In this volume marking the Sesquicentennial of Confederation in Canada, leading scholars and jurists discuss the evolution of the Canadian Constitution since the British North America Act 1867; the role of the Supreme Court in interpreting the Constitution as a “living tree” capable of application to new legal issues; and the growing influence of both the Constitution, with its entrenched Charter of Rights and Freedoms, and the decisions of the Court on other constitutional courts dealing with a wide range of issues pertaining to human rights and democratic government. The contributors assess how the Canadian Constitution accommodates the cultural diversity of the country’s territories and peoples while ensuring the universal applicability of its provisions; the role of the Court in interpreting and applying the Constitution; and the growing global influence of the Constitution and decisions of the Court on legislatures and courts in other countries.

Richard Albert is Professor of Law at Boston College Law School, with visiting appointments at Yale University, Externado University of Colombia, University of Toronto, and IDC Herzliya. A graduate of Yale, Harvard and Oxford, he formerly served as law clerk to the Chief Justice of Canada. As of January 1, 2018, he is Professor of Law at the University of Texas at Austin.

David R. Cameron is Professor of Political Science at Yale and the Director of the Yale Program in European Union Studies. He has written extensively in the field of comparative political economy and the impact on states of globalization, including a book, co-edited with Gustav Ranis and Annalisa Zinn, entitled Globalization and Self-Determination: Is the Nation-State under Siege?
Comparative constitutional law is an intellectually vibrant field that encompasses an increasingly broad array of approaches and methodologies. This series collects analytically innovative and empirically grounded work from scholars of comparative constitutionalism across academic disciplines. Books in the series include theoretically informed studies of single constitutional jurisdictions, comparative studies of constitutional law and institutions, and edited collections of original essays that respond to challenging theoretical and empirical questions in the field.

Books in the Series

*Canada in the World: Comparative Perspectives on the Canadian Constitution* Richard Albert and David R. Cameron

*Constitutions, Religion and Politics in Asia: Indonesia, Malaysia and Sri Lanka* Dian A. H. Shah

*Proportionality: New Frontiers, New Challenges* edited by Vicki Jackson and Mark Tushnet

*Constituents Before Assembly: Participation, Deliberation, and Representation in the Crafting of New Constitutions* Todd A. Eisenstadt, A. Carl LeVan, and Tofigh Maboudi

*Assessing Constitutional Performance* Tom Ginsburg and Aziz Huq

*Buddhism, Politics and the Limits of Law: The Pyrrhic Constitutionalism of Sri Lanka* Benjamin Schonthal

*Engaging with Social Rights* Brian Ray

*Constitutional Courts as Mediators* Julio Rios-Figueroa

*Perils of Judicial Self-Government in Transitional Societies* David Kosař

*Making We the People* Chaihark Hahm and Sung Ho Kim

*Radical Deprivation on Trial* Cesar Rodriguez-Garavito and Diana Rodriguez-Franco

*Unstable Constitutionalism* edited by Mark Tushnet and Madhav Khosla

*Magna Carta and Its Modern Legacy* edited by Robert Hazell and James Melton

*Constitutions and Religious Freedom* Frank Cross

*International Courts and the Performance of International Agreements: A General Theory with Evidence from the European Union* Clifford Carrubba and Matthew Gabel
Reputation and Judicial Tactics: A Theory of National and International Courts
Shai Dothan

Social Difference and Constitutionalism in Pan-Asia edited by Susan H. Williams

Constitutionalism in Asia in the Early Twenty-First Century edited by Albert Chen

Constitutions in Authoritarian Regimes edited by Tom Ginsburg and Alberto Simpser

Presidential Legislation in India: The Law and Practice of Ordinances
Shubhankar Dam

Social and Political Foundations of Constitutions edited by Denis J. Galligan and Mila Versteeg

Consequential Courts: Judicial Roles in Global Perspective edited by Diana Kapiszewski, Gordon Silverstein and Robert A. Kagan

Comparative Constitutional Design edited by Tom Ginsburg
Canada in the World

COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVES ON
THE CANADIAN CONSTITUTION

Edited by

RICHARD ALBERT
Boston College Law School

DAVID R. CAMERON
Yale University
Contents

List of Contributors ix
Acknowledgements xi

Introduction: The Values of Canadian Constitutionalism 1
Richard Albert

PART I FEDERALISM AND PLURALISM IN CANADIAN CONSTITUTIONALISM 25

1 Diversity and the Rule of Law: A Canadian Perspective
   The Right Honourable Beverley McLachlin, P.C. 27

2 Misconceiving Federalism: Canada and the Federal Idea
   Stephen Tierney 34

3 Political Dynamics in Quebec: Charting Concepts and Imagining Political Avenues
   Alain-G. Gagnon 59

4 Indigenous Peoples and the Canadian State: The Prospects of a Postcolonial Constitutional Pluralism
   Patrick Macklem 81

5 Legality, Legitimacy and Constitutional Amendment in Canada
   Jamie Cameron 98

6 Constituting Citizens: Oaths, Gender, Religious Attire
   Ayelet Shachar 123
Table of Contents

PART II THE COURT IN CANADIAN CONSTITUTIONALISM 153

7 The Judicial Constitutionalization of Politics in Canada and Other Contemporary Democracies: Comparing the Canadian Secession Case to South Africa’s Death Penalty Case and Israel’s Landmark Migdal Constitutional Case 155
Michel Rosenfeld

8 Originalism in Australia and Canada: Why the Divergence? 183
Jeffrey Goldsworthy and Hon. Grant Huscroft

9 Rights Inflation in Canada and the United States 209
Mark Tushnet

10 Substantive Equality Past and Future: The Canadian Charter Experience 227
Catharine A. MacKinnon

11 Canadian Constitutional Law of Freedom of Expression 245
Adrienne Stone

12 The Judicial, Legislative and Executive Roles in Enforcing the Constitution: Three Manitoba Stories 264
Kent Roach

PART III THE GLOBAL IMPACT OF CANADIAN CONSTITUTIONALISM 303

13 Going Global? Canada as Importer and Exporter of Constitutional Thought 305
Ran Hirschl

14 Exporting Dialogue: Critical Reflections on Canada’s “Commonwealth” Model of Human Rights Protections 324
Alison L. Young

15 The European Court of Human Rights and the Canadian Case Law 348
Lech Garlicki

16 Canadian Rights Discourse Travels to the East: Referencing to Canadian Charter Case Laws by Hong Kong’s Court of Final Appeal and Taiwan’s Constitutional Court 371
Wen-Chen Chang

17 The Canadian Charter, South Africa and the Paths of Constitutional Influence 397
Heinz Klug

Conclusion: The Court and Constitution in the World 418
David R. Cameron

Index 451
Contributors

Richard Albert is Professor of Law at Boston College Law School; as of January 1, 2018, at the University of Texas at Austin.

David R. Cameron is Professor of Political Science, Director of the Program in European Union Studies and a member of the Canadian Studies Committee at Yale University.

Jamie Cameron is Professor of Law at Osgoode Hall Law School at York University.

Wen-Chen Chang is Professor of Law at the College of Law at National Taiwan University.

Alain-G. Gagnon is Professor of Political Science at L’Université du Québec à Montréal. He is a member of the Royal Society of Canada.

Lech Garlicki is Professor of Constitutional Law at Warsaw University and former Judge on the Constitutional Court of Poland and European Court of Human Rights.

Jeffrey Goldsworthy is Emeritus Professor of Law at Monash University and Adjunct Professor of Law at the University of Adelaide.

Ran Hirschl is Professor of Political Science and Law at the University of Toronto and holder of the Alexander von Humboldt Professorship in Comparative Constitutionalism at the University of Göttingen. He is a member of the Royal Society of Canada.

Hon. Grant Huscroft is a Justice on the Court of Appeal for Ontario.

Heinz Klug is the Evjue-Bascom Professor in Law at the University of Wisconsin Law School.
Contributors

Catharine A. MacKinnon is the Elizabeth A. Long Professor of Law at the University of Michigan Law School and the James Barr Ames Visiting Professor of Law (long-term) at the Harvard Law School.

Patrick Macklem is the William C. Graham Professor of Law at the University of Toronto Faculty of Law. He is a member of the Royal Society of Canada.

Rt. Hon. Beverley McLachlin, P.C., is the Chief Justice of Canada.

Kent Roach is Professor and Prichard Wilson Chair in Law and Public Policy at the University of Toronto Faculty of Law. He is a member of the Royal Society of Canada and of the Order of Canada.

Michel Rosenfeld is University Professor of Law and Comparative Democracy and the Justice Sydney L. Robins Professor of Human Rights at the Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law at Yeshiva University.

Ayelet Shachar is Professor of Law and Political Science at the University of Toronto and Director of the Max Planck Institute for the Study of Religious and Ethnic Diversity. She is a member of the Royal Society of Canada.

Adrienne Stone is Professor of Constitutional Law and Kathleen Fitzpatrick Australian Laureate Fellow and Director of the Centre for Comparative Constitution Studies at the University of Melbourne Law School.

Stephen Tierney is Professor of Constitutional Theory at the University of Edinburgh Law School.

Mark Tushnet is the William Nelson Cromwell Professor of Law at Harvard Law School.

Alison L. Young is Professor of Public Law at the University of Oxford Faculty of Law.
Acknowledgements

Today, as co-editors of this volume commemorating the Sesquicentennial of Confederation, we approach an anniversary of our own: we met nearly twenty years ago when David Cameron served as Richard Albert’s senior thesis advisor at Yale University – on the subject of Canadian politics no less!

When Richard returned to Yale as the 2015–16 Canadian Bicentennial professor, we picked up where we had left off years before and began to plan a major conference to mark the Sesquicentennial. We had one overriding objective in mind: to gather leading scholars in comparative public law to reflect collaboratively, provocatively and imaginatively on the Constitution of Canada. This volume memorializes the papers – since revised and refined – presented at the Yale Law School on April 12, 2016, in a conference organized under the theme “Comparative Perspectives on the Constitution of Canada.”

This project was made possible by the generous support of the MacMillan Center for International and Area Studies at Yale and the Oscar M. Ruebhausen Fund at the Yale Law School.

We thank Lisa Brennan, Lina Chan, Rahima Chaudhury, George Joseph, Lourdes Haynes, Ian Shapiro and Marilyn Wilkes at the MacMillan Center.

We thank Joseph Crosby, Renee Dematteo, Debra Krosner, Susan Levesque, Jennifer Marshall, Brian Pauze, Tyson Streeter, Mike Thompson and Adrienne Webb at the Yale Law School.

We also thank our students Dhruv Aggarwal, Chintan Chandrachud, Dayo Gbadamosi, Sameer Jaywant and Mariana Velasco Rivera.

Owen Fiss, David Schleicher, Reva Siegel and Jim Whitman have earned our thanks for so ably and fluently moderating the panels on which the papers in this volume were presented and debated. We are likewise grateful to Bruce Ackerman for giving closing remarks at the conference, and to Guido Calabresi for introducing our keynote speaker, the Right Honourable Chief Justice
Acknowledgements

Beverley McLachlin, to whom we are appreciative for attending this conference accompanied by her husband Frank McArdle.

We thank the team at Cambridge University Press for the privilege of publishing this volume with them.

We have not forgotten the contributors to this volume. Each of them made considerable efforts to prepare and revise their own papers, to comment on other papers and to travel to the conference. It is not easy to get to New Haven when traveling from almost anywhere but the Northeast, and even then the weather often fails to cooperate. It was a pleasure of the highest order to collaborate with them on this volume – a book we hope will become a useful resource for those interested in learning about Canada since Confederation and as it marches toward its Bicentennial.

David Cameron wishes to thank Cynthia Horan for her support throughout the project, and Richard Albert is grateful to his late father for encouraging him to choose Yale for college.