

## World Ordering

Drawing on evolutionary epistemology, process ontology, and a social-cognition approach, this book suggests “cognitive evolution,” an evolutionary-constructivist social and normative theory of change and stability of international social orders. It argues that practices and their background knowledge survive preferentially; communities of practice serve as their vehicle; and social orders evolve. As an evolutionary theory of world ordering, which does not borrow from the natural sciences, it explains why certain configurations of practices organize and govern social orders epistemically and normatively, and why and how these configurations evolve from one social order to another. Suggesting a multiple and overlapping international social orders approach, the book uses three running cases of contested orders – Europe’s contemporary social order, the cyberspace order, and the corporate order – to illustrate the theory. Based on the concepts of “common humanity” and “epistemological security,” the author also submits a normative theory of “better” practices and of bounded progress.

EMANUEL ADLER is the Andrea and Charles Bronfman Chair of Israeli Studies and Professor of Political Science at the University of Toronto, and Honorary Professor at the University of Copenhagen. He is also a Fellow of the Royal Society of Canada and of the European Academy of Sciences. His publications include *Security Communities* (co-edited with Michael Barnett, Cambridge University Press, 1998) and *International Practices* (co-edited with Vincent Pouliot, Cambridge University Press, 2011).

*Cambridge Studies in International Relations: 150*

Global Norms with a Local Face

Editors

Evelyn Goh

Christian Reus-Smit

Nicholas J. Wheeler

Editorial Board

Jacqueline Best, Karin Fierke, William Grimes, Yuen Foong Khong,  
 Andrew Kydd, Lily Ling, Andrew Linklater, Nicola Phillips, Elizabeth  
 Shakman Hurd, Jacque True, Leslie Vinjamuri, Alexander Wendt

*Cambridge Studies in International Relations* is a joint initiative of Cambridge University Press and the British International Studies Association (BISA). The series aims to publish the best new scholarship in international studies, irrespective of subject matter, methodological approach or theoretical perspective. The series seeks to bring the latest theoretical work in International Relations to bear on the most important problems and issues in global politics.

*Cambridge Studies in International Relations*

- 149 *Brian C. Rathbun reasoning of state* Realists and romantics in international relations
- 148 *Silviya Lechner and Mervyn Frost Practice theory and international relations*
- 147 *Bentley Allan Scientific cosmology and international orders*
- 146 *Peter J. Katzenstein and Lucia A. Seybert (eds.) Protean power* Exploring the uncertain and unexpected in world Politics
- 145 *Catherine Lu justice and reconciliation in world politics*
- 144 *Ayşe Zarakol (ed.) Hierarchies in world politics*
- 143 *Lisbeth Zimmermann Global norms with a local face* Rule-of-law promotion and norm-translation
- 142 *Alexandre Debs and Nuno P. Monteiro Nuclear Politics* The Strategic Causes of Proliferation
- 141 *Mathias Albert A theory of world politics*
- 140 *Emma Hutchison Affective communities in world politics* Collective emotions after trauma
- 139 *Patricia Owens Economy of force* Counterinsurgency and the historical rise of the social
- 138 *Ronald R. Krebs Narrative and the making of US national security*
- 137 *Andrew Phillips and J. C. Sharman International order in diversity* War, trade and rule in the Indian Ocean
- 136 *Ole Jacob Sending, Vincent Pouliot and Iver B. Neumann (eds.) Diplomacy and the making of world politics*
- 135 *Barry Buzan and George Lawson The global transformation* History, modernity and the making of international relations
- 134 *Heather Elko McKibben State strategies in international bargaining* Play by the rules or change them?
- 133 *Janina Dill Legitimate targets?* Social construction, international law, and US bombing

*Series list continues after index*

# World Ordering

*A Social Theory of Cognitive Evolution*

---

Emanuel Adler

University of Toronto



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-41995-6 — World Ordering  
Emanuel Adler  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom  
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,  
New Delhi – 110025, India  
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781108419956](http://www.cambridge.org/9781108419956)  
DOI: 10.1017/9781108325615

© Emanuel Adler 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

Printed and bound in Great Britain by Clays Ltd, Elcograf S.p.A.

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

Names: Adler, Emanuel, author.

Title: World ordering : a social theory of cognitive evolution / Emanuel Adler.

Description: Cambridge : Cambridge University Press, 2019. |

Series: Cambridge studies in international relations

Identifiers: LCCN 2018034221 | ISBN 9781108419956 (hardback) |  
ISBN 9781108412674 (paperback)

Subjects: LCSH: International relations—Sociological aspects. | International relations—Philosophy. | Social constructionism. | BISAC: POLITICAL SCIENCE / International Relations / General.

Classification: LCC JZ1251 .A26 2019 | DDC 306.2—dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2018034221>

ISBN 978-1-108-41995-6 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-41267-4 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## Contents

---

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page</i> vi
Prologue: The Crux of the Matter	1
<b>Part I Social Constructivism as Cognitive Evolution</b>	11
1 Samurai Crabs and International Social Orders	13
2 Evolutionary Ontology: From Being to Becoming	45
3 Evolutionary Epistemology	77
4 Practices, Background Knowledge, Communities of Practice, Social Orders	109
<b>Part II Cognitive Evolution Theory and International Social Orders</b>	135
5 International Social Orders	137
6 Cognitive Evolution Theory: Social Mechanisms and Processes	165
7 Agential Social Mechanisms	198
8 Creative Variation	219
9 Selective Retention	234
10 Better Practices and Bounded Progress	265
Epilogue: World Ordering	295
<i>References</i>	304
<i>Index</i>	364

## Acknowledgments

---

Because this book is about how thinking involves relationships – how relationships are about practices and their evolution – it is not surprising that my own thinking and academic practice evolved with and because of relationships. I first began conceiving of cognitive evolution in graduate school forty years ago in close interaction with Ernst Haas, without whom this book would never have happened. I trace my intellectual origins to him. The ideas themselves evolved through universities I worked at, projects I was involved with, articles and books I wrote, conferences I attended, and most important, interactions with colleagues around the world and with my graduate students. Throughout all this time, I've had the good luck to accumulate numerous debts. If, because of the book's long gestation, or for reasons of mere distraction, I forgot to mention individuals and institutions who deserve acknowledgment, I apologize.

I thank my graduate students who made this long journey much more meaningful, helping me to bring the book to fruition from a love for teaching and learning. In particular, Gustavo Carvalho, Steven Loleski, Craig Smith, and Simon Pratt, four of my research assistants, played a major role in putting together the book's empirical illustrations. I am immensely indebted to their knowledge, research, large amounts of material, lengthy discussions, and positive dispositions. My editor and friend Jacqueline Larson made the book much more readable by eliminating the many traces of Spanish and Hebrew in my use of the English language. Two reviewers gave me excellent suggestions for revision, most of which I followed. The book improved because of them. I am grateful to John Haslam, who, as always, provided encouragement and guidance. Robert Dreesen read a messy first draft and pointed out its flaws. He and Patrick McCartan encouraged me to write the book.

This journey would have been different, duller, and probably would have headed in a different direction had it not been for Janice Stein and Michael Barnett, two of my best friends and colleagues, whose intellectual inspiration and continuous encouragement were essential

for me to write this book. Janice was instrumental for my move to the University of Toronto almost twenty years ago, which opened a new scholarly world and access to excellent students and colleagues who knowingly or unknowingly contributed to this book. Charles Bronfman established the Bronfman Chair of Israeli Studies and therefore made writing this book possible. I also owe a huge intellectual debt to my good friend Chris Reus-Smit, who was my “compass.” He read all the drafts and consistently provided feedback and advice that always pointed in the right direction. In 2015, Chris organized a book workshop at Queensland University in Brisbane, Australia, where I received excellent comments that forced me back to the drawing board to revise the manuscript one more time. In particular, I thank Robyn Eckersley, Colin Wight, Toni Erskine, Jason Sharman, Ian Hall, and Renee Jeffrey, who discussed different chapters. Among many of the workshop’s participants whose comments were useful, I thank Tim Dunne, Andy Hurrell, Richard Devetak, Andrew Philipps, Heather Rae, Richard Shapcott, and Martin Weber.

Vincent Pouliot read all the drafts and has been providing invaluable feedback and advice since we first met more than a decade ago. Vincent, together with Markus Kornprobst and Piki Ish Shalom, all former students and currently colleagues and friends, appointed themselves as a “junta” that organized a festschrift conference in 2017. With many former and current students, as well as colleagues and friends all in one room, the feedback I received on the book was invaluable. In addition to the members of the “junta,” I especially want to highlight Chris Reus-Smit (again), Stefano Guzzini, Michael Barnett, Janice Stein, Peter Katzenstein, Peter Haas, and Alena Drieschova, who wrote papers and provided excellent feedback and advice that sent me to revise the manuscript still once more. Their comments, along with Chuck Beitz’s, were important for conceiving Chapter 10, where I suggest a normative theory to supplement cognitive evolution’s analytical theory.

Of the many colleagues and friends at the University of Toronto, I will single out David Cameron, Rob Vipond, Pekka Sinervo, and Louis Pauly. Lou was also my pal as co-editor of *International Organization*, which became another milestone in the book’s journey because it taught me a lot about the field of international relations. I am also very grateful to Stephen Toope, who, as former director of the Munk School of Global Affairs and Public Policy, provided intellectual guidance and financial support, and to Steven Bernstein, Matt Hoffmann, Lilach Gilady, Seva Gunitsky, Teresa Kramarz, Wendy Wong, Bob Brym, Jutta Brunnée, and John Lindsay. I thank my former students Alena Drieschova, Corneliu Bjola, Ruben Zaiotti, Nisha Shaw, Alanna Krolikowski, Joelle Dumouchel,

viii Acknowledgments

Patricia Greve, and David Polanski, as well as my current students Maika Sondarjee, Michael Faubert, Steven Loleski, Michael Faubert, and Ryder McKeown. Through their work and our exchanges, they have contributed to my own thinking on cognitive evolution and practice theory.

My graduate students at the International Relations Department of the Hebrew University were among the first to be exposed to the idea of cognitive evolution. I learned from them and am particularly grateful to Piki Ish Shalom, Tal Dingott, Raffaella Del Sarto, Amir Lupovici, Emily Landau, Tal Sadeh, Tommy Steiner, Arie Kacowicz, and Orit Gazit. I am also grateful to the late Yaacov Bar Siman Tov, Yaacov Vertzberger, Moshe Hirsch, and Alfred Tovias. I especially want to mention Yaron Ezrahi, whose brilliant mind I mined.

While still a student in Berkeley and then throughout my career, I received support and advice and learned a lot from my good friend Beverly Crawford. She and I first conceived of minimalist progress in IR. I developed many of my ideas on progress and humanist realism together with her – she was my harshest critic but also my greatest enthusiast. I thank colleagues who contributed to *Bev's* and my edited book on progress in IR, particularly Jack Donnelly, Peter Haas, John Ruggie, and Ben Schiff, for inspiring my ideas on progress. John Ruggie, and his lifetime work on “what makes the world hang together,” was one of the main inspiration sources for this book. In the late 1980s I spent two years as a fellow of the Center of Science and International Affairs (CSIA) at Harvard University, where I first published on cognitive evolution. I am especially grateful to Joe Nye and Thomas Schelling for intellectual inspiration. Tom was one of my mentors then, and I am sure that he was surprised when, in an International Studies Association (ISA) panel in his honor years later, I claimed that deep down he was a constructivist. My ideas on cognitive evolution kept evolving as a consequence of my cooperation with Peter Haas in putting together a special issue of *International Organization* on epistemic communities in 1992, and then my cooperation with Michael Barnett on an edited book on security communities, which we published in 1998.

My many conversations with Karl Deutsch deeply enriched me and my understanding of security communities and cognitive evolution. In 1998–99, I started to conceive the book in its present form while taking a sabbatical year at the Weatherhead Center for International Affairs (WCFIA), Harvard University. I still remember when I discovered by chance the concept of communities of practice, and how I could not sleep that night because of my excitement at the implications. The concept helped organize many of my loose thoughts on cognitive evolution. I am grateful to the then-director of WCFIA, Jorge Dominguez, and to Herbert Kelman, from whom I learned much.



In 2011, I first presented some rough ideas on the book at an inaugural lecture for an honorary professorship I received from the Political Science Department at Copenhagen University. I am very grateful to Lene Hansen, Rebecca Adler-Nissen, Stefano Guzzini, Trine Flockhart, and James Der Derian for their critical but extremely useful feedback and suggestions.

Two sabbatical years gave me the opportunity to write the first draft. In 2012–13, I was a Senior Braudel Fellow at the European University Institute (EUI). I am grateful to Laszo Brust for the opportunity to become a Braudel Fellow and for his comments on my work. I also thank Fritz Kratochwil, Nikolas Rajkovic, Philippe Schmitter, Sven Steinmo, Raffaella Del Sarto, Federica Bicchi, Hanspeter Kriesi, Ulrich Krotz, and Gerald McDermott, with whom I enjoyed useful conversations on my book plans. Gabriella Unger, Maureen Lechleitner, and Filipa de Sousa provided useful staff support. In 2014–15, I spent another year, this time in the Kolleg-Forschergruppe, the Transformative Power of Europe (KFG) program at Freie Universität, directed by Thomas Risse and Tanja Börzel. There, I wrote most of the first draft. I am immensely grateful to Thomas and Tanja for giving me this opportunity and also for their useful feedback on my project, which I presented when it still was in a preliminary stage. KFG fellows, too many to mention, also provided good advice. I thank Hans Joas, Michael Zürn, Andrea Ribeiro Hoffmann, Tobias Berger, Wolfram Kaiser, and Gil Murciano, who offered useful comments. Astrid Roos, Anne Morgestern, and Torsten Spickhoffen provided wonderful administrative support.

I thank the Centre for International and Policy Affairs at the University of Ottawa, particularly Michael Williams; the Institut Barcelona D'estudis Internacionals (IBEI); Universitat Pompeu-Fabra, Barcelona, particularly Esther Barbe; the Hebrew University and the Halbert Program, particularly Moshe Hirsch and Jutta Brunnée; and the Centre for International Governance Innovation, University of Waterloo, particularly Ambassador Jorge Heine for inviting me to give talks on cognitive evolution theory.

In 2017, I gave two talks on cognitive evolution and democracy, one of them by invitation at the Conference of the Association of Latin American Political Scientists (ALACIP), in Montevideo, Uruguay. I am immensely grateful to my friend Adolfo Garcé, with whom I have been speaking about cognitive evolution ever since, for inviting me and for his invaluable feedback. I gave the other lecture at the Conference of the Society of Argentinian Political Scientists (SAAP) in Buenos Aires. Special thanks go to Emanuel Porcelli and Daniela Perrotta for their kind invitation and for extensive feedback on the talk. I profusely thank

x Acknowledgments

Nicolas Saldias, who offered invaluable research assistance in preparing my talks. I am happy to have helped establish a bridge to these countries with cognitive evolution and practice theory ideas, and hope that my book will be published in Spanish, not only for the sake of knowledge diffusion but also because “a mucha honra soy Uruguayo.”

I am grateful to Alex Wendt, Fritz Kratochwil (again), Christian Büger, Anna Leander, Jeff Checkel, Alexandra Gheciu, Yosef Lapid, Jennifer Mitzen, Antje Wiener, William Thompson, Charles Kupchan, Jean-Marc Coicaud, Huen Fung-Khong, Barry Buzan, Ole Weaver, Janice Bially Mattern, Iver Neumann, Ole Jacob Sending, Michael Williams (again), Raymond Duvall, Daniel Levine, Nicholas Bremberg, and Magnus Ekengren for their comments and advice at different stages of this project.

I thank the Charles Bronfman Foundation; the Center for Science and International Affairs at the Kennedy School of Government, and the Weatherhead Center for International Affairs (both at Harvard University); the Munk School of Global Affairs and Public Policy at the University of Toronto; the European University Institute; and the Kolleg-Forschergruppe, the Transformative Power of Europe at Freie Universität for financial support.

In my eclectic and synthetic approach, I stand on the shoulders of giants without whom I would not have been able to develop cognitive evolution theory. The particular giants are Ernst B. Haas, Ilia Prigogine, Karl Deutsch, Kenneth Boulding, Ludwik Fleck, Karl Popper, Thomas Schelling, John Searle, Stephen Toulmin, and Etienne Wenger. Because of Robert Pirsig’s *Zen and the Art of Motorcycle Maintenance*, which I read back in 1976, I had my first “aha” moment on the construction of social reality (a.k.a. the motorcycle).

Finally, my deepest gratitude goes to my family. Sylvia, my wife, stoically endured my struggle to write this book and accompanied me on the wild ride. Shirli, my daughter, Nadav and Jonathan, my sons, and Daniel, Elisha, Nina, and Lily, my delightful grandchildren, patiently waited for the moment that I’d be finished writing this book. Without their love, support, and understanding this work would have never seen the light of day. I dedicate it to them, and to my students, whom I also consider part of a larger family.