



Healthy or Sick?

This book analyzes how policies to prevent diseases are related to policies aiming to cure illnesses. It does this by conducting a comparative historical analysis of Australia, Germany, Switzerland, the United Kingdom, and the United States. It also demonstrates how the politicization of the medical profession contributes to the success of preventive health policy. This book argues that two factors lead to a close relationship of curative and preventive elements in health policies and institutions: a strong national government that possesses a wide range of control over subnational levels of government, and professional organizations (especially the medical profession) perceiving preventive and nonmedical health policy as important and campaigning for it politically. This book provides a historical and comparative narrative to substantiate this claim empirically.

PHILIPP TREIN is a postdoctoral researcher in political science at the Institute of Political, Historical, and International Studies (IEPHI) at the University of Lausanne and a visiting scholar at the Institute of European Studies (IES) at UC Berkeley. His research interests cover comparative public policy (coordination and integration of policies, health policy, employment policy), comparative federalism and multilevel governance (including European Studies), as well as economic voting (Germany). His research has been published or is forthcoming in the *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, *European Journal of Political Research*, *German Politics*, *Journal of Public Policy*, *Journal of Comparative Policy Analysis: Research and Practice*, *Public Administration*, *Publius: The Journal of Federalism*, and *Regional and Federal Studies*.

CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN COMPARATIVE PUBLIC POLICY

The **Cambridge Studies in Comparative Public Policy** series was established to promote and disseminate comparative research in public policy. The objective of the series is to advance the understanding of public policies through the publication of the results of comparative research into the nature, dynamics, and contexts of major policy challenges and responses to them. Works in the series will draw critical insights that enhance policy learning and are generalizable beyond specific policy contexts, sectors, and time periods. Such works will also compare the development and application of public policy theory across institutional and cultural settings and examine how policy ideas, institutions, and practices shape policies and their outcomes. Manuscripts comparing public policies in two or more cases as well as theoretically informed critical case studies which test more general theories are encouraged. Studies comparing policy development over time are also welcomed.

GENERAL EDITORS:

M. Ramesh, *National University of Singapore*; Xun Wu, *Hong Kong University of Science and Technology*; Michael Howlett, *Simon Fraser University, British Columbia*

In Defense of Pluralism: Policy Disagreement and Its Media Coverage
By Éric Montpetit

Asia after the Developmental State: Disembedding Autonomy
Edited by Toby Carroll and Darryl S. L. Jarvis

The Politics of Shale Gas in Eastern Europe: Energy Security, Contested Technologies and the Social Licence to Frack
By Andreas Goldthau

Healthy or Sick? Coevolution of Health Care and Public Health in a Comparative Perspective
By Philipp Trein

Healthy or Sick?

Coevolution of Health Care and
Public Health in a Comparative
Perspective

PHILIPP TREIN
University of Lausanne



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42649-7 — Healthy or Sick?
Philipp Trein
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108426497
DOI: 10.1017/9781108670883

© Philipp Trein 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Trein, Philipp, 1981– author.

Title: Healthy or sick? : coevolution of health care and public health in a comparative perspective / Philipp Trein.

Other titles: Cambridge studies in comparative public policy.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2018. | Series: Cambridge studies in comparative public policy | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2018017452 | ISBN 9781108426497 (hardback)

Subjects: | MESH: Health Policy–history | Public Health–history |

Internationality | History, 19th Century | History, 20th Century

Classification: LCC RA418 | NLM WA 11.1 | DDC 362.1–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2018017452>

ISBN 978-1-108-42649-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42649-7 — Healthy or Sick?
Philipp Trein
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

To Thenia

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42649-7 — Healthy or Sick?
Philipp Trein
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> ix
<i>List of Tables</i>	x
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xi
<i>Acronyms</i>	xiii
1 Introduction	1
2 Sectoral Coupling of Health Care and Public Health	19
3 Theoretical Priors	37
4 Global Context and Case Selection	59
5 United Kingdom: Institutional Unification and Tight Coupling of Health Care and Public Health	85
6 Australia: Politicized Professions and Tight Coupling of Health Care and Public Health	113
7 Germany: Dominance of Individual Health Care and Decoupling from Public Health	140
8 Switzerland: Institutional Fragmentation, Depoliticized Health Professions, and Noncoupling	171
9 United States: Politicized Professions and Loose Coupling of Health Care and Public Health	200
10 Coevolution of Policy Sectors: Health Care and Public Health in a Comparative Perspective	234
<i>Appendix A</i>	256
<i>Appendix B</i>	262

viii

Contents

Notes

277

References

282

Index

313

Figures

1.1	Health expenditure and life expectancy.	<i>page 2</i>
1.2	Coevolution of health care and public health.	10
2.1	Ideal-typical coupling of policy sectors.	31
3.1	Overview of the argument.	56
4.1	Expenditure on prevention and cure I (percentage of health expenditure, OECD average).	66
4.2	Expenditure on prevention and cure II (percentage of health expenditure).	67
4.3	Development of GDP in selected countries.	74
10.1	Causal pathways: coevolution of policy sectors.	240
10.2	Coevolution and complementarity of health care and public health.	250
10.3	Coevolution and complementarity per country (percentage of reforms).	251

Tables

1.1	Case studies and empirical implications.	<i>page 9</i>
2.1	Ideal-typical distinction of health care and public health as two different policy sectors.	21
2.2	Ideal-typical coupling of health care and public health.	32
3.1	Professionalism, interest intermediation, type of government, and coupling of health care and public health.	51
4.1	Summary of contextual conditions of health care and public health.	75
4.2	Operationalization of key variables and sources.	81
5.1	Coevolution of health care and public health in the United Kingdom.	106
6.1	Coevolution of health care and public health in Australia.	135
7.1	Coevolution of health care and public health in Germany.	164
8.1	Coevolution of health care and public health in Switzerland.	194
9.1	Coevolution of health care and public health in the United States.	229

Acknowledgments

During the time I spent on this research project, I accumulated numerous debts to colleagues, friends, and members of my family who helped me in many ways. First of all, I want to thank Dietmar Braun, who hired me as a PhD student and teaching assistant, and helped me in many ways throughout the entire project. He diligently read my drafts, chapters, and sketches, always provided many critical and constructive comments on how to pursue this project, and – if necessary – put me back on track.

Second, my thanks go to three colleagues who read previous versions of this manuscript and commented extensively on them: Daniel Kübler who kindly provided me with many helpful comments on how to improve my manuscript – notably on how to structure the argument; Stéphane Nahrath who particularly helped me to situate my manuscript in the comparative public policy literature and re-read important aspects of my conceptualization regarding policy sectors and their relation; and of course Yannis Papadopoulos who had numerous helpful suggestions on how to improve my argument, the framing of this thesis overall, and who hired me as an assistant, always making sure that I was not overloaded with teaching duties. Eventually, I am very grateful to Martino Maggetti for giving me the freedom to work on this book alongside other tasks.

Additionally, I would like to thank the editors of the Cambridge Studies in Comparative Public Policy series and three anonymous reviewers for their very helpful comments and suggestions. I would also like to thank the Swiss National Science Foundation and the Institute of Political, Historical, and International Studies at the University of Lausanne for generous financial support at all stages of my research.

Furthermore, I want to thank a large number of colleagues who helped me with comments and suggestions on how to improve my work: Wally Achtermann, Philip Balsiger, Nils Bandelow,

Ruth Beckmann, Giuliano Bonoli, Aurélien Buffat, Fabrizio de Francesco, Patrick Farfard, Scott Greer, Fabrizio de Francesco, Ted Marmor, Johannes Marx, Julie Pollard, Claudio Radaelli, Harald Saetren, Fritz Sager, Fritz W. Scharpf, Manfred G. Schmidt, Monica Steffen, Eva Thomann, Lorenz Trein, Lars Tummers, Frédérick Varone, Thomas Widmer, the members of the WIPCAD research group at the University of Potsdam, and Stefanie Walter. My thanks also go to colleagues and friends who supported me in many other ways during the process of my PhD project. These are: Daniel Auer, Hakim Bensalah, Sandra Dolderer, Steven Eichenberger, Alain Eloka, Christian Ewert, Gerold Eyrich, Flavia Fossati, David Giauque, Edoardo Guaschino, Bob Hancké, Dorte Hering, Ewoud Lauwerier, Fabienne Liechti, André Mach, Gian-Andrea Monsch, Markus Orth, Andrea Pilotti, Delia Pisoni, Carolina Rossini, Christian Ruiz, Johanna Schnabel, Marco Silvestri, and Björn Uhlmann.

This book is dedicated to my wife Thenia for her love, patience, and support. Without her constant encouragement, I would not have been able to finish this project.

Acronyms

AAAS	American Association for the Advancement of Science
ACoSH	Action Council on Smoking and Health, Australia
AHA	Area Health Authority, UK
AHV	Alters- und Hinterlassenenversicherung, Switzerland
AMA	American Medical Association
AUSMA	Australian Medical Association
ASH	Action on Smoking and Health
AUS	Australia
BMA	British Medical Association
CACR	Centre Anti-Cancéreux Romand
CDP	Cantonal Directors of Public Health, Switzerland
CG	Central government
CHP	Community Health Program, Australia
CME	Coordinated market economy
CW	Commonwealth of Australia
DHA	District Health Authority, UK
DHHS	United States Department of Health and Human Services
DRG	Diagnosis-related groups
EHI	Etatist Health Insurance
FAZ	Frankfurter Allgemeine Sonntagszeitung
FCTC	Framework Convention on Tobacco Control
FDR	Federal Democratic Republic of Germany
FSA	Federal Security Agency, USA
GB	Great Britain
GDR	German Democratic Republic
HC	Health care
HTA	Health technology assessment
IMNA	Institute of Medicine of the National Academies, US
JPCSS	Joint Parliamentary Committee of Social Security, Australia

LME	Liberal market Economy
LTC	Long-term care
MOH	Medical officer of health, UK
NHI	National health insurance
NHMRC	National Health and Medical Research Council, Australia
NHS	National Health Service
NRW	North Rhine-Westphalia, Germany
NS	National Socialism
NSDAP	Nationalsozialistische Deutsche Arbeiterpartei, Germany
NSW	New South Wales
NZ	New Zealand
PBS	Pharmaceutical Benefits Scheme, Australia
PH	Public health
PHI	Private health insurance
PHIAC	Private Health Insurance Administration Council, Australia
PHIO	Private Health Insurance Ombudsman, Australia
QUE	Queensland
RACP	Royal Australian College of Physicians
RACS	Royal Australian College of Surgeons
SA	Southern Australia
SHI	Social health insurance
SKI	Schweizerisches Krankenhausinstitut, Switzerland
SUVA	Schweizerische Unfallversicherungsanstalt, Switzerland
TAS	Tasmania
TB	Tuberculosis
USPHS	United States Public Health Service
VIC	Victoria
VoC	Varieties of capitalism
WA	Western Australia
WHO	World Health Organization
WZB	Wissenschaftszentrum Berlin