

The First Modern Risk

During the late nineteenth century, many countries across Europe adopted national legislation that required employers to compensate workers injured or killed in accidents at work. These laws suggested that the risk of accidents was inherent to work and not due to individual negligence. By focusing on Britain, Germany and Italy during this time, Julia Moses demonstrates how these laws reflected a major transformation in thinking about the nature of individual responsibility and social risk. *The First Modern Risk* illuminates the implications of this conceptual revolution for the role of the state in managing problems of everyday life, transforming understandings about both the obligations and rights of individuals. Drawing on a wide array of disciplines including law, history and politics, Moses offers a fascinating transnational view of a pivotal moment in the evolution of the welfare state.

JULIA MOSES is Senior Lecturer in Modern History at the University of Sheffield, co-founder and co-chair of the Risk, Policy and Law Research Group at Sheffield's Centre for Medical Humanities, and currently Marie Curie Fellow in Sociology at the Georg-August-Universität Göttingen, Germany. Her previous publications include *The Impact of Ideas on Legal Development* (with Michael Lobban; 2012) and *Marriage, Law and Modernity: Global Histories* (2017).



See the Studies in Legal History series website at
<http://studiesinlegalhistory.org/>

Studies in Legal History

EDITORS

Sarah Barringer Gordon, University of Pennsylvania
 Holly Brewer, University of Maryland, College Park
 Michael Lobban, London School of Economics and Political Science
 Reuel Schiller, University of California, Hastings College of the Law

Other books in the series

Cynthia Nicoletti, *Secession on Trial: The Treason Prosecution of Jefferson Davis*
 Edward James Kolla, *Sovereignty, International Law, and the French Revolution*
 Assaf Likhovski, *Tax Law and Social Norms in Mandatory Palestine and Israel*
 Robert W. Gordon, *Taming the Past: Essays on Law and History and History in Law*
 Paul Garfinkel, *Criminal Law in Liberal and Fascist Italy*
 Michelle A. McKinley, *Fractional Freedoms: Slavery, Intimacy, and Legal Mobilization in Colonial Lima, 1600–1700*
 Mitra Sharafi, *Law and Identity in Colonial South Asia: Parsi Legal Culture, 1772–1947*
 Karen M. Tani, *States of Dependency: Welfare, Rights, and American Governance, 1935–1972*
 Stefan Jurasinski, *The Old English Penitentials and Anglo-Saxon Law*
 Felice Batlan, *Women and Justice for the Poor: A History of Legal Aid, 1863–1945*
 Sophia Z. Lee, *The Workplace Constitution from the New Deal to the New Right*
 Michael A. Livingston, *The Fascists and the Jews of Italy: Mussolini's Race Laws, 1938–1943*

The First Modern Risk

Workplace Accidents and the Origins of European Social States

JULIA MOSES
University of Sheffield



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42650-3 — The First Modern Risk
Julia Moses
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108426503

DOI: 10.1017/9781108657853

© Julia Moses 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-108-42650-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

To my parents, and to H.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42650-3 — The First Modern Risk
Julia Moses
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> viii
<i>List of Tables</i>	ix
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xi
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xv
Introduction	I
1 Accidents, Freedom and Modernity in the Nineteenth Century	21
2 Occupational Risk, Work and the Nation State	60
3 Spreading Risk, Forging Solidarity	89
4 Taking Risks and Dismissing Fate	120
5 Workers, Citizens and the State	162
6 Risk Societies as ‘People’s Communities’	212
Conclusion	254
<i>Appendix</i>	272
<i>Bibliography</i>	276
<i>Index</i>	311

Figures

1	'Diagram of Goldsworthy Gurney's apparatus for ventilating mines'	<i>page 46</i>
2	Statistical representation of accidents at work in Britain in 1869–70	48
3	Statistical representation of accidents, risk and death in Italy	50
4	Statistical representation of workplace accidents in Prussia	52
5	'Phossy jaw'	134
6	<i>Dermatitis artefacta</i> , a superficial, self-inflicted injury	153
7	Battery for combined continuous and faradic currents, to test muscle activity	154
8	Germania watching over a realm of workers ('A'), supporting their employers ('U')	209
9	'The workmen's insurance of the German Empire'	210
10	'Man with disabled right arm with a prehensile hand'	240
11	Italian safety image (1922): 'Don't trust your eyes to your workmate'	252
12	German safety image (1925): 'Watch out or you'll get lead poisoning'	253

Tables

1	Sequencing of accident laws in relation to other social-security policies	<i>page</i> 272
2	Global spread of accident compensation laws, 1884–1918	273
3	Proportion of workers within the British, German and Italian compensation systems, 1885–1925	274
4	Percentage of economically active population employed in agriculture	274
5	Commercial accident insurance premiums	275

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42650-3 — The First Modern Risk
Julia Moses
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank the individuals and institutions that made the research and writing of this book possible. For funding the initial research, I am grateful to the Gates Cambridge Trust; the Overseas Research Studentship Awards Scheme; the German Academic Exchange Service; the Prince Consort and Thirwall Prize Scholarship Scheme at the University of Cambridge; the Faculty of History at the University of Cambridge; and St John's College, Cambridge. I am especially grateful to my doctoral supervisors, Chris Clark and Martin Daunton, for their enthusiasm for the project and encouragement in seeing it through. My examiners, Peter Baldwin and Pat Thane, played an enormous role in helping me to sharpen the thesis and make it into a book. Not least, the University of Sheffield, and especially my various heads of department, have provided the essential environment in which to complete the manuscript. Michael Lobban has graciously and patiently enabled me to make my book project into a reality, reading multiple drafts and helping to shape the manuscript. I am also grateful to Tim Smith, Larry Frohman, Holger Nehring and the anonymous reviewers for Cambridge University Press for their comments on earlier drafts. Thanks, too, to my editor at the Press, Debbie Gershenowitz, and to Kris Deusch, as well as my excellent copyeditor, Christopher Feeney, for making the process of publishing this book a pleasure.

Many colleagues, friends and mentors along the way have proved formative for this book. I am deeply indebted to Jose Harris and Abigail Green at Oxford for encouraging me to pursue this research and pointing me in the right direction – even if it was to ‘the other place’. Through their example of inspirational scholarship, I owe Deborah Valenze and Lars Trägårdh at Barnard College thanks for supporting my decision to abandon law and pursue the path of comparative history. Thanks, too, to colleagues around the world who have provided feedback on the project along the way, including Arnd Bauerkämper, Jürgen Kocka, Hartmut Kaelble, Bernhard Struck and other members of the

Collegium for Comparative European History at the Free University, Berlin, where I was a visiting scholar in 2005; my many excellent colleagues at Oxford, and especially at Pembroke and Brasenose Colleges; Paul-André Rosental and Laura Downs at the École des Hautes Études en Sciences Sociales (EHESS), where I had the immense privilege of visiting as a guest professor in 2010; Ingrid Gilcher-Holtey, Willibald Steinmetz and Bettina Brandt at the University of Bielefeld Graduate School of History and Sociology, where I enjoyed an international guest lectureship in 2012; Michael Lobban, John Bell, David Ibbetson and the other members of the AHRC-funded European Legal Development Project; Paul-André Rosental, Martin Lengwiler, Bernard Thomann and members of the European Research Council's Silicosis project; Thomas Le Roux and members of the CNRS/EHESS Industrial Risks and Accidents project; Dan Rodgers, Susan Pedersen, Frank Trentmann and other participants in the Social Policy across Borders conference at Cambridge; participants in the Risk, Social Policy and the State conference at Sheffield, and especially my co-organiser Eve Rosenhaft; colleagues and collaborators in the Political Economy and Welfare Research Network at the Council for European Studies, and especially my co-chairs Matthieu Leimgruber, Marius Busemeyer and Christine Trampusch, and in the Risk, Policy and Law Research Group and at the Centre for Medical Humanities at Sheffield, and especially my co-director Matthias Benzer; and interlocutors at Cambridge, including Simon Szreter, Deborah Thom, Richard Evans, Bonnie Evans, Sian Pooley and Andrew Fearnley.

I am also enormously grateful to the hosts who have generously invited me to present on this research in seminars and conferences over the last many years, including at the University of Cambridge, the University of Oxford, the University of York, the University of Sheffield, King's College London, the University of Glasgow, Princeton University, the Graduate Institute at Geneva, the University of Groningen, the EHESS, Sciences Po and the University of Paris VII, the Free University in Berlin, the University of Cologne, the University of Bochum, the University of Gothenburg, the University of Stockholm, the New University of Lisbon, the Finnish Institute in Rome and the German Historical Institutes in Rome and in Washington, DC, as well as elsewhere.

Not least, I wish to acknowledge the many institutions and archives that have enabled me to pursue this research. In Britain, I would like to thank the staffs of the Working Class Movement Library in Salford, The National Archives in Kew, the Modern Records Centre at the University of Warwick, the West Yorkshire Archives Service at Wakefield and the Guildhall Archives, as well as Bill Noblett at Cambridge University Library. In Germany, the staffs of the Bundes-Archiv at Lichterfelde West and Hoppegarten and of the Geheimes Staats-Archiv Preußischer Kulturbesitz provided valuable aid and friendly rapport during a lonesome stay in Berlin. In Italy, the staffs of the Archivio centrale dello stato, the historical archives of the Foreign Office and the Archivio di stato in Rome provided helpful advice. The staffs of the historical archives at the Senate and the Chamber of Deputies, in particular,

Acknowledgements

xiii

provided valuable assistance and information about the historical functions of each body. I am especially grateful to the staff of the historical archives and library at the Istituto nazionale della previdenza sociale for opening their doors to me and providing such a convivial atmosphere, along with numerous invaluable photocopies. Alberto Lucarelli, Gianpiero Ruspantini and Bernardo Sabetta at the Istituto nazionale per l'assicurazione infortuni sul lavoro went out of their way to allow me access to the closed and uncatalogued holdings there and shared their wealth of knowledge about accident insurance in Italy. Lutz Klinkhammer, Patrick Bernhard and Gerhard Kuck at the German Historical Institute in Rome provided helpful tips about pursuing research in Italy at the beginning of my stay there. I am also indebted to Bodo Nehring and Christopher Dowe for procuring valuable photocopies in Germany. Bodo and Waltraut Nehring provided a home away from home while working in the archives and on the manuscript in Germany, while Pia Schneider and Valerio Ialongo offered me an insider's view of Rome and much helpful advice about navigating my way through Italian archives.

I am especially grateful to several publishers for generously permitting me to draw on various aspects of my earlier publications, including: 'Accidents at work, security and compensation in industrialising Europe: the cases of Britain, Germany and Italy, 1870–1925', *Annual Review of Law and Ethics* 17 (Summer 2009): 237–58, for parts of Chapters 1 and 4; 'Foreign workers and the emergence of minimum international standards for the compensation of workplace accidents, 1880–1914', *Journal of Modern European History* 7/2 (2009): 219–39, for parts of Chapter 5; 'Risk, humanity and injuries to the body politic: governmental representations of "the industrial accident problem" in Britain, Germany and Italy, 1870–1900', in C. Smit et al., eds., *Imagination and commitment: representations of the social question* (Leuven: Peeters, 2010), pp. 209–32, for parts of Chapters 1 and 2; and 'Contesting risk: specialist knowledge and workplace accidents in Britain, Germany and Italy, 1870–1920', in K. Brückweh et al., eds., *Engineering society: the role of the human and social sciences in modern societies, 1880–1980* (Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2012), pp. 59–78, for parts of Chapters 1 and 4. Thanks, too, to the Geheimes Staats-Archiv Preußischer Kulturbesitz and to Bruno Müller, Hubert Steinke and Ulrich Woermann of the University of Bern for enabling me to reproduce Figures 4 and 5, respectively, here.

I dedicate this book to my parents, for their encouragement of intellectual curiosity and sacrifices made for my education, and to H. and F., who have provided me with a secure retreat from a world of risk.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42650-3 — The First Modern Risk
Julia Moses
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Abbreviations

ACS	Archivio centrale dello stato
<i>A. P. Cam.</i>	<i>Atti parlamentari della Camera dei deputati del regno</i>
<i>A. P. Sen.</i>	<i>Atti parlamentari del Senato del regno</i>
BArch	Bundes-Archiv Berlin
BT	Board of Trade
Ccmi	Central Committee on Mobilisation (Italy)
CdAs	Camera dei deputati, Archivio storico
CNAIL	Cassa nazionale d'assicurazione per gl'infortuni degli operai sul lavoro
<i>DDB</i>	<i>Drucksachen des Deutschen Bundesrates</i>
<i>DDNB</i>	<i>Drucksachen des norddeutschen Bundes</i>
<i>DDR</i>	<i>Drucksachen des Deutschen Reichstags</i>
Div. Ind. & Comm.	Division of Industry and Commerce
FO	Foreign Office
GStAPK	Geheimes Staats-Archiv Preußischer Kulturbesitz
HC	House of Commons
HO	Home Office
ILO	International Labour Organization

INAIL	Istituto nazionale per l'assicurazione contro gli infortuni sul lavoro
INPS	Istituto nazionale della previdenza sociale
LAB	Ministry of Labour
Maem	Ministry of Arms and Munitions (Italy)
MAIC	Ministry of Agriculture, Industry and Commerce (Italy)
MdaeAs	Historical Archives of the Foreign Office (Italy)
MRC	Modern Records Centre
MT	Ministry of Transport
PCM	Presidenza del consiglio dei ministri
PIN	Ministry of Pensions
PP	<i>Parliamentary Papers</i> (British)
QS	<i>Quellensammlung zur Geschichte der deutschen Sozialpolitik 1867 bis 1914</i>
RECO	Ministry of Reconstruction
RGBL	<i>Reichsgesetzblatt</i>
SBDR	<i>Stenographische Berichte über die Verhandlungen des Deutschen Reichstags</i>
SdrAs	Senato del regno, Archivio storico
SPD	Sozialdemokratische Partei Deutschlands
TNA	The National Archives of the United Kingdom
TUC	Trades Union Congress
UGC	Ufficio del Genio Civile
WCML	Working Class Movement Library