

The Ethics of Multiple Citizenship

Citizenship is no longer an exclusive relationship. Many people today are citizens of multiple countries, whether by birth, naturalization, or even through monetary means, with schemes fast-tracking citizenship applications from foreigners making large investments in the state. Moral problems surround each of those ways of acquiring a second citizenship, while retaining one's original citizenship. Multiple citizenship can also have morally problematic consequences for the coherence of collective decisions, for the constitution of the demos, and for global inequality. The phenomenon of multiple citizenship and its ramifications remains understudied, despite its magnitude and political importance. In this innovative book, Ana Tanasoca explores these issues and shows how they could be avoided by unbundling the rights that currently come with citizenship and allocating them separately. It will appeal to scholars and students of normative political theory, citizenship, global justice, and migration in political science, law, and sociology.

ANA TANASOCA is a postdoctoral research fellow at the Centre for Deliberative Democracy and Global Governance, University of Canberra. Broadly interested in analytic normative political theory, her principal current research project explores the moral and epistemic dimensions of deliberation. Her work has been published in the *European Journal of Sociology*, the *Australasian Journal of Philosophy*, and *Moral Philosophy and Politics*.

Contemporary Political Theory

Series Editor

Ian Shapiro

Editorial Board

Russell Hardin† Stephen Holmes Jeffrey Isaac

John Keane Elizabeth Kiss Susan Okin†

Phillipe Van Parijs Philip Pettit

As the twenty-first century begins, major new political challenges have arisen at the same time as some of the most enduring dilemmas of political association remain unresolved. The collapse of communism and the end of the Cold War reflect a victory for democratic and liberal values, yet in many of the Western countries that nurtured those values there are severe problems of urban decay, class and racial conflict, and failing political legitimacy. Enduring global injustice and inequality seem compounded by environmental problems, disease, the oppression of women and racial, ethnic, and religious minorities and the relentless growth of the world's population. In such circumstances, the need for creative thinking about the fundamentals of human political association is manifest. This new series in contemporary political theory is needed to foster such systematic normative reflection.

The series proceeds in the belief that the time is ripe for a reassertion of the importance of problem-driven political theory. It is concerned, that is, with works that are motivated by the impulse to understand, think critically about, and address the problems in the world, rather than issues that are thrown up primarily in academic debate. Books in the series may be interdisciplinary in character, ranging over issues conventionally dealt with in philosophy, law, history, and the human sciences. The range of materials and the methods of proceeding should be dictated by the problem at hand, not the conventional debates or disciplinary divisions of academia.

Other books in the series

Ian Shapiro and Casiano Hacker-Cordón (eds.)
Democracy's Value

Ian Shapiro and Casiano Hacker-Cordón (eds.)
Democracy's Edges

Brooke A. Ackerly
Political Theory and Feminist Social Criticism

Clarissa Rile Hayward
De-Facing Power

John Kane
The Politics of Moral Capital

Ayelet Shachar
Multicultural Jurisdictions

John Keane
Global Civil Society?

Rogers M. Smith
Stories of Peoplehood

Gerry Mackie
Democracy Defended

John Keane
Violence and Democracy

Kok-Chor Tan
Justice without Borders

Peter J. Steinberger
The Idea of the State

Michael Taylor
Rationality and the Ideology of Disconnection

Sarah Song
Justice, Gender, and the Politics of Multiculturalism

Georgia Warnke
After Identity

Courtney Jung
The Moral Force of Indigenous Politics

Sonu Bedi
Rejecting Rights

Richard Vernon
Cosmopolitan Regard

Lawrence Hamilton
Freedom is Power

Jonathan Floyd
Is Political Philosophy Impossible?

The Ethics of Multiple Citizenship

Ana Tanasoca
University of Canberra



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42915-3 — The Ethics of Multiple Citizenship
Ana Tanasoca
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108429153
DOI: 10.1017/9781108554176

© Ana Tanasoca 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed and bound in Great Britain by Clays Ltd, Elcograf S.p.A.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Tanasoca, Ana, 1986- author.

Title: The ethics of multiple citizenship / Ana Tanasoca.

Description: Cambridge [UK] ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2018. | Series: Contemporary political theory | Originally presented as the author's thesis (doctoral)—University of Essex, 2015. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2018009352 | ISBN 9781108429153 (hardback)

Subjects: LCSH: Dual nationality. | Citizenship. | Conflict of laws—Citizenship.

Classification: LCC K7128.D8 T36 2018 | DDC 172/.1—dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2018009352>

ISBN 978-1-108-42915-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

To my parents, Doina and Sandu Tanasoca

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	page xii
<i>List of Tables</i>	xiii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xiv
1 Introduction	1
I The Legal History of Multiple Citizenship	2
II Academic Reception and Debates	3
A What Will Be Said	4
B What Has Been Said	5
III The Arguments to Come	10
Part I Acquisition	15
2 Multiple Citizenship by Birthright	17
I The Efficiency Argument behind Birthright	20
II What, If Not Efficiency, Could Justify Birthright Multiple Nationality?	22
A <i>jus Soli</i>	23
B <i>jus Sanguinis</i>	28
C Reform	34
III Conclusion	35
3 Multiple Citizenship by Naturalization	36
I Legal Framework	38
II Against the Citizenship Renunciation Requirement	38
III In Defence of the Citizenship Renunciation Requirement	41
A The Demands of Consistency	41
B No Different from Other Conditions	43
C Not like the Other Conditions: What Is Permissible and What Is Not	43
D Acting against One's Interest	45
E Loss Aversion	46
IV Default Rules and Dual Citizenship	47
A What Are Default Rules?	48
B Dual Citizenship by Default	49
C Reform	52
	ix

x	Contents	
4	Multiple Citizenship by Investment	55
I	The Rise of Economic Citizenship	56
II	Selling Honours: The Historical Record	58
III	Lessons from the Sale of Honours	60
A	Merit and Reciprocity	60
B	Fairness	66
C	Signalling	68
D	Social Values and Meanings	72
E	Political Consequences	75
IV	A Clarification	79
V	Conclusion	80
	Part II Consequences	83
5	Multiple Citizenship and Collective Decision Making	85
I	Multiple Citizens as Political Agents	86
II	Voting, Deliberation, and Collective Rationality	89
A	The Condorcet Paradox: How Majority Rule Can Yield Inconsistent Collective Decisions	89
B	From Aggregating Preferences to Aggregating Judgements	90
C	Why Consistency Matters	92
D	Avoiding Inconsistency: Single-Peaked Preferences, Unidimensionally Aligned Judgements	92
E	The Need for Structured Disagreement or Meta-Agreement	94
F	Structuring Disagreement through Deliberation	96
G	Recap and the Role of Citizenship	97
III	How Multiple Citizenship Could Undermine Collective Rationality	99
A	Deciding in Two Countries	99
B	A Perceptual Analogy	106
IV	Conclusion	110
6	Multiple Citizenship and the Boundary Problem	112
I	Three Boundary-Drawing Principles: Affectedness, Subjection to Law, and Unaffectedness	114
A	The Affected Interests Principle	114
B	The Legally Subjected Principle	116
C	The Unaffected Interests Principle	117
II	Multiple Citizenship and Boundaries: An Assessment	119
A	The Affected Interests Principle	119
B	The Legally Subjected Principle	124
C	The Unaffected Interests Principle	126
III	Untying the Gordian Knot: Citizenship- <i>sine</i> -Political Rights, Political Rights- <i>sine</i> -Citizenship	129
7	Taxing Multiple Citizens and Global Inequality	134
I	Citizenship and Global Inequality	135
II	Multiple Citizenship, Inequality, and the Birthright Levy	136
III	Interactive Effects, Extra-Benefits, and Double Taxation Agreements	138
A	What Do Double Taxation Agreements Entail for Dual Citizens?	140

	Contents	xi
IV	Impact on Global Inequality	142
	A The Poor Do Not Move	143
	B Dual Citizens Reside in and Pay Taxes to the Richer of Their Countries	144
V	Solutions	146
	A A Levy on Multiple Citizenship	147
	B Alter Double Taxation Agreements	148
VI	Objections to the Proposed Solutions	149
	A People Would Renounce Their Additional Citizenships	149
	B Countries Would Close Borders to Immigrants from Poor Countries	150
	C The Money Will End Up in the Wrong Hands	151
VII	An Implementation Strategy	153
VIII	Conclusion	157
8	Conclusion	158
	I The Promises	158
	II Debunking the Myth: Broken Promises	159
	III A Reprise of Policy Proposals	162
	IV Unbundling Citizenship	163
	A Institutional Design Options	165
	B Advantages and Disadvantages	167
	V Conclusion to the Conclusion	177
	<i>Bibliography</i>	178
	<i>Index</i>	197

Figures

5.1 K 's single-peaked preference profile in A	<i>page</i> 102
5.2 K 's non-single-peaked preference profile in B	102
5.3 'Kaninchen und Ente' ('Rabbit and Duck'), the earliest known version of the duck-rabbit illusion, from the October 23, 1892, issue of <i>Fliegende Blätter</i>	107

Tables

5.1 Aggregating judgements	<i>page</i> 91
6.1 What gets distributed to whom in the unbundling	132

Acknowledgements

This book stems from a 2015 PhD dissertation in normative political theory, written during the three years I spent as a PhD student in the Department of Government, at the University of Essex. I thank the department for its support during those years and for allowing me to be surrounded by great minds.

The introductory and concluding chapters of this book were written during my completion year that I spent as a visitor at the Philosophy Department, Australian National University. I thank the members of the department for their hospitality, which allowed me to complete this manuscript.

My greatest gratitude goes to those who guided my steps through my PhD. I thank the members of my supervisory board, Paul Bou-Habib, Avia Pasternak, and Jeffrey Howard, for the very generous and helpful comments and suggestions they offered during my PhD. While they did not always agree with everything that I wrote, they always provided important feedback. But this book would not have been possible without one person in particular: my supervisor Bob Goodin. My greatest thanks go to him for his invaluable advice, patience, and reassurance and for believing in me. His sharp comments and objections constantly challenged me and helped improve each chapter. Thank you for cultivating my mind – the way I think, the way I write – but also for putting up with my constant worries (rightly dismissed as wasted time!) and innumerable questions about academic life. Thanks are also due to Christian Barry and Todd Landman, who served as examiners and who offered advice on how to best transform the thesis into a book. Many thanks also to John Dryzek, who encouraged me to publish my dissertation and allowed me the time to do so. I am also grateful to Joseph Carens, who was very kind to share with me his draft chapters of *The Ethics of Immigration*.

I am also very grateful to the anonymous referees for Cambridge University Press. Their comments and suggestions proved extremely useful while doing the final revisions to the book manuscript. Thanks also to John Haslam and Toby Ginsberg at Cambridge University Press

for guidance through the publication process and to their team for their help in making ready the manuscript for publication.

Two chapters of this book are based on articles that have been previously published: Chapter 4 is based on an article entitled ‘Citizenship for sale: neomedieval, not just neoliberal?’, published in *Archives Européennes de Sociologie/European Journal of Sociology*, vol. 57 (April 2016), 169–95. Chapter 6 is based on an article entitled ‘Double taxation, multiple citizenship and global inequality’, published in *Moral Philosophy and Politics*, vol. 1 (2014), 147–69. I thank the publishers and editors of these journals for allowing me to reproduce these articles in revised form.

Drafts of some chapters were presented to audiences at the University of Essex, Sciences Po Paris, University of Luzern, Sorbonne-Paris I, Social and Political Sciences at the University of Sydney, and the Sydney Law School. I thank the organizers of these conferences for giving me the opportunity to present my work and the audiences for their questions and comments.

Last, I thank my mother for letting me make my own decisions from a very young age. Her encouraging me to always pursue what makes me happy made this book possible in no small part.

