

Women and the Periodical Press in China's Long Twentieth Century

In this major new collection, an international team of scholars examine the relationship between the Chinese women's periodical press and global modernity in the late nineteenth and twentieth centuries. The essays in this illustrated volume probe the ramifications for women of two monumental developments in this period: the intensification of China's encounters with foreign powers and a media transformation comparable in its impact to the current Internet age. The book offers a distinctive methodology for studying the periodical press, which is supported by the development of two bilingual databases of early Chinese periodicals. Throughout the study, essays on China are punctuated by transdisciplinary reflections from scholars working on periodicals outside of the Chinese context, encouraging readers to rethink common stereotypes about lived womanhood in modern China and to reconsider the nature of Chinese modernity in a global context.

MICHEL HOCKX is Professor of Chinese Literature and Director of the Liu Institute for Asia and Asian Studies at the University of Notre Dame.

JOAN JUDGE is Professor in the Department of History at York University in Toronto, Canada.

BARBARA MITTLER is Professor of Chinese at the Institute of Chinese Studies and Director of the Heidelberg Centre for Transcultural Studies at Heidelberg University.





Women and the Periodical Press in China's Long Twentieth Century

A Space of Their Own?

Edited by

Michel Hockx

Department of East Asian Languages and Cultures, University of Notre Dame

Joan Judge

Department of History, York University

Barbara Mittler

Institute of Chinese Studies, Heidelberg University





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108419758

DOI: 10.1017/9781108304085

© Cambridge University Press 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd. Padstow, Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-108-41975-8 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



> For Harriet Evans An inspiration to all of us





Contents

	List of Figures	page x
	List of Contributors	xiv
	Acknowledgements Note on Sources	xx xxii
	Note on Sources	XXII
	Preface: The Role of Gender in Defining the "Women's	
	Magazine"	XXV
	MARGARET BEETHAM	
	Introduction: Women's Journals as Multigeneric Artefacts	1
	JOAN JUDGE, BARBARA MITTLER, AND MICHEL HOCKX	
Part I	Methodologies: Framing, Constituting, and Regulating	
1 41 (1	the Space of the Women's Journal	19
1	Persuading with Pictures: Cover Art and <i>The Ladies' Journal</i>	
1	(1915–1931)	21
	JULIA F. ANDREWS	
2	Engendering a Journal: Editors and Nudes in <i>Linloon</i>	
_	Magazine and Its Global Context	57
	LIYING SUN	
3	Raising Eyebrows: The Journal Eyebrow Talk and the	
	Regulation of "Harmful Fiction" in Modern China	74
	MICHEL HOCKX	
	Coda: Women's Journals through the Prism of Late Qing	
	Fiction	93
	ELLEN WIDMER	
D4 II	A Construction of The West of Learner Construction	
PartII	A Space of Their Own: The Woman's Journal, Generic Choice and the Making of Female Public Expression	99
	•	,,
	Reflection: Writers and Readers – Constituting the Space of	101
	Women's Journals JENNIFER SCANLON	101
	JENNIFER SCANLON	
		3711



viii	Contents	
4	Radicalizing Poetics: Poetic Practice in <i>Women's World</i> , 1904–1907 GRACE FONG	104
5	Redefining Female Talent: <i>The Women's Eastern Times, The Ladies' Journal</i> , and the Development of "Women's Art" in China, 1910s–1930s DORIS SUNG	121
6	Constituting the Female Subject: Romantic Fiction by Women Authors in <i>Eyebrow Talk</i> JIN-CHU HUANG (TRANSLATED BY MICHEL HOCKX AND WEI-HSIN LIN)	141
7	Rebellious Yet Constrained: Dissenting Women's Views on Love and Sexual Morality in <i>The Ladies' Journal</i> and <i>The</i> New Woman RACHEL HUI-CHI HSU	158
8	Voices of Female Educators in Early-Twentieth-Century Women's Magazines SIAO-CHEN HU	176
9	Room for Improvement: The Ideal of the Educational Home in <i>The Ladies' Journal</i> MARIA AF SANDEBERG	192
Part III	Gendered Space and Global Context: Foreign Models, Circulating Concepts, and the Constitution of Female	
	Subjectivities	213
	Reflection: Lived and Idealized Self and Other in Women's Journals NATHALIE COOKE AND JENNIFER GARLAND	215
10	Competing Conceptualizations of <i>Guo</i> (Country, State, and/or Nation-State) in Late Qing Women's Journals NANXIU QIAN	218
11	Western Heroines in Late Qing Women's Journals: Meiji-Era Writings on "Women's Self-Help" in China XIA XIAOHONG (TRANSLATED BY JOSHUA A. FOGEL)	236
12	Foreign Knowledge of Bodies: Japanese Sources, Western Science, and China's Republican Lady JOAN JUDGE	255



	Contents	ix
13	"Othering" the Foreign Other in Early-Twentieth-Century Chinese Women's Magazines PAUL J. BAILEY	282
14	The New (Wo)man and Her/His Others: Foreigners on the Pages of China's Women's Magazines BARBARA MITTLER	302
	Conclusion: A Space of Their Own? Concluding Reflections HARRIET EVANS	332
	Appendix: Journal Data	340
	Glossary	345
	Bibliography	367
	Index	408



Figures

1.1	Cover of The Ladies Journal, 1.1 (1913): painting by Au	
	Yongqing	page 22
1.2	Cover of Dianshizhai Pictorial, 128 (1887.8.xia)	23
1.3	Cover of Women's World, 1 (Jan. 1904)	24
1.4	Cover of <i>The Women's Eastern Times</i> , 1 (June 11, 1911):	
	painting by Xu Yongqing	25
1.5	Cover of The Women's Eastern Times, 13 (April 1, 1914):	
	painting by Xu Yongqing	27
1.6	Cover of The True Record, 12 (1912): painting by Gao Qifeng	27
1.7	Cover of <i>The Ladies' Journal</i> , 1:2 (1915): painting by Xu	
	Yongqing	30
1.8	Cover of <i>The Ladies' Journal</i> , 1:3 (1915): painting by Xu	
	Yongqing	32
1.9	Cover of <i>The Ladies' Journal</i> , 1:5 (1915): painting by Xu	
	Yongqing	33
1.10	Covers of <i>The Ladies' Journal</i> , 1:7–10 (1915): paintings by X	u
	Yongqing	34
1.11	Cover of <i>The Ladies' Journal</i> , 1:12 (1915): painting by Xu	
	Yongqing	35
1.12	Cover of <i>The Ladies' Journal</i> , 2:6 (1916): painting by Lou Ton	g 37
1.13	Cover of <i>The Ladies' Journal</i> , 2:8 (1916): painting by Jin	
	Zhang	37
1.14	Cover of The Ladies' Journal, 3:10 (1917)	39
1.15	Cover of <i>The Ladies' Journal</i> , 4:7 (1918): painting by Wu	
	Shujuan	40
1.16	Cover of <i>The Ladies' Journal</i> , 6:5 (1920): painting by Zhou Li	i ,
	dated 1801	41
1.17	Cover of The Ladies' Journal, 7:5 (1921)	42
1.18	Cover of The Ladies' Journal, 8:4 (1922): special issue on	
	divorce	43
1.19	Cover of The Ladies' Journal, 9:11 (1923): special issue on	
	choosing a spouse	44

X



More Information

	List of Figures	xi
1.20	Cover of The Ladies' Journal, 10:2 (1924): painting by Li	
	Lichen	45
1.21	Cover of <i>The Ladies' Journal</i> , 11:5 (1925): design by "Xiang"	46
1.22	"What Is the New Sexual Morality?" The Ladies' Journal, 11:1	
	(1925)	47
1.23	Cover of <i>The Ladies' Journal</i> , 11:3 (1925): design by "Ke"	48
1.24	Cover of <i>The Ladies' Journal</i> , 15:7 (1929): design by Jiang	
	Zhaohe	49
1.25	Cover of <i>The Ladies' Journal</i> , 16:11 (1930): design by Qian	
	Juntao	50
1.26	Table of Contents for <i>The Ladies' Journal</i> , 17:1 (1931):	
	ornaments by Baceo (Qian Juntao)	51
1.27	Cover of <i>Student Magazine</i> , 18:1 (1929): design by Qian Juntao	53
1.28	Cover of The Ladies' Journal, 17:9 (1931)	55
2.1	A semi-nude, <i>Linloon Magazine</i> , 1:39 (1931), 1534	66
2.2	A semi-nude, Li Li, Pictorial Weekly, 8:366 (1932), 49	67
2.3	Examples of photographs circulated between Linloon	
	Magazine and Pictorial Weekly	69
2.4	A male nude in Linloon Magazine, 1:17 (1931), 606	70
2.5	A male nude in <i>Pictorial Weekly</i> , 5:250 (August 9, 1930), 399.	71
3.1	Nudes in Eyebrow Talk	81
3.2	Original and "cleansed" covers of Eyebrow Talk 1	82
3.3	Original and "cleansed" covers of Eyebrow Talk 2	83
3.4	Original and "cleansed" covers of Eyebrow Talk 3	83
3.5	Shenbao advertisement for Eyebrow Talk	84
3.6	Photographs of women's everyday lives in Eyebrow Talk	90
4.1	"Ms Du Qingchi," Women's World 7 (1904)	110
5.1	Photo-portrait and a painted fan by Jin Taotao, The Women's	
	Eastern Times 1 (June 11, 1911)	127
5.2	A painted fan by Jin Taotao in <i>The Women's Eastern Times</i> 1	
	(detail)	128
5.3	Handicrafts by Su Bennan and Su Benyan, The Women's	
	Eastern Times 3 (September 22, 1911)	131
5.4	Paintings by Zhang Mojun, The Women's Eastern Times 4	
	(November 5, 1911)	132
5.5	Photo-portrait and embroidery of the Italian Empress by Shen	
	Shou, The Women's Eastern Times 1 (June 11, 1911)	134
5.6	Photo of female students at L'Institut franco-chinois de Lyon,	
	The Ladies' Journal 8:7 (1922)	138
5.7	"Guying" (Looking at one's own reflection) by Pan Yuliang,	
	The Ladies' Journal 15:7 (1929)	139



Cambridge University Press

978-1-108-41975-8 — Women and the Periodical Press in China's Long Twentieth Century Edited by Michel Hockx , Joan Judge , Barbara Mittler

Frontmatter

More Information

xii	List of Figures	
9.1	Advertisement for educational toys, <i>The Ladies' Journal</i> 6:5 (1920), 67	198
9.2	"A beautiful dwelling," <i>The Ladies' Journal</i> 13:1 (1927), 1	202
9.3	Map of the first floor of the "beautiful dwelling," <i>The Ladies' Journal</i> 13:2 (1927), 41	203
9.4	Three alternative plans for Chu Hui's home library, <i>The Ladies' Journal</i> 13:7 (1927), 119	206
9.5	Liu Heng's educational cards, <i>The Ladies' Journal</i> 17:6 (1927), 69	210
12.1	Ms. Kinbara, Japanese teacher in China, <i>The Women's Eastern Times</i> 6 (May 1912)	256
12.2	Physical education specialist (<i>tiyu jia</i>) Tang Jianwo in Western dress, <i>The Women's Eastern Times</i> 2 (July 1911)	260
12.3	Younger sister of the wife of [Kajita] Hanko wearing Kajita-style reformed clothing. <i>The Women's Eastern Times</i> 1 (June 1911)	264
12.4	Ye Jingzi, <i>Zhongguo nüxia</i> (Chinese female knight-errant) in Western dress. <i>The Women's Eastern Times</i> 5 (January 1912)	265
12.5	Female volunteers at a <i>saizhenhui</i> (exhibition) teashop, <i>The Women's Eastern Times</i> 8 (September 1912)	265
12.6	Cover for <i>Jogaku sekai</i> (World of women's education)	266
12.7	Cover for <i>Jogakusei gahô</i> (Illustrated journal for female	200
12.7	students) with woman in kimono	267
12.8	Cover for <i>The Women's Eastern Times</i> 18 (June 1916)	267
12.9	The Women's Eastern Times 12 (January 1914)	269
	Ladies' Home Journal (February 1899)	269
	The Women's Eastern Times 5 (January 1912)	270
	Ladies' Home Journal (July 1902)	270
12.13	"A woman from Tianjin had been suffering from stomach-	_, 0
	ache," The Women's Eastern Times 4 (November 1911)	271
12.14	"Nüjiebao – [it is] the most precious thing for women indeed," <i>The Women's Eastern Times</i> 10 (May 1913), 11 (October 1913)	272
12.15	Republican Chinese survey of women's menstruation, <i>The Women's Eastern Times</i> 16 (February 1915), 85	275
12.16	Photographs of doctors as featured in Aoyagi's <i>The Practice of Painless Childbirth</i> , front matter	279
12.17	Photographs of doctors as featured in a translation of Aoyagi's work in Qin Zhong, <i>The Women's Eastern Times</i> 20	
13.1	(November 1916), 47 (identical to those in Fig. 12.16) A notice by a Shanghai pharmacist advertising the benefits of <i>qingkuai wan</i> , a fortifying pill for women, <i>The Ladies' Journal</i>	280
	1:5 (1915)	293



More Information

	List of Figures	xiii
13.2	Photographs of a "Chinese old-style wedding" and of a	
	"European new-style wedding," The Women's Eastern Times 2	
	(July 26, 1911)	295
13.3	A Javanese royal wedding and fashionably dressed European	
	women, The Women's Eastern Times 3 (September 22, 1911)	296
13.4	An aristocratic Javanese woman and a wealthy Javanese	
	woman, The Women's Eastern Times 4 (November 5, 1911)	297
13.5	Satirical cartoon illustrating "civilization" and "savagery," <i>The</i>	
	Ladies' Journal 7:7 (1921)	299
14.1	As foreign as it gets, <i>Women's World</i> 10 (1904)–2 (1905)	304
14.2	Rural women at leisure, Rural Women Knowing All 2 (1996)	308
14.3	Rural women at work, Rural Women Knowing All 4 (1996)	309
14.4	Rural women for (dis)play, Rural Women Knowing All 5 (1996)	310
14.5	A rare foreign woman, Rural Women Knowing All 2 (1996), 52	311
14.6	Women at work, Woman of China 5 (1965)	313
14.7	Women moving mountains, Woman of China 1 (1966)	314
14.8	Mussolini's wife, Linloon Magazine 225 (1936), 466	320
14.9	Inviting positions, Linloon Magazine 222 (1936), 304	321
14.10	Healthy bodies, Linloon Magazine 221 (1936), 214	322
14.11	"The standard Chinese," Shidai Manhua 25 (20 January 1936),	
	n.p.	324
14.12	Transcultural types, Linloon Magazine 40 (1931), 1559	325
14.13	The transcultural 1950s, Woman of China 9 (1956), 6	326
14.14	Foreign or Chinese? Not always an easy distinction, Rural	
	Women Knowing All 2 (1996), 54	327
14.15	Foreign or Chinese? Not always an easy distinction, Linloon	
	Magazine 44 (1932), 1790	329
14.16	Foreign or Chinese? Not always an easy distinction, Linloon	
	Magazine 71 (1932), 970h	330



Contributors

MARIA AF SANDEBERG is a Senior Teaching Fellow in the Department of the Languages and Cultures of China and Inner Asia at SOAS, University of London, and a freelance writer and translator. Her research interests include gender studies and the literature and literary debates of China's Republican period.

JULIA F. ANDREWS is Distinguished University Professor in the History of Art Department at the Ohio State University. In addition to many articles in journals, exhibition catalogues, and anthologies, among her previous publications are *Painters and Politics in the People's Republic of China, 1949–1979* (1994), which was awarded the Levenson Prize; *A Century in Crisis: Modernity and Tradition in the Art of 20th Century China* (1998); and *Art of Modern China* (2012), which received the Humanities Book Prize of the International Convention of Asia Scholars. She is currently completing an exhibition catalogue, *Painting Her Way: The Art of Fang Zhaoling* (1914–2006), for the Asia Society Hong Kong Center. Her research has received vital support from the NEH, NEA, ACLS, Fulbright Program, Chiang Chingkuo Foundation, and, most recently, a Guggenheim fellowship.

PAUL J. BAILEY is Professor of Modern Chinese History at the University of Durham (UK), having previously taught at Lingnan College (Hong Kong) and the University of Edinburgh (UK). His previous publications include Reform the People (1990); Postwar Japan (1996); China in the Twentieth Century (2001); Gender and Education in China (2007); Creative Spaces: Seeking the Dynamics of Change in China (2012, co-editor and contributor); and Women and Gender in Twentieth-Century China (2012). His forthcoming book, Chinese Overseas Labour in World War One France: Migrant Workers, Globalisation and the Sino-French Connection, will be published by Routledge. His current project is a study of female crime and socioeconomic change in twentieth-century China.

MARGARET BEETHAM's publications include A Magazine of Her Own? Domesticity and Desire in the Woman's Magazine, 1800–1914 (1996);

xiv



List of Contributors xv

Victorian Woman's Magazines: An Anthology (2001), with Kay Boardman; The Women's Worlds: Ideology, Femininity and Women's Magazines (1991), with Ros Ballaster, Liz Frazer, and Sandra Hebron; and numerous journal articles, chapters in books, and edited or co-edited volumes. She was an Associate Editor of the Dictionary of Nineteenth-Century Journalism (2009) and is Senior Advisor to the Boards of the Research Society for Victorian Periodicals and ESPRit (the European Society for Periodical Research). She is an Honorary Research Fellow in the School of Arts and Media at the University of Salford, Manchester, having retired from the English Department at Manchester Metropolitan University.

NATHALIE COOKE is Associate Dean of McGill Library (rare and special collections) and professor of English at McGill University in Montreal. Her publications focus on the shaping of culinary and literary taste. She is the author of two books on the writing of Margaret Atwood, the founding editor of the journal CuiZine: The Journal of Canadian Food Cultures: Revue des cultures culinaires au Canada (2009–), and the editor of What's to Eat? Entrées in Canadian Food History (2009). She is the co-editor of Mrs. Johnson's Receipt Book: A Treasury of Cookery and Medicinal Receipts, 1741–1848 (2015) and of Catharine Parr Traill's The Female Emigrant's Guide, Cooking with a Canadian Classic (2017), which includes resource materials to make this publication a toolkit for those exploring historical cookery.

HARRIET EVANS is Professor Emeritus of Chinese Cultural Studies at the University of Westminster. She was recently appointed Visiting Professor in Anthropology at the London School of Economics. She has written extensively on the politics of gender and sexuality in China and on visual culture of the Mao era. Her main publications include Women and Sexuality in China: Dominant Discourses of Female Sexuality and Gender since 1949 (1997); Picturing Power in the People's Republic of China: Posters of the Cultural Revolution (co-edited with Stephanie Hemelryk Donald, 1999); and The Subject of Gender: Daughters and Mothers in Urban China (2008). She is currently completing Beijing from Below, an oral history of a disadvantaged neighborhood in Beijing. She is also coming to the end of a three-year research project, funded by the Leverhulme Trust, on "Conflicts in Cultural Value: Localities and Heritage in Southwestern China."

GRACE FONG is Professor of Chinese Literature in the Department of East Asian Studies, McGill University. She is Director of the Ming Qing Women's Writings digital archive and database project (http://digital.library.mcgill.ca/mingqing/); author of *Herself an Author: Gender, Agency, and Writing in Late Imperial China*; and co-editor of *Representing Lives in China: Forms of Biography in the Ming-Qing Period, 1368–1911* (Cornell East Asia Series,



xvi List of Contributors

forthcoming 2018). She is currently conducting a genealogical study of the filiality of daughters in late imperial China.

JENNIFER GARLAND is an Associate Librarian at Rare Books and Special Collections, McGill University and curator of the Blackader–Lauterman Collection of Architecture and Art and the John Bland Canadian Architecture Collection. Her recent research interests include visual literacy, the history of book illustration, and engaging new audiences with special collections. She is also part of a team currently developing the McGill Library Book Arts Laboratory, a hands-on space for teaching the history of the book using the tools of the hand press period. She serves on the Executive Board of the Art Libraries Society of North America (ARLIS/NA) as Canadian Liaison (2016–2018).

MICHEL HOCKX is Professor of Chinese literature and Director of the Liu Institute for Asia and Asian Studies at the University of Notre Dame. He has published widely on modern Chinese literary communities, their practices and values, their printed and digital publications, and their relationship to the state. His latest monograph, *Internet Literature in China* (Columbia University Press, 2015), was listed by *Choice* magazine as one of the "Top 25 Outstanding Academic Titles of 2015."

RACHEL HUI-CHI HSU received her first Ph.D. in Chinese history in 2001 and her second Ph.D. in U.S. transnational history in 2016. She has taught in Mingdao University (2001–2003), Tunghai University (2003–2014), and Loyola University Maryland (2016). She is a two-time Fulbrighter and has published two books, "Nala" zai Zhongguo: Xin nüxing xingxiang de suzao ji qi yanbian, 1900s–1930s 「娜拉」在中國:新女性形象的塑造及其演變, 1900s–1930s ('Nora' in China: The image-making and evolution of the new woman, 1900s–1930s; 2003) and Gudu xinmao: Qianduhou dao kangzhanqian de Beiping chengshi xiaofei 故都新貌: 遷都後到抗戰前的 北平城市消費 (1928–1937) (New looks of an ancient capital: Urban consumption in Beiping from 1928 to 1937; 2008), as well as more than twenty peer-reviewed articles. She is currently a research fellow in the Department of History, Sun Yat-Sen University, Guangzhou, China.

SIAO-CHEN HU is a Research Fellow at the Institute of Chinese Literature and Philosophy in Academia Sinica, Taiwan. A specialist in early modern Chinese literature, especially Ming—Qing narrative and women's literature, she is the author of Xinlixiang, jiu tili yu bukesiyi zhi shehui: Qing-mo Minchu Shanghai 'Chuantongpai' wenren yu guixiu zuojia de zhuanxing lixiang 新理想、舊體例與不可思議之社會—清末民初上海「傳統派」文人與閨秀作家的轉型現象 (A conflicted new world; 2011); Cainii chuyeweimian: Jindai Zhongguo niixing xushi wenxue de xingqi 才女徹夜未眠—近代中



List of Contributors xvii

國女性敘事文學的興起 (Burning the midnight oil: The rise of female narrative in early modern China; 2003), and Ming Qing wenxue zhong de Xinan xushi 明清文學中的西南敘事 (The Southwest in Ming—Qing literary imagination; 2017). She is also the co-editor, with Wang Ayling, of Jingdian zhuanhua yu Ming Qing xushi wenxue 經典轉化與明清敘事文學 (Transformations of literary canons and Ming—Qing narrative literature; 2009), and with Wang Hongtai, of Richang shenghuo de lunshu yu shijian 日常生活的論述與實踐 (Discourse and practice of everyday life; 2011). She has published widely in essay collections focused on Chinese women's literature, including The Inner Quarters and Beyond: Women Writers from Ming through Qing (edited by Grace Fong and Ellen Widmer, 2010) and Text, Performance, and Gender in Chinese Literature and Music (edited by Maghiel van Crevel, Tian Yuan Tan, and Michel Hockx, 2009).

JIN-CHU HUANG obtained her Ph.D. in Chinese Literature from National Taiwan University (1992). She is Professor of Chinese Literature at National Chung Cheng University, Taiwan, and her academic interests include late Qing and early Republican fiction and fiction theory and modern women writers, as well as gender studies. Her publications include Wan Qing shiqi xiaoshuo guannian zhi zhuanbian 晚清時期小說觀念之轉變 (The development of the concept of fiction in the late Qing period; 1995); Wan Qing xiaoshuo zhong de xin nüxing yanjiu 晚清小說中的新女性研究 (A study of "new women" in late Qing fiction; 2005); Wu Meicun xushishi yanjiu (A study of narrative poetry of Wu Meicun; 2008); and Nüxing shuxie de duoyuan chengxian: Qing-mo minchu nüzuojia xiaoshuo yanjiu 女性書寫的多元呈現:清末民初女作家小說研究 (Multiple presentations of female writing: A study of the fiction of late Qing and early Republican women writers; 2014). She is currently doing research on women's newspapers and magazines.

JOAN JUDGE is Professor in the Department of History at York University in Toronto, Canada. She is the author of Republican Lens: Gender, Visuality, and Experience in the Early Chinese Periodical Press (2015); The Precious Raft of History: The Past, the West, and the Woman Question in China (2008); and Print and Politics: "Shibao" and the Culture of Reform in Late Qing China (1996) and the co-editor of Beyond Exemplar Tales: Women's Biography in Chinese History (2011). She is currently engaged in a project with the working title "Quotidian Concerns: Everyday Knowledge and the Rise of the Common Reader in China, 1870–1955."

BARBARA MITTLER is Professor of Chinese at the Institute of Chinese Studies, and Director of the Heidelberg Centre for Transcultural Studies (Asia and Europe in a Global Context) at Heidelberg University. She is the author of



xviii List of Contributors

Dangerous Tunes: The Politics of Chinese Music in Hong Kong, Taiwan and the People's Republic of China since 1949 (1997); A Newspaper for China? Power, Identity and Change in China's News-Media, 1872–1912 (2004); and A Continuous Revolution: Making Sense of Cultural Revolution Culture (2012), which won the Fairbank Prize 2013. She is also the editor of Asian Punches: A Transcultural Affair (with Hans Harder, 2013). Currently, she is finishing another book-length study on women's magazines and a joint book with historian Thomas Maissen on the Renaissance and China.

NANXIU QIAN is Professor of Chinese Literature at Rice University and the author of Politics, Poetics, and Gender in Late Qing China: Xue Shaohui (1866–1911) and the Era of Reform (2015) and Spirit and Self in Medieval China: The Shih-shuo hsin-yu and Its Legacy (2001). She is also co-editor of Different Worlds of Discourse: Transformations of Gender and Genre in Late Qing and Early Republican China (with Grace Fong and Richard J. Smith, 2008); Chinese Literature: Conversations between Tradition and Modernity (with Zhang Hongsheng, 2007); and Beyond Tradition and Modernity: Gender, Genre, and Cosmopolitanism in Late Qing China (with Grace Fong and Harriet Zurndorfer, 2004). Her current book project is 'Exemplary Women' (Lienü) versus 'Worthy Ladies' (Xianyuan): The Two Traditions of Representing Women in the Sinosphere.

JENNIFER SCANLON is the William R. Kenan Jr. Professor of Gender, Sexuality, and Women's Studies at Bowdoin College. She has written extensively on women's magazines and consumer culture, including two books, *Inarticulate Longings: The Ladies' Home Journal, Gender, and the Promises of Consumer Culture* and *Bad Girls Go Everywhere: The Life of Helen Gurley Brown*. Her most recent publication, *Until There Is Justice: The Life of Anna Arnold Hedgeman*, is the first biography of the acclaimed civil rights worker.

LIYING SUN is a cultural historian who focuses on early-twentieth-century Chinese visual media history and popular culture from transcultural perspectives. She received her Ph.D. from Heidelberg University in 2015; her dissertation is entitled "Body Un/Dis-covered: *Luoti*, Editorial Agency and Transcultural Production in Chinese Pictorials (1925–1933)." In Heidelberg, she worked as content manager and co-editor of the database projects "Chinese Women's Magazines in the Late Qing and Early Republican Period" and "Early Chinese Periodicals Online." Sun is presently an Andrew Mellon Postdoctoral Fellow of Digital Humanities at the University of Southern California, Los Angeles. Her current project deals with historical audiences and transcultural receptions of silent films in China.

DORIS SUNG is Assistant Curator for Exhibitions and Research at the Peabody Essex Museum in Salem, Massachusetts. Prior to joining PEM, Sung was



List of Contributors xix

an adjunct professor of studio art and Chinese and East Asian art history at York University and the University of Toronto. Her publications cover topics ranging from women's art practices in early-twentieth-century China to contemporary performance art. Sung earned her Ph.D. in Humanities from York University in June 2016. She is also a visual artist and holds an M.F.A. in visual arts.

ELLEN WIDMER is the Mayling Soong Professor of Chinese Studies at Wellesley College. Her research fields include Chinese women's literature of the Ming and Qing dynasties, history of the book, missionary history, and traditional Chinese fiction and drama. She is the author of three monographs: The Margins of Utopia: Shui-hu hou-chuan and the Literature of Ming Loyalism (1987); The Beauty and the Book: Women and Fiction in Nineteenth Century China (2006); and Fiction's Family: Zhan Xi, Zhan Kai, and the Business of Women in Late-Qing China (2016). Volumes she has edited include From May Fourth to June Fourth: Fiction and Film in Twentieth-Century China (with David Wang, 1993); Writing Women in Late Imperial China (with Kang-i Sun Chang, 1997); Trauma and Transcendence in Early Qing Literature (with Wilt Idema and Wai-yee Li, 2006); China's Christian Colleges: Cross-Cultural Connections (with Daniel Bays, 2008); and The Inner Chambers and Beyond: Women Writers from Ming to Qing (with Grace Fong, 2010).

XIA XIAOHONG is a Professor of Chinese Literature at Peking University. She is the author of numerous works, including Jueshi yu zhuanshi – Liang Qichao de wenxue daolu 觉世与传世 – 梁启超的文学道路 (Awakened and transmitted worlds: Liang Qichao's literary trajectory; Zhonghua shuju, 2006); Wan Qing wenren funü guan 晚清文人妇女观 (Late Qing literati views of women; Zuojia chubanshe, 1995); Wan Qing nüxing yu jindai Zhongguo 晚清女性与近代中国 (Late Qing women and modern China; Beijing daxue chubanshe, 2014); Liang Qichao: Zai zhengzhi yu xueshu zhijian 梁启超:在政治与学术之间 (Liang Qichao: Between politics and scholarship; Dongfang chubanshe, 2014); and Wan Qing nüzi guomin changshi de jiangou 晚清女子国民常识的建构 (The construction of late Qing female citizens' common knowledge; Beijing daxue chubanshe, 2016).



Acknowledgements

This volume has been a long time in the making. It is the product of a conference entitled "Gender and Transcultural Production: Chinese Women's Journals in their Global Context, 1900–2000," which was held at SOAS University of London in May 2011. We are extremely grateful to the American Council of Learned Societies, which awarded us a conference grant under its "Comparative Perspectives on Chinese Culture and Society" program, and to the Chiang Ching-kuo Foundation for International Scholarly Exchange, which funds the program. In addition to funding the conference, the ACLS/CCK grant also provided a generous publishing subvention that has greatly facilitated the publication process and enabled us to include all of the images we wanted to appear in the volume. We must also acknowledge the many other agencies and institutions that helped subsidize various aspects of the London conference: the SOAS Centre of Chinese Studies, the Social Science and Humanities Research Council of Canada, and the Heidelberg Centre for Transcultural Studies, HCTS (Asia and Europe in a Global Context) at Heidelberg University.

The conference, which included 24 participants from six countries, would have been a logistical nightmare without the support of Alicia Filipowich at the York Center for Asian Research, York University, Toronto. Alicia managed flight details and reimbursements with unfailing efficiency and good nature. We also want to thank Jane Savory and her team at SOAS, who provided invaluable local assistance.

The London meeting was not merely a standalone conference on the Chinese women's periodical press. It was also the culmination of a three-year international collaborative project on "Gender and Cultural Production: A New Approach to Chinese Women's Journals in the Early 20th Century," funded by the Social Science and Humanities Research Council of Canada and the German Alexander von Humboldt-Foundation's Transcoop Programme. The conference was an opportunity for the six members of the project who attended (Michel Hockx, Joan Judge, Barbara Mittler, Grace Fong, Liying Sun, and Doris Sung) to share their research and to further refine the project's methodology for reading the periodical press. It was also the occasion for the launch of the digital component of the project, the database "Chinese Women's

XX



Acknowledgements

xxi

Magazines in the Late Qing and Early Republican Period" (womag.uni-hd.de), and its follow-up, the "Early Chinese Periodicals Online Database" (ecpo.uni-hd.de). We owe a tremendous debt of thanks to our digital team, who constantly refined the database's functionality, uploaded data, and organized metadata. We are immensely grateful to our database technician, Matthias Arnold of the Heidelberg Research Architecture (HRA), Heidelberg University, and to our two former database program managers, Liying Sun and Doris Sung, both contributors to the volume, who have now moved on to exciting new stages in their professional careers.

The transition from vibrant conference to coherent volume would not have been possible without the support of Cambridge University Press. Lucy Rhymer showed enthusiasm for the project from the moment we presented her with the idea, and she continued to offer thoughtful support as we navigated the publication process. We also want to thank the various members of the Cambridge team: Melissa Shivers, Ian McIver, Laura Blake, Anamika Singh, Shubhangi Tripathi, and our conscientious copy editor, William H. Stoddard. We also owe deep thanks to the two readers for the press. We greatly benefitted from their detailed and insightful suggestions and criticism of the original manuscript. Their input has strengthened the final volume in innumerable ways. Last but not least, we want to thank Ms Wai-hing Tse of the SOAS Library for assisting us in getting a high-quality image for the book cover.

We owe a huge intellectual debt to those who participated in the conference as discussants but who are not represented in the volume. They include Jan Bardsley, Parnal Chirmuley, Natascha Gentz, Andrea Janku, and Francesca Orsini. We have special thanks for Jennifer Scanlon, who launched the conference with her illuminating keynote lecture, "Ephemeral, Material, Instrumental: Meditations on Women's Magazines."

Our final round of thanks is for the contributors to the volume. These include our "outside experts," who were willing to grapple with the particularities of the Chinese case, and our "China experts," who were willing to think hard about the methodological challenges and transcultural dimensions of the Chinese women's periodical press. Each of them has endured multiple rounds of revisions and long periods of wondering if their essays were ever going to make it into print. The volume would never have come together without their fine work, energy, and commitment to the project.



Note on Sources

Two databases provide online access to digital copies of many of the journals discussed in various chapters in this volume. Their search and browsing features offer researchers access to indices of articles, illustrations, advertisements, key terms, and personages appearing in these journals.

Chinese Women's Magazines in the Late Qing and Early Republic (WoMag: womag.uni-hd.de)

This database of the Heidelberg Research Architecture (HRA) is a key component of a collaborative project first funded by the Social Science and Humanities Research Council of Canada and the German Humboldt Foundation, and further expanded with additional funding from the Chiang Ching-kuo Foundation. It is a joint project, conducted by researchers at York University, Toronto; Academia Sinica, Taiwan; and the Heidelberg Centre for Transcultural Studies. The focus is on four seminal women's or gendered journals – a key genre of the new media – published between 1904 and 1937: *Nüzi shijie* (Women's world, 1904–07), *Funü shibao* (The women's Eastern times, 1911–17), *Funü zazhi – The Ladies' Journal* (1915–31), and *Linglong – Linloon Magazine* (1931–37).

The database facilitates research on these periodicals. It highlights the journals' pictorial material, including materials normally excised in reprinted or digitized editions, such as advertisements. It provides online access to digital copies of the journals from cover to cover, and its search and browsing features offer researchers access to indices of articles, illustrations, advertisements, key terms, and personages. It therefore mobilizes and interrelates various bodies of data (e.g., visual and textual) within the same tableau, enabling its users to create horizontal and vertical narratives and interconnections between them. The database is ultimately not simply another electronic archive, but can serve as the basis for new forms of historical research. It is of interest to scholars of cultural history and of Chinese cultural, print, literary, women's, and art history.

xxii



Note on Sources xxiii

Early Chinese Periodicals Online (ECPO: ecpo.uni-hd.de)

ECPO was originally created by the Heidelberg Digital Humanities Unit, the Heidelberg Research Architecture (HRA), in collaboration with Taiwan's Academia Sinica. It joins together several important digital collections of the early Chinese press and makes them available to scholarly communities around the world.

Developed jointly by many of the authors of the book, this database is distinguished from all other existing databases of Chinese periodicals in that it not only provides image scans, but also preserves materials often excluded in reprint, microfilm, or digital (even full text) editions, such as advertising inserts and illustrations. In addition, it incorporates a sophisticated body of metadata in both English and Chinese, including keywords and biographical information on editors, authors, and individuals represented in illustrations and advertisements. By framing the journals with this body of metadata, ECPO enables researchers to establish interconnections between, for example, specific individuals, topics, or illustrations over the entire run of a particular periodical or across different periodicals. These capabilities open new horizons in Chinese studies. Using ECPO, the researcher is able to nuance, challenge, and potentially refute existing narratives of historical and cultural change.

Illustrations

High-resolution color versions of the illustrations in this book are available at https://doi.org/10.25354/2017.06.1

Most images contained in this book can also be found in the two databases introduced above, WoMag and ECPO.

Online Resources

All online resources cited in this volume are permanently available through the Digital Archive for Chinese Studies (http://www.zo.uni-heidelberg.de/boa/digital_resources/dachs/). We have created a repository for this volume.

Conventions

In discussions of Chinese periodicals, the first mention gives the pinyin transliteration of the title, followed by the English translation: for example, *Nüzi shijie* (Women's world). Subsequent mentions use the English translation: for example, *Women's World*.



xxiv Note on Sources

If publishers gave a journal an English name we use that name as our translation. At the first mention, we give both the Chinese and English titles. Subsequent mentions will give the English title: for example, *Funü zazhi – The Ladies' Journal*; *Linglong – Linloon Magazine*.



Preface: The Role of Gender in Defining the "Women's Magazine"

Margaret Beetham

"Women's magazines? Old women's magazines? Are there any?" People's responses when I answer a question about what I am studying often betray surprise and more or less politely concealed contempt at the idea of scholarly attention to a form so ephemeral, so marginal. They never ask, "What are women's magazines?" or "How do you study them?" There is a common-sense view that we already know the answers to these questions and could all recognize a women's magazine at ten paces and, as for reading it, nothing could be easier. As I and all the authors in this volume have discovered, such "common sense" fractures under critical scrutiny. We have to answer the implicit question "Why study women's magazines?" — a form that until recently was below the horizon of the academic gaze. However, even more basically and surprisingly for my hypothetical questioner, we have to define the object of our study. What is a women's magazine? What is it that the writers in this volume see as the object of their study, a study mostly of the recent past of China, a country not normally associated with this particular print genre?

Historians have often turned to periodicals of various kinds, including magazines, for facts about, or contemporary views of, a particular period; literary critics have extracted poetry or fiction; art historians have looked for visual material. However, the magazine is a slippery kind of form, not single-authored but multivocal, heterogeneous in terms of genre, and with a particular relationship to time that complicates periodization. It juxtaposes different kinds of writing or textual and visual representations, it mixes voices, and, because it comes out at regular intervals over a period of time, it resists closure – even as it presents each number as self-contained. If we ignore these formal qualities and try to treat the magazine simply as a repository of facts, or of literary gems from the past, we miss the particular qualities that the form can bring to our historical understanding. All the characteristics of the magazine listed above open up the complexities of the past as no single-authored or single-genre work can, but these characteristics also present methodological problems. They challenge our modes of reading. Of course, I and others engaged in this field would argue that it is precisely this complexity that makes the magazine such a potentially wonderful resource for historians of all kinds - literary, cultural, and social.

XXV



xxvi Preface

And this is abundantly demonstrated in the range and variety of scholarship represented in this volume.

What happens when we add gender to this already rich mix? Katherine Shevelow, among others, argues that the rise of the magazine in the anglophone world at the end of the seventeenth century was inextricably bound up with gender, as it was with class. Scholars of the nineteenth-century press, particularly Brake and Fraser *et al.*, though coming at periodical study from different perspectives, argue cogently that periodical forms, such as the magazine, are intrinsically gendered, though the way gender works in and through them is not stable. However, the "women's magazine," as we now understand the term, makes the role of gender central and explicit. This is what distinguishes it.

The "women's magazine" has its roots in the late eighteenth century/early nineteenth century, and by the late nineteenth century and early twentieth century had become an important part of the magazine press globally, as the chapters in this volume attest. However, as I have suggested, despite a commonsense understanding of what we mean by the term, it is not easy to define for scholarly research. The Ladies' Magazine, which was launched in England in 1770 and lasted through mergers and title variations until 1847, may be seen as the earliest example of the form, and it defined itself as a magazine written exclusively "by ladies." However, even a rapid reading shows that this claim is hard to sustain. For one thing, most of the contributors were anonymous or used pseudonyms, a practice that continued and continues to make it difficult for scholars to know the gender of a magazine. Later women's magazines have almost always employed men as well as women writers, and some of the most famous nineteenth-century English journals, such as The Englishwoman's Domestic Magazine (1852–1877) and Woman's World (Lady's World 1886–1887, then Woman's World –1890) were openly edited by men (Samuel Beeton and Oscar Wilde, respectively) or edited by men who concealed their gender under female pseudonyms, as did the future novelist Arnold Bennett when he edited Woman (1890-1912) in the 1890s. Of course, some women's magazines that were explicitly concerned with women's rights did make a point of employing women at all levels of the processes of production, from writing articles through to the print room (see, for example, Emily Faithful's The Victoria Magazine, 1863–1880), but generally the gender purity of production is uncertain, ambiguous, and shifting. This is in part because of the nature of the magazine as a polyvocal, multiauthored work.

¹ Shevelow, Women and Print Culture. See also Ballaster, Beetham, Frazer, and Hebron, Women's Worlds, 43 ff.

² Brake, Subjugated Knowledges. Fraser, Green, and Johnston, Gender and the Victorian Periodical.



Preface xxvii

Recent scholarship, including some in this volume, situates particular magazines within communities of writers, editors and artists, which further complicates the importance of gender as a defining concept of the women's magazine. In terms of production the magazine is more like a film than a novel; that is – even with a powerful editor or "auteur" director – it is the product of a team.³ And beyond the immediate editorial team may well lie other networks of fellow writers, fellow artists, and – of course – readers who bring their own gendered and classed identities to bear.

Turning to readership, then, can we define the "women's magazine" in terms of an exclusively female readership? We can usually find out who the target readership of a magazine is or was, though even that may be unclear. However, I think we can safely say that women's magazines can be defined as aiming to be read by women and usually to be read by a particular group of women defined by social status, education, political persuasion and so on, as well as by gender. This is crucial. Discovering who in point of fact read, or even reads, any kind of published work is extraordinarily difficult. Proving who were the actual readers of magazines is particularly so. Contemporary media research shows that substantial numbers of men read magazines designated for women. Historically, we may look to extraneous information from diaries, letters or other such sources, but these are hard to find. Where there is correspondence or advice columns in the magazines themselves, we can look to see what proportion of those who wrote in to the magazine defined themselves as men, though all the cautions about anonymity and pseudonyms apply.⁴ The methodological challenges are great indeed.

There is a further aspect of readership that both complicates and enriches our research, and that is the way the magazine characteristically seeks to blur the line between readers and writers, rhetorically inviting the reader into the circle of the magazine's community or even inviting actual readers to become writers. This is a function of the way the magazine comes out over time and therefore, in common with other forms of serial, has the potential not only to enter the life of the individual reader in a time-extended way but also to create real or "imagined" communities of readers who are linked through the publication. ⁵ To sum up, we can define the women's magazine as having a target readership that is exclusively female, but we cannot prove that its readership is exclusively defined by gender – in fact, evidence suggests the contrary.

Where does this leave us? We may either decide at this point to go and find an easier research topic or, like the writers of this volume, press on to develop

³ See Leary, *The Punch Brotherhood*, for a detailed examination of this in relation to *Punch*.

⁴ For an extended discussion of these problems see Beetham, *In Search of the Historical Reader*.

⁵ The concept of the "imagined community" in relation to periodical readers was coined by Benedict Anderson in *Imagined Communities*, and has been widely used, and perhaps abused, in periodical studies.



xxviii Preface

a more nuanced methodology. Such a methodology must, I suggest, take the foregrounding of gender in the woman's magazine as a starting rather than a finishing point. In identifying women as its target readers, the women's magazine presents these imagined readers with material appropriate to what Judith Butler has called the "performance" of femininity. Whether it concentrates on domestic matters, on the upbringing of children, on fashion or on family, it is defining an "appropriate" gender role for its readers.

If, as argued above, the magazine is always already gendered, then the presence of women's magazines in a print culture where there is no equivalent flagging up of the masculine as a writing or reading position shows that "woman" here represents the "other" to a norm, assumed to be masculine. The binary of gender means that address to femininity always involves, whether articulated or not, an equivalent masculine norm. Women's magazines, therefore, not only delineate a particular cultural and historic femininity but by implication, by omission, or sometimes by direct admonition can also reveal much about the masculinity that is the cultural norm against which "woman" is defined.

Of course, some of the magazines, including some of those studied here, deliberately sought to challenge accepted definitions of appropriate femininity by offering new models. In particular, the very act of allowing, or even encouraging, women to appear in print might itself be a challenge to traditional concepts of a valued femininity as confined to the private or the domestic. The ambiguous nature of the magazine as a print space that is simultaneously public and yet private is important here. For, as the magazines discussed in this volume show, the unsettling of gender definitions is one of the marks of modernity, like the appearance of print media. The women's magazine, with its interactive and multivocal form, emerged globally in the late nineteenth/early twentieth century as a site in which shifting gender roles could be debated, enacted, or denounced.

There are other methodological problems that the study of women's magazines in a historical context raises. These range from the practical difficulties of finding and delimiting the historical sources to wider questions of what critical and theoretical models are useful for the study. Material problems in relation to historical women's magazines are Janus-faced, often presenting us simultaneously with lack and overabundance. Because magazines are of their moment, ephemeral, they were not always preserved as were more valued literary objects, or, if kept, they were often in partial and fragmented form. Even digital resources, which open up so much for us, cannot completely solve this. They may, however, contribute to the converse problem, which is that, where we can find runs from the past – either material or digital – even a single magazine can provide a daunting quantity of material over the course of just a few

⁶ Butler, Gender Trouble, is the work where she first developed this theory.



Preface xxix

years. In seeking to draw on appropriate reading strategies for these texts, we may turn to draw on different theoretical models from elsewhere, including those of philosophers and social theorists, such as Bourdieu and Foucault, or we may look to a Bakhtinian model.⁷

However, whatever the other problems we encounter in our study of the women's magazine, we need, I suggest, to keep the role of gender central, along with the qualities of the magazine. Whatever the body of material to be studied, whatever theoretical models we draw on to develop our research and reading methods, we need to address the complexity of the "women's magazine" in relation to both terms, to genre and gender and to the dynamic between them. The chapters in this volume show some of the ways in which that task can fruitfully be carried out.

⁷ See Liddle, *The Dynamics of Genre*. See also the discussion in *Victorian Periodical Review*, 44:3 (2011), 291–300.

⁸ See Beetham, A Magazine of Her Own? 1–14 and passim; see also Gough-Yates, Understanding Women's Magazines, 6–25 for an overview.

