

### Networked News, Racial Divides

Against conventional wisdom, pervasive Black-White disparities pair with vitriolic public conversation in politically progressive communities throughout America. Networked News, Racial Divides examines obstacles to public dialogues about racial inequality and opportunities for better discourse in mid-sized, liberal cities. The book narrates the challenges faced when talking about race through stories about communities struggling with K-12 education achievement gaps. Media expert Sue Robinson applies Bourdieusian field theory to understand media ecologies and analyze whose voices get heard and whose get left out. She explores how privilege shapes discourse and how identity politics can interfere with deliberation. Drawing on network analysis of community dialogues, interviews with journalists, politicians, activists and citizens, and deep case study of five cities, this reflexive and occasionally narrative book chronicles the institutional, cultural, and other problematic realities of amplifying voices of all people, while also recommending strategies to move forward and build trust.

Sue Robinson holds the Helen Franklin Firstbrook Professor of Journalism research chair in the School of Journalism and Mass Communication at University of Wisconsin-Madison, where she teaches and researches digital technologies and information authority in journalism studies. Robinson is widely published, has won many grants and awards – including the Krieghbaum Under-40 Award – and consults for newsrooms, school districts, and other organizations. She worked as a reporter for thirteen years before entering academia.



### Communication, Society and Politics

#### **Editors**

W. Lance Bennett, University of Washington Robert M. Entman, The George Washington University

Politics and relations among individuals in societies across the world are being transformed by new technologies for targeting individuals and sophisticated methods for shaping personalized messages. The new technologies challenge boundaries of many kinds – between news, information, entertainment, and advertising; between media, with the arrival of the World Wide Web; and even between nations. Communication, Society and Politics probes the political and social impacts of these new communication systems in national, comparative, and global perspective.

### Other Books in the Series

Erik Albæk, Arjen van Dalen, Nael Jebril, and Claes de Vreese, *Political Journalism in Comparative Perspective* 

Eva Anduiza, Michael James Jensen, and Laia Jorba, eds., Digital Media and Political Engagement Worldwide: A Comparative Study

C. Edwin Baker, Media Concentration and Democracy: Why Ownership Matters C. Edwin Baker, Media, Markets, and Democracy

W. Lance Bennett and Robert M. Entman, eds., Mediated Politics: Communication in the Future of Democracy

Rodney Benson, Shaping Immigration News: A French-American Comparison Bruce Bimber, Information and American Democracy: Technology in the Evolution of Political Power

Bruce Bimber, Andrew Flanagin, and Cynthia Stohl, Collective Action in Organizations: Interaction and Engagement in an Era of Technological Change Lynn S. Clark and Regina Marchi, Young People and the Future of News Murray Edelman, The Politics of Misinformation

Frank Esser and Barbara Pfetsch, eds., Comparing Political Communication: Theories, Cases, and Challenges

Myra Marx Ferree, William Anthony Gamson, Jürgen Gerhards, and Dieter Rucht, Shaping Abortion Discourse: Democracy and the Public Sphere in Germany and the United States

Hernan Galperin, New Television, Old Politics: The Transition to Digital TV in the United States and Britain

Tim Groeling, When Politicians Attack: Party Cohesion in the Media

(continued after the Index)



# Networked News, Racial Divides

How Power and Privilege Shape Public Discourse in Progressive Communities

**SUE ROBINSON** 

University of Wisconsin-Madison





### CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108419895
DOI: 10.1017/9781108304405

© Sue Robinson 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-41989-5 Hardback ISBN 978-1-108-41232-2 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



This book is dedicated to my mother and best friend,
Gloria P. Robinson,
whose incredible strength and resourcefulness
have been my inspiration.



## Contents

List of Figures		page viii
List of Tables		ix
Lis	List of Boxes	
Ac	Acknowledgments	
	PART I	
Ι	Introduction: A Plea for Progressives to "Stay in the Room"	3
2	Networked Media Ecologies	41
3	Power, Trust, and Authority in a Local Information Flow	79
	PART II	
4	Obstacles to Public Discourse About Race	121
5	Legitimation Strategies in Public Discourse About Race	160
6	Outcomes and Opportunities in Community Trust Building	194
Appendix		234
References		238
Index		254

vii



## **Figures**

2.1	A networked media ecology.	page 46
2.2	Four top influencers.	48
2.3	Long tail of URLs.	50
3.1	Newspaper articles.	95
3.2	Blog posts.	96
3.3	Facebook posts.	97



## **Tables**

I.I	Case study demographics (2010–2013).	page 38
2.1	Most influential producers.	54
2.2	Roles in an emergent ecology in local community.	63



## Boxes

1.1	An interlude: The timeline of Madison Prep	
	and its aftermath.	page 8
2.1	An interlude: Public talk in Cambridge, Mass.,	
	about race.	71
3.1	An interlude: Public talk in Chapel Hill, N.C.,	
	about race.	112
<b>4.</b> I	An interlude: Public talk in Ann Arbor, Mich.,	
	about race.	126
5.1	An interlude: Public talk in Evanston, Ill.,	
	about race.	167
6.1	Tips for Public communicators.	227



## Acknowledgments

First and foremost, I want to thank Cambridge University Press, editors Sara Doskow, Claudia Bona-Cohen, and Julie Hrischeva, as well as the series editors, Lance Bennett and Robert Entman, the board, copy editor Brian Black, and anonymous reviewers for their suggestions and for helping to make this book as good as it could be.

Next, I want to give a shout-out to the nonprofit, nonpartisan Kettering Foundation and its members, whom I met in 2014. The Foundation is a research organization interested in enabling citizens to participate more fully in solving communities' problems. Being connected with them meant an immediate real-world application to all of this. It is not an understatement that I would not have been able to finish this book in a timely manner without their partnership. In particular, I'd like to thank Paloma Dallas, Paula Lynn Ellis, Alice Diebel, David Holwerk, and Maura Casey for their high-level feedback and general kindness. In addition, I'd like to thank the group of reporters and engaged citizens via Martin Reynolds at the Maynard Institute for Journalism who helped me revise the recommendations that we are sending to newsrooms across the country. Also, Kettering Foundation served as a collaborator in the research for a section in Chapter 2 as seen in the table on roles in the emergent media ecology.

I used parts of an article published in Taylor & Francis' *Journalism Studies* journal for Chapter 5 on legitimation strategies. That 2015 article is titled "Legitimation Strategies in Journalism: Public Storytelling about Racial Disparities." I thank *Journalism Studies* for allowing us to republish some of that article here.

The amazing art on the book cover was done by artist and graphic designer Claire Michelle Miller of Madison, Wisc., whom I met through



xii

### Acknowledgments

the Simpson Street Free Press, a nonprofit youth organization that trains kids to be researchers and journalists and seeks to resolve K-12 achievement disparities.

In other acknowledgments: The Minority Student Achievement Network, run by Madeline Hafner, became my partner in understanding these racial achievement disparities as well as identifying cities across the country that met my criteria. I am happy to call Madeline my friend. In addition, I'd like to give a shout-out to all the superintendents in MSAN to whom we talked; they were all so forthcoming in the important work they are doing in these districts. The Graduate School at University of Wisconsin-Madison gave me some resources to fund different phases of the project, and the School of Journalism and Mass Communication supported this project in myriad ways as well. In addition, more than 120 citizens (parents, journalists, bloggers, Facebook commenters, activists, community leaders, superintendents, school officials, city politicians, administrators, teachers, and others) took the time to sit down with me and chat about race – never an easy topic to talk about. The fact that I am a White academic made these conversations awkward sometimes. These people gave their trust, and I feel honored that they talked to me. Kaleem Caire, TJ Mertz, John Matthews, Matt DeFour, Dr. Rev. Alex Gee, Rev. Everett Mitchell, John Odom, Derrell Connor, Ananda Mirilli, Jennifer Cheatham, and Shakil Choudhury in particular spent time making sure the information in here is accurate. A special shout-out to Jonathan Gramling, Paul Fanlund, Katie Dean, Zoe Sullivan, Nathan Comp, John Smalley, Pat Schneider, Matthew DeFour, Judy Davidoff, Karen Lincoln Michel, Brennan Nardi, Pat Dillon, and all the other journalists I met who were committed to "staying in the room." During Spring 2016, 14 UW-Madison students took a chance on a new service-learning class that was the result of the findings from this book. They were very forthcoming in their feedback, and I thank them for participating.

Someone had to read parts of this manuscript besides me (and my research team) and that dubious honor fell to Lucas Graves, Rachelle Winkle-Wagner, Seth Lewis, Wilson Lowrey, Nikki Usher, Matthew Powers, Chris Anderson, and Matthew Carlson. Rodney Benson read the entire thing – and parts of it twice – and gave me amazing feedback, and Lewis and Carlson were huge supporters from conception to completion. My gratitude extends to my colleagues within the University of Wisconsin-Madison who helped with various parts of the conceptualization or publication as well: Robert Asen, Shawnika Hull,



### Acknowledgments

xiii

Hemant Shah, Lewis Friedland, Kathleen Culver, Dhavan Shah, Doug McLeod, Hernando Rojas, Chris Wells, Kathy Cramer, Julie Petrokubi, Karyn Riddle, Lindsay Palmer, Michael Wagner, Young Mie Kim, and the late James Baughman. Thanks to Janet Buechner, Lisa Aarli, and Rowan Calyx in the front office of SJMC for helping me with the logistics of grants, reimbursements, and graduate students on the project. Beth Horstmeier transcribed interviews on deadline and with incredible accuracy given how some of them were done in noisy coffee shops.

A long list of UW graduate students contributed to the data collection in some way - from the first phase documenting Madison's whole media ecology to literature reviews to interviews: Jordan Foley, Mark Mederson, Michael Mirer, Cathy DeShano, Emily Eggleston, Mitchell Bard, Linda Pfeiffer, Ashley Hinck, Cara Lombardo, German Alvarez, Mitchael Schwartz, and Mary Sussman. I add to this list two of the most competent undergraduates I have ever had the pleasure to work with: Tyriek Mack and Alexa Grunwaldt. I fully expect them both to do great things. Ho Young Yoon, who was a graduate student at the time of data collection, was instrumental in helping me design and execute the network analysis portion of the project. Plus, he was extremely patient with me, helping me to learn a number of software programs and then coding thousands of pieces of copy (along with Mitchael Schwartz) and drawing the maps and tables in Chapters 2 and 3. Proofreader extraordinaire (and SJMC graduate student) Catasha Davis copyedited with a very critical eye. Graduate student K. C. Councilor helped me turn the data into the service-learning class I mention in the conclusion. And last but definitely not least, I'd like to thank the "Dream Team" comprising Meredith Metzler and Caitlin Cieslik-Miskimen who worked with me for two years on this project. In addition to the copious amount of data collection, in-depth interviews, and analyses we did during Summer 2015, they gave me professional-level editing of the book. They are amazing scholars.

So many of my friends have had to listen to me throughout this process – some every day – and a whole slew of people brainstormed titles. I can't list everyone but you know who you are. Thank you, friends.

A very special dedication goes to Dr. Shawnika Hull, now of George Washington University, who pushed me on my journey to understand my own White privilege. She also stepped in to facilitate two focus groups for me so that conversation could be open and less awkward for parents. She is a wonderful friend and brilliant colleague.



xiv

### Acknowledgments

Finally, I dedicated this book to my amazing mother but I want to give a shout-out to my dad, Samuel Robinson, as well. I've rarely met an individual so talented in so many areas, and I have tried to emulate his work ethic in my life. My love and husband, Dr. Robert Asen, is that rare partner who both understands and appreciates not only academic life but also communication theory in particular. His support both professionally as a colleague at the University of Wisconsin-Madison and personally at home have been essential to the completion of this book. My smart and insightful stepdaughter Simone helped brainstorm possible titles for the book. Finally, I acknowledge my little one, Zachary, who is my joy and gets me through every day.