

# The Value of Disorder

Despite being central to the development of Saharan regional connectivity, northern Chad has been closed to researchers since the late 1960s and thus remains virtually unknown to scholarship. Based on long-term fieldwork, *The Value of Disorder* is an original and in-depth account of the area and its Tubu majority inhabitants. Julien Brachet and Judith Scheele examine trans-border connectivity and trade; civil war and rebellion; wealth creation and dispersal; labour and gender relations; and aspirations to moral autonomy in northern Chad from an internal point of view – a point of view that in turn participates in a dynamic process of regional interdependence. Vividly ethnographic, the book gives precedence to local categories of value, while asking broader questions about the nature of non-state regional political organisation, questions that inform current political developments in the Sahara more widely and have the potential to challenge key concepts in Saharan studies and the social sciences.

JULIEN BRACHET is Research Fellow at the Institut de recherche pour le développement (IRD, Research Institute for Development), University of Paris 1 Panthéon-Sorbonne. He is the author of *Migrations transsahariennes: vers un désert cosmopolite et morcelé* (2009).

JUDITH SCHEELE is Director of Studies at the École des hautes études en sciences sociales (EHESS, School for Advanced Studies in the Social Sciences). She is the author of *Village Matters: Knowledge, Politics and Community in Kabylia*, Algeria (2009) and *Smugglers and Saints of the Sahara: Regional Connectivity in the Twentieth Century* (2012).



#### African Studies Series

The African Studies series, founded in 1968, is a prestigious series of monographs, general surveys, and textbooks on Africa covering history, political science, anthropology, economics, and ecological and environmental issues. The series seeks to publish work by senior scholars as well as the best new research.

#### Editorial Board:

David Anderson, The University of Warwick
Catherine Boone, The London School of Economics and Political Science
Carolyn Brown, Rutgers University, New Jersey
Christopher Clapham, University of Cambridge
Michael Gomez, New York University
Richard Roberts, Stanford University, California
David Robinson, Michigan State University
Leonardo A. Villalón, University of Florida

Other titles in the series are listed at the back of the book.



# The Value of Disorder

Autonomy, Prosperity, and Plunder in the Chadian Sahara

JULIEN BRACHET

IRD - University of Paris 1 Panthéon-Sorbonne

JUDITH SCHEELE

École des hautes études en sciences sociales (EHESS)





# CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108428330

DOI: 10.1017/9781108566315

© Julien Brachet and Judith Scheele 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd. Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Brachet, Julien, 1979- author. | Scheele, Judith, 1978- author.

Title: The value of disorder: autonomy, prosperity and plunder in the Chadian Sahara / Julien Brachet, Judith Scheele.

Other titles: African studies series.

Description: New York: Cambridge University Press, 2019. | Series: African studies series | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2018040381 | ISBN 9781108428330 (hardback : alk. paper) | ISBN 9781108449342 (pbk. : alk. paper)

Subjects: LCSH: Daza (Dazaga-speaking people)–Chad. | Teda (African people)–Chad. | Faya (Chad)–History. | Faya (Chad)–Economic conditions. | Faya (Chad)–Social conditions. | Borkou-Ennedi-Tibesti (Chad)–History. | Chad–Politics and government.

Classification: LCC DT546.445.D38 B73 2019 | DDC 305.89653096743-dc23 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2018040381

ISBN 978-1-108-42833-0 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



## Contents

List of Photographs	page v	ii
List of Maps	i	ix
Acknowledgements		x
Glossary	xi	ii
List of Abbreviations	x	v
Introduction		1
The Sahara and Its Double	e	7
The Lacuna	1	6
The Bad Reputation	2	7
Alterity Endorsed	3	2
Obstacles as Social Facts	3	9
1 A Never-Ending Conqu	est: Settlement and the Making	
of a Saharan Town	4	-5
Regional Disconnections	4	7
The Sanūsiyya	5	3
The French Colonial Cond	quest 5	9
The Enemy Who Came or	<u> </u>	4
Colonial State-Building		9
Boom and Bust	7	5
Imperial Twilight	8	0
Conclusion	8	6
2 Fifty Shades of Khaki: A	Armed Conflict and Other	
Entanglements	8	8
The Outbreak of War	9	1
Ongoing Connections	9	8
'The Enemy of My Enemy	is Your Friend' 10	6
Suspicions and Departures		4
Looking Like a State	12	0.
Plus ça change	12	6
Conclusion	13	2

v



vi		Contents
3	Trouble in the Palm Grove: Labour, Status, Ownership The 2006 Conflict The Right Kind of History Labour and Irrigated Agriculture Property and Possession Those Who Leave and Those Who Stay Conclusion	133 135 140 148 157 164 170
4	Tricks of Trade: Production, Protection, and Predation Fortunes of War: The First Generation of Faya Traders The One Exception Local Production and Decentralised Trade Libya: Wealth at Your Fingertips Rent over Risk: Garages and Other Forms of 'Protection' Rent-Seeking through Authority and Force Conclusion	172 175 184 190 197 204 209 215
5	Great Ploys and Small Expectations: Accumulation and Dispersal in a Half-World The Glory of Giving Raiding and Theft Kinship and Marriage The Ties That Bind Faya as a Half-World Conclusion	217 221 227 234 242 247 255
6	The State Encompassed: Everyday Disorder, the Aesthetic of Violence, and the Political Imagination Tubu 'Anarchy' In Praise of Disorder A Good Fight Men in Arms The State Encompassed Conclusion	256 260 264 269 276 283 290
	Conclusion Elite Cultures The Lacuna Revisited Times, Things, Others	293 298 303 309
Re	eferences	314
In	dex	341



# Photographs

I.1	Faya seen from the north	page 4
I.2	Camel caravan in Faya	4
I.3	Main street leading to the central market, Faya	5
	The archives of the Borkou Prefecture	41
1.1	Ruins of the Sanūsī zāwiya and/or the first French	
	colonial fort in Faya	54
1.2	'Libyan' mosque in Faya	68
1.3	Faya: central market arcades	79
1.4	French-drilled artesian well in the suburbs of	
	Faya	84
2.1	Wreck of Libyan tank abandoned near Faya	117
3.1	Non-irrigated extensive palm grove near Amoul	148
	Irrigated garden with trimmed date palms in	
	Kirdimi	149
3.3	Shadūf (manual well with a counterpoise lift) in	
	Kirdimi	151
3.4	Date harvest near Tchang Souss (August 2012)	156
4.1	Ahmad Tuwār's house, Faya	178
4.2	Natron mining near Djiddi	194
4.3	Advertisement for weekly car sales in Faya	202
4.4	Garages with stockpiles of flour near Terre	
	Rouge, Faya	209
4.5	Trucks waiting at the Chadian customs office in	
	Zouarké	213
5.1	Open air Libyan market in Faya	218
5.2	Departure of wedding procession, Faya	240
	Wedding celebrations in the outskirts of Faya	241
	Crowds waiting for the presidential plane at Faya	
	aerodrome (15/9/2012)	257

vii



viii	ii List of Ph	
6.2	Soldiers cruising, Faya	278
6.3	Military parade to celebrate Independance Day	in
	Faya (11/8/2012)	282
C.1	'Peace in Chad - this is my battle': Poster portr	aying
	the Chadian President Idriss Déby and his army	,
	displayed in government offices in Faya	298



# Maps

I.1	Chad: administrative regions and isohyetal lines	page 2
I.2	Faya town centre (2012)	6
I.3	Sahara: main areas of settlement of Hassāniyya-,	
	Tuareg-, Beri-, and Tubu-speakers	10
I.4	Empires, sultanates, and trade routes in the	
	mid-nineteenth century	19
2.1	Borkou-Ennedi-Tibesti (1980s)	93
3.1	Faya and its suburbs and palm grove	137
4.1	Main trade routes between Fazzān, Kufra, Waddaï,	
	and N'Djamena	173

ix



## Acknowledgements

This book is based on twelve months of fieldwork in Chad, principally in Faya-Largeau, the main town of Borkou-Ennedi-Tibesti (BET) in the far north of the country. It could not have been written without the hospitality and generosity of the people we met in Faya, who helped us in what to many must have seemed like a fool's errand. Despite people's repeated assertions that Faya was a difficult place to live for outsiders, we were treated with great kindness and consideration throughout.

Our first gratitude must go to our hosts in Faya, Moussa Hassan Adiker and Zeynaba and their family, including Zeynaba's siblings, aunt, uncle, and grandmother. The women of the family opened doors to local sociabilities and family relations, and Moussa Hassan was a calm authority on many things local and national. Adoum Fozari, Faya's most prominent trader and brilliant story-teller, became a great friend, companion, and interpreter of local affairs, in both Faya and the Chadian capital N'Djamena. Achta, Fatimé, and Khadidja Mahamat Bahr provided a female perspective from the start; Achta's husband kindly hosted us in Moundou, and her father, Sherfaddine, in Ngaoundéré in northern Cameroon. Youssef Mahamat Bahr, Faya's former prefect, provided invaluable information as we visited him in N'Djamena. The late Idriss Ndélé Moussa Yayami narrated his father's history, and through it that of Faya, as well as sharing his own childhood memories. Al-Hāji Mūsā Khayrallāh and Adoum Mahamat Yacoub ('Papa Adoum'), who were then considered to be the oldest living residents of Faya, patiently granted us access to their own memories and historical documents, and their views on Faya's transformation over the last seventy years.

Ali Mansour (aka Alain Togilbert), Mahamadayn, Smain, and 'Sultan Maltina' shared their knowledge of the hardships and pleasures of desert travel, of life in Libya, and of the busy tracks between northern Chad and southern Libya. Haroun Kellé, al-Hājj Sougi



#### Acknowledgements

xi

Torna, and Moussa Tidjani Yahia were indefatigable guides to the complexities of local social distinctions and labour relations. Hamid Noheleh Kamadou ('Commandant Tuka'), Goukouni Hissen, and General Kokoï Toké provided precious insider commentary on rebellions, the police, and the army; as did Idriss and Acheikh Toké. The late Tuka, Ali Rozi Ahmat, and Issa 'DG des impôts' introduced us to worlds that were physically beyond Faya (Tibesti, Djourab) but highly relevant to it. Ndoumbé and William, among other travellers heading to or coming back from Libya, gave us glimpses of foreign migrants' perspectives, bringing with them an air of cosmopolitanism. Kébir, from his compound overlooking the rest of town, provided commentary that was as incisive as it was dispassionate. Djimmi was our guide to Dozanga; Emmanuel Kagoubé Ladayé and Béatrice, to Démocratie; Nestor and Aboubakar Zeini, to the ONDR, its archival records, and irrigated perimeter; Moussa, to Kirdimi; and Hassan Bollobo, to Amoul. Hanna very graciously hosted us in Abéché.

We would also like to thank the Borkou Prefect for access to the local archives; and the chefs de cantons Anakazza, Donza, Kamaya, and Mina and their families, especially Ahmat Tidjani and Hassan, for their support and information provided. We are also grateful to the Délégué des Mines, and other ministerial delegates in Faya, who always helped us when they could, often beyond their calls of duty. In N'Djamena, thanks are due to Marc Ortman, more usually known in the BET as Kandamaï, who was always ready to share his extensive knowledge of Tubu language, culture, and politics with us. Thanks are also due to the staff at the national archives in N'Djamena, who granted us access even though the archives had not officially been opened; to the staff at the Centre national d'appui à la recherche (CNAR), who introduced us to the wealth of grey literature at their disposal; to the Cefod and the Centre al-Mouna; and to the University of N'Djamena, our hosts and colleagues. Members of the geography department in particular helped us sort out our paperwork, getting official research and travel permits, while introducing us to aspects of Chadian life that would otherwise have escaped our notice, focused, as we were, on the north of the country. Our particular thanks here go to Ngaressem Goltob Mbaye and Zakinet Dangbet, but also to Pabamé Sougnabé, Passinring Kedeu, and Robert Madjigoto. And, finally, to Chloé Leconte, who so warmly hosted us during our visits to N'Djamena. We arrived on the same plane, but she never left.



xii

Acknowledgements

While fieldwork was primarily funded by the Institut de recherche pour le développement (Paris) and All Souls College (Oxford), most of this book was written when we were both at Oxford. We would like to thank our colleagues and students at All Souls College and at Queen Elizabeth House for ongoing exchange and support. Paul Dresch read the manuscript with his usual attention and care at a far too early stage. His patience, insights, and frankness have helped make this a much better book. Ann McDougall also provided invaluable feedback; we take this occasion to thank her for it. Material included in this book was presented in many different venues and to different audiences. Reactions were not always positive, but they were invariably useful; and we thank everybody who, in one way or another, has contributed to this project.

Arabic words are transliterated following the *International Journal* of *Middle East Studies*, with diacritics omitted. Dazaga and Tedaga words adopt the spelling proposed by Charles Le Cœur (1950) and the Summer Institute of Linguistics.



## Glossary

arba (Tubu)camel mark'askar (Arabic)soldier

aza, singular eze (Tubu) blacksmith and praise-singer

azûma (Tubu) fund-raising party

*bādiya* (Arabic) wilderness

bilād al-sība (Arabic)land of dissidencebilād al-sūdān (Arabic)land of the blacks

boubou (French) ankle-length shirt for men bunduk jāb-ha (Arabic) 'brought by the guns': returnees

from Libya

canton (French) smallest administrative unit

in Chad

chef de canton (French) leader and representative of a

canton

député (French) delegate to the Chadian national

parliament

derdé (Tubu)traditional 'chief'diya (Arabic)blood money

Fazzānī (Arabic) inhabitant of Fazzān in

southern Libya

griot (French) blacksmith and praise-singer

haddād (Arabic) blacksmith

*ikhwān*, singular *akh* brother, member of a Sufi order

(Arabic)

khalīfa (Arabic) representative, here head of a

zāwiya

*koro* measurement for dry goods

(dates, cereals)

*métis* (French) child of one European and one

African parent

xiii



> xiv Glossary

mustaghriq al-dhimma 'forfeited of his own goods':

(Arabic)

beyond the law nawāzil (Arabic) legal responsa

*qādī* (Arabic) judge

radda (Arabic) compensation

Sufi order, primarily based Sanūsiyya

in Libya

shadūf (Arabic) well with counterpoise lift

sharī'a (Arabic) Islamic law

administrator subordinate to sous-préfet (French)

the prefect

tirailleur (French) indigenous soldier in French

colonial army

yele (Tubu) clan

zakāt (Arabic) religious tax

zarība, plural zarā'ib fortified military or slave-

(Arabic) raiding camp

zāwiya, plural zawāyā religious stronghold

(Arabic)



### **Abbreviations**

AEF French Equatorial Africa
ANL Armée nationale de libération

ASECNA Agence pour la sécurité de la navigation

aérienne en Afrique et à Madagascar

BET Borkou-Ennedi-Tibesti
BNF Bureau national de fret
CAR Central African Republic

CCFAN Conseil de commandement des forces armées

du nord

CCMSR Conseil de commandement militaire pour le

salut de la république

CDR Conseil démocratique révolutionnaire
COM/RM Commandant de la région militaire
CTT Coopérative des transporteurs tchadiens
DDS Direction de la documentation et de la

sécurité

ECOWAS Economic Community of West African

States

EFT Éléments français au Tchad

FACT Front pour l'alternance et la concorde

au Tchad

FAN Forces armées du Nord

FANT Forces armées nationales tchadiennes FAO Food and Agriculture Organization of the

United Nations

FAP Forces armées populaires FAT Forces armées tchadiennes

F CFA Franc de la communauté financière africaine

(1,000 F CFA = £1.52)

Frolinat Front de libération nationale du Tchad

ΧV



xvi List of Abbreviations

GUNT Gouvernement d'union national de

transition

INSEED Institut national de la statistique, des Études

Économiques et démographiques

IOM International Organization for Migration MATUH Ministère de l'Amènagement du territoire, de

l'urbanisme et de l'habitat

MDJT Mouvement pour la démocratie et la justice

au Tchad

MINUSCA Mission multidimensionnelle Intégrée des

Nations unies pour la stabilisation en

Centrafrique

MINUSMA Mission multidimensionnelle intégrée des

Nations unies pour la stabilisation au Mali

MISCA Mission internationale de soutien à la

Centrafrique sous conduite africaine

MNJTF Multinational Joint Task-Force
MPS Mouvement patriotique du Salut
MRA Mission pour la réforme administrative

OCRS Organisation commune des régions

sahariennes

ONC Office national des céréales

ONDR Office national de développement rural ORSTOM Office de la recherche scientifique et

technique outre-mer

PPT Parti progressiste tchadien
RFI Radio France internationale
TAT Tunisienne automobile transport

UFDD Union des forces pour la démocratie et le

développement

UNIR Union nationale pour l'indépendance et la

révolution

WFP World Food Program