

## NARRATIVE AND METAPHOR IN THE LAW

It has long been recognized that court trials, both criminal and civil, in the common law system, operate around pairs of competing narratives told by opposing advocates. In recent years, however, it has increasingly been argued that narrative flows in many directions and through every form of legal theory and practice. Interest in the part played by metaphor in the law, including metaphors for the law, and for many standard concepts in legal practice, has also been strong, though research under the metaphor banner has been much more fragmentary. In this book, for the first time, a distinguished group of legal scholars, collaborating with specialists from cognitive theory, journalism, rhetoric, social psychology, criminology, and legal activism, explore how narrative and metaphor are both vital to the legal process. Together, they examine topics including concepts of law, legal persuasion, human rights law, gender in the law, innovations in legal thinking, legal activism, creative work around the law, and public debate around crime and punishment.

Michael Hanne founded the Comparative Literature Programme at the University of Auckland, New Zealand and directed it until his retirement in 2010. He has published “Binocular Vision: Narrative and Metaphor in Medicine,” in *Genre* (2011) and *Warring with Words: Narrative and Metaphor in Politics* (2014).

Robert Weisberg is Edwin E. Huddleson, Jr. Professor of Law at Stanford. He also founded and now serves as faculty co-director of the Stanford Criminal Justice Center (SCJC). He is co-author (with Guyora Binder) of the book *Literary Criticisms of Law* (2000).

# Narrative and Metaphor in the Law

Edited by

**MICHAEL HANNE**

University of Auckland

**ROBERT WEISBERG**

Stanford University



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-42279-6 — Narrative and Metaphor in the Law  
Edited by Michael Hanne, Robert Weisberg  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom  
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,  
New Delhi – 110025, India  
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781108422796](http://www.cambridge.org/9781108422796)  
DOI: 10.1017/9781108381734

© Cambridge University Press 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

NAMES: Hanne, Michael, editor. | Weisberg, Robert, 1946–, editor.

TITLE: Narrative and metaphor in the law / edited by Michael Hanne, Robert Weisberg.

DESCRIPTION: New York : Cambridge University Press, 2018. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2017053783 | ISBN 9781108422796 (hardback)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Law – Language. | Semantics (Law) | Metaphor. | BISAC: LAW / General.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC K487.L36 N37 2018 | DDC 340/.14–dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2017053783>

ISBN 978-1-108-42279-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## Contents

<i>List of Contributors</i>	<i>page viii</i>
<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>CONVERSATION I NARRATIVE, METAPHOR, AND CONCEPTS OF JUSTICE AND LEGAL SYSTEMS</b>	<b>13</b>
<b>Editors' Introduction</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>1 On Narrating and Troping the Law: The Conjoined Use of Narrative and Metaphor in Legal Discourse</b> <i>Greta Olson</i>	<b>19</b>
<b>2 What's It Like? Native Americans and the Ambivalence of Legal Metaphors</b> <i>Lawrence Rosen</i>	<b>37</b>
<b>CONVERSATION II NARRATIVE AND METAPHOR IN LEGAL PERSUASION</b>	<b>55</b>
<b>Editors' Introduction</b>	<b>57</b>
<b>3 Metaphoric Parable: The Nexus of Metaphor and Narrative in Persuasive Legal Writing</b> <i>Michael R. Smith</i>	<b>65</b>
<b>4 Embodied Metaphor in Persuasive Legal Narrative</b> <i>Raymond W. Gibbs, Jr.</i>	<b>90</b>

	CONVERSATION III NARRATIVE AND METAPHOR IN JUDICIAL OPINIONS	111
	Editors' Introduction	113
5	Narrative in the Legal Text: Judicial Opinions and Their Narratives <i>Simon Stern</i>	121
6	Legal Stories, the Reality Effect, and Visual Narratives: A Response to Simon Stern <i>Peter Brooks</i>	140
	CONVERSATION IV NARRATIVE, METAPHOR, AND GENDER IN THE LAW	151
	Editors' Introduction	153
7	Gender Justice: The Role of Stories and Images <i>Linda L. Berger and Kathryn M. Stanchi</i>	157
	CONVERSATION V NARRATIVE, METAPHOR, AND INNOVATIONS IN LEGAL THINKING	193
	Editors' Introduction	195
8	The "Crime as a Disease" Metaphor: Vision, Power, and Collaboration in Social Problems Research <i>Roberto H. Potter</i>	200
9	The Fertility (sic) of the Crime/Disease Linkage for Metaphor and Narrative: Response to Potter <i>Robert Weisberg</i>	220
	CONVERSATION VI NARRATIVE AND METAPHOR IN PUBLIC DEBATE AROUND CRIME AND PUNISHMENT	243
	Editors' Introduction	245
10	Narrative Conventions in Crime Reporting <i>Dahlia Lithwick</i>	251

## Contents

vii

11	Metaphors, Stories, and Media Framing of Crime: Response to Lithwick <i>L. David Ritchie</i>	269
	CONVERSATION VII NARRATIVE AND METAPHOR IN HUMAN RIGHTS LAW	289
	Editors' Introduction	291
12	When Rights-Talk Meets Queue-Talk <i>Katharine G. Young</i>	297
13	The Cutters and the Others <i>Bernadette A. Meyler</i>	319
	CONVERSATION VIII NARRATIVE AND METAPHOR IN CREATIVE WORK BY LAWYERS	325
	Editors' Introduction	327
14	Through Narrative and by Metaphor: Creating a Lawyer-Self in Poetry and Prose <i>Lawrence Joseph</i>	332
15	Secrets of Civility in <i>Lawyerland</i> <i>Meredith Wallis</i>	349
	CONVERSATION IX NARRATIVE AND METAPHOR IN LEGAL ACTIVISM	359
	Editors' Introduction	361
16	A Conversation with Mari Matsuda <i>Michael Hanne</i>	367
	<i>Bibliography</i>	380
	<i>Index</i>	414

## Contributors

**Linda L. Berger** is the Family Foundation Professor of Law at the University of Nevada, Las Vegas, William S. Boyd School of Law. Her research, writing, and teaching converge on the practices of legal rhetoric; her most recent work blends critical rhetorical analysis with computational criticism to explore the making and unmaking of precedent. She is one of the coeditors, with Kathryn Stanchi and Bridget Crawford, of *U.S. Feminist Judgments: Rewritten Opinions of the United States Supreme Court* (Cambridge, 2016), the first volume in an ongoing series. She also is the coauthor, with Kathryn Stanchi, of *Legal Persuasion: A Rhetorical Approach to the Science* (2017).

**Peter Brooks** is Sterling Professor of Comparative Literature Emeritus at Yale University, where he was the Founding Director of the Whitney Humanities Center. He is currently Andrew W. Mellon Foundation Scholar in the University Center for Human Values and the Department of Comparative Literature, Princeton University. He is the author of several books, including *Reading for the Plot* and *Troubling Confessions: Speaking Guilt in Law and Literature*, and the recently published *Flaubert in the Ruins of Paris*.

**Raymond W. Gibbs, Jr.** is Distinguished Professor of Psychology at the University of California, Santa Cruz. His research as a cognitive scientist focuses on the interactions between language, thought, and embodied experience. A particular interest within his scholarship is on the ways metaphorical language emerges from enduring metaphorical concepts that are rooted in pervasive bodily actions. Much of his writing extends his empirical findings and theoretical ideas to debates within multiple disciplines including linguistics, philosophy, and literary studies. His most recent books include *Interpreting Figurative Meaning*, with Herb

Colston (2012), and *Metaphor Wars: Conceptual Metaphor in Human Life* (2017), both published by Cambridge University Press.

**Michael Hanne** founded and, for many years, directed the Comparative Literature program at the University of Auckland, New Zealand. His major research interest has been on the interlocking roles played by narrative and metaphor in a wide range of disciplines. He has coorganized a series of conferences in the United States and Europe on narrative and metaphor in medicine (2010), politics (2012), the law (2016) and education (2017), and coedited volumes stemming from each. *Binocular Vision: Narrative and Metaphor in Medicine* (2011) and *Warring with Words: Narrative and Metaphor in Politics* (with W. Crano and J. S. Mio, 2013) have already appeared. Details of the project are to be found at [narrative-metaphornexus.weebly.com](http://narrative-metaphornexus.weebly.com).

**Lawrence Joseph** is Tinnelly Professor of Law at St. John's University School of Law, New York, and the author of six books of poems, most recently *So Where Are We?* (2017), and two books of prose, *Lawyerland* (1997), and *The Game Changed: Essays and Other Prose* (2011). Among his awards are fellowships from the National Endowment for the Arts and the Guggenheim Foundation.

**Dahlia Lithwick** is a senior editor at *Slate*, and in that capacity, writes the "Supreme Court Dispatches" and "Jurisprudence" columns. Her work has appeared in the *New York Times*, *Harper's*, *The New Yorker*, *The Washington Post*, and *Commentary*, among other places. She won a 2013 National Magazine Award for her columns on the Affordable Care Act. She has been twice awarded an Online Journalism Award for her legal commentary and was the first online journalist invited to be on the Reporters Committee for the Freedom of the Press. She received the 2017 Golden Pen Award from the Legal Writing Institute. Ms. Lithwick has testified before Congress about access to justice in the era of the Roberts Court. She has appeared on CNN, ABC, *The Colbert Report*, and is a frequent guest on *The Rachel Maddow Show*.

**Mari Matsuda** is a law professor at the William S. Richardson School of Law, University of Hawai'i. She is an original member of the group of scholars who developed critical race theory and intersectional feminism. She is also an artist (see [marimatsudapeaceorchestra.com](http://marimatsudapeaceorchestra.com)). Her books include *Where is Your Body? and Other Essays on Race, Gender, and Law* (1996), *Words That Wound: Critical Race Theory, Assaultive Speech, and the First Amendment* (1993), and *We Won't Go Back: Making the Case for Affirmative Action* (with Charles R. Lawrence III, 1997).



**Bernadette A. Meyler** is the Carl and Sheila Spaeth Professor of Law at Stanford University. She is the coeditor of *New Directions in Law and Literature* (2017) with Elizabeth Anker and of *The Oxford Handbook of Law and Humanities* (forthcoming) with Simon Stern and Maks Del Mar. She is also the author of the forthcoming *Theaters of Pardoning* and *Common Law Originalism*.

**Greta Olson** is a professor of English and American Literary and Cultural Studies at the University of Giessen and was Fellow at the Käte Hamburger Center “Law as Culture” in Bonn. She is general editor of the *European Journal of English Studies*, and cofounder of the European Network for Law and Literature Research. She works on projects related to legal pluralism, cultural approaches to law, the politics of narrative form, critical media and American studies, and feminism and sexuality studies. Related publications include “Law’s Pluralities” (*German Law Journal*, 2017) and “Narration and Narrative in Legal Discourse” (*Living Handbook of Narratology*, 2014).

**Roberto H. Potter** is a professor in the Department of Criminal Justice at the University of Central Florida. His research interests lie at the intersections of criminal justice, public and behavioral health, and the mechanisms of social control represented by each of those sectors. In particular, he is interested in the organizational relationships among the various sectors involved in the control of human behavior, including universities. These interests are reflected in *Epidemiological Criminology: A Public Health Approach to Crime and Violence* (2013), and *Criminal Justice Organizations: Structure, Relationships, Control and Planning* (2017).

**L. David Ritchie** is Professor of Communication at Portland State University, Oregon. His primary research focus is metaphor use, storytelling, metaphorical stories, and humor in naturally occurring discourse. He is the author of three books on metaphor theory, including *Metaphorical Stories in Discourse*, to be issued by Cambridge University Press in September 2017. Other publications include with M. Thomas “A ‘glowing marble’: ‘brushed with clouds’ or ‘parched, scorched, and washed away’? Obama’s use of contrasting metaphors and stories in framing climate change” (*Metaphor and the Social World*, 2015).

**Lawrence Rosen** has taught at Princeton University for almost forty years and has won all of his university’s teaching awards. As a lawyer and adjunct professor of law at Columbia University he has concentrated on comparative law and the rights of indigenous peoples. He has served as a Phi Beta

Kappa Lecturer and was named to the first group of MacArthur Award fellows. The author of a dozen books on law, culture, and Middle East societies, he will be completing a broadscale study of tribes while a visitor next year at the Institute for Advanced Study in Princeton.

**Michael R. Smith** is a professor of Law and the Founder and Director of The Center for the Study of Written Advocacy at the College of Law, University of Wyoming. He has written extensively on the art and science of persuasive writing, including the groundbreaking article on metaphor in legal discourse, “Levels of Metaphor in Persuasive Legal Writing.” He also authored the book, *Advanced Legal Writing: Theories and Strategies in Persuasive Writing* (3rd ed. 2013), which explores strategies in persuasive legal writing based on principles from other disciplines, such as cognitive psychology, classical rhetoric, and narrative theory.

**Kathryn M. Stanchi** is the Jack E. Feinberg Professor of Litigation and Affiliated Professor of Gender, Sexuality and Women’s Studies at Temple University School of Law. She specializes in legal issues related to the intersection of writing, persuasion, and gender. Her scholarship touches on many of the subjects of this volume, notably two recent books *Feminist Judgments: Rewritten Opinions of the United States Supreme Court* (with Linda Berger and Bridget Crawford) (Cambridge, 2016) and *Legal Persuasion: A Rhetorical Approach to the Science* (with Linda Berger) (2017).

**Simon Stern** is an associate professor of Law and English at the University of Toronto. His current work includes articles on literature and obscenity law, narratives of search and seizure, and the relation between metaphor and metonymy in legal analysis. He is coeditor of the *Routledge Research Companion to Law and Humanities in Nineteenth-Century America* (2017) and of the forthcoming *Oxford Handbook of Law and Humanities*. He is writing a book on the history and theory of legal fictions in common law since the seventeenth century.

**Meredith Wallis** is an Oakland attorney, finishing her PhD in Modern Thought and Literature at Stanford University. Her practice areas are demonstrations and asylum, and her research is on children’s literature as a source of law.

**Robert Weisberg**, who teaches criminal law at Stanford, has drawn on his pre-law background in addressing themes in law and the humanities. He coauthored (with Guyora Binder) *Literary Criticisms of Law* (Princeton,

2000), a comprehensive assessment of scholarship treating law in regard to such literary phenomena as narrative, rhetoric, and deconstruction. Among his later works in the field is “Law, Literature, and Cultural Unity: Between Celebration and Lament,” in *Teaching Law and Literature* (Sarat and Anderson eds., 2012). His writing also examines criminal law from a cultural perspective, as in “Apology, Legislation, and Mercy” (*North Carolina Law Review* 2004), which explores retributive theories related to clemency and the death penalty.

**Katharine G. Young** is an associate professor at Boston College Law School. She writes in the fields of constitutionalism and human rights, and focuses on, among other issues, the role of narrative, metaphor, and interpretation in the changing nature of legal rights, such as in “Freeing Mohammed Zakari: Rights as Footprints” (with Jeremy Perelman) in *Stones of Hope: How African Activists Reclaim Human Rights to Challenge Global Poverty* (Lucie E. White and Jeremy Perelman, eds., 2011). Two books relevant to these themes are her *Constituting Economic and Social Rights* (2012) and *The Public Law of Gender: from the Local to the Global* (Cambridge, 2016, with Kim Rubenstein).