

CANADA IN THE WORLD

In this volume marking the Sesquicentennial of Confederation in Canada, leading scholars and jurists discuss the evolution of the Canadian Constitution since the British North America Act 1867; the role of the Supreme Court in interpreting the Constitution as a “living tree” capable of application to new legal issues; and the growing influence of both the Constitution, with its entrenched Charter of Rights and Freedoms, and the decisions of the Court on other constitutional courts dealing with a wide range of issues pertaining to human rights and democratic government. The contributors assess how the Canadian Constitution accommodates the cultural diversity of the country’s territories and peoples while ensuring the universal applicability of its provisions; the role of the Court in interpreting and applying the Constitution; and the growing global influence of the Constitution and decisions of the Court on legislatures and courts in other countries.

Richard Albert is Professor of Law at Boston College Law School, with visiting appointments at Yale University, Externado University of Colombia, University of Toronto, and IDC Herzliya. A graduate of Yale, Harvard and Oxford, he formerly served as law clerk to the Chief Justice of Canada. As of January 1, 2018, he is Professor of Law at the University of Texas at Austin.

David R. Cameron is Professor of Political Science at Yale and the Director of the Yale Program in European Union Studies. He has written extensively in the field of comparative political economy and the impact on states of globalization, including a book, co-edited with Gustav Ranis and Annalisa Zinn, entitled *Globalization and Self-Determination: Is the Nation-State under Siege?*

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-41973-4 — Canada in the World
Edited by Richard Albert, David R. Cameron
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Comparative Constitutional Law and Policy

Series Editors

Tom Ginsburg
University of Chicago
 Zachary Elkins
University of Texas at Austin
 Ran Hirschl
University of Toronto

Comparative constitutional law is an intellectually vibrant field that encompasses an increasingly broad array of approaches and methodologies. This series collects analytically innovative and empirically grounded work from scholars of comparative constitutionalism across academic disciplines. Books in the series include theoretically informed studies of single constitutional jurisdictions, comparative studies of constitutional law and institutions, and edited collections of original essays that respond to challenging theoretical and empirical questions in the field.

Books in the Series

- Canada in the World: Comparative Perspectives on the Canadian Constitution*
 Richard Albert and David R. Cameron
- Constitutions, Religion and Politics in Asia: Indonesia, Malaysia and Sri Lanka*
 Dian A. H. Shah
- Proportionality: New Frontiers, New Challenges* edited by Vicki Jackson and Mark Tushnet
- Constituents Before Assembly: Participation, Deliberation, and Representation in the Crafting of New Constitutions* Todd A. Eisenstadt, A. Carl LeVan, and Tofiq Maboudi
- Assessing Constitutional Performance* Tom Ginsburg and Aziz Huq
- Buddhism, Politics and the Limits of Law: The Pyrrhic Constitutionalism of Sri Lanka*
 Benjamin Schonthal
- Engaging with Social Rights* Brian Ray
- Constitutional Courts as Mediators* Julio Ríos-Figueroa
- Perils of Judicial Self-Government in Transitional Societies* David Kosar
- Making We the People* Chaihark Hahm and Sung Ho Kim
- Radical Deprivation on Trial* Cesar Rodríguez-Garavito and Diana Rodríguez-Franco
- Unstable Constitutionalism* edited by Mark Tushnet and Madhav Khosla
- Magna Carta and its Modern Legacy* edited by Robert Hazell and James Melton
- Constitutions and Religious Freedom* Frank Cross
- International Courts and the Performance of International Agreements: A General Theory with Evidence from the European Union* Clifford Carrubba and Matthew Gabel

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-41973-4 — Canada in the World
Edited by Richard Albert, David R. Cameron
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Reputation and Judicial Tactics: A Theory of National and International Courts
Shai Dothan

Social Difference and Constitutionalism in Pan-Asia edited by Susan H. Williams

Constitutionalism in Asia in the Early Twenty-First Century edited by Albert Chen

Constitutions in Authoritarian Regimes edited by Tom Ginsburg and Alberto Simpser

Presidential Legislation in India: The Law and Practice of Ordinances
Shubhankar Dam

Social and Political Foundations of Constitutions edited by Denis J. Galligan and
Mila Versteeg

Consequential Courts: Judicial Roles in Global Perspective edited by Diana
Kapiszewski, Gordon Silverstein and Robert A. Kagan

Comparative Constitutional Design edited by Tom Ginsburg

Canada in the World

COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVES ON
THE CANADIAN CONSTITUTION

Edited by

RICHARD ALBERT

Boston College Law School

DAVID R. CAMERON

Yale University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-41973-4 — Canada in the World
Edited by Richard Albert, David R. Cameron
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryaganj, Delhi – 110002, India
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108419734

DOI: 10.1017/9781108333436

© Cambridge University Press 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Albert, Richard (Law professor), editor. | Cameron, David R., editor.

TITLE: Canada in the world : comparative perspectives on the Canadian Constitution / edited by

Richard Albert, Boston College; David R. Cameron, Yale University, Connecticut.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge [UK] ; New York : Cambridge University Press, 2017. |

Series: Comparative constitutional law and policy

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2017024133 | ISBN 9781108419734 (hardback : alk. paper) |

ISBN 9781108414753 (pbk. : alk. paper)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Constitutional law—Canada. | Rule of law—Canada. | Civil rights—Canada.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC KE4219 .C33 2017 | DDC 342.7102—dc23 LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2017024133>

ISBN 978-1-108-41973-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Contributors</i>	page ix
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xi
Introduction: The Values of Canadian Constitutionalism <i>Richard Albert</i>	1
PART I FEDERALISM AND PLURALISM IN CANADIAN CONSTITUTIONALISM	25
1 Diversity and the Rule of Law: A Canadian Perspective <i>The Right Honourable Beverley McLachlin, P.C.</i>	27
2 Misconceiving Federalism: Canada and the Federal Idea <i>Stephen Tierney</i>	34
3 Political Dynamics in Quebec: Charting Concepts and Imagining Political Avenues <i>Alain-G. Gagnon</i>	59
4 Indigenous Peoples and the Canadian State: The Prospects of a Postcolonial Constitutional Pluralism <i>Patrick Macklem</i>	81
5 Legality, Legitimacy and Constitutional Amendment in Canada <i>Jamie Cameron</i>	98
6 Constituting Citizens: Oaths, Gender, Religious Attire <i>Ayelet Shachar</i>	123

PART II THE COURT IN CANADIAN CONSTITUTIONALISM	153
7 The Judicial Constitutionalization of Politics in Canada and Other Contemporary Democracies: Comparing the Canadian Secession Case to South Africa's Death Penalty Case and Israel's Landmark Migdal Constitutional Case <i>Michel Rosenfeld</i>	155
8 Originalism in Australia and Canada: Why the Divergence? <i>Jeffrey Goldsworthy and Hon. Grant Huscroft</i>	183
9 Rights Inflation in Canada and the United States <i>Mark Tushnet</i>	209
10 Substantive Equality Past and Future: The Canadian Charter Experience <i>Catharine A. MacKinnon</i>	227
11 Canadian Constitutional Law of Freedom of Expression <i>Adrienne Stone</i>	245
12 The Judicial, Legislative and Executive Roles in Enforcing the Constitution: Three Manitoba Stories <i>Kent Roach</i>	264
PART III THE GLOBAL IMPACT OF CANADIAN CONSTITUTIONALISM	303
13 Going Global? Canada as Importer and Exporter of Constitutional Thought <i>Ran Hirschl</i>	305
14 Exporting Dialogue: Critical Reflections on Canada's "Commonwealth" Model of Human Rights Protections <i>Alison L. Young</i>	324
15 The European Court of Human Rights and the Canadian Case Law <i>Lech Garlicki</i>	348
16 Canadian Rights Discourse Travels to the East: Referencing to Canadian Charter Case Laws by Hong Kong's Court of Final Appeal and Taiwan's Constitutional Court <i>Wen-Chen Chang</i>	371
17 The Canadian Charter, South Africa and the Paths of Constitutional Influence <i>Heinz Klug</i>	397
Conclusion: The Court and Constitution in the World <i>David R. Cameron</i>	418
<i>Index</i>	451

Contributors

Richard Albert is Professor of Law at Boston College Law School; as of January 1, 2018, at the University of Texas at Austin.

David R. Cameron is Professor of Political Science, Director of the Program in European Union Studies and a member of the Canadian Studies Committee at Yale University.

Jamie Cameron is Professor of Law at Osgoode Hall Law School at York University.

Wen-Chen Chang is Professor of Law at the College of Law at National Taiwan University.

Alain-G. Gagnon is Professor of Political Science at L'Université du Québec à Montréal. He is a member of the Royal Society of Canada.

Lech Garlicki is Professor of Constitutional Law at Warsaw University and former Judge on the Constitutional Court of Poland and European Court of Human Rights.

Jeffrey Goldsworthy is Emeritus Professor of Law at Monash University and Adjunct Professor of Law at the University of Adelaide.

Ran Hirschl is Professor of Political Science and Law at the University of Toronto and holder of the Alexander von Humboldt Professorship in Comparative Constitutionalism at the University of Göttingen. He is a member of the Royal Society of Canada.

Hon. Grant Huscroft is a Justice on the Court of Appeal for Ontario.

Heinz Klug is the Evjue-Bascom Professor in Law at the University of Wisconsin Law School.

Catharine A. MacKinnon is the Elizabeth A. Long Professor of Law at the University of Michigan Law School and the James Barr Ames Visiting Professor of Law (long-term) at the Harvard Law School.

Patrick Macklem is the William C. Graham Professor of Law at the University of Toronto Faculty of Law. He is a member of the Royal Society of Canada.

Rt. Hon. Beverley McLachlin, P.C., is the Chief Justice of Canada.

Kent Roach is Professor and Prichard Wilson Chair in Law and Public Policy at the University of Toronto Faculty of Law. He is a member of the Royal Society of Canada and of the Order of Canada.

Michel Rosenfeld is University Professor of Law and Comparative Democracy and the Justice Sydney L. Robins Professor of Human Rights at the Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law at Yeshiva University.

Ayelet Shachar is Professor of Law and Political Science at the University of Toronto and Director of the Max Planck Institute for the Study of Religious and Ethnic Diversity. She is a member of the Royal Society of Canada.

Adrienne Stone is Professor of Constitutional Law and Kathleen Fitzpatrick Australian Laureate Fellow and Director of the Centre for Comparative Constitution Studies at the University of Melbourne Law School.

Stephen Tierney is Professor of Constitutional Theory at the University of Edinburgh Law School.

Mark Tushnet is the William Nelson Cromwell Professor of Law at Harvard Law School.

Alison L. Young is Professor of Public Law at the University of Oxford Faculty of Law.

Acknowledgements

Today, as co-editors of this volume commemorating the Sesquicentennial of Confederation, we approach an anniversary of our own: we met nearly twenty years ago when David Cameron served as Richard Albert's senior thesis advisor at Yale University – on the subject of Canadian politics no less!

When Richard returned to Yale as the 2015–16 Canadian Bicentennial professor, we picked up where we had left off years before and began to plan a major conference to mark the Sesquicentennial. We had one overriding objective in mind: to gather leading scholars in comparative public law to reflect collaboratively, provocatively and imaginatively on the Constitution of Canada. This volume memorializes the papers – since revised and refined – presented at the Yale Law School on April 12, 2016, in a conference organized under the theme “Comparative Perspectives on the Constitution of Canada.”

This project was made possible by the generous support of the MacMillan Center for International and Area Studies at Yale and the Oscar M. Ruebhausen Fund at the Yale Law School.

We thank Lisa Brennan, Lina Chan, Rahima Chaudhury, George Joseph, Lourdes Haynes, Ian Shapiro and Marilyn Wilkes at the MacMillan Center.

We thank Joseph Crosby, Renee Dematteo, Debra Krosner, Susan Levesque, Jennifer Marshall, Brian Pauze, Tyson Streeter, Mike Thompson and Adrienne Webb at the Yale Law School.

We also thank our students Dhruv Aggarwal, Chintan Chandrachud, Dayo Gbadamosi, Sameer Jaywant and Mariana Velasco Rivera.

Owen Fiss, David Schleicher, Reva Siegel and Jim Whitman have earned our thanks for so ably and fluently moderating the panels on which the papers in this volume were presented and debated. We are likewise grateful to Bruce Ackerman for giving closing remarks at the conference, and to Guido Calabresi for introducing our keynote speaker, the Right Honourable Chief Justice

Beverley McLachlin, to whom we are appreciative for attending this conference accompanied by her husband Frank McArdle.

We thank the team at Cambridge University Press for the privilege of publishing this volume with them.

We have not forgotten the contributors to this volume. Each of them made considerable efforts to prepare and revise their own papers, to comment on other papers and to travel to the conference. It is not easy to get to New Haven when traveling from almost anywhere but the Northeast, and even then the weather often fails to cooperate. It was a pleasure of the highest order to collaborate with them on this volume – a book we hope will become a useful resource for those interested in learning about Canada since Confederation and as it marches toward its Bicentennial.

David Cameron wishes to thank Cynthia Horan for her support throughout the project, and Richard Albert is grateful to his late father for encouraging him to choose Yale for college.