Introduction: America and the 'Way to the Devil'

It was under these circumstances that I resolved to go to America – on my way to the Devil. Charles Dickens, 'The Holly-Tree: Three Branches' (1855)¹

'By a special arrangement with me and my English Publishers', ran a notice attached to the American edition of Dickens's 'The Holly-Tree', 'MESSRS. TICKNOR AND FIELDS, of Boston, have become the only authorized representatives in America of the whole series of my books'.² Like the patented swoosh on a trainer, or the chef's signature on a supermarket meal, this sentence offers a guarantee of authenticity in the face of a local mass of counterfeits. Writing a few decades before the arrival of international copyright law (with the Chace Act of 1891), Dickens was unable to launch a case against the American book pirates; instead, he penned a long series of essays, open letters and stories, tracing the moral cost of cultural inauthenticity. Upon visiting the New World for the first time in 1842, he had dismissed it as a 'foul growth' whose people don't 'care for poetry', the roots of their malaise lying 'deep in its licentious press'.³ By 1855, with the fictional landscape of 'The Holly-Tree', things grew darker still, the territory across the Atlantic yawning open as a pathway to hell. 'I was not going that way to the Devil', his narrator reminds us, 'but by the American route'.⁴

The notion of antebellum America as a site of essential (and diabolical) inauthenticity can be found in the margins of *Sincerity and*

¹ Charles Dickens, *The Uncommercial Traveller, and Additional Christmas Stories* ([1855] Boston, MA: Fields, Osgood, & Co., Successors to Ticknor and Fields, 1869), p. 290.

² Ibid., copyright page.

³ Charles Dickens, *American Notes* ([1842] London: Penguin Classics, 2000), p. 268. Andrew Burke argues that this punningly titled work presents America as a 'land of counterfeits and confidence tricksters, and crafts an analogy between pirated texts and forged banknotes'. Andrew Burke 'Purloined Pleasures: Dickens, Currency, and Copyright', *Dickens Studies Annual*, 41 (2010), p. 61.

⁴ Dickens ([1855] 1869), p. 293.

2

Counterfeit Culture

Authenticity, Lionel Trilling's celebrated series of lectures on the subject, delivered at Harvard in 1969-70. Describing Emerson's 'happy surprise over the sincerity of the English', the critic wonders what the writer must have been 'used to in his native land, what sinister subtleties of dissimulation had been practised upon him in Concord, Massachusetts'.5 For Trilling, the difference between English and American attitudes to authenticity is actually rather straightforward, and more social than supernatural:

the American self can be taken to be a microcosm of American society, which has notably lacked the solidity and intractability of English society; it is little likely to be felt by its members as being palpably *there*. [...] English sincerity depends upon the English class structure.

And plainly this was the implicit belief of the English novelists of the nineteenth century. They would all of them appear to be in agreement that the person who accepts his class situation, whatever it may be, as a given and necessary condition of his life will be sincere beyond question. He will be sincere and authentic, sincere because authentic."

The lack of an intractable social system is placed at the heart of American inauthenticity, the young nation relying upon a democratic model that opposes what is 'plainly' the 'implicit belief of the English novelists': namely that 'class [is] a chief condition of personal authenticity'.7 Significantly, Dickens is listed among these conservative voices, with The Pickwick Papers' Sam Weller alongside the protagonists of works by Jane Austen and Anthony Trollope. The English author's 'way to the Devil' is thus traced back to the subtle 'weakening of the fabric of personal authenticity' that might follow from the 'abandonment of an original class position'.

Trilling's focus on the relationship between class and personal inauthenticity put his series of lectures determinedly out of step with the campus currents of the period, reflecting the critic's attempts to distance himself from what he saw as the 'adversary culture' of the New Left following the Columbia student protests of 1968.9 This conservative turn, discussed in detail by Christopher Lasch, led Trilling to a provocative – and extremely influential – assessment of American inauthenticity, but it can also be seen leading to a rather selective reading of the texts. Emerson's 'happy surprise',

⁵ Lionel Trilling, *Sincerity and Authenticity* ([1969–70] Cambridge, MA: Harvard College Press, 1972), ⁶ Ibid., pp. 113–15. ⁷ Ibid., p. 115.

⁸ Ibid.

⁹ Christopher Lasch, *The Minimal Self: Psychic Survival in Troubled Times* (New York: Norton, 1984), pp. 200–I.

Introduction: America and the 'Way to the Devil'

for example, was not only prompted by the personal (and social) elements that Trilling highlights, but also by less animate things:

The [English] names are excellent, – an atmosphere of legendary melody spread over the land. [...] Cambridge is the bridge of the Cam; Sheffield the field of the river Sheaf; Leicester the *castra* or camp of the Lear or Leir (now Soar); Rochdale, of the Roch; Exeter or Excester, the *castra* of the Ex; Exmouth, Dartmouth, Sidmouth, Teignmouth, the mouths of the Ex, Dart, Sid, and Teign rivers. Waltham is strong town; Radcliffe is red cliff; and so on: – a sincerity and use in naming very striking to an American, whose country is whitewashed all over by unmeaning names, the cast-off clothes of the country from which its emigrants came; or, named at a pinch from a psalm-tune.¹⁰

Emerson's study of *English Traits*, circulated by Ticknor & Fields (Dickens's own 'authorized representatives in America'), frames English authenticity in terms of material and verbal coherence, a 'sincerity and use in naming' in which places bear a genuine, observable etymological prehistory. America is, in marked contrast, 'whitewashed all over by unmeaning names', its geography a panorama of copies, meaninglessly lifted from a series of European originals.¹¹ This vision of American inauthenticity has less to do with ideas of class and self-coherence, and more the material reality of forging an intellectual culture within a former colony, working within a set of imported beliefs, words and names.

The duplicated and second-hand nature of American culture is a quality that will, as we shall see, become central to the fictional works of Trilling's contemporaries. At the outset, however, it is worth pausing to consider the tension between originality and authenticity that can already be detected in the writings of the antebellum period, as seen in the work of such established figures as Emerson and Dickens. This is the transitional era in which, as Henry Cabot Lodge put it, American writing was seen as a fundamentally 'parasitic literature', in which the 'first step of an American entering upon a literary career' was to 'pretend to be an Englishman'.¹² In a private letter, Dickens records the standard American

3

¹⁰ Ralph Waldo Emerson, *English Traits* ([1856] Boston, MA: Ticknor and Fields, 1866), pp. 180–1.

¹¹ In *The Innocents Abroad* (1869), Mark Twain describes the landscape of the American West as 'thirteen hundred miles of desert solitudes [...], mimic cities, of pinnacled cathedrals, of massive fortresses, counterfeited in the eternal rocks'. Mark Twain, *The Innocents Abroad* ([1869] London: Penguin Classics, 2002), p. 73.

¹² Henry Cabot Lodge, 'Colonialism in the United States', in *The Atlantic Monthly* (May 1883), pp. 612–26, reprinted in Brander Matthews (ed.), *The Oxford Book of American Essays* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1914), pp. 428–9.

4

Counterfeit Culture

retort to his warning that by relying on piracy the young nation 'will have no literature of their own':

the universal answer (out of Boston) is, 'We don't want one. Why should we pay for one when we can get it for nothing? Our people don't think of poetry, sir. *Dollars, banks, and cotton are our books, sir*'. [...] So much, at present, for international copyright.¹³

It is a striking boast; rather than poetry, Dickens claims, the antebellum American sees textiles and paper dollar bills (the 'American Notes' of his title) as their national text. The industrial metaphor hints at a new form of literature, forging a national genius by constructing texts according to a mechanical model. This is an idea that recurs throughout the national literature, appearing in Emerson's journals before becoming a foundational trope in the post-war writings of Andy Warhol and William Gaddis.¹⁴

To a contemporary European observer, the methods of the pirates and their consumers were inhuman, and the prospect of recycled and automated prose hardly worth thinking about. As Dickens points out in the same letter:

he chuckles over the humour of the page with an appreciation of it, quite inconsistent with, and apart from, its honest purchase. The raven hasn't more joy in eating a stolen piece of meat, than the American has in reading the English book which he gets for nothing.¹⁵

Framing 'the American' as a carrion bird devouring stolen meat, Dickens evokes the talkative Grip, star of his own *Barnaby Rudge* (1842). Choosing a bird famed for its mimicry – rather than a vulture, say – the novelist raises the same question as Emerson: is the American damned to utter nothing but a string of imported words without any comprehension of their meaning, echoing sounds from across the ocean?

Sailing home, Dickens drafted an open letter to the press, declaring that he had resolved 'never from this time [to] enter into any negociation [*sic*] with any person for the transmission, across the Atlantic, of early proofs of any thing I may write; and that I will forego all profit derivable from such a source'.¹⁶ According to Graham Storey and Madeleine House, he 'held to this for 10 years', concentrating on the 'plain and

¹³ Letter to Forster (3 May 1842), in Charles Dickens, *The Letters of Charles Dickens*, Vol. 3, Graham Storey and Madeleine House (eds.) (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1965), p. 233. Emphasis added.

¹⁴ For the Emerson reference, see the epigraph to Chapter 2.

¹⁵ Letter to Forster (3 May 1842), Dickens (1965), p. 232.

¹⁶ Letter to British Authors and Journals (7 July 1842), in Dickens (1965), p. 258.

Introduction: America and the 'Way to the Devil'

5

manly Truth' of the local fiction market and cutting himself off from this troubling territory of inauthenticity.¹⁷ The warning that the pirates and ravens would have 'no literature of their own', however, was soon undermined; in a review of Barnaby Rudge, Edgar Allan Poe observed that 'intensely amusing as it is', more might have been made of the symbolic raven, Grip:

Its croakings might have been prophetically heard in the course of the drama. Its character might have performed, in regard to that of the idiot, much the same part as does, in music, the accompaniment in respect to the air. Each might have been distinct. Each might have differed remarkably from the other. Yet between them there might have been wrought an analogical resemblance, and, although each might have existed apart, they might have formed together a whole which would have been imperfect in the absence of either.¹

This, of course, is the raven brazenly lecturing the creator, as the American picks apart the imagery of the imported novel, outlining a new (and more intricate) version of the text, in which two interrelated voices might have been brought together to form an 'analogical resemblance'. Poe's hypothetical version would duly appear three years later as 'The Raven', a poem in which lines from Dickens's novel are reworked into a portentous system of interlocking repetitions:

'What was that? Him tapping at the door'?

'No', returned the widow. 'It was in the street, I think. Hark! Yes. There again! 'Tis some one knocking softly at the shutter. Who can it be'!19

While I nodded, nearly napping, suddenly there came a tapping, As of some one gently rapping, rapping at my chamber door. "Tis some visitor', I muttered, 'tapping at my chamber door-Only this and nothing more'.²⁰

The poet is engaged here in a deliberate act of corvid pilfering and ventriloquism, smuggling Grip from a Southwark cottage into his own text. The theft is a defiant display of what Robert Macfarlane identifies as inventio, or 'creation as rearrangement', as opposed to creatio, or 'creation

¹⁷ Ibid., p. 258, n. 2. The phrase 'plain and manly Truth' appears in a letter of 27 April 1842 to 'The Editors of Four American Newspapers', ibid., p. 213. ¹⁸ Edgar Allan Poe, 'Review of *Barnaby Rudge*' in *Graham's Magazine* (February 1842), reprinted in

Poe, Essays and Reviews (New York: Library of America, 1984), p. 243.

 ¹⁹ Charles Dickens, *Barnaby Rudge* ([1842] New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1901), p. 40.
²⁰ Edgar Allan Poe, 'The Raven' (1845), in *The Norton Anthology of Poetry*, 4th edition, ed. Margaret Ferguson (New York: Norton, 1970), p. 881.

6

Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-42848-4 - Counterfeit Culture Rob Turner Excerpt **More Information**

Counterfeit Culture

as generation'.²¹ His raven is a copy of a copy, a carbon-print lifted from the living 'great originals' that Dickens fondly describes as the domesticated inspiration for the uncanny bird in his preface.²² And yet, of course, it is the counterfeit that is more familiar today; while Grip remains fairly anonymous, Poe's bird has starred in films alongside Bela Lugosi, Boris Karloff and Bugs Bunny.²³

In his account of the origins of American prose fiction, Jeffrey Rubin-Dorsky examines the historical impact of the book piracy situation that so exasperated foreign observers, such as Dickens. The nation's first novels began to emerge, he argues, at the height of an anarchic period in which 'English writers were pirated, printed, and sold by American booksellers under their own imprints; they were, in effect, published in America'.²⁴ According to the critic, these origins led to a fundamental stifling of local literary development:

no authentic American language was available for literary purposes. The writers who constitute the canon here, from Foster and Rowson through Irving and Cooper, were thoroughly dependent on the modes, styles, rhythms, and structures of the English language that they found in the books of their favourite seventeenth- and eighteenth-century authors. While America may have proclaimed its political independence from Britain, it nevertheless remained culturally subservient.²⁵

The diagnosis echoes Dickens's, as Rubin-Dorsky repeats the novelist's warning that 'they will have no literature of their own', 150 years after the fact. Since 'international copyright made cheap reprints of British authors readily available', he wonders, why would anybody 'pay more for a book written by an American, which in any case was likely to be inferior'? Prior to the late nineteenth century, with the ratification of the Chace Act – or so the argument goes - there was no economic place for an 'authentic' American literature. The writer was thus doomed to become either

²¹ Robert Macfarlane, Original Copy: Plagiarism and Originality in Nineteenth-Century Literature (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007), p. 6. Despite his serious commercial misgivings, there is a chance that Dickens might have admired (or at least smiled at) Poe's ingenuity; as Macfarlane points out, his own periodical, Household Words had itself demonstrated a 'fascination with the concepts of conversion, regeneration, and cyclicality' (Ibid., p. 55). It is worth noting that it was in the pages of *Household Words* that 'The Holly-Tree' first appeared. ²² Dickens ([1842] 1901), p. v.

²³ These appearances occur in *The Raven* (1935) dir. Lew Landers, *The Raven* (1963) dir. Roger Corman, and No Parking Hare (1954) dir. Robert McKimson.

²⁴ Jeffrey Rubin-Dorsky, 'The Early American Novel', in Emory Elliott (ed.), *The Columbia History of* the American Novel (New York: Columbia University Press, 1991), pp. 6-25 (p. 7).

²⁵ Ibid., p. 11.

Introduction: America and the 'Way to the Devil'

a forger or a mimic: an 'authentic American idiom' and a 'genuine "cultural voice" would have to await Mark Twain's arrival on the novelistic scene'.²⁶

In Counterfeit Culture, I turn this claim on its head, critically examining the notion that the national literature required an 'authentic' idiom or 'genuine "cultural voice"', and raising instead the possibility that inauthenticity, and the conscious counterfeit, might become a dominant American mode. This trend has been explored by a number of critics, ranging from Trilling's landmark study to more recent works, such as Miles Orvell's The Real Thing: Imitation and Authenticity in American Culture, 1880–1940 (1989), and Mary McAleer Balkun's The American Counterfeit: Authenticity and Identity in American Literature and Culture (2006). Both of these texts differ from Trilling's in making use of postmodernist theory, and the work of Jean Baudrillard in particular. Concentrating primarily on material culture, Orvell invokes the French theorist's claim that, for the archetypal American 'self-made man, the "authentic" European object supplies the signature of his paternity'.²⁷ This attention to an artificial and duplicated America, as described in *Le Système des objets* (1968), is further developed by Balkun, leading to a convincing reading of Whitman's Specimen Days (1882) as a 'demonstration of the "obsession with certainty"' that Baudrillard attached to the 'demand for authenticity'.²⁸ Despite their ready familiarity with the major theoretical developments since 1960, however, both critics concentrate solely on the period immediately following Dickens and Emerson, with Balkun following Orvell's example and dealing exclusively with works written between 1880 and 1930.

Writing in the wake of Orvell and Balkun, I have chosen to apply these questions of authenticity and duplication to the American writing of the past half-century, working with a series of experimental works written since 1960. My approach is informed by Hugh Kenner's anarchic study of our 'Xerox age', *The Counterfeiters: An Historical Comedy* (1968), although the early appearance of that book means that it, like the works mentioned above, is silent on my core texts.²⁹ Another important examination of the phenomenon of literary counterfeiting is K.K. Ruthven's

²⁶ Ibid., p. 25. In Chapters 2 and 3, below, I question this use of Twain's writings as a model of literary authenticity, exploring issues of technology and counterfeit raised by *The Refuge of the Derelicts* (1905) and 'A Literary Nightmare' (1876) respectively.

²⁷ Miles Orvell, The Real Thing: Imitation and Authenticity in American Culture, 1880–1940 (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1989), p. 62.

 ²⁸ Mary McAleer Balkun, *The American Counterfeit: Authenticity and Identity in American Literature and Culture* (Tuscaloosa: University of Alabama Press, 2006), p. 33.
²⁹ The phrase 'Xerox age' appears in Hugh Kenner, *The Counterfeiters: An Historical Comedy* ([1968]

²⁹ The phrase 'Xerox age' appears in Hugh Kenner, *The Counterfeiters: An Historical Comedy* ([1968] Champaign, IL: Dalkey Archive Press, 2005), p. 14.

8

Counterfeit Culture

Faking Literature (2001), a text that carefully re-assesses the traditional hierarchy between originals and copies, raising the notion that 'literary forgery is not so much the disreputable Other of "genuine" literature as its demystified and disreputable Self.³⁰ Of the authors discussed in this book, Ruthven finds space only for Gaddis, noting that such concerns are 'thematised brilliantly in [his] novel about art forgery, The Recognitions (1955)."³¹ In her recent study of *Real Phonies: Cultures of Authenticity in Post-*World War II America (2009) Abigail Cheever also avoids the texts discussed in my volume, approaching the question of 'authenticity as it relates to persons' through a series of 'social and cultural contexts', including psychiatric medicine, cultural assimilation and teenage anxiety.³² Navigating through the decades since 1960, I have made use of studies by Alex Houen, Marc Chénetier and Kathryn Hume, as well as Gary Lindberg, who has shown - in his study of Herman Melville's The Confidence-Man - the merit in tracing antebellum tropes into the postmodern world of John Barth and Richard Nixon.³³

Assessing the American literary scene in 1989, Chénetier offers an account of the transformations that took place in experimental prose across the preceding decades:

it seems possible to affirm that, in the years between 1960 and 1990, an important qualitative leap was, if not accomplished, at least confirmed: the leap that invites us to speak of American 'fiction' rather than of prose or of the American 'novel'. This is not only the result of a set of circumstances [...] but also the profound change in the notion of 'novel'. With the antirealist break of the sixties and seventies and the programmatic demonstration of the constitution of worlds by discourses, the word 'fiction' takes back all of its etymological force. An effect of disillusionment occurred, of distrust in the referential illusion.³⁴

The break with realism, and the accompanying collapse of faith in the 'referential illusion' have become familiar territory in the critical discussion

³¹ Ibid., pp. 126–7.

³⁰ K.K. Ruthven, *Faking Literature* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001), p. 3.

³² Abigail Cheever, *Real Phonies: Cultures of Authenticity in Post-World War II America* (Athens: University of Georgia Press, 2009), p. 3.

³³ Gary Lindberg, The Confidence Man in American Literature (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1982). The other three studies mentioned are Alex Houen, Powers of Possibility: Experimental American Writing Since the 1960s (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012); Marc Chénetier, Beyond Suspicion: New American Fiction Since 1960, trans. Elizabeth A. Houlding ([1989] Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 1996); Kathryn Hume, American Dream, American Nightmare Fiction since 1960 (Champaign: University of Illinois Press, 2000).

³⁴ Chénetier ([1989] 1996), pp. 59–60.

Introduction: America and the 'Way to the Devil'

of postmodernism. In 1981, Baudrillard addressed the same shift, noting a 'transition from signs that dissimulate something to signs that dissimulate that there is nothing', a quasi-theological notion that relies upon Jacques Derrida's earlier claims of a new 'metaphysics of absence' (discussed in Chapter 2).³⁵ Of equal importance to my work, however, and somewhat less familiar, is Chénetier's insistence that the alleged turn away from literary illusionism was itself part of a historic disintegration of 'the American "novel" itself:

The passage from the 'American novel' to 'American fiction' is not a simple matter of vocabulary. It translates the emergence of a set of new aesthetic values; it indicates that American fiction, having learned the lessons of modernism and made use of later developments without being led down a path not of its own making, has moved beyond suspicion.³⁶

This trend in American writing since 1960, as the literature moved beyond even the most difficult 'lessons of modernism', raising a host of new formal possibilities and fresh approaches to the 'referential illusion', provides an important context to the approaches to (in)authenticity explored in Counterfeit Culture.

Working with a series of experimental prose works that span the period, I have selected texts that break the generic parameters of the 'American novel' in the manner described by Chénetier, including Marguerite Young's Miss MacIntosh, My Darling (1965), Andy Warhol's a: a novel (1968), William Gaddis's J R (1975), William S. Burroughs's Nova Trilogy (1961–64), Thomas Pynchon's interlinked row of historiographic metafictions (1964–), William T. Vollmann's Seven Dreams cycle (1990–), and Vanessa Place's *Tragodía* (2011). At least half of these works, it is worth noting, are hardly classifiable as novels at all: Warhol's experiment, for example (despite its teasing subtitle), is a forerunner to the conceptualist prose of writers such as Place. The Nova books, on the other hand, are an account of a quasi-Homeric war between the 'Nova Mob' and the 'Nova Police', written (as Allen Ginsberg put it) in the form of 'a series of prose poems that have no end'.³⁷ Even Vollmann's Seven Dreams cycle, a project that was initially conceived in terms of the novel, soon transformed, as shown in Chapter 5, into an attempt to write

9

³⁵ Jean Baudrillard, *Simulacra and Simulation*, trans. Sheila Faria Glaser ([1981] Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1994), pp. 6–7. ³⁶ Chénetier ([1989] 1996), p. 60. ³⁷ Quoted in Houen (2012), p. 116.

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-42848-4 — Counterfeit Culture Rob Turner Excerpt <u>More Information</u>

10

Counterfeit Culture

an 'accurate work of history'.³⁸ In dealing with such unruly texts, I have steered clear of some of the generic neologisms coined by recent critics, such as Frederick R. Karl's 'Mega-Novel' (defined in relation to *J R* and *Gravity's Rainbow*) or Stefano Ercolino's 'Maximalist Novel', a term reserved almost exclusively for works published since 1995.³⁹ Striving to forge a distinct subset of the novel, these retrospective taxonomies can become prescriptive, outlining such precise recipes as the ten ingredients – 'not one more, not one less' – that Ercolino insists upon.⁴⁰ Avoiding such terms, and preferring not to introduce yet another of my own invention, I concur with Catherine Morley that a 'more established and consequential term for this kind of work is the prose epic'.⁴¹ After all, this is a tradition that is far older than the novel: as Gregory Nagy points out, Herodotus 'subsume[d] the framework of the *Iliad*' into his *Histories*, consciously adopting a 'Homeric stance' while composing the earliest extant work of western prose literature.⁴²

Given the centrality of race to contemporary discussions of American authenticity, a concern that informs recent studies by J. Martin Favor, Shelley Eversley, Randolphe Hohle and John N. Duvall, the absence of

³⁹ Frederick R. Karl, 'American Fictions: The Mega-Novel', *Conjunctions* 7 (1985), pp. 248–60; Stefano Ercolino, *The Maximalist Novel* (New York: Bloomsbury Academic, 2014).

- ⁴⁰ Ercolino (2014), p. xvi. A similarly arbitrary set of requirements is introduced towards the end of Edward Mendelson's otherwise excellent 1976 essay on 'Encyclopedic Narrative': 'All include a full account of a technology or science. [...] Encyclopedic narratives also offer an account of an art outside the realm of written fiction [...]. All encyclopedias attend to the complexities of statecraft [...]. All encyclopedias provide an image of their own scale by including giants or gigantism.' Edward Mendelson, 'Encyclopedic Narrative: From Dante to Pynchon', *MLN* 91 (1976), pp. 1267–75 (pp. 1270–1).
- ⁴¹ Catherine Morley, *The Quest for Epic in Contemporary American Fiction: John Updike, Philip Roth and Don DeLillo* (New York: Routledge, 2009), p. 1. Another older (and narrower) term that I find useful in thinking about these works is the 'anatomy' form, traceable to the classical 'Menippea'. I make some use of this tradition in Chapter 5, but have otherwise stuck to the broader term. As Northrop Frye has observed, the 'anatomy' is but one of the traditions subsumed within the 'complete prose epic' in works such as *Moby-Dick* it is deliberately combined with other forms, such as the 'romance'. Northrop Frye Anatomy of Criticism (New York: Atheneum, 1968), pp. 313–14. Following Frye's example, Sherill E. Grace has described Gravity's Rainbow as a 'complete prose epic'. Sherill E. Grace The Voyage That Never Ends: Malcolm Lowry's Fiction (Kelowna: University of British Columbia, 1982), p. 142, n. 12.
- ⁴² Gregory Nagy, *Pindar's Homer: The Lyric Possession of an Epic Past* (Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 1990), pp. 227, 233. The parallel was apparent to ancient critics: the author of *On the Sublime* described Herodotus as 'the most Homeric of writers', while a recently discovered inscription at Halicarnassus calls him 'the prose Homer'. See Richard B. Rutherford, 'Structure and Meaning in Epic and Historiography', in Edith Foster and Donald Lateiner (eds.), *Thucydides and Herodotus* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012), pp. 13–38, p. 14.

³⁸ Vollmann, Letter to Esther Whitby and Tom Rosenthal (Andre Deutsch Ltd), and Christine Pevitt and Amanda Vail (Viking) (18 February 1991), reprinted in McCaffery and Hemmingson (eds.), *Expelled from Eden: A William T. Vollmann Reader* (New York: Thunder's Mouth Press, 2004), p. 313.