

The Politics of Unfree Labour in Russia

How, and why, did human trafficking out of Russia escalate at the beginning of the twenty-first century? Why did some labour migrants from Uzbekistan, Tajikistan and Kyrgyzstan find happy work situations in Russia whereas others became trapped in forced labour? This book focusses on human trafficking out of the Russian Federation since the collapse of the Soviet state and on labour migration into it from Central Asia, and on some internal movement. It looks at the socio-economic reasons behind labour flows and examines key social, political, legislative and policy responses. Discussion includes how the Russian press covers these topics and what politicians, experts and the public think about them. Based on interviews, polls and focus groups in Russia, this book is rich in original research which highlights different Russian perspectives on exploitation in unfree labour. It gives examples of entrapment in prostitution, in construction work, on farms and in begging rings.

Mary Buckley is a Fellow of Hughes Hall at the University of Cambridge. She has published extensively in the field of Soviet and post-Soviet politics, society, history and foreign policy. Her books include *Mobilizing Soviet Peasants: Heroines and Heroes of Stalin's Fields* (2006), *Redefining Russian Society and Polity* (1993) and *Women and Ideology in the Soviet Union* (1989).

The Politics of Unfree
Labour in Russia
Human Trafficking and Labour Migration

Mary Buckley
Hughes Hall, University of Cambridge

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-41996-3 — The Politics of Unfree Labour in Russia
Mary Buckley
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108419963
DOI: 10.1017/9781108325639

© Mary Buckley 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Buckley, Mary (Mary E. A.), author.

Title: The politics of unfree labour in Russia : human trafficking and labour migration / Mary Buckley, Hughes Hall, University of Cambridge.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2017. | 9781108412704 (paperback) | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2017035941 | ISBN 9781108419963 (hardback)

Subjects: LCSH: Human trafficking—Russia (Federation) | Human smuggling—Russia (Federation) | Forced labor—Russia (Federation) | Illegal aliens—Russia (Federation) | Russia (Federation)—Emigration and immigration.

Classification: LCC HQ281 .B783 2017 | DDC 364.15/51—dc23 LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2017035941>

ISBN 978-1-108-41996-3 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-41270-4 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-41996-3 — The Politics of Unfree Labour in Russia
Mary Buckley
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

To all who kindly let me interview them

Contents

<i>List of Tables</i>	page viii
<i>Map</i>	x
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xiii
<i>Note on Transliteration, Websites and Permissions</i>	xvii
Introduction	1
1 Unfree Labour in Russian History	27
2 The Politics of Getting Human Trafficking onto Agendas	56
3 Press Reporting on Human Trafficking out of Russia	94
4 Public Attitudes on Human Trafficking	116
5 How the Public Talks About Human Trafficking	140
6 Expert Narratives on Human Trafficking	173
7 Labour Migration Flows into Russia and Reports on Forced Labour	188
8 Policy and Legislation on Labour Migrants	218
9 Migration Experts Talking	243
10 Public Opinion on Migrant Labour	269
Conclusion	293
<i>Glossary</i>	305
<i>Select Bibliography</i>	309
<i>Index</i>	317

Tables

4.1 ‘How Large Do You Think the Problem of Trafficking Women, Girls, Men and Boys out of Russia Is?’ (2007)	<i>page</i> 118
4.2 ‘How Large Do You Think the Problem of Trafficking Women, Girls, Men and Boys out of Russia Is?’ (2007 and 2014)	119
4.3 ‘In Your Opinion, Are Women and Girls Who Find Themselves Trafficked into the Sex Industry Abroad . . .?’ (2007)	120
4.4 ‘In Your Opinion, Are Women and Girls Who Find Themselves Trafficked into the Sex Trade Abroad . . .?’ (2014)	121
4.5 ‘Which Institution Is Likely to Be the Most Effective in Tackling the Problem of Human Trafficking?’ (2007)	124
4.6 ‘Which Institution Is Likely to Be the Most Effective in Tackling the Problem of Human Trafficking?’ (2007 and 2014)	126
4.7 ‘How Should the Russian Government Treat Women Who Return After Having Been Trafficked into Prostitution in the West?’ (2007)	128
4.8 ‘How Should the Russian Authorities Treat Those People Who Have Been Abused Physically and Mentally in Forced Labour After They Have Returned Home?’ (2014)	129

Tables	ix
4.9 ‘How Can the Problem of Human Trafficking Best Be Solved?’ (2007); ‘How Can the Problem of Human Trafficking into Forced Labour Best Be Solved?’ (2014)	132
4.10 ‘If You Had a Daughter Who Returned Home After Having Worked in Prostitution in Germany, Would You . . .?’ (2007)	134
4.11 ‘If You Had a Daughter Who Returned Home After Having Worked in Prostitution in Germany, Would You . . .?’ (2007); ‘If You Had a Daughter Who Returned Home After Having Been Forced into the Sex Industry in Germany Against Her Will, Thinking That She Was Being Sent There for Completely Different Work, Would You . . .?’ (2014)	136
4.12 ‘In Your Opinion, Is Work in Prostitution . . .?’ (2007)	137
10.1 ‘Should Russia . . .?’ (2014)	270
10.2 ‘What Policy Should the Government of Russia Adhere to in Relation to Arrivals?’ (2014)	272
10.3 ‘What Should Be Done About Illegal Workers from the States of the “Near Abroad”?’ (2006 to 2014)	272
10.4 ‘Which Feelings Do You Experience in Relation to Arrivals from the North Caucasus, Central Asia and Other Southern Countries Living in Your Town or District?’ (2005 to 2014)	273
10.5 ‘Why, in Your Opinion, Do Men from Central Asia and Other Regions of the Former Soviet Union Find Themselves in Russia in Slave Labour in Manual Work?’ (2014)	275

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-108-41996-3 — The Politics of Unfree Labour in Russia
 Mary Buckley
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Map



Map 1 Map of the Russian Federation Situated Within the Commonwealth of Independent States and with Surrounding States and Borders. Drawn by David Cox.

x

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-41996-3 — The Politics of Unfree Labour in Russia
Mary Buckley
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



Acknowledgements

My debts are many and I am delighted to acknowledge them all.

This project sprouted in the Easter term of 2004 when I was a Visiting Fellow at the Centre for Research in the Arts, Social Sciences and Humanities (CRASSH) at the University of Cambridge on a one-term placement under a 'Migration' theme. It was followed by research in Moscow and St Petersburg in September 2004 funded by the Cultural Exchange agreement between the British Academy and the Russian Academy of Sciences, a programme now regrettably no longer in existence, to the detriment of research. The Russian Academy of Sciences, the Institute of Socio-Economic Problems of the Population in Moscow, and the Criminology Section of the Institute of Sociology in St Petersburg merit gratitude for their support and welcome. A small grant from the Elisabeth Barker Fund at the British Academy gave further backing in 2004 and 2005, followed by another research visit through the Cultural Exchange in April 2007.

Crucial funding for a nationwide public opinion poll in the Russian Federation and the running of two focus groups in June 2007 on attitudes towards various aspects of human trafficking was also awarded by the British Academy. An Emeritus Fellowship from the Leverhulme Trust made possible a second nationwide poll in September 2014 to gather longitudinal data and to run two further focus groups. The second survey widened the scope of the project to incorporate issues of labour migration into Russia. Gratitude is owed to these funding bodies for covering research expenses. Warm acknowledgment is owed to the Levada Analytic Center for organising the polls and focus groups in both years. For their help I should like to thank Alexei Grazhdankin, Alexey Levinson, Svetlana Koroleva and Rita Stepina.

I finally began writing this book in October 2014 and am especially grateful to the Rockefeller Foundation for awarding me a writing residency in May 2016 at the Villa Serbelloni in Bellagio on Lake Como to concentrate on research into the Russian language, history and law tests for incoming migrant workers. This rare-life opportunity to work

xiv Acknowledgements

intensively in this wonderfully tranquil setting a second time, twenty-six years after my first residency, was an honour and a privilege. For making my stay so pleasant, I warmly thank Pilar Palacia, Elena Ongania and all my fellow residents who contributed to a highly stimulating time.

Earlier papers from which this book has picked up threads were delivered at CRASSH, University of Cambridge, in May 2004; St Antony's College, Oxford, in March 2005; the Fakultät für Geschichtswissenschaft, Lehrstuhl für osteuropäische Geschichte, Ruhr-Universität Bochum, May 2005; Koç University, Istanbul, Turkey, in June 2006; the School of Public Policy, University College, London, November 2007; Hughes Hall, Cambridge, in 2007 and 2015; Birkbeck College, London, June 2015; annual conferences of BASEES, Fitzwilliam College, Cambridge, in 2005, 2008, 2013 and 2017; the VII and VIII World Congresses of ICCEES in Berlin in 2005 and Stockholm in 2010; and annual conventions of ASEES in Boston, Philadelphia and Washington, DC, in 2013, 2015 and 2016. Thanks are due to those present who gave feedback and raised questions, particularly to Steven Barnes and Lauren McCarthy.

Numerous people in Russia have willingly helped in this project. I have enjoyed interviews, discussions and talks with a range of experts and specialists, and it gives me great pleasure to name those who permit me so to do. Since 2004 Natalia Khodyreva has been a regular source of helpful information and update. In 2004 and 2007, Elena Tiuriukanova, now sadly deceased, shared her recollections and reflections on the politics of pressing for anti-trafficking legislation. In this first phase of the project I also enjoyed revealing conversations in Moscow with Alberto Andriani, Robert Aronson, Juliette Engel, Svetlana Iakimenko, Tat'iana Kholshchevnikova, Maria Mokhovo, Anna Rubtsova and Mariana Solomotova. In St Petersburg, the Russian Academy of Sciences kindly organised my first conversation with Khodyreva and illuminating meetings with Dmitrii Kiriukhin at the Department of Criminal Investigation of the Ministry of Internal Affairs, with a judge in Dzherzhinskii district, and talks with Yakov Gilinsky and Yakov Kostyukovsky.

After the project widened to include labour migrants going into Russia, I benefited in 2013 from conversing with Kirill Boychenko and in 2014 from meetings with Sergei Boldyrev, Sergey Brestovitsky, Nikolai Kurdiumov, Julia Melnichouk, Juliana Pavlovskaya, Dmitry Poletaev, Vyacheslav Postavnin, Roman Rybakov, Olga Rybakova and Natalia Vlasova as well as discussions via Skype with Svetlana Gannushkina and Elena Timofeeva. They generously explained some of the complexities in changing migration policy and what was contentious. Warm thanks are due to them all for the time they devoted to me in their busy lives and especially to Kirill Boychenko for painstakingly arranging these

meetings. I am hugely grateful to everyone who spoke to me for their time and kindness. This book is dedicated to them all.

For indispensable feedback and comments on early drafts of the history chapter, which took me back into centuries which I do not normally explore in detail, nor of which I dare to claim research expertise beyond secondary sources, I owe special thanks to Simon Dixon, Diane Koenker, William Rosenberg and Maria Zezina. I am also grateful to Andrew Cohn for his feedback on the Introduction and Conclusion. For suggestions on how best to translate some phrases in colloquial Russian, I owe a debt to Maria Zezina and Nikolay Kozhanov. For drawing to my attention a Memorandum that circulated in the Duma, I thank Iurii Zhukov. Gratitude is also due to two anonymous reviewers arranged by Cambridge University Press for their reflections. The arguments, interpretations and conclusions expressed in this book, however, are mine alone. Those named above may, or may not, agree with me and cannot be held responsible for my assessments, omissions and errors.

My editor, John Haslam, deserves thanks for his backing, as do Julie Hrischeva for her efforts and Karen Anderson for her thorough copy-editing. It would be remiss not to thank Lynda Stratford at Cambridge University's Computing Service for cleansing my laptop of uninvited guests.

Finally, for sharing summer dacha life, travels in Russia, concerts and plays across the decades, I am grateful to Maria and Kolia for all the good times. For many a happy meal, I am also indebted to them both and to Iurii, Rimma, Natalia, Leonid, Anna, Polina, Miasachnik, Tania and Luda. They have all enriched my understanding of life in Russia which somehow became a part of my mental world.

Note on Transliteration, Websites and Permissions

A word is in order about style. I have followed the Library of Congress transliteration system with the exception of names and words whose more customary English forms are now widely adopted. Thus, I use Yel'tsin rather than El'tsin, Dostoyevsky, not Dostoevskii, and Yaroslavl, not Iaroslavl. Words will include *aia* and *iu* rather than *aya* and *yu*. Some Russians in their publications in English or on their business cards also offer options different from conventional transliteration systems. In keeping with their preferences, where relevant I refer to Juliana rather than Iuliana and Julia rather than Iuliia. Variations in spellings across names will also be found for the same reason, so Sergei, Sergey, Aleksei, Alexey, Natalia, Natal'ia, Dmitrii and Dmitry can all be found. When a person's surname has been presented in more than one way in English, I standardise it to the Library of Congress system, so I refer to Tiuriukanova rather than Tyuryukanova. Where professional preference is for an *aya* ending on a surname, I adhere to that, so refer to Pavlovskaya and not Pavlovskaia, although most endings will be *aia*. As is customary, I have dropped soft signs from the end of some words in the text, so *oblast'* is referred to as *oblast*. In the footnotes, however, all soft signs are present for accuracy in Russian. Articles whose final word ends with a soft sign and which happens to sit inside a quotation within a quotation will consequently have four closing apostrophes.

All websites cited here were checked again throughout February 2017 to confirm their continued availability on-line. The majority were still obtainable and so have no 'accessed' date after the citation and can be safely read as having been available on 1 February. The minority that have been removed and that cannot be traced elsewhere include a date when they were last accessed.

Permission has been granted by Taylor and Francis for reprinting selected data from my earlier article 'Public opinion in Russia on the

xviii Note on Transliteration, Websites and Permissions

politics of human trafficking', *Europe-Asia Studies*, Vol. 61, No. 2, March 2009, pp. 213–248, which can also be accessed via www.tandfonline.com. I should also like to acknowledge minimal crossover and fragments taken from this book for my 'Recent Russian press coverage of unfree labour', in Melanie Ilic, ed., *The Palgrave Handbook of Women and Gender in Twentieth-Century Russia and the Soviet Union* (London: Palgrave, 2018).