



Wittgenstein in the 1930s

Wittgenstein's "middle period" is often seen as a transitional phase connecting his better-known early and later philosophies. The fifteen essays in this volume focus both on the distinctive character of his teaching and writing in the 1930s, and on its pivotal importance for an understanding of his philosophy as a whole. They offer wide-ranging perspectives on the central issue of how best to identify changes and continuities in his philosophy during those years, as well as on particular topics in the philosophy of mind, religion, ethics, aesthetics, and the philosophy of mathematics. The volume will be valuable for all who are interested in this formative period of Wittgenstein's development.

DAVID G. STERN is Professor of Philosophy and a Collegiate Fellow in the College of Liberal Arts and Sciences at the University of Iowa. He is the author of *Wittgenstein's Philosophical Investigations: An Introduction* (CUP, 2004) and *Wittgenstein on Mind and Language* (1995), as well as more than 50 journal articles and book chapters. He is also a coeditor of *The Cambridge Companion to Wittgenstein* (CUP, 2nd edition, 2018), *Wittgenstein: Lectures, Cambridge 1930–1933, from the Notes of G. E. Moore* (CUP, 2016), and *Wittgenstein Reads Weininger* (CUP, 2004).

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42587-2 — Wittgenstein in the 1930s
Edited by David G. Stern
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Wittgenstein in the 1930s

Between the *Tractatus* and the *Investigations*

Edited by

DAVID G. STERN
University of Iowa



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42587-2 — Wittgenstein in the 1930s
Edited by David G. Stern
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108425872

DOI: 10.1017/9781108349260

© Cambridge University Press 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed and bound in Great Britain by Clays Ltd, Elcograf S.p.A.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Stern, David G., editor.

Title: Wittgenstein in the 1930s : between the Tractatus and the Investigations / edited by David G. Stern.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2018. | Includes bibliographical references.

Identifiers: LCCN 2018009855 | ISBN 9781108425872

Subjects: LCSH: Wittgenstein, Ludwig, 1889–1951.

Classification: LCC B3376.W564 W521455 2018 | DDC 192–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2018009855>

ISBN 978-1-108-42587-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Walking with Wittgenstein

*My father was equable and mild. Not so
Was Ludwig Wittgenstein. His lean
Body twitched nervously and his musician's
Hands never ceased from movement, nor his bony
Ankles and feet. He never would sit still,
As though the violence of his thoughts made slow
Deliberate movement quite impossible.
Yet there were times his nervous face went stony
And quiet as he brooded on the green
Meaning of things. His thoughts resembled flowers
Drawn by a delicate hand. In golden showers
They flickered silently across his face.
Anxiety kept to his bodily conditions,
His knitted brows, his knotted legs. His thoughts had grace.*

*Walking with Wittgenstein was like a race,
But a race for hobbled boys, three-legged dwarfs,
Fantastic wizards. Nothing went by halves.
He strode ahead, all joints, his noble face
Swept by the wind, his eyes darting about,
Observant and perceptive as his mind,
And just as nervous, earnest, and devout
In seeking truth, and also just as kind.
But often he saw nothing but the river
Of his own thoughts, the nervously twitching veins
Of fine distinctions, philosophic gains
And losses, victories, defeats.
For, while he loved the people in the streets,
Philosophy alone rushed on forever.*

Nicholas Moore, poet and son of G. E. Moore

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42587-2 — Wittgenstein in the 1930s
Edited by David G. Stern
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Contents

<i>List of Contributors</i>	page ix
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xii
Introduction: Wittgenstein between the <i>Tractatus</i> and the <i>Investigations</i> <i>David G. Stern</i>	1
Part I Changes and Continuities in Wittgenstein's Philosophy	25
1 Wittgenstein and Moore on Grammar <i>David G. Stern</i>	27
2 Wittgenstein on Understanding: Language, Calculus, and Practice <i>Alois Pichler</i>	45
3 Wittgenstein on Sentence-Hypotheses and Certainty <i>Mauro L. Engelmann</i>	61
4 Wittgenstein on Meaning, Use, and Linguistic Commitment <i>Anna Boncompagni</i>	77
5 Will There Soon Be Skilful Philosophers? Wittgenstein on Himself, His Work, and the State of Civilization in 1930 <i>Wolfgang Kienzler</i>	93
6 Wittgenstein and His Students: 1929–1933 <i>James C. Klagge</i>	109
Part II Philosophy of Mind	123
7 From Moore's Lecture Notes to Wittgenstein's <i>Blue Book</i> : The Emergence of Wittgenstein's Performative Conception of the Self <i>Hans Sluga</i>	125
	vii

viii	<i>Contents</i>
8 “Two Kinds of Use of ‘I’”: The Middle Wittgenstein on “I” and the Self <i>William Child</i>	141
9 Wittgenstein on Rules and the Mental <i>Volker A. Munz</i>	158
Part III Religion, Ethics, and Aesthetics	175
10 Wittgenstein’s Discussion of “Use of Such a Word as ‘God’” <i>Anat Biletzki</i>	177
11 Wittgenstein on Ethics, May 1933 <i>Duncan Richter</i>	194
12 Wittgenstein on Aesthetic Normativity and Grammar <i>Hanne Appelqvist</i>	209
13 Wittgenstein’s Remarks on Aesthetics and Their Context <i>Joachim Schulte</i>	224
Part IV Philosophy of Mathematics	239
14 Moore’s Notes and Wittgenstein’s Philosophy of Mathematics: The Case of Mathematical Induction <i>Warren Goldfarb</i>	241
15 Wittgenstein, Goodstein, and the Origin of the Uniqueness Rule for Primitive Recursive Arithmetic <i>Mathieu Marion and Mitsuhiro Okada</i>	253
<i>Bibliography</i>	272
<i>Index</i>	290

Contributors

Hanne Appelqvist, Docent of Theoretical Philosophy, University of Helsinki, and Fellow of the Turku Institute for Advanced Studies, University of Turku. She is the author of *Wittgenstein and the Conditions of Musical Communication* (2008) and has published several articles on the Kantian features of Wittgenstein's thought.

Anat Biletzki, Albert Schweitzer Professor of Philosophy, Quinnipiac University, Hamden, CT, and Tel-Aviv University, Israel. She is the author of *(Over)Interpreting Wittgenstein* (2003) and *Talking Wolves: Thomas Hobbes on the Language of Politics and the Politics of Language* (1997).

Anna Boncompagni, Chancellor's ADVANCE Postdoctoral Fellow, University of California, Irvine. She is the author of *Wittgenstein and Pragmatism: On Certainty in the Light of Peirce and James* (2016) and *Wittgenstein: Lo sguardo e il limite* (2012).

William Child, Professor of Philosophy, University of Oxford. He is the author of *Wittgenstein* (2011) and *Causality, Interpretation, and the Mind* (1994), and coeditor, with David Charles, of *Wittgensteinian Themes: Essays in Honour of David Pears* (2001).

Mauro L. Engelmann, Professor of Philosophy at the Federal University of Minas Gerais (UFMG), Brazil, and researcher at the National Research Council (CNPq). He is the author of *Wittgenstein's Philosophical Development: Phenomenology, Grammar, Method and the Anthropological View* (2013) and a number of articles on Wittgenstein and the history of analytic philosophy.

Warren Goldfarb, W. B. Pearson Professor of Modern Mathematics and Mathematical Logic, Harvard University. He coauthored, with Burton Dreben, *The Decision Problem: Solvable Classes of Quantificational Formulas* (1979), and coedited, with Solomon

Feferman et al., Kurt Gödel's *Collected Works*, vol. III (1995), vols. IV–V (2003), and has published many papers on mathematical logic, the development of analytic philosophy, and on issues in metaphysics and philosophical logic.

Wolfgang Kienzler, teaches philosophy at Friedrich Schiller University Jena, Germany. He is the author of books (in German) on Wittgenstein's turn to his late philosophy, 1930–1932 (1997), Wittgenstein's *Philosophical Investigations* (2007), and a study of the development of Frege's thought (2009).

James C. Klagge, Professor of Philosophy, Virginia Tech. He is the author of *Wittgenstein in Exile* (2011) and *Simply Wittgenstein* (2016), editor of *Wittgenstein: Biography and Philosophy* (2001), and coeditor, with Alfred Nordmann, of two collections of Wittgenstein's writing, *Philosophical Occasions, 1912–1951* (1993) and *Public and Private Occasions* (2003).

Mathieu Marion, Professor of Philosophy, University of Quebec at Montreal. He is the author of two books on Wittgenstein: *Wittgenstein, Finitism, and the Foundations of Mathematics* (1998), and an introduction (in French) to the *Tractatus* (2004), as well as a number of papers on Wittgenstein and the history of analytic philosophy.

Volker A. Munz, Associate Professor, Department of Philosophy, University of Klagenfurt, Klagenfurt, Austria. He is the author of *Satz und Sinn* (2005) and coeditor, with Bernhard Ritter, of *Wittgenstein's Whewell's Court Lectures, Cambridge 1938–1941* (2017).

Mitsuhiro Okada, Professor of Philosophy, Keio University, Japan. He has published widely on logic in general, and proof theory in particular, as well as on logical philosophy and philosophy of mathematics, epistemology, semantics, and historical studies in logic and philosophy.

Alois Pichler, Professor of Philosophy, and Director of the Wittgenstein Archives at the University of Bergen, Norway. He is the author of *Wittgenstein's Philosophical Investigations: From the Book to the Album* (2004) and coeditor, with Simo Säätelä, of *Wittgenstein: The Philosopher and His Works* (2005).

Duncan Richter, Professor of Philosophy, Charles S. Luck III '55 Institute Professor, Virginia Military Institute. He is the author of five

List of Contributors

xi

books; the most recent are the second edition of a *Historical Dictionary of Wittgenstein's Philosophy* (2014) and *Anscombe's Moral Philosophy* (2011).

Joachim Schulte, recently retired from teaching at University of Zurich, Switzerland. His publications include numerous articles and four books on Wittgenstein as well as critical editions of his main works; with P. M. S. Hacker, he edited and translated the revised fourth edition of Wittgenstein's *Philosophical Investigations* (2009).

Hans Sluga, William and Trudy Ausfahl Professor of Philosophy, University of California, Berkeley. He is the author of *Heidegger's Crisis: Philosophy and Politics in Nazi Germany* (1993), *Wittgenstein* (2011), and *Politics and the Search for the Common Good* (2014).

David G. Stern, Professor of Philosophy and a Collegiate Fellow in the College of Liberal Arts and Sciences at the University of Iowa. He is the coeditor, with Brian Rogers and Gabriel Citron, of *Wittgenstein: Lectures, Cambridge 1930–1933, From the Notes of G. E. Moore* (2016) and the author of *Wittgenstein on Mind and Language* (1995) and *Wittgenstein's Philosophical Investigations: An Introduction* (2004).

Abbreviations

AWL	<i>Wittgenstein's Lectures, Cambridge 1932–1935</i> , edited by A. Ambrose
BLBK	<i>The Blue Book</i>
BRBK	<i>The Brown Book</i>
BT	<i>The Big Typescript</i>
CPJ	Kant, <i>Critique of the Power of Judgment</i>
CPR	Kant, <i>Critique of Pure Reason</i>
CV ¹	<i>Culture and Value</i>
LC	<i>Lectures and Conversations on Aesthetics, Psychology and Religious Belief</i>
LE	“A Lecture on Ethics” (In PO)
LFM	<i>Wittgenstein's Lectures on the Foundations of Mathematics, Cambridge 1939</i>
LWL	<i>Wittgenstein's Lectures, Cambridge 1930–1932</i> , edited by D. Lee
M	<i>Wittgenstein: Lectures, Cambridge 1930–1933, From the Notes of G. E. Moore</i>
MS	Manuscript in <i>Wittgenstein's Nachlass: The Bergen Electronic Edition</i>
Ms-	Manuscript in <i>Wittgenstein Source Bergen Nachlass Edition</i>
MWL	Moore, G. E. “Wittgenstein's Lectures in 1930–33” (In PO)
NB	<i>Notebooks 1914–1916</i>
OC	<i>On Certainty</i>
PG	<i>Philosophical Grammar</i>
PI	<i>Philosophical Investigations</i>
PO	<i>Philosophical Occasions</i>
PPO	<i>Ludwig Wittgenstein: Public and Private Occasions</i>

¹ References to *Culture and Value* are cited from both the 1980 English translation edition and the 1998 revised second edition; e.g., the 1930 “Sketch for a Foreword” is cited as CV, 1980: 6–8; 1998: 8–11.

List of Abbreviations

xiii

PR	<i>Philosophical Remarks</i>
RFM	<i>Remarks on the Foundations of Mathematics</i>
RLF	“Some Remarks on Logical Form” (In PO)
RPPH	<i>Remarks on the Philosophy of Psychology</i> , vol. II
TLP	<i>Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus</i>
TS	Typescript in <i>Wittgenstein’s Nachlass: The Bergen Electronic Edition</i>
Ts-	Typescript in <i>Wittgenstein Source Bergen Nachlass Edition</i>
VW	<i>The Voices of Wittgenstein. The Vienna Circle</i>
WC	<i>Wittgenstein in Cambridge: Letters and Documents 1911–1951</i>
Wi3	<i>Wiener Ausgabe Band 3</i> [MSS 109–110]
Wi4	<i>Wiener Ausgabe Band 4</i> [MSS 111–112]
Wi5	<i>Wiener Ausgabe Band 5</i> [MSS 113–114]
WWCL	<i>Wittgenstein’s Whewell’s Court Lectures, Cambridge 1938–1941</i>
WWK	<i>Waismann, Wittgenstein and the Vienna Circle</i>
Z	Zettel

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42587-2 — Wittgenstein in the 1930s
Edited by David G. Stern
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)
