical appearance, ca. 1270.	153
5.9	Pietro Ruga (etcher), Andrea Alippi (surveyor), Carlo Ruspi	
	(designer), III. Spaccato della Basilica Ostiense sulla linea C,	
	from N. M. Nicolai Della basilica di S. Paolo, plate 4, etching,	
	1815.	154
5.10	Plan of the area of the transept following the addition of the	
	transverse wall, ca. 1140.	154



List of figures  $\sim$  xv

5.11	Antonio Acquaroni, view from the apse following the fire,	
	preparatory watercolor for an etching, $37.5 \times 57.3$ cm, 1823.	155
5.12	Anonymous draftsman, view of the sarcophagus of the muses – formerly along the chord of St. Paul's apse – that still preserves	
	the lion base reported by Panvinio (as seen in its subsequent	
	location in Villa Mattei).	157
5.13	Reconstructed view of the central portion of the transept and	
	apse, following the insertion of the transverse wall and new apse	
	mosaic, but before the insertion of the ciborium by Arnolfo di	
	Cambio, ca. 1280.	158
5.14	Frescoed chapterhouse of the monastery in its current guise,	
	previously called "Cappella di San Giuliano," today a ticket office	
	for the cloister.	160
5.15	Reconstructed view from the nave with the Easter candelabrum	
	and the choir hypothetically modeled on the extant example at San Clemente and some corner fragments still preserved in the	
	cloister at St. Paul's, ca. 1220.	161
5.16	Nicola d'Angelo and Pietro Vassalletto, Easter candelabrum,	101
J.10	ca. 1190.	162
5.17	Apse mosaic in its current guise, following the major nineteenth-	
	century restoration.	163
5.18	Detail of etimasia motif in the apse, with the arma Christi, Abbot	
	Iohannes Gaetani, Adinulphus the sexton, and the five Holy	
	Innocents, restored but originally installed 1208–ca. 1230.	165
5.19	Cloister of St. Paul's monastery, originally completed 1233.	166
	Portrait of Pope Anacletus, fresco, 1277–1280.	167
5.21	Arnolfo di Cambio, ciborium over the main altar and tomb of	
	St. Paul, originally installed 1285.	168
5.22	Detail of the donation scene on the ciborium with Abbot	
	Bartholomew (left) and St. Paul (right), 1285.	169
5.23	Anonymous, copy of fresco of Sts. Peter and Paul and their	
	respective citadels with Abbot Bartholomew, watercolor, 1630s.	170
5.24	Reconstructed view of the triumphal arch including Abbot	
	Bartholomew's pictures of Sts. Peter and Paul and a simplified representation of the ciborium commissioned to Arnolfo di	
	Cambio in 1285.	171
5 25	Anonymous, copy of the façade mosaic, watercolor, $38 \times 108$ cm,	1/1
J.2J	nineteenth century.	173
5.26	Anonymous, copy of the façade mosaic, red-chalk drawing on	-/3
	paper, $30.4 \times 42.4$ cm, seventeenth century.	174
5.27	Anonymous, mosaic icon of mother and child, first half of the	. •
•	thirteenth century.	176



#### $xvi \sim$ list of figures

5.28	Giovanni Guerra and Cesare Nebbia, scene of Stational Mass at St	
	Paul's, from the Salone Sistino of the Biblioteca Apostolica	
	Vaticana (now part of the Vatican Museums), 1588–1589.	176
5.29	Anonymous, sculpted crucifix, wood, 1310.	177
5.30	Anonymous, polychrome statue of St. Paul, wood, late thirteenth	
	or early fourteenth century.	178
5.31	Paolo Romano, statue of Pope Boniface IX, marble, ca. 1400.	178
5.32	Reconstructed view of the counter-façade, ca. 1400.	179
6.1	Anonymous, copy of fresco of Paul Preaching in Jerusalem,	
	watercolor, 1630s.	184
6.2	Anonymous, copy of fresco of Paul Preaching, watercolor, 1630s.	185
6.3	Plan (abbreviated) with altars and their dedications, ca. 1570.	187
6.4	Reconstructed liturgical arrangement of the transept and its	
	vicinity, ca. 1570.	188
6.5	A. Costa, Altare [of St. Luke] nella basilica di S. Paolo sulla Via	
	Ostiense, also known as the altar commissioned by Cardinal de	
	Pereriis, from Francesco Maria Tosi's Raccolta di monumenti sacri e	
	sepolcrali, vol. 4, plate 116, etching, 44.5 $ imes$ 29.2 cm, 1840s.	190
6.6	Reconstructed liturgical arrangement of the transept and its	
	vicinity, ca. 1590.	194
6.7	Penel, Détails divers de la Basilique de St Paul, from Paul-Marie	
	Letarouilly's Édifices de Rome Moderne, III, plate 336, lithograph,	
	$33.5 \times 42.5$ cm, $1825-1827$ .	194
6.8	Anonymous, suspended ceiling planned over the nave, drawing on	
	six glued sheets, 137 $ imes$ 37.5 cm, 1585–1590.	195
6.9	Reconstructed view of the transept and presbytery with the open-	
	air confessio, statue of St. Bridget and the pair of new altars against	
	the transverse wall, ca. 1600.	197
6.10	Stefano Maderno, Statue of St. Bridget, marble, late 1590s.	198
6.11	Reconstructed view "from Christ's eyes" toward the open-air	
	confessio and statue of St. Bridget with niches for statues of female	
	saints along the transept wall, ca. 1650.	199
6.12	Reconstructed view "from St. Bridget's eyes" toward the altar of	
	the crucifix, ca. 1600.	201
6.13	Angelo Uggeri, Paralello [sic] istorico del abside Ostiense, rovina,	
	colored engraving, 41 $\times$ 29 cm, 1833.	202
6.14	Reconstructed view of the apse, ca. 1610.	203
6.15	Pietro Ruga (etcher), Andrea Alippi (surveyor), Carlo Ruspi	
	(designer), Spaccato della Basilica Ostiense sulla linea A.A., from	
	N. M. Nicolai, Della basilica di S. Paolo, plate 2, etching, 1815.	204
6.16	Reconstructed view of the northeast side chapel in the transept	
	with altar and altarpiece of St. Benedict, ca. 1600.	204



list of figures  $\sim$  xvii

6.17	Reconstructed view of the altars flanking the main entrance,	
	ca. 1600.	206
6.18	Giuseppe Vasi, Basilica e Monasterio di S. Paolo fuori le mura, from	
	Delle Magnificenze di Roma antica e moderna, libro V, plate 100,	
	etching, 21.2 × 32 cm, 1764.	206
6.19	Matteo Greuter, S. Paolo Basilica sive templum divi Pauli in via	
	ostiensi, from Giovanni Maggi's Le dieci basiliche del giubileo,	
	engraving, 40.5 × 55 cm, 1625.	207
5.20	Inscription currently below kneeling statue of St. Bridget (formerly	
	beneath her standing statue set against the triumphal arch wall), 1650.	209
6.21	Francesco Righi?, plan of St. Paul's, graphite on paper, $46.6 \times 22.8$	
	[at apse], 23.2 cm [at atrium], 1654.	210
6.22	Carlo Rainaldi?, plan of St Paul's, graphite under colored washes	
	on paper, 139.7 $\times$ 39 [smallest width] $\times$ 50.7 cm [largest width],	
	1654.	211
6.23	Carlo Rainaldi?, detail of Albertina AZ 705, top left of sheet with	
	chapels, candelabrum, and inscription north of the transept.	212
5.24	Carlo Rainaldi?, detail of Albertina AZ 705 with entrance portal,	
	curved lines, and compass point marks.	213
6.25	Francesco Borromini (possibly reworked by Bernardo Castelli	
	Borromini), plan for major reconstruction of St. Paul's, graphite	
	on paper, 72.6 × 46.8 cm, ca. 1654–1655.	214
5.26	Anonymous, project to straighten the Tiber near St. Paul's.	216
7.1	Giovanni Paolo Panini, Interior of the Church of San Paolo Fuori le	
	Mura, Rome, oil on canvas, 74 × 98 cm, ca. 1750.	220
7.2	Giovanni Battista Piranesi, Spaccato interno della Basilica di	
	S. Paolo fuori delle Mura, from Vedute di Roma, plate 9, etching,	
	41 × 61 cm, 1748–1749.	221
7.3	Girolamo Toma, Pianta della Basilica di S. Paolo ridotta in forma	
	moderna (winning proposal for the Concorso Clementino, second	
	class), pen and ink on paper, 46.9 $ imes$ 71.8 cm, 1758.	222
7.4	Girolamo Toma, Spaccato per longo della chiesa, portico e campanile	
	(winning proposal for the Concorso Clementino, second class),	
	pen and ink on paper, 71.6 $ imes$ 46.4 cm, 1758.	223
7.5	Giuseppe Mochetti (etcher), Andrea Alippi (surveyor), Carlo	
	Ruspi (designer), Mosaico del prospetto, from N. M. Nicolai, Della	
	basilica di S. Paolo, plate 6, etching, 1815.	224
7.6	Pietro Ruga (etcher), Andrea Alippi (surveyor), Carlo Ruspi	
	(designer), detail of II. Spaccato della Basilica Ostiense sulla linea B,	
	with eighteenth-century depiction of emperors flanking the	
	triumphal arch, from N. M. Nicolai, Della basilica di S. Paolo, plate	
	3, etching, 1815.	225



#### xviii $\, \succ \,$ list of figures

7.7	Giovanni Michele Knapp, Veduta dell'interno della Basilica di	
	S. Paolo presa dalla tribuna, from C. C. T. Bunsen's Die Basiliken	
	des Christlichen Roms nach ihrem Zusammenhange, pl. VI, etching,	
	$33.5 \times 46.4  \text{cm},  1843.$	227
7.8	Angelo Uggeri, <i>In pristinum</i> , with portrait of Pius VII atop the first	
	column, from Uggeri's Della Basilica di S. Paolo sulla Via	
	Ostiense, final plate, engraving, 27.5 $ imes$ 20 cm, 1823.	227
7.9	Anonymous, detail of a survey of the sloped nave floor before and	
	after the nineteenth-century reconstruction, graphite and black	
	ink on paper, 40 $\times$ 54 cm, 1840s.	228
7.10	Cloister of St. Paul's with inscriptions formerly in the basilica.	230
	Antonio Acquaroni, detail with the candelabrum from a preparatory	
	watercolor for an etching, 1823.	231
7.12	Francesco Barbazza (based on an unknown painting by G.P.	
	Panini), detail from Prospetto esteriore della basilica di S. Paolo sulla	
	Via Ostiense, from Francesco Panini's Vedute delle quattro principali	
	basiliche, etching, 1775.	232
7.13	Pietro Ruga (etcher), Andrea Alippi (surveyor and designer),	3
,5	Prospetto della Basilica di S. Paolo sulla Via Ostiense, from N. M.	
	Nicolai, Della basilica di S. Paolo, plate 5, etching, 1815.	233
7.14	Reconstructed view of the eighteenth-century atrium and narthex,	-33
/ ·- I	ca. 1730.	234
7.15	Giuseppe Vasi, Veduta interna del portico avanti l'ingresso della	-37
/ • - 3	Basilica di S. Paolo, from Francesco Panini's Vedute delle quattro	
	principali basiliche, etching, 47 × 68 cm, 1775.	234
7 16	Reconstructed view of the narthex with brass door, open Holy	234
/ <b>.1</b> 0	Door with view of Pope John XIII's tomb and with Pietro di	
	Leone's sarcophagus, ca. 1750.	235
7 17	Giovanni Battista Piranesi, Veduta della Basilica di S. Paolo fuor	233
/•1/	delle mura, from Vedute di Roma, pl. 8, etching, 38 × 61 cm, 1748.	236
7 18	Giovanni Battista Piranesi, Veduta della Basilica di S. Paolo fuor	230
/.10	delle mura, from Vedute di Roma, pl. 8, etching, 38 × 61 cm,	
	1757–1758.	236
7.10	Interior view of the Chapel of the Crucifix.	238
	Pietro Ruga (etcher), Andrea Alippi (surveyor and designer),	230
/.20	detail of chapel of the Crucifix, from Pianta della Basilica di	
	•	
	S. Paolo sulla Via Ostiense, from N. M. Nicolai, Della basilica di	
	S. Paolo, plate 1, etching, 1815.	239
7.21	Pietro Ruga (etcher), Andrea Alippi (surveyor and designer),	
	detail of the baptistery, from Pianta della Basilica di S. Paolo sulla	
	Via Ostiense, from N. M. Nicolai, Della basilica di S. Paolo, plate 1,	
	etching, 1815.	240



list of figures  $\sim$   $\sin$ 

7.22	Nicola Salvi, section drawing of the proposal for St. Paul's baptistery, pen and brown ink, gray and yellow-pink wash on	
	heavy ivory paper, $53.3 \times 39$ cm, ca. 1728.	240
7.22	Anonymous, view of the baptistery at St. Paul's, graphite on heavy	240
7.23	paper, $28 \times 22$ cm, second half of eighteenth-century.	2.41
<b>5</b> 2 4	Nicola Salvi and Antonio Arrighi, baptismal font originally from	241
7.24		
	St. Paul's, now at Abbey of Morimondo (MI), marble, wood, and	
	bronze, 1728.	241
7.25	Reconstructed view of the presbytery enclosure, bronze	
	decoration on the altar, and one of two imperial depictions	
	flanking the triumphal arch, ca. 1790.	242
7.26	Composite overlay of Albertina AZ 705 (Carlo Rainaldi?) and the	
	plan of St Paul's (by Andrea Alippi).	243
E.1	Ascanio Conte di Brazzà, Incendio di S. Paolo, lithograph, 25.5 $\times$	
	30 cm, 1824.	247
E.2	Antonio Sarti, Veduta interna degli avanzi dell'incendiata basilica di	
	S. Paolo, from Interni di varie chiese di Roma, in 6 stampe, etching,	
	53.5 × 70 cm, 1827.	248
E.3	Léopold Louis Robert, interior of St. Paul's after the fire, oil on	
	canvas, 102 × 82.4 cm, 1824.	249
E.4	Anonymous, Charles Bouton's new diorama building in Paris with	
	his tableaux of St. Paul's.	250
E.5	Giuseppe Bianchi, Progetto della riedificazione della Chiesa di	
J	S. Paolo di Giuseppe Valadier, from Giornale delle belle arti, anno I,	
	Tav. 5, etching, $31.5 \times 26$ cm, $1830$ .	251
F.6	Charles Vertray, River crossing by the French at St. Paul's,	-31
	lithograph, 1849.	252
F 7	Francesco Grandi, Solenne consacrazione dell'altare detto della	232
<b>L</b> ./	confessione nella basilica di S. Paolo la nave traversa, 1840.	252
Εο	Marina Docci, overlaid plans of old (red) and new (black) basilicas.	253
		254
E.9	Angelo Uggeri, Tavola chronologica e proposizione prima, graphite	
г	black ink and wash on paper, $39 \times 55$ cm, $1826$ .	255
E.10	Pasquale Belli, Spaccato per lungo della Basilica di San Paolo sulla	
	linea A-B, pen and ink with watercolor, 74.3 × 103.2 cm, 1830.	256
E.11	D. G. Francesco, flooded nave at New St. Paul's, early photograph,	
_	December 1, 1900.	257
E.12	Anonymous, Basilique de S. Paul, etching, ca. 1850. Shows new	
	basilica (at rear) with the eighteenth-century façade still in place.	258
E.13	Luigi Poletti, elevation and section of façade / counter-façade,	
	drawing, graphite, black ink and two-toned wash, 55 $\times$ 77 cm, 1840s.	258
E.14	Anonymous, photograph of the façade before the completion of	
	the narthex and after 1875.	259



#### $xx \sim$ list of figures

E.15	Contemporary view of the transept with a portion of mosaic	
	formerly from the façade.	260
E.16	Pezzini, Chiostri d'Italia: nella Basilica di S. Paolo a Roma, photograph	
	of the cloister includes thin panels with figures on them (portions of	
	the detached nave frescos?), from "Le vie d'Italia," XII, May 1934.	261
E.17	Postcard of the northern portico of the new basilica, probably first	
	quarter of the twentieth century.	262
E.18	Inscribed column of Pope Siricius after being slimmed down,	
	topped by a new capital and moved to the northern portico.	263
E.19	Atrium of St. Paul's, today.	264
E.20	Reconstructed view of the transept before the fire, ca. 1822.	266
	View of the transept, as seen from a secret window in the	
	monastery's night chapel.	267
A.1	Detail of select structures that accumulated around the tomb of	
	St. Paul between 404 and 1823.	271
A.2	Annotated version of Virginio Vespignani's drawing. Fondo	
	Lanciani, BIASA, MS Lanciani 2 ("Vespignani's Sketchbook"),	
	fol. 1r, 1838.	274
A.3	Annotated version of Virginio Vespignani's drawing. Fondo	
	Lanciani, BIASA, MS Lanciani 2 ("Vespignani's Sketchbook"),	
	fols. 2v and 3r, 1838.	275
A.4	Annotated version of Virginio Vespignani's drawing. Fondo	
	Lanciani, BIASA, MS Lanciani 2 ("Vespignani's Sketchbook"),	
	fols. 6v and 7r.	275
A.5	Annotated version of a detail from Virginio Vespignani's drawing.	
	Fondo Lanciani, BIASA, MS Lanciani 2 ("Vespignani's	
	Sketchbook"), fol. 7r.	276
A.6	Annotated version of Virginio Vespignani's drawing. Fondo	
	Lanciani, BIASA, MS Lanciani 2 ("Vespignani's Sketchbook"),	
	fols. 7v and 8r.	276
A.7	Annotated version of Virginio Vespignani's drawing. Fondo	
	Lanciani, BIASA, MS Lanciani 2 ("Vespignani's Sketchbook"),	
	fols. 8v and 9r.	277
A.8	Annotated version of Virginio Vespignani's drawing. Fondo	
	Lanciani, BIASA, MS Lanciani 2 ("Vespignani's Sketchbook"),	
	fols. 9v and 10r.	277
A.9	Annotated version of Virginio Vespignani's drawing. Fondo	
	Lanciani, BIASA, MS Lanciani 2 ("Vespignani's Sketchbook"),	
	fols. 10v and 11r.	278
A.10	Annotated version of Virginio Vespignani's drawing. Fondo	
	Lanciani, BIASA, MS Lanciani 2 ("Vespignani's Sketchbook"),	
	fols. 11v and 12r.	278



list of figures  $\sim$  xxi

A.11	Annotated version of Virginio Vespignani's drawing. Fondo		
	Lanciani, BIASA, MS Lanciani 2 ("Vespignani's Sketchbook"),		
	fols. 14v and 15r.	279	
A.12	Annotated version of Virginio Vespignani's drawing. Fondo		
	Lanciani, BIASA, MS Lanciani 67 ("Vespignani's Scrapbook"),		
	fol. 40.	279	
A.13	Annotated version of Virginio Vespignani's drawing. Fondo		
	Lanciani, BIASA, MS Lanciani 67 ("Vespignani's Scrapbook"),		
	fol. 42.	280	





### ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

have studied the Roman Basilica of St. Paul's Outside the Walls for nearly fifteen years and, along the way, received funds, advice, and encouragement, as well as compliments and critiques, from more people than can be possibly mentioned here. That said, I will do my best.

Financial support for this study was provided by the University of Oregon (Dean Frances Bronet and the Department of Art and Architectural History), the Neukom Institute for Computational Science at Dartmouth College (Daniel Rockmore), the Dartmouth College Associate Dean of Arts and Humanities (Barbara Will), and the Barr Ferree Fund of Princeton University's Department of Art and Archaeology (Michael Koortbojian and Susan Lehre). These grants greatly subsidized the costs of producing the digital model, ordering the images, obtaining publication rights, and getting the book published.

This project began as a dissertation advised by the late Danny Ćurčić, whose mentorship during my early, tentative forays into scholarly research was exemplary. He suggested the topic of St. Paul's, first helped me give shape to the research, and, I believe, would have taken great pride in reading this book. At Princeton, I also had the pleasure of working with and drawing advice from John Pinto, who never hesitates to deploy his encyclopedic knowledge of Rome with acuity and good spirit. A key figure in transforming the dissertation into this book has been Herbert Kessler, whose encouragements and curiosity have been an inspiration. I owe these three scholars a debt of gratitude that I can only

∼ xxiii



#### xxiv > ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

hope to repay by following their example and inspiring future generations of scholars.

At Dartmouth College's Leslie Center for the Humanities, under the directorship of Graziella Parati, I had the opportunity to share my book manuscript with a very generous team of reviewers that included Dottie Metzger Habel, Caroline Bruzelius, Cecilia Gaposchkin, and Monika Otter, as well as Ada Cohen and Mary Coffey from my own department. This process of review and frank conversation enhanced the book immeasurably. For that matter, all my colleagues at the college have been wonderfully supportive, but I wish to single out Joy Kenseth, Allen Hockley, Katie Hornstein, Christopher MacEvitt, Adrian Randolph, Viktor Witkowski, Samantha Potter, and Janice Chapman Allen for their unwavering help. My students at Louisiana State University, University of Oregon, and Dartmouth College have kept my feet on the ground.

For the most part, this book treats a basilica that was lost to a devastating fire in 1823. To study such a "virtual" building, I have created a number of digital models that reconstruct what was where, and when in the history of St. Paul's. Developing these computer models has been a collaboration process - a welcome counterpart to the more solitary task of writing. I am grateful to Justin Kaden for beginning the work in 2010 and to Evan Gallitelli for bringing it to completion in all of its complexity. Both are now practicing architects, and it is nice to think that some part of this wondrous building informs their designs. Additionally, Evan deserves special mention for attentively curating and preparing most of the book's custom-made images. Technical consultation, expertise, and labor were also provided by Coleman Barnes, Alex Weinberg, Adam Horbinski, Nathan Schultze, Scott Warneke, and, most recently, Ty Austin. At Dartmouth, the project advanced in no small way thanks to George Morris, Stephen Gaughan, and Douglas Hill, who helped establish the website, where the models can be viewed and downloaded. The website can be visited at https://Dartgo.org/virtualbasilica

or at the archived and permanent address https://n2t.net/ark:/81428/v81593. For photographic and technical support, I thank Federico Caruso and Atticus Kangas.

In the Eternal City, I have also received support from Rosanna Barbera, Leonardo di Blasi, Giulia Bordi, Giuseppe Bonaccorso, Evandro Correia, Marina Docci, Elizabeth Kieven, Adriano La Regina, Roberto Luongo, Cecilia Mazzetti, Massimo Pomponi, Paolo Portoghesi, Georg Schelbert, Michael Schmitz, Lucrezia Spera, Umberto Utro, and most especially Giorgio Filippi - one of the people without whom this book simply would not exist. His generosity and infectious enthusiasm for all things St. Paul are rare but splendid gifts. At the basilica, the archpriest, His Eminence Cardinal James Michael Harvey, and Vincenzo Coraggio have encouraged and facilitated my studies. In a similar manner, at the adjacent monastery, abbots Paolo Lunardon, Edmund Power, and Roberto Dotta, as well as the archivist Don Francesco, have been welcoming and supportive. It is nice to know that the site is in good hands. On a daily basis, the upkeep has become the onus of the custodians of the basilica, who were always willing to open a hatch, provide a ladder, or lend a flashlight. My thanks to them, too.

Other colleagues spread across the globe - and beyond – have been patient listeners, impromptu translation advisors, and wise friends. They include: Christy Anderson, Katherine Bentz, Bettina Bergmann, Sible de Blaauw, Claudia Bolgia, Robert Bork, Caryn Brause, Catherine Carver, Naomi Darling, Michael Davis, David Eastman, David Friedman, Adam Gitner, Dorothy Glass, Robert Glass, Elie Goodman, James Harper, John Herrmann, Marius Hauknes, Janna Israel, Liliana Leopardi, Dale Kinney, Janet Marquardt, Petra McGillen, Chloe Miller, Daniela Mondini, Jennifer Montagu, Al Narath, Kristofer Neville, Kirstin Noreen, Alison Perchuk, Pietro del Pero, Dana Prescott, Manu Radhakrishnan, Katherine Rinne, Schreiber, Andrew Schulz,



ACKNOWLEDGMENTS  $\sim$  XXV

Senekovic, Erik Steiner, Mike Sullivan, Giovanni Svevo, James Tice, Geoffrey Taylor, Herica Valladares, the late John Variano, Justin Walsh, Wendy Watson, Richard Wittman, Dena Woodall, Nino Zchomelidse, and the late Mark Zucker.

Incredibly valuable and practical suggestions were offered by my editor, Beatrice Rehl, by the staff at Cambridge University Press, including Katherine Barbaro, Kevin Eagan, Catherine Kuruvilla Jacob, Robert Swanson, and by my two anonymous peer reviewers. Yes, it is their job, but they did it well. Despite their best efforts, the responsibility for any shortcomings are mine.

Books are seldom written without the support of one's closest relations. When I got married, I acquired a wonderful new family. I have received much encouragement from Charles Maier and the late Pauline Maier, from Andrea Maier, Deborah O'Halloran, and Anne Sa'adah. My family has shown earnest interest in this project and in my career for more years than I care to count. The constant love and advice of my parents (Giovanni and Helena) helped me maintain a healthy perspective. While writing this book, I became a father not once, but twice. Raising Matteo and Marco and having them in our lives has given a new outlook and a deeper meaning to everything, including this project. Finally, my true companion in life is Jessica, and it is to her that I dedicate this book.

