CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42707-4 — Refugee Law's Fact-Finding Crisis
Hilary Evans Cameron
Table of Contents
More Information

Contents

Acknowledgements *page* x

Introduction 1

PART I 5

1 **The Wrong Mistake** 7

The Traditional Economic Approach 10
A Psychologically Founded Theory 11
A Comparative Study 14
The Wrong Mistake in the Criminal Law 15
The Wrong Mistake in the Civil Law 20
Conclusion 24

PART II 25

2 **Setting the Scene** 27

At the Refugee Board 29
At the Federal Court 38
The Case Study: Method and Findings 39

3 **The Wrong Mistake: Sending a Refugee Home** 42

Wrongly Disbelieving the Claimant 44
The Claimant's Testimony 44
The Claimant's Conduct 60
Troubles Getting Evidence 69
Overlooking Objective Danger 74
Denying Claims on Procedural Grounds 75
Conclusion 78

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42707-4 — Refugee Law's Fact-Finding Crisis
Hilary Evans Cameron
Table of Contents
More Information

4 **Resolving Doubt in the Claimant's Favour** 79
The Burden of Proof 79
Standards of Proof 82
The 'Well-foundedness' Threshold: How Much Risk Is Risk Enough? 83
The State Protection Threshold: How Much Protection Is Enough Protection? 85
Presumption of Truthfulness 87
In Civil and Administrative Law Generally 88
Within Refugee Law 90
Conclusion 96

5 **The Wrong Mistake: Accepting an Unfounded Claim** 98
Refugee Claimants Are Ordinary Litigants 98
Acting Rationally and Responsibly within the Hearing Process 102
Acting Rationally and Responsibly outside of the Hearing Process 112
The Member Is an Ordinary Decision-Maker 118
Judging Demeanour 120
Judging Plausibility 121
Conclusion 129

6 **Resolving Doubt at the Claimant's Expense** 133
The Burden of Proof 133
Standards of Proof 139
The 'Well-foundedness' Threshold: How Much Risk Is Risk Enough? 139
The State Protection Threshold: How Much Protection Is Enough Protection? 147
Presumptions 151
The Presumption of State Protection 151
The Presumption of Truthfulness 154
Conclusion 160

7 **In the Hearing Room** 161
Conflicting Standards of Proof 162
Permissible Inferences: Rational Action and Memory 166
Conclusion 171

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42707-4 — Refugee Law's Fact-Finding Crisis
Hilary Evans Cameron
Table of Contents
More Information

PART III 173

8 **A Way Forward** 175

The Wrong Mistake in International Refugee Law 175
The Principle of *Non-refoulement* 180
Refugee Status Determination Is Declaratory 181
The Duty to Resolve Doubt in the Claimant's Favour 182
The *Karanakaran* Approach 184
Traditional Common Law Legal Theory: Truth-Seeking and Inductive Inference 185
Karanakaran: Risk Assessment and Inference to the Best Explanation 187
Abductive Reasoning 192
Refugee Status Determination as an Abductive Risk Assessment 197
Explanation in a Refugee Hearing: Theory and Counter-theory 199
Josephson on 'the Best Explanation' 202
Conclusion 210

Index 212

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org