

An Incarnational Model of the Eucharist

The Eucharist is at the heart of Christian worship, and at the heart of the Eucharist are the curious phrases, ‘This is my body’ and ‘This is my blood.’ James M. Arcadi offers a constructive proposal for understanding Christ’s presence in the Eucharist that draws on contemporary conceptual resources and is faithful to the history of interpretation. He locates his proposal along a spectrum of Eucharistic theories. Arcadi explores the motif of God’s presence related to divine omnipresence and special presence in holy places, which undergirds a biblical–theological proposal concerning Christ’s presence. Utilizing recent work in speech-act theory, Arcadi probes the acts of consecration and renaming in their biblical and liturgical contexts. A thorough examination of recent work in Christology leads to an action model of the Incarnation that borrows the notion of enabling externalism from philosophy of mind. These threads undergird an impanation model of Christ’s presence in the Eucharist.

JAMES M. ARCADİ is a Postdoctoral Research Fellow in the Analytic Theology project at Fuller Theological Seminary. From 2015–2017, he was a Research Fellow in the Jewish Philosophical Theology project at the Herzl Institute. His articles have appeared in *Religious Studies*, *Topoi*, *Heythrop Journal*, and *Philosophy Compass*. He is the co-editor for special issues of the journals *TheoLogica* and *Open Theology*.

CURRENT ISSUES IN THEOLOGY

General Editor:

Iain Torrance
Pro-Chancellor of the University of Aberdeen

Editorial Advisory Board:

David Ford *University of Cambridge*
Bryan Spinks *Yale University*
Kathryn Tanner *Yale Divinity School*

There is a need among upper-undergraduate and graduate students of theology, as well as among Christian teachers and church professionals, for a series of short, focussed studies of particular key topics in theology written by prominent theologians. *Current Issues in Theology* meets this need.

The books in the series are designed to provide a 'state-of-the-art' statement on the topic in question, engaging with contemporary thinking as well as providing original insights. The aim is to publish books which stand between the static monograph genre and the more immediate statement of a journal article, by authors who are questioning existing paradigms or rethinking perspectives.

Other titles in the series:

Holy Scripture John Webster
The Just War Revisited Oliver O'Donovan
Bodies and Souls, or Spirited Bodies? Nancey Murphy
Christ and Horrors Marilyn McCord Adams
Divinity and Humanity Oliver D. Crisp
The Eucharist and Ecumenism George Hunsinger
Christ the Key Kathryn Tanner
Theology without Metaphysics Kevin W. Hector
Reconsidering John Calvin Randall C. Zachman
God's Presence Frances Young

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-42589-6 — An Incarnational Model of the Eucharist

James M. Arcadi

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

JAMES M. ARCADI

Fuller Theological Seminary, California

An Incarnational Model of the Eucharist



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42589-6 — An Incarnational Model of the Eucharist
James M. Arcadi
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108425896

DOI: 10.1017/9781108588560

© James M. Arcadi 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Arcadi, James M., 1981– author.

Title: An incarnational model of the Eucharist / James M. Arcadi,
Fuller Theological Seminary, California.

Description: New York: Cambridge University Press, 2018. |

Series: Current issues in theology | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2017053515 | ISBN 9781108425896 (hardback) |

ISBN 9781108441773 (paperback)

Subjects: LCSH: Lord's Supper. | Jesus Christ – Presence. | Incarnation.

Classification: LCC BV825.3.A73 2018 | DDC 234/.163–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2017053515>

ISBN 978-1-108-42589-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42589-6 — An Incarnational Model of the Eucharist
James M. Arcadi
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

For Alli

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-42589-6 — An Incarnational Model of the Eucharist

James M. Arcadi

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

Contents

	<i>List of Tables</i>	page x
	<i>Preface</i>	xi
1	Discerning the Body of Christ	1
	Declarative Theology	2
	Some Conceptual Preliminaries	8
	A Spectrum of Views on the Eucharist	13
	A Preview of What is to Come	23
2	Known in the Breaking of Bread:	
	A Biblical–Theological Foundation for the Eucharist	26
	A Little of ‘This’	27
	Bread Cup	32
	Hunsinger’s ‘Real Predication’	36
	‘Because I Go to the Father, You Will See Me No Longer’	48
	The Epistemology of Emmaus	51
	The Epistemology of the Eucharist	57
	Participating in the Bodily Presence of Christ	58
3	‘Holy to the Lord’: Speech-Acts, Consecration, and the Divine Presence	62
	Speech-Act Theory	63
	Alstonian EXERCITIVES	66
	Towards a Definition of Consecration	71
	The EXERCITIVE of Consecration	74
	Divine Presence: Omni- and Special	85
		vii

CONTENTS

	Refining Holiness	101
	Towards the Eucharist	103
	The Eucharistic EXERCITIVE of Consecration	105
	Eucharistic Ownership and Theophany	110
4	What's in a (Re)Name? That Which We Call Bread, by Another Name Would Be Christ's Body	111
	Singular Terms as Names	113
	The EXERCITIVE of Renaming	117
	The Eucharistic EXERCITIVE of Renaming	120
	Dual-Named	128
	Plantinga's Boethian Compromise	130
	Bread <i>and</i> Body	139
5	Christology for the Eucharist	142
	The 'Definition' of Chalcedon	143
	Theological Methodology	148
	The Contemporary Family Tree	152
	The <i>Three-Part, Concrete-Compositional</i> Model and the Conciliar Tutelage	165
	Rogers' Action Model of the Incarnation	170
	Instrumentalism in Thomas	174
	Ownership in Crisp	179
	Instrumentalism and Enabling Externalism	180
	<i>First-Person</i> Private Instrumental Ownership	186
	Conclusion	190
6	Varieties of Impanation	193
	Corporeal Mode Models of the Eucharist	194
	The <i>Three-Part, Concrete-Compositional</i> Model of Christ and the Eucharist	196
	Types of Impanation	199
	A Specific Historical Survey Pertaining to Impanation	216
	Deficiencies of Hypostatic and Natural Impanation	231

CONTENTS

7	Sacramental Impanation: An Incarnational Model of the Eucharist	240
	Sacramental Impanation, Enabling Externalism, and the Chalcedonian Tutelage	241
	Sacramental Impanation as a Variation on a Hunsingerian Theme	250
	Objections to Sacramental Impanation	258
	Some Benefits of Sacramental Impanation	274
	Epilogue	282
	<i>Bibliography</i>	291
	<i>Index</i>	303

Tables

2.1 Bread/Cup action parallelism	<i>page</i> 33
2.2 Bread/Cup grammatical parallelism – English	35
2.3 Bread/Cup grammatical parallelism – Greek	35
2.4 Bread/Cup grammatical parallelism – Greek transliterated	35
2.5 Last Supper/Emmaus action parallelism	54
2.6 Last Supper/Emmaus grammatical parallelism	54
2.7 Corinthians 10.16 participation relations	60

Preface

The history of Christian theological reflection has seen no shortage of attempts to explicate the curious words Christ uttered at the Last Supper. I do not pretend that this book will settle all the disputes pertaining to this doctrine in one fell swoop. However, by updating a neglected Eucharistic motif with contemporary conceptual resources, I propose a novel account of an incarnational model of Christ's presence in the Eucharist.

This book, written for the glory of God and in service to God's kingdom, has had a long gestation period and thus its birth is due to the contributions of many. This project began as my thesis at the University of Bristol. As such, I owe an unrepayable debt of gratitude to the conceptual midwifery of my *doktorvater* Oliver D. Crisp. I am also grateful for the comments and encouragement of my examiners, Gavin D'Costa and Alan Torrance. I am and will be forever grateful for Bonnie and Caleb Loring III, who provided financial and spiritual support for my research; very few of the concepts of this book would ever have been expressed had it not been for their magnanimity. Although my degree was from Bristol, the vast majority of the writing of this piece was undertaken in New England, where the institutions of Gordon College and Christ the Redeemer Anglican Church served as my academic and ecclesial homes. I am grateful for the hospitality and encouragement of Gordon faculty: Dan Russ, Tal Howard, Bruce Webb(†), and Jennifer Hevelone-Harper. My own sacramental life was nourished by serving alongside of the clergy of Christ the Redeemer, especially the Reverends Jürgen Liias, Timothy Clayton, and Brian Barry. Some of the ideas contained herein were

PREFACE

tested in the fires of conversation with a small cadre of Crispians with whom no dialectical preamble was ever necessary: Jordan Wessling, Ben Arbour, Joshua Farris, and Mark Hamilton. These voices were joined more recently by J. T. Turner, Christopher Woznicki, Jesse Gentile, and James Crocker.

Various aspects of the research presented here have been supported by funding from the John Templeton Foundation mediated through various intermediaries, including the Analytic Theology project at Fuller Theological Seminary, the Center for Philosophy of Religion at the University of Notre Dame, the Jewish Philosophical Theology project at the Herzl Institute, and the Classical Theism project at the University of St. Thomas (Minnesota). I am grateful that these institutions have seen my research worthy of Sir John's patronage.

The Very Reverend Professor Sir Iain Torrance and Beatrice Rehl, as well as the rest of the staff at Cambridge University Press, have been helpful ushers in the process of moving this project along. I am also grateful to two anonymous reviewers for Cambridge whose comments have improved aspects of this work.

Because of the long gestation period of this project, and because my thoughts always seems so tangled up with one another, piecemeal versions of the research expressed here have seen the light of publication in the following forms: 'A Theory of Consecration: A Philosophical Exposition of a Biblical Phenomenon', *The Heythrop Journal* 54.6 (2013): 913–925; 'Impanation, Incarnation, and Enabling Externalism', *Religious Studies* 51.1 (2015): 75–90; 'Kryptic or Cryptic? The Divine Preconscious Model of the Incarnation as a Concrete-nature Christology', *Neue Zeitschrift für Systematische Theologie und Religionsphilosophie* 58.2 (2016): 229–243; 'Recent Philosophical Work on the Doctrine of the Eucharist', *Philosophy Compass* 11.7 (2016): 402–412; 'An Instrumental Explication of George Hunsinger's Eucharistic Real Predication' in *Marking the Church: Essays in Ecclesiology*, eds. Greg Peters and Matt Jenson (Eugene, OR: Pickwick Publications, 2016), pp. 138–150; and 'God

PREFACE

Is Where God Acts: Reconceiving Divine Omnipresence,' *Topoi* 36.4 (2017): 631-639; I am grateful to the publishers for permission to reproduce these materials, as well as the review processes that have served to sharpen my thought.

Finally, and foremost, I am grateful to my family for the love, encouragement, and respites from writing they have offered me. The conscious lives of my children, Dominic, Clare, and Simeon, have always included my working on 'daddy's book'. My wife, Alli, has been a constant and steady source of inspiration. She has tirelessly managed her life, the lives of our children, and, at times, my life to provide me with the space adequate to the task. Her efforts have been great and it is to her that I dedicate this book.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-42589-6 — An Incarnational Model of the Eucharist

James M. Arcadi

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)
