

CAMERA POWER

Camera Power is the first book to tackle the policy questions raised by two ongoing revolutions in recording the police: copwatching and police-worn body cameras. Drawing on original research from over two hundred jurisdictions and more than one hundred interviews – with police leaders and officers, copwatchers, community members, civil rights and civil liberties experts, industry leaders, and technologists – Mary D. Fan offers a vision of the great potential and perils of the growing deluge of audiovisual big data. In contrast to the customary portrayal of big data mining as a threat to civil liberties, *Camera Power* describes how audiovisual big data analytics can better protect civil rights and liberties and prevent violence in police encounters. With compelling stories and coverage of the most important debates over privacy, public disclosure, proof, and police regulation, this book should be read by anyone interested in how technology is reshaping the relationship with our police.

Mary D. Fan is the Henry M. Jackson Professor of Law at the University of Washington. She served as a federal prosecutor in the Southern District of California, and as an associate legal officer at a United Nations (UN) tribunal. Professor Fan was elected to the American Law Institute (ALI) in 2012 and is an Advisor to the ALI's Model Penal Code: Sexual Assault and Related Crimes Project.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-41855-3 — Camera Power
Mary D. Fan
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Camera Power

PROOF, POLICING, PRIVACY, AND AUDIOVISUAL
BIG DATA

MARY D. FAN
University of Washington



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-41855-3 — Camera Power
Mary D. Fan
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108418553

DOI: 10.1017/9781108290364

© Mary D. Fan 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd. Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Fan, Mary D., 1978– author.

TITLE: Camera power : proof, policing, privacy, and audiovisual big data / Mary D. Fan, University of Washington.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2019. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2018052246 | ISBN 9781108418553 (hbk : alk. paper)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Police misconduct – United States. | Police – community relations – United States. | Video recordings – United States. | Video surveillance – United States. | Civil rights – United States.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC HV8141 .F36 2019 | DDC 363.2–dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2018052246>

ISBN 978-1-108-41855-3 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-40754-0 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

For every person who just wants their beloved to come home
safely.

And for Andy and Dean, always.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-41855-3 — Camera Power
Mary D. Fan
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> x
<i>List of Tables</i>	xii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xiii
Introduction: Dual Revolutions in Recording the Police	1
Life and Death on Body Camera	1
Copwatching, Spontaneous and Organized	5
Toutveillance	8
Changing the Balance of Power over Proof	12
Audiovisual Big Data Analytics for Justice and Harm Prevention	13
Recurrent Challenges and Frameworks for the Future	14
PART I TOUTVEILLANCE POWER AND POLICE CONTROL	25
1 Policing in the Camera Cultural Revolution	27
Peaceful Weapons – and Shields	27
The Radical Cultural Change on Recording the Police	30
A Violent Revolution	35
The Future Will Be Recorded	51
2 Copwatching and the Right to Record	59
Community Countersurveillance	59
The Rise of Copwatching	64
Correcting – or Creating – the Record	66
Arrested for Recording the Police	70
Growing Recognition of the Right to Record the Police	74
The Continued Risk of Retaliation for Recording and Judicial	
Pushback	76
A New Generation of Cops on Camera	78
Going Viral: The Race for Public Perceptions	80

3	Democratizing Proof, Taking the Case to the People	82
	Game-Changing Evidence	82
	The Side of the Story That Traditionally Gets Told	91
	Damaging Credibility Contests, Malleable Memory	94
	Addressing Judicial Blind Spots	98
	Surmounting Barriers to Civil Damages	103
	The Court of Public Opinion and Civil Settlements	105
	PART II AUDIOVISUAL BIG DATA'S GREAT POTENTIAL AND PERILS	113
4	Audiovisual Big Data Analytics and Harm Prevention	115
	Big Data, Better Harm Detection and Prevention	115
	Smarter Early Intervention Systems	121
	Crowdsourcing Accountability	128
	An Independent Repository to Pool Community Member Videos	131
5	Partisan Perceptions: How Audiovisual Evidence and Big Data Can Mislead	135
	The Case of the Amazing Robber Who Grew from 5'6" to 6'3"	139
	The Fantasy of the Camera's Objectivity	144
	The Partisanship of Audience Perceptions	146
	The Legally Relevant Perspectives and Proper Fact-Finders	149
	Subtle Persuasion Effects	151
	Data That Can Lead Us Astray Also Can Lead Advanced Analytics Astray	153
6	Privacy and Public Disclosure	156
	The Privacy Costs of Regulation by Recording	156
	After the Recording Revolution: Public Disclosure and Privacy Dilemmas	161
	Protections for Victims, Witnesses, and Minors	180
	Comparative Perspective: How the United Kingdom Strikes the Balance	186
	PART III FRAMEWORKS FOR MOVING FORWARD	193
7	Controlled Access, Privacy Protection Planning, and Data Retention	195
	The Health Sciences Approach to Protecting Privacy While Advancing Harm Prevention	196

Contents

ix

Epicrim Insights: The Marriage of Epidemiology and Criminology	199
The Architecture of Protection	202
Data Preservation	204
Open Ethical and Policy Frontiers	211
8 Nonrecording and Officer Monitoring and Discipline Dilemmas	215
When Officers Do Not Record	216
The Disciplinary Dilemma	222
The Murk between Legitimate Mistake and Subversion	229
Beyond Individual Blame	234
Automate Everything	244
Conclusion: Beyond Technological Silver Bullets	247
What Are We Buying?	247
Supporting Multiple Visions of the Public Good	250
Transforming Proof	251
Mining for Justice and Accountability	253
<i>Appendix: The Collection and Coding of 213 Body Camera Policies</i>	255
<i>Index</i>	258

Figures

o.1 An officer in West Baltimore tags police-worn body camera with metadata between handling calls for service	<i>page 4</i>
o.2 In the Anacostia neighborhood of Washington, DC, officers link body camera video to police reports	5
o.3 A West Baltimore resident records the police talking to witnesses and searching for bullets after a shooting	7
1.1 Longitudinal trends in the risk of death by race, 1999–2016	38
1.2 Racial disparities in the risk of death by race, longitudinal trends, 1999–2016	39
1.3 View from patrol vehicle dash camera	55
1.4 View from officer-worn body camera	56
2.1 Copwatchers Elsa Waithe and Anthony Beckford on patrol	60
3.1 Still image from body camera video of the search of Kenneth Simmons showing officer’s hand between Simmons’s buttocks	88
3.2 Still image from body camera video of the search of Kenneth Simmons showing Simmons’s pants pulled down	88
4.1 Law enforcement officers from around the nation and world attending the International Association of the Chiefs of Police Convention in 2017 watch a video debuting software that permits officers to share links with citizens to upload their video footage into secure storage	130
5.1 What led to a ten-year-old child being pressed to the ground by two officers in Athens-Clarke County, Georgia? The difference in the stories conveyed of the same incident by a cell phone video and an officer’s body camera shows the partiality of perspectives	138
5.2 How tall is this robber from a surveillance video? Differing methods reach sharply different conclusions	141
5.3 Powell, 6’3”, against the 7-Eleven doorway	142

List of Figures xi

5.4	The robber against the 7-Eleven doorway	143
6.1	A woman who called the police about an assault shows her injuries from the altercation	157
6.2	Automatically overredacted Seattle Police Department body camera video using an image-blurring technique and no sound	171
6.3	Automatically overredacted Seattle Police Department body camera video using a technique to eliminate sound and only show outlines	172
6.4	Body camera mounted on an officer	178
8.1	Demonstration of a device that can automatically activate body cameras upon the drawing of a weapon from the holster	245

Tables

1.1 Deaths Due to Legal Intervention, by Race, 1999 to 2016	<i>page</i> 38
1.2 Approaches to Officer Discretion over Recording, 213 Body Camera Policies	52
1.3 Law Enforcement Activities That Must Be Recorded, 213 Body Camera Policies	53
3.1 Officer Access to Body Camera Videos for Report Writing and Court Preparation	100
6.1 Privacy Protections in State Body Camera Laws as of February 2018	163
6.2 Contexts Where Recording Must Cease, 213 Body Camera Policies	176
6.3 Limits on Surreptitious Recording of Conversations, 213 Body Camera Policies	177
6.4 Notice Regarding Recording, 213 Body Camera Policies	180
7.1 Examples of Body Camera Data Retention Provisions in State Laws	207
7.2 Nonevidentiary Data Retention, 213 Body Camera Policies	210
7.3 Retention of Data for Civil Suit or Complaint, 213 Body Camera Policies	210
8.1 Sanctions for Failure to Follow Body Camera Policy	223
8.2 Supervisorial Review or Compliance Audits, 213 Body Camera Policies	228
A.1 The 213 Jurisdictions Represented in the Body Camera Policies Collected and Coded	256

Acknowledgments

Expressing thanks is one of the most pleasurable tasks – but also one of the most challenging for fear of inadvertently omitting someone deeply appreciated and because it is hard to express the full strength of my gratitude. I will err on the side of brevity rather than lengthy name lists because many of your names already appear in the citations in the text. I hope you know how grateful I am to you.

Thank you to the people, named and unnamed in the pages of this book, who contributed powerful stories, deep expertise, and excellent insights. You are law enforcement officers, activists, copwatchers, community members, civil libertarians, civil rights advocates, industry leaders, and technologists. Thank you for your important work. You may not agree with each other on some of the big issues dividing our nation. But each of you from a different perspective has amazed me with your courage, vision, and crucial work. I wish each side could see what I have witnessed about how brave, hard, and crucial your work is. It has been a beautiful gift to learn from each of you and to share your time.

Many thanks to my editor, Matt Gallaway. This book exists because of your outreach. Your brilliant vision, judgment, grace, and responsiveness have guided me throughout this process. You are a writer's dream editor.

This work has benefited from presentation at many fora and from commentary by scholars and leaders in the field. Thank you to the faculty and students at the University of Alabama, UCLA, University of Colorado, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, University of North Carolina, and Vanderbilt for your excellent comments and suggestions. I am especially grateful to my wonderful faculty hosts and the masterminds behind the gatherings, David Ardia, Jean-François Blanchette, Snowden Becker, Frederic M. Bloom, Jason Mazzone, Dean Jennifer Mnookin, Richard Ernest Myers II, Mary-Rose

Papandrea, Stephen Rushin, and Chris Slobogin. Thanks also to the Sousveillance Task Force of the National Association of Criminal Defense Lawyers (NACDL) for great questions, insights, and suggestions.

I want to particularly give a shout-out to three brilliant scholars and giants in my field who have inspired me, mentored me, and helped shape this project from its inception to completion with their insights: Barry Friedman, Richard Myers, and Chris Slobogin.

I also am deeply grateful and influenced by my mentors Drs. Fred Rivara and Ali Rowhani-Rahbar at the Harborview Injury Prevention and Research Center and Dr. David Hemenway and Cathy Barber at the Harvard Injury Control Center. You inspire me with your vision and dedication to violence prevention and have helped shape the soul of this project. Thank you, David and Cathy, for the wonderful daily lunches, which I miss, and the great talks as I developed this work. Thank you, Fred and Ali, for teaching me and inspiring my interest in violence prevention – and understanding when I became a hermit to finish this project.

Thanks also to advanced analytics industry leader Peter T. Parker, who read all of Chapter 4 and all the sections on audiovisual big data, machine learning, and artificial neural networks and gave extensive illuminating comments. Many thanks to Brian Sweeney, who brought an engineer's precise mind to checking facts and figures in the book. You keep me grounded and stalwartly catch me on the rock walls and beyond.

Some sections of this book draw from portions of my previously published articles. These articles include Mary D. Fan, *Privacy, Public Disclosure, Police Body Cameras: Policy Splits*, 68 ALA. L. REV. 395 (2016); Mary D. Fan, *Justice Visualized: Courts and the Body Camera Revolution*, 50 U.C. DAVIS L. REV. 897 (2017); Mary D. Fan, *Missing Police Body Camera Videos: Remedies, Evidentiary Fairness, and Automatic Activation*, 52 GA. L. REV. 57 (2017); *Hacking Qualified Immunity: Camera Power and Civil Rights Settlements*, 8 ALA. C.R. & C.L. L. REV. 51 (2017); Mary D. Fan, *Democratizing Proof: Pooling Police Body Camera and Public Cell Phone Videos*, 96 N.C. L. REV. 1639 (2018); Mary D. Fan, *Body Cameras, Big Data, and Police Accountability*, 43 L. & SOC. INQUIRY __ (2018); Mary D. Fan, *Audiovisual Analytics and Smarter Early Intervention Systems for Policing* 2018 U. ILL. L. REV. __. Many thanks to the outstanding editors at each of these publications, especially lead editors Ryan Lee Giles, Lauren Kosches, Kaitlin Melissa Phillips, Kimberly Procida, Chris Saville, Aaron Smith, Shalyn Smith, and Lee Whatling.

I am deeply grateful to the outstanding librarians of the Gallagher Law Library at the University of Washington, especially Maya Swanes, Alena Wolotira, and Cheryl Nyberg, who have been intrepid and resourceful in

tracking down and amassing a library of 213 body camera policies. You have been invaluable on so many projects.

Thanks to my superb Hazelton Fellows Francesco Carriedo, Ali Gaffney, Garrett Heilman, Michelle Hur, Sophie Jin, Taryn Jones, Alyssa Nevala, Geoff Wickes, and Jake Willard. You inspired me with your enthusiasm and ideas and were stalwart, dedicated, and careful coders. Francesco and Garrett, your initiative, outreach, and intrepid ability to secure information were stellar. Michelle Hur was a particular rock star in taking on a lion's share of work and cross-checking with impeccable grace, skill, and an eagle's eye. Officer Jake Willard never ceased to amaze me with the excellence of his work and initiative in administering surveys and coding while finishing law school and also serving full time as a patrol officer with the Tacoma Police Department.

I have been blessed to work under inspirational deans. Many thanks to Dean Kellye Testy for your encouragement and leadership, which has fostered a productive environment to write this book, and to incoming Dean Mario Barnes, whose motivating check-ins (during your first weeks as dean!) spurred me to the finish line.

Thank you to Andy for the hugs and the sweet everythings that give me perspective and inspire me to slow down, at least for a little while. And thanks always to Dean, my best friend for almost half my life now and the first reader for much of my work.

Finally, thanks to my amazing students in criminal law and procedure and evidence and the outstanding law review editors who have worked on my articles over the years. You energize me with your curiosity, enthusiasm, and passions; inspire (and sometimes horrify) me with your stories; and make me so optimistic for our future. I love your fascination with innovative technology-enhanced approaches to addressing long-burning problems. I am so proud to see all that you are accomplishing in making hopes and ideas a reality in the field and in the legislature.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-41855-3 — Camera Power
Mary D. Fan
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)
