CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42369-4 — Debunking Arguments in Ethics
Hanno Sauer
Frontmatter
More Information

DEBUNKING ARGUMENTS IN ETHICS

In this crisply written book, Hanno Sauer offers the first book-length treatment of debunking arguments in ethics, developing an empirically informed and philosophically sophisticated account of genealogical arguments and their significance for the reliability of moral cognition. He breaks new ground by introducing a series of novel distinctions into the current debate, which allows him to develop a framework for assessing the prospects of debunking or vindicating our moral intuitions. He also challenges the justification of some of our moral judgments by showing that they are based on epistemically defective processes. His book is an original, cutting-edge contribution to the burgeoning field of empirically informed metaethics and will interest philosophers, psychologists, and anyone interested in how – and whether – moral judgment works.

HANNO SAUER is Assistant Professor of Ethics at the Department of Philosophy at Utrecht University and a member of the Ethics Institute. He is the author of *Who's Afraid of Instrumental Reason? Instrumentelle Vernunft und die Diagnose sozialer Pathologien* (2009) and *Moral Judgments as Educated Intuitions* (2017). Sauer has published articles in a number of journals including *Philosophical Studies*, *The Journal of Ethics*, *Philosophical Psychology*, and *Ethical Theory and Moral Practice.*

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42369-4 — Debunking Arguments in Ethics
Hanno Sauer
Frontmatter
More Information

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42369-4 — Debunking Arguments in Ethics
Hanno Sauer
Frontmatter
More Information

DEBUNKING ARGUMENTS IN ETHICS

HANNO SAUER
University of Utrecht

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42369-4 — Debunking Arguments in Ethics
Hanno Sauer
Frontmatter
More Information

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108423694
DOI: 10.1017/9781108529181

© Hanno Sauer 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018
Printed and bound in Great Britain by Clays Ltd, Elcograf S.p.A

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data
NAMES: Sauer, Hanno, author.
TITLE: Debunking arguments in ethics / Hanno Sauer, Universiteit Utrecht, The Netherlands.
DESCRIPTION: 1 [edition]. | New York : Cambridge University Press, 2018. | Includes bibliographical references.
IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2018009838 | ISBN 9781108423694 (Hardback)
SUBJECTS: LCSH: Ethics. | Ethics, Evolutionary.
CLASSIFICATION: LCC BJ1012 .S333 2018 | DDC 170/.42–dc23
LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2018009838

ISBN 978-1-108-42369-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42369-4 — Debunking Arguments in Ethics
Hanno Sauer
Frontmatter
More Information

Contents

List of Figures *page* viii
List of Tables ix
Acknowledgments x

Introduction: Debunking Arguments and the Gap 1
I.1 Cornflakes and Critical Theory 1
I.2 A Cold, Hard Look 4
I.3 The Gap 6
I.4 Normative Theory 9
I.5 Moral Agency 13
I.6 Moral and Nonmoral Judgment 16
I.7 Moral Intuition 20
I.8 Outline of the Book 24

PART I DEBUNKING 27

1 Debunking Explained: Structure and Typology 29
Introduction 29
1.1 The Structure of Debunking 30
1.2 Selective or Global? 31
1.3 Off Track 32
1.4 Obsoleteness 33
1.5 Symmetry 36
1.6 Detection Error 38
1.7 Inconsistency 41
1.8 Ignoble Origins 44
Conclusion 46

2 Debunking Defused: The Metaethical Turn 48
Introduction 48
2.1 The Darwinian Dilemma 50
2.2 The Weakest Link 53
2.3 Metaethical or Substantive Debunking? 56

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42369-4 — Debunking Arguments in Ethics
Hanno Sauer
Frontmatter
More Information

2.4 Against the Metaethical Turn 60
2.5 A Diagnosis: Prior Plausibility 63
Conclusion 67

3 Debunking Contained: Selective and Global Scope 70
Introduction 70
3.1 Scope: Wide and Narrow Debunking 71
3.2 Process or Best Explanation? 72
3.3 Distance: Distal and Proximal Debunking 73
3.4 Bad Debunking! 74
3.5 Depth: Shallow and Deep Debunking 74
3.6 Trade-Offs and Elective Affinities 79
3.7 Global Debunking: Garbage In, Garbage Out 81
3.8 Selective Debunking: Disgust, Deontology, Partiality 85
3.9 The Instability of Selective Debunking: Collapse 89
3.10 The Instability of Selective Debunking: Regress 90
3.11 The Instability of Global Debunking: Overgeneralization 92
Conclusion 95

PART II DISAGREEMENT 97

4 Debunking Realism: Moral Disagreement 99
Introduction 99
4.1 The Empirical Case against Realism 100
4.2 The Right Kind of Disagreement 103
4.3 Moral Convergence and the Right Kind of Disagreement 110
4.4 Moral Convergence and Debunking 114
Conclusion 118

5 Debunking Conservatism: Political Disagreement 119
Introduction 119
5.1 Moral Foundations 120
5.2 The Asymmetry of Understanding 122
5.3 Against Social Intuitionism 130
5.4 Against Moral Foundations 133
5.5 Debunking Conservatism 135
5.6 Moral Foundations for Liberals 143
Conclusion 145

PART III DEONTOLOGY 147

6 Debunking Details: The Perils of Trolleyology 149
Introduction 149
6.1 Trolleyology 153
6.2 Unfamiliarity 155

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42369-4 — Debunking Arguments in Ethics
Hanno Sauer
Frontmatter
More Information

6.3 The Difference Argument 157
6.4 Ecological Validity 160
6.5 Novelty 161
6.6 Imaginative Resistance 163
6.7 Specificity 164
6.8 Certainty 166
6.9 Revisiting the Difference Argument 168
6.10 Whither Trolleyology? 174
Conclusion 176

7 Debunking Doctrines: Double or Knobe Effect? 178
Introduction 178
7.1 Three Questions: Methodological, Substantive, Normative 181
7.2 From Unification to Scope 185
7.3 The Obstacle Model 191
7.4 Relevant Alternatives? 197
7.5 Normative Implications: Deontology Debunked? 203
Conclusion 205

PART IV CONCLUSION 207

8 Vindicating Arguments 209
Introduction 209
8.1 Affirmative Vindication and Vindication by Elimination 209
8.2 Vindicating Arguments: Structure 210
8.3 Vindicating Arguments: Features 213
8.4 Bridging the Gap 218

References 222
Index 239

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42369-4 — Debunking Arguments in Ethics
Hanno Sauer
Frontmatter
More Information

Figures

3.1 Evolutionary debunking: Deep *off-track* debunking of M{all moral judgments} *page* 77
3.2 Framing effects: Shallow *symmetry* debunking of M{moral judgments which are susceptible to framing effects} 77
3.3 Disgust: Medium-deep *hypersensitivity* debunking of M{moral judgments resulting from disgust responses} 78

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42369-4 — Debunking Arguments in Ethics
Hanno Sauer
Frontmatter
More Information

Tables

3.1 Permutations of Debunking *page* 80
4.1 Defusing Explanations 102
4.2 Content of the Right Kind of Disagreement 111
4.3 The Right Kind of Disagreement: Sources and Content 117

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42369-4 — Debunking Arguments in Ethics
Hanno Sauer
Frontmatter
More Information

Acknowledgments

This book has been greatly improved by the constructive (and occasionally also by the less constructive) feedback I received from audiences at Barchem, Berlin, Bielefeld, Bochum, Eindhoven, Groningen, Münster, Nijmegen, Osnabrück, Potsdam, Rotterdam, Salzburg, Tilburg, Tübingen, Toronto, Utrecht, and Zürich. I am grateful for the many helpful conversations on the topic of this book and the organizers of the events above for making those conversations possible.

Some of the chapters draw on previously published material: the introduction is based on my "Between Facts and Norms: Ethics and Empirical Moral Psychology." In: Voyer, B. and Tarantola, T. (2017). *Moral Psychology*: *A Multidisciplinary Guide*. Springer. Chapter 5 is based on "Can't We All Disagree More Constructively? Moral Foundations, Moral Reasoning, and Political Disagreement," *Neuroethics* 8(2), 153–169. Chapter 7 is based on "It's the Knobe Effect, Stupid! How (and How Not) to Explain the Side-Effect Effect," *Review of Philosophy and Psychology*, 5(4), 485–503. I am grateful to the editors and publishers for permission to reuse this material.

Special thanks go to Neil Roughley and the participants of his Oberseminar at the Universität Duisburg-Essen for discussing various draft chapters with me, the participants of the Moral Psychology and Evolution Research Master seminar I cotaught with Joel Anderson at Utrecht University, Mark Alfano for reading the whole manuscript and providing extremely thorough and helpful feedback, and the various anonymous referees who helped me improve the manuscript in countless ways.

Moreover, I want to thank Joel Anderson, James Andow, Tom Bates, Constanze Binder, Matthew Braddock, Christoph Bublitz, Matteo Colombo, Sabine Döring, Susan Dwyer, Thyra Elsasser, Daan Evers, Anika Fiebich, Lily Frank, Machteld Geuskens, Aglaia von Götz, Joshua Greene, Thomas Grundmann, Joseph Heath, Frank Hindriks, Jeroen Hopster, Joachim Horvath, Silvia Ivani, Fleur Jongepier, Wouter Kalf, Jeanette

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42369-4 — Debunking Arguments in Ethics
Hanno Sauer
Frontmatter
More Information

Kennett, Dominik Klein, Pauline Kleingeld, Michael Klenk, Sebastian Köhler, Peter Königs, Felicitas Krämer, Victor Kumar, Marjolein Lanzing, Neil Levy, Sem de Maagt, Heidi Maibom, Alessandra Marra, Anthonie Meijers, Bert Musschenga, Albert Newen, Philip Nickel, Sven Nyholm, Tristram Oliver-Skuse, Norbert Paulo, James Pearson, Herman Philipse, Kevin Reuter, Regina Rini, Arthur Ripstein, Scott Robbins, Carel van Schaik, Larissa Schmidt, Eleonora Severini, Maureen Sie, Jan Sprenger, Sharon Street, Bart Streumer, Sergio Tenenbaum, Alan Thomas, Christine Tiefensee, Peter Timmerman, Laura Valentini, Bruno Verbeek, Joseph Walsh, Pascale Willemsen, Joeri Witteveen, and Jonathan Webber. They made the book a much better one.

I am also extremely grateful to my editor Hilary Gaskin and the rest of the team at Cambridge University Press. Their expertise, kindness, and professionalism made it enormously pleasant to work with them on the publication of this book.

I dedicate this book to my daughters Clara and Julia – χάος and κόσμος.

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-42369-4 — Debunking Arguments in Ethics
Hanno Sauer
Frontmatter
More Information

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org