

INDEX

- accelerated procedures (Decision of 5 April 1966)**, 77–8, 178–9
 Director-General, role of, 77
 precedence over DSU 4, 5, 6 and 12 (DSU 3.12), 20, 179
- Advisory Centre on WTO Law and private counsel**, 181–2
- Agreement on Safeguards**
 standard of review, 85
 suspension of concessions after adoption of panel/AB report without DSB authorization (Safeguards 8.2 and 5.3), 142
- alternatives to dispute settlement**, 167.
See also arbitration, competence and functions; consultations (DSU 4); good offices, conciliation and mediation (DSU 5); mutually agreed solution consistent with covered agreements (DSU 3.7)
- amicus curiae briefs**. *See also* experts, panel's right to consult (DSU 13)
 admissibility, 163–6
 AB, 23, 164–6: filing as exhibits of parties' submissions, 165: justification for, broad authority to adopt procedural rules (DSU 17.9), 165: non-participating member, 165: special procedures (WP (AB) 16(1)) adopted in *EC – Asbestos*, 165
 General Council's discussion of the procedures, 165
 panel proceedings, 164
 definition, 163
 first receipt of *amicus curiae* brief in *US – Shrimp*, 164
 proceedings, justification for (DSU 12.1/13), 164
- Anti-Dumping Agreement**
 measures challengeable under (AD 17.4), 45
 standard of review (AD 17.6), 88–9
- Appellate Body (AB)**
 administrative and legal support (DSU 17.7), 33–4
 chairperson
 competence and functions, direction of AB business (WP (AB) 5(3)), 33
 election of (WP (AB) 5), 33
 collegial body, 118–19
 competence and functions, 113. *See also* appellate review, legal issues and interpretation, limitations to (DSU 17.6)
 application of rights and obligations as set out in WTO Agreement, limitation to (DSU 3.2 and 19.2), 7, 17
 declaration of panel findings as moot and having no legal effect, 119
 deliberations following conclusion of oral hearings, 118–19
 direction of AB business (WP (AB) 5(3)), 31–2
 implementation, suggestions for (DSU 19.1), 122

- completion of the legal analysis, 32
 - right to uphold, modify or reverse legal findings and conclusions (DSU 17.13), 32
- composition
 - appointment by consensus, 32
 - continuity and consistency in the interpretation and application of rights and obligations, 31–2
 - members' independence from government (DSU 8.9), 33
 - representation of developing countries, 33
 - term of office (DSU 17.2), 32
- divisions (WP (AB) 6), 110
 - citizenship, broad representation of WTO membership, 111
 - presiding member (WP (AB) 7 (2)), 111
 - responsibility for deciding on an appeal (DSU 17.1/WP (AB) 4(4) and 3(1)), 118–19
- recommendations, 122
 - for challenged measure to be brought into conformity with WTO law, (DSU 19.1), 101
 - non-violation complaint (DSU 26.1(b)), 102
- reports
 - adoption procedure (DSU 17.14), 25, 125–8: Members' right to express views, 128: negative consensus, 126: panel findings not appealed, simultaneous adoption, 128: deadline for adoption, 125–8: unconditional acceptance, 128
 - binding nature, 128
 - circulation, 123
 - comparison with issuance and circulation of panel reports, 103
 - confidentiality of process (DSU 17.10), 117–18
 - consensus/majority decision (WP (AB) 3(2)), 118
 - descriptive part, 121
 - drafting, finalization and signature, 122
 - findings, 119
 - as public document, 123
 - withdrawal of appeal and, 123
 - Secretariat,
 - independence from WTO Secretariat, 33
 - legal and administrative support to AB (DS 17.7), 33
 - workload, 33
- appellate review**
 - applicable rules and working procedures for, 104
 - composition of Appellate Body division, 110
 - distinction between legal and factual questions, 106
 - legal effect of Appellate Body Reports, 122
 - legal issues and interpretation. *See also* Appellate Body (AB), competence and functions
 - characterization of domestic legislation, whether, 107–8
 - limitations to (DSU 17.6), 11, 32, 105, 107, 120
 - mixed questions of law and fact, 106–7
 - “objective assessment” (DSU 11), 113
 - standard of review as (DSU 11), 108. *See also* standard of review (DSU 11)
 - multiple appeals
 - appeal/cross-appeal (WP (AB) 23(1)), 114–15
 - notice of appeal (DSU 16.4), 104, 112
 - adoption of panel report, effect on, 112
 - notice of other appeal, 114
 - official document, 112
 - requirements: detail, level of, 60, 112: requirements formalities (WP (AB) 20(2)(a)–(c)), 60
 - time-frames, 112
 - oral hearings (WP (AB) 27(1)), 117

appellate review (cont.)

- behind closed doors (DSU 17.10), 117
- panel hearings distinguished, 118
- panel record, transmission by WTO Secretariat to AB Secretariat (WP (AB) 25), 114
- reports, separate opinion, anonymity (DSU 17.11), 119
- right to (DSU 16.4), 108–9
 - appeal by both parties, 108
 - third parties and. *See* third parties *below*
- third parties,
 - amendment of Working Procedures (AB), 110
 - limitation to third parties
 - notifying substantial interest under DSU, 109
 - notification of intention to appear as “passive observer” (WP (AB) 24(4) and 27(3)(b)), 110
 - as “third participants”, 109–10
 - as third participants, notification of intention to appear at oral hearing and request to make oral statement if desired (WP (AB) 24(2) and 27(3)(a)), 110: time-limits, 110
 - third participant’s submission (WP (AB) 24(1)), 109
 - written submissions/opportunity to be heard (DSU 17.4) *amicus curiae* brief and, 109, 164–6. *See also amicus curiae* briefs
 - time-frames
 - completion, 124–5
 - for completion of review (DSU 17.5), 124
 - other/cross-appeal (WP (AB) 23 (1)), 115
 - SCM Agreement (Article 4.9 thereof), 125
 - Uruguay Round changes to dispute settlement system, 31–2, 331
 - withdrawal of appeal (WP (AB) 30(1)), 123

- as a condition for refiling the appeal, 124
- as termination of the appeal, 123
- Working Procedures for Appellate Review (WP (AB)), 27
- adoption or amendment (DSU 17.9), 104
- gap-filling/additional features (WP (AB) 16(1)), 105
- written submissions, 114–15
 - appellee’s submissions (WP (AB) 22(2)), 115
 - content, 114–15
 - service on participants and third participants (WP (AB) 18(2)), 116

applicable law

- covered agreements, 46
- panel reports, 101

arbitration

- competence and functions,
 - application of rights and obligations as set out in WTO Agreement, limitation to (DSU 3.2 and 19.2), 7
 - as alternative to panel/AB resolution (DSU 25.2), 34, 175
- implementation of
 - recommendations and rulings, determination of reasonable period of time (RPT), 34
 - review of countermeasures (DSU 22.6), 28, 34. *See also* countermeasures (DSU 22)
 - review in case of disagreement (DSU 22.6), 34
- consultations, as an alternative to (DSU 25.2), 50
- dispute, definition by parties, 175
- implementation of decision (DSU 25.4), 175
- notification
 - agreement to arbitrate, 175
 - arbitration award, 175
 - parties to, 175
 - procedures, parties’ freedom to determine (DSU 25.2), 175
 - remedies (DSU 21 and 22), 175

- review of countermeasures (DSU 22.6), 34–5
 - suspension in case of mutually agreed solution, 135
- arbitration award**
 - enforcement (DSU 21 and 22), 34
 - finality/binding effect, 34, 149, 175
 - time-frames
 - determination of the reasonable period of time (RPT) for implementation (DSU 21.3(c)), 133–6
 - review of countermeasures (DSU 22.6), 143, 150
- arbitrators**
 - appointment by, Director-General, 28
 - determination of the reasonable period of time (RPT) for implementation (DSU 21.3(c)), 28, 133
 - review of countermeasures (DSU 22.6), 150
- burden of proof**, 92–3. *See also*
 - standard of proof
 - definition, 92
 - rules of evidence, 94–7
 - standard of proof, 93
 - party making assertion, 93–4
 - prima facie* case, 94
- chairperson (DSB), competence and function**
 - chairing of DSB meetings, 27
 - channel for members'
 - communications to DSB, 27
- claims.** *See also* non-violation
 - complaint; situation complaints (DSU 26.2)
 - as such/as applied, 43
 - covered agreements, 46–7
 - terms of reference, 53
- Committee on Government Procurement, notification of applicability of DSU**, 47
- compensation (DSU 22)**
 - non-violation complaint, 154
 - requirements
 - agreement between parties (DSU 22.2), 139
 - consistency with covered agreements (DSU 22.1), 140
 - MFN obligations, 140
 - surveillance by DSB until resolved (DSU 22.8), 153
 - as temporary measure pending withdrawal (DSU 3.7), 140
- complaints**
 - non-violation, 47, 153–4
 - situation, 47, 154
 - violation, 47
- compliance review (DSU 21.5)**, 136–9
 - appeals against, 137
 - countermeasures and (DSU 22), 28
 - reference to original panel, 137
 - scope, 138–9
 - time-frames, 137
- conciliation.** *See* good offices, conciliation and mediation (DSU 5)
- confidentiality.** *See also* public documents
 - appellate review (DSU 17.10), 118
 - arbitration (DSU 22.6), 38
 - business confidential information, 97
 - consultations (DSU 4.6), 54, 160
 - good offices, conciliation and mediation, 172
 - panel deliberations (DSU 14.1), 160
 - preparation of panel/AB reports (DSU 14.1/DSU 17.10), 117–18, 160
 - Rules of Conduct for the DSU, 38
 - third parties, 71
 - substantive meeting of the panel, 117
 - written submissions (DSU 18.2), 79–80
- consensus.** *See* DSB, decision-making, consensus; negative consensus
- consultations (DSU 4).** *See also* mutually agreed solution
 - consistent with covered agreements (DSU 3.7)

- consultations (DSU 4)** (cont.)
- arbitration (expeditious) by agreement
 - as alternative to panel/AB resolution (DSU 25.2), 50
 - confidentiality (DSU 4.6), 54, 160
 - dependence on DSU 4 and relevant provisions of covered agreement(s), 52
 - developing countries (special and differential treatment) (DSU 4.10), 176
 - extension of time-frames (DSU 12.10), 177
 - as first stage in dispute settlement, 50
 - obligation to accord sympathetic consideration and adequate opportunity (DSU 4.2), 54
 - preference for mutually agreed solution consistent with covered agreements (DSU 3.7), 50
 - purpose of, 53
 - role in defining dispute, 54
 - request for, 54
 - legal basis for complaint sufficient to present the problem clearly (DSU 4.4), 53
 - measures at issue (DSU 4.4), 53
 - notification (DSU 4.4), purpose, 52
 - public document, 52
 - relationship between request for consultations and panel request, 50
 - Secretariat, role, 52
 - single text, 52
 - third parties. *See* third parties, consultations (DSU 11)
 - time-frames
 - developing countries and (DSU 12.10), 27, 176
 - for agreement to, 51: failure to meet, right to request establishment of panel, 51
 - urgency, cases of (e.g. perishable goods), 55
 - countermeasures (DSU 22)**,
 - arbitral review in case of objection by respondent (DSU 22.6), 28, 34–5
 - on application of principles and procedures for cross-retaliation (DSU 22.7), 147
 - appointment of arbitrator, 147
 - on equivalence to nullification or impairment (DSU 22.4), 147
 - finality of decision, 149, 175
 - on relationship with degree and nature of adverse effects (SCM 7.10), 151
 - consistency with covered agreements, 142
 - definition, 141
 - discriminatory basis, 142
 - DSB responsibility (DSU 2.1), 142
 - equivalence to nullification or impairment (DSU 22.4), 144
 - calculation, 150
 - SCM Agreement, 150
 - failure to agree on compensation and (DSU 22.2), 141
 - as inducement to comply, 141
 - as last resort (DSU 3.7), 141
 - limitation subsequent to DSB authorization, 141
 - negative consensus rule, 25, 60
 - non-violation complaint, special features, 154
 - permissible level of countermeasures, 144–7
 - permissible level of suspension, 144
 - principles covering choice of action (DSU 22.3)
 - action in different sector under the same agreement (DSU 22.3(b)), 145
 - action in same sector and under the same agreement, preference for (DSU 22.3(a)), 144
 - action under another agreement (DSU 22.3(c)) 145
 - classification of relevant agreements (DSU 22.3(g)), 144
 - classification of sectors (DSU 22.3 (f)) 82, 144
 - smaller and developing countries and, 146
 - under different agreement, 145

- under same agreement, 145
 - prior DSB responsibility (DSU 2.1)
 - authorization, need for, 142
 - prior DSB responsibility (DSU 2.1)
 - authorization, need for, time-limits, 142
 - problematic nature of suspension of
 - concessions, 142
 - retaliation, 146–50
 - surveillance and (DSU 22.8), 141
 - SCM Agreement, 150–1. *See also*
 - SCM Agreement, countermeasures
 - temporary nature (DSU 22.1), 6, 139, 141
- covered agreements.** *See also* GATS; GATT 1994, Art. XXIII:1
 - (nullification or impairment) as legal basis for DSU proceedings
 - Article XI of the GATT 1994, 41
 - consultation and dispute settlement provisions as legal basis for DSU proceedings (DSU 1.1), 171
 - consultation and dispute settlement provisions, GATS, Arts. XXII:1 and XXIII:1, importance of choice, 52–3
 - consultation and dispute settlement provisions, GATT 1994 as core text, Arts. XXII:1 and XXIII:1, importance of choice, 52–3
 - DSU, 6
 - definition, 46
 - Plurilateral Trade Agreements as, 46
 - request for consultations and, 52–4
 - “single undertaking”, 1
 - WTO agreement, 6–7
- developing countries.** *See also*
 - accelerated procedures (Decision of 5 April 1966); special and differential treatment (developing countries)
- AB, 33
- legal advice and assistance (DSU 27.2), 181
- training courses (DSU 27.3), 28, 181
- developing countries, legal representation,** 181–2
 - Advisory Centre on WTO Law and external counsel, 181–2
- developing countries, representation on,**
 - panel (DSU 8.10), 176
- developing country**
 - surveillance in a case brought by, 153
- Digital Dispute Settlement Registry,** 29
- Director-General, competence and functions**
 - appointment of arbitrator
 - to determine the reasonable period of time (RPT) for implementation (DSU 21.3(c)), 28, 134
 - to review countermeasures (DSU 22.6), 28, 147
 - composition of panel (DSU 8.7), 27
 - consultations, 28
 - request to appoint in case of failure to agree on panelists within time-frame, 73
- DSB meetings, convening, 28
- good offices, conciliation and mediation, 27, 172
 - accelerated procedures (Decision of 5 April 1966), 178–9
 - settlement of dispute (DSU 5.6), 28
 - special procedures involving least-developed countries (DSU 24), 28, 174, 180
- dispute**
 - broad discretion to initiate (DSU 3.7), 21
 - initiation, 39
 - measures attributable to a WTO member, 40
 - measures that can be challenged, 40
- Dispute Settlement Body (DSB).** *See also* panel, reports, adoption procedure
 - administrative support (DSU 27.1), 28, 30

Dispute Settlement Body (DSB)

(cont.)

- adoption of panel/AB reports, need for placement by Member on agenda (DSU 2), 127
 - chairperson (WTO IV: 3)
 - appointed by consensus, 26
 - competence and functions:
 - chairing of DSB, 27: channel for members' communications to DSB, 27: consultation on AB's adoption or amendment of Working Procedures, 27:
 - extension of time-frames, 27:
 - special and differential treatment (developing countries), extension of time-frames, 176: special measures involving least-developed countries (DSU 24.2), 180: special terms of reference, drafting (DSU 7.3), 27
 - decision-making, consensus, 24
 - establishing a panel, 24
 - good offices, conciliation and mediation in relation to special measures involving least-developed countries (DSU 24.2), 27, 174
 - mediation in case of conflicting special or additional rules and procedures (DSU 1.2), 27
 - competence and functions
 - adoption of panel reports, 24, 125–8
 - application of rights and obligations as set out in WTO Agreement (DSU 3.2 and 19.2), 7
 - countermeasures, authorization. *See* countermeasures (DSU 22); DSB, responsibility (DSU 2.1) as General Council for discharge of DSU responsibilities (WTO IV: 3), 24
 - composition, 24
 - decision-making consensus, 26. *See also* negative consensus
 - negative consensus, 25, 60, 112, 126
 - participation as right of all parties, 25
 - veto, power of, 328–9
 - good offices, conciliation and mediation in relation to special measures involving least-developed countries (DSU 24.2), 174
 - meetings
 - frequency, 24
 - special meetings, 24
 - submission of items for inclusion, time-limit, 26, 59
 - negative consensus. *See also* negative consensus
 - plurilateral trade agreement, 24
 - political nature, 24
 - recommendations and rulings
 - binding effect, 128
 - as obligation to put to an end WTO-inconsistency/breach of obligation, 101
 - non-violation complaint (DSU 26.1(b)), 102
 - prompt compliance, obligation of (DSU 21.2), 130
 - surveillance of implementation of recommendations and rulings, 24, 131, 153
- dispute settlement registry**, 29
- disputes, tables of**, 332
- DSU interpretation**
- application of disciplines in specific instances, 7
 - compromise texts, 8
 - “exclusive authority” of Ministerial Conference and General Council to adopt interpretations of the WTO Agreement, 12
- DSU objectives (DSU 3.2)**, 185. *See also* mutually agreed solution consistent with covered agreements (DSU 3.7)
- AB's role, 31–2
- application of rights and obligations as set out in WTO Agreement
 - limitation to (DSU 3.2 and 19.2), 6

- clarification of rights and obligations through interpretation, 7–12.
See also interpretation of DSU integrated dispute settlement system, 17–20
 negotiations to interpret and clarify, 183–4
 perspective of the complainant, 6
 perspective of the respondent, 7
 positive solution to a dispute (DSU 3.7), judicial economy and, 90
 preservation of rights and obligations, 6–7
 Secretariat's informal consultations concerning the panel process, 184–5
 “Dispute Settlement Efficiency Exercise”, 185
 security and predictability, 5
 consistency of rulings, need for, 62, 118
 withdrawal of inconsistent measure (DSU 3.7), 6
- evidence.** *See also* burden of proof; standard of review (DSU 11)
 admissibility, 96
 adoption of working procedures for confidential information, 97
 advice from experts, 35–6
 excluded persons, citizens of parties to dispute except by agreement of parties or in exceptional circumstances, 36
 incorporation of advice in panel report, 35–6
 independence of members, 36
 persons of professional standing in relevant field, 36
 procedures for consultation with individual expert, 36
 rules and procedures (DSU, Appendix 4), 35–7
 terms of reference, determination by panel, 35
- exclusive and compulsory jurisdiction**, 16–17
 Plurilateral Trade Agreements, 1
- expert review group**
 advisory nature, 35
 preference for consultation with individual expert, 36
 rules and procedures (DSU, Appendix 4), 35
 terms of reference, determination by panel, 35
- expert review group, membership**
 excluded persons, citizens of parties to dispute except by agreement of parties or in exceptional circumstances, 36
 excluded persons, government officials of parties to dispute except by agreement of parties or in exceptional circumstances, 36
 independence of members, 36
 persons of professional standing in relevant field, 36
- experts, panel's right to consult (DSU 13)**, 35–6, 99. *See also* *amicus curiae* briefs
 consultation of individual expert/
 appointment of expert review group, choice (DSU 13.2), 36
 DSU provisions specifically authorizing or requiring expert advice, 35
 obligation to inform Member before seeking information from individual or body within its jurisdiction (DSU 13.1), 35
- fruitfulness of dispute settlement action, obligation to consider (DSU 3.7)**, 39
- GATS**
 situation complaint, 47
 third parties, involvement in consultations, Arts XXII:1 and XXIII
 distinguished, 52–3
 violation complaint, 47

GATT 1947

- Arts. XXII and XXIII
2, 327
- compromise rulings, 329
- positive consensus requirement, 328
- pre-Uruguay Round decisions and understandings, 327–8
- Tokyo Round Codes, 330
- unilateral action, 330

- GATT 1947 dispute settlement.** *See also* GATT 1994, Art. XXIII:1 (nullification or impairment) as legal basis for DSU proceedings end to *à la carte* system, 18, 330 positive consensus requirement, 25 Uruguay Round changes. *See* Uruguay Round changes to dispute settlement system

- GATT 1947, Tokyo Round Codes** forum-shopping/forum-duplication, 330

- GATT 1994 as basis of complaint** challenge to law “as such”, 43, 45 positive action in breach of (GATT 1994, Art. XI), 41 positive implementation action, failure to take (GATT 1994, Art. X:1), 41 third parties, involvement in consultations, Arts XXII:1 and XXIII:1 distinguished, 52–3

- GATT 1994, Art. XXIII:1 (nullification or impairment) as legal basis for DSU proceedings**, 47–8
 - non-violation complaint (Art. XXIII:1(b)), 47
 - arbitrator’s suggestions (DSU 26.1(c)), 134
 - non-participation in proceedings and, 61
 - panel recommendations (DSU 26.1(b)), 102
 - non-violation complaint, exceptional nature, 47
 - overlapping/alternative grounds, 90
 - situation complaint (Art. XXIII:1(c)), 47

- applicable rules and procedures (DSU 26.2), Decision of 12 April 1989 (surveillance and implementation), 154
- applicable rules and procedures (DSU 26.2), DSU (up to circulation of panel report), 154
- special procedures, 154
- veto power, 154
- violation complaint (Art. XXIII: 1 (a)), 47

good offices, conciliation and mediation (DSU 5), 171–4

- confidentiality, 172
- definitions, 171
- Director-General’s role, 172–4
- DSB chairperson’s role, 174
- impartiality, 171
- in matter other than “dispute”, 173
- least-developed countries and (DSU 24.2), 28, 174, 180
- non-committal basis (DSU 5.2), 172
- panel process and (DSU 5.5), 172
- termination, 172
- timing, 171
- request for consultations and, 171
- voluntary nature (DSU 4.1), 167, 171

impartiality. *See also* Rules of Conduct of the DSU

- AB members (DSU 8.9), 33
- disclosure of interest, relationship or matter affecting or giving rise to, 37–8
- ex parte* communications, exclusion (DSU 18.1), 37
- expert review group, 36
- good offices, conciliation and mediation, 171
- panel members (DSU 8.2 and 8.9), 29, 72
- Secretariat (WTO), 27–8, 172
- implementation of recommendations and rulings (DSU 21)**, 131. *See also* compensation (DSU 22)
- agreement on procedures under Articles 21 and 22, 137

- arbitral award (DSU 25.4), 175
- choice of means (DSU 21.5), 133
- compliance proceedings (DSU 21.5), 136–9
- determination by arbitrator of
 - reasonable period of time (RPT) for (DSU 21.3(c)), 28, 34
- developing countries (DSU 21.7/21.8), 153
- duration, 153
 - preference of full implementation over temporary measures (DSU 3.7 and 22.1), 139
 - status reports (DSU 21.6), 152
- inconsistency of rulings and, 62
- notification of intentions (DSU 21.3), 131
- panel responsibilities with respect to (DSU 19), 29
- panel suggestions for (DSU 19.1), 101–2
- regional government or subdivision of government, 130
- sequencing, 137
- reasonable period of time (RPT) (DSU 21.3)
 - determination by arbitrator,
 - appointment of arbitrator by Director-General (DSU 21.3(c)), 28, 34
 - reasonable period of time (RPT):
 - agreement to Member's proposal by consensus, (DSU 21.3(a)), 133: as a grace period, 132: burden of proof, 135: determination by arbitrator (DSU 21.3(c)), 133: developing countries (DSU 21.2), 177: guidelines (DSU 21.3(c)), 134: legislative changes and, 132, 134: mutually agreed by parties and approved by the DSB by consensus, (DSU 21.3(b)), 133
 - situation complaint and, 132
- surveillance, DSB responsibility, 24, 131, 152–3
 - in case of compensation/countermeasures (DSU 22.8), 153
- Uruguay Round changes to dispute settlement system and, 331
- individuals, role of, 22**
- information, panel's right to seek (DSU 13).** *See also* experts, panel's right to right to consult (DSU 13)
- discretionary nature of right, 98
- Members
 - non-cooperation, panel's right to draw adverse inferences from, 99
 - obligation to provide, 99
 - right to request and obtain information from, 98
- initiation of proceedings, right of private parties to petition for, 23**
- interpretation of DSU.**
 - aids
 - dictionary, 10
 - applicable law, Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties (1969) as means for discerning customary rules of interpretation of public international law, 8
 - authentic languages (VCLT 33), 12
 - competence
 - authoritative interpretations distinguished from interpretations of the covered agreements in a particular dispute, 12
 - exclusive authority of Ministerial Conference and General Council (WTO IX:2), 12
 - panel (DSU 17.6), 11
 - context (VCLT 31(1)–(3)), 10
 - explicit or implicit objective of the agreement being applied, 10
 - guidelines
 - context (VCLT 31(1)–(3)), 10
 - principle of effective treaty interpretation, 11
 - object and purpose (VCLT 31(1)), 10
 - ordinary meaning (VCLT 31(1)), 10

interpretation of DSU (cont.)

- need for in case of ambiguity arising from compromise texts, 8
 - on basis of plain text, 10
 - ordinary meaning (VCLT 31(1)), 10
 - panel (DSU 17.6), 11
 - redundancy or inutility, 11
 - relevant rules of international law (VCLT 31(3)(c))
 - special or additional rules and procedures (DSU 1.2), mediation by DSB chairperson, 19
 - special or additional rules and procedures (DSU 1.2), presumption of complementarity, 20
 - subsequent agreements (VCLT 31(3)(a)), 11
 - subsequent practice (VCLT 31(3)(b)), 11
 - supplementary means (VCLT 32), where interpretation under Article 31,
 - leads to a result which is manifestly absurd or unreasonable (VCLT 32(b)), 11
 - leaves the meaning ambiguous or obscure (VCLT 32(a)), 11
 - negotiating history, 11
 - Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties (1969) as means for, 8
- judicial economy**, 89–91
- need to secure positive solution to a dispute (DSU 3.7/21.1) and, 90
 - panel finds that the complainant failed to make a *prima facie* case, 90
- jurisdiction**. *See also* covered agreements; *individual bodies* compulsory, 16–17
 exclusive (DSU 23), 16. *See also* parties
- jurisdiction/object of complaint**
- challenges to measures “as such” and “as applied”, 42–5

- mandatory/discretionary distinction, limitation to GATT 1947 jurisprudence, 44
- covered agreements (DSU 1.1), 6, 46
- governments obligations regarding non-state actors, 40–1
- legislation as law/fact, 95
- no direct access for non-state actors, 22
- positive action in breach of prohibition
 - failure to abrogate law as, 41
- prohibition of action/requirement for positive action distinguished, 41
 - GATT 1994, Art. XI, 41
- prohibition of action/requirement for positive action distinguished “measure” (DSU 6.2), 42–3
 - TRIPS, 41
- withdrawal of inconsistent measure (DSU 3.7) and, 43

least-developed countries. *See also* developing countries; special procedures involving least-developed countries (DSU 24)
 legal assistance (DSU 27.2), 180–1
 training courses (DSU 27.3), 181

legal assistance to developing and least-developed countries (DSU 27.2), 182

legal basis for dispute. *See* covered agreements; covered agreements, consultation and dispute settlement provisions; GATT 1994, as basis of complaint; GATT 1994, Art. XXIII:1 (nullification or impairment) as legal basis for DSU proceedings; jurisdiction; panel, establishment, request for

legal representation, 162–3
 Advisory Centre on WTO Law or private counsel, 181–2
 developing countries, 162–3, 181–2
 Member’s responsibility for, 162–3

legal support to panels, 28

Marrakesh Agreement

authentic languages, 12

measure

acts or omissions, 42
 amended, related, subsidiary,
 implementing measure, 59
as such/as applied, 43
 attribution of a measure to a WTO
 Member, 40
 challengeable under the Anti-Dumping
 Agreement (AD 17.4), 45
 expired/terminated measures, 65
 mandatory/discretionary distinction, 44
 taken to comply (DSU 21.5), 136
 terms of reference (DSU 7), 65
 types, 44
 unwritten measure, 42

mediation. *See also* good offices,
 conciliation and mediation
 (DSU 5)

meetings

experts' meeting, 75–6
 first substantive meeting of the panel,
 81
 interim review meeting, 100
 organizational meeting, 76
 Rules of Procedure for Meetings of
 the DSB, 26
 second substantive meeting of the
 panel, 78, 81
 third-party session, 82–3
 oral hearing at the appellate stage,
 117

multiple complainants (DSU 9), 61–4.

See also judicial economy
 disputes with related matters,
 separate panels with same
 members, 64
 establishment and composition of
 panel, 62
 full participation in parallel or
 jointly, 62
 non-participation in process, effect, 61
 non-participation in process, effect,
 non-violation complaint and, 61
 reports (DSU 9.2), 79
 separate panels, 63
 single panel, 62

third-party action. *See also* third
 parties
 timetable, harmonization (DSU 9.2/
 9.3), 62

**mutually agreed solution consistent
with covered agreements (DSU
3.7)**, 12, 167–70

avoidance of detriment to other
 Members, 168
 consistency with covered
 agreements, need for, 168
 fruitfulness of dispute settlement
 action, obligation to consider
 (DSU 3.7), 39
 legal effect and interpretation of, 169
 nature of, 169
 non-violation complaint (DSU
 26.1(b)), 101
 AB recommendations, in case of
 non-violation complaint (DSU
 26.1(b)), 101, 122
 arbitrator's suggestions (DSU
 26.1(c)), 134
 panel recommendations, 102
 notification requirement (DSU 3.6),
 168, 170
 panel, opportunity during (DSU 11),
 170
 panel, opportunity during (DSU 11),
 suspension of proceedings and
 (DSU 12.2), 77
 as preferred solution (DSU 3.7), 50,
 77, 168
 third parties and, 56, 168
 timing, 169
 withdrawal of appeal and, 123

negative consensus

applicability, appropriate
 countermeasures, SCM
 Agreement, 150
 definition, 25
 findings of nullification or
 impairment, 126
negative consensus, applicability
 adoption of reports, 25, 154
 authorization of countermeasures, 25
 establishment of panel, 25

NGOs, role, 22

non-violation complaint. *See* GATT 1994, Art. XXIII:1 (nullification or impairment) as legal basis for DSU proceedings; non-violation complaint (Art. XXIII:1(b))

arbitration on reasonable period for implementation (DSU 21.3(c)), 154

definition, 47

recommendation for mutually satisfactory adjustment, 154

special procedures, 153–4

withdrawal of WTO-consistent measure, 153–4

notification requirement (DSU 3.6)

panel report in case of (DSU 12.7), 170

nullification or impairment

requirement (GATT 1994, Art. XXIII:1/DSU 3.8), 47–8. *See also* GATT 1994, Art. XXIII:1 (nullification or impairment) as legal basis for DSU proceedings

GATS, 52

panel, competence and functions

discretion to decline to rule on certain claims, 90. *See also* judicial economy

objective assessment of facts and legal aspects (DSU 11 and 19.2; AD 17.6). *See also* appellate review, legal issues and interpretation, limitation to (DSU 17.6)

objective assessment of facts and legal aspects (DSU 11 and 19.2; AD 17.6), evaluation and establishment of facts, 106

objective assessment of facts and legal aspects (DSU 11 and 19.2; AD 17.6), limitation to, 83–4 provide security and predictability (DSU 3.2), 5

quasi-legal role, 29, 86

recommendation for implementation (DSU 19), 29

panel, composition of (DSU 8)

ad hoc basis, 29, 71

as part-time activity, 72

citizen of party or third party, exclusion except with agreement of parties (DSU 8.3), 72

considerations

diversity and spectrum of experience (DSU 8.2), 29, 72 independence (DSU 8.2), 30, 72 “well-qualified” requirement (DSU 8.1), 29, 72

consultation (DSU 8.7)

chairperson of relevant Council or Committee, 73

Director General, 27

DSB chairperson, 27, 73

developing countries and (DSU 8.10), 72, 176

distinguished from panel establishment, 29

frequency of appointment, 30

harmonization in case of parallel panels (DSU 9.3), 62

indicative list (DSU 8.4), 29, 72

members’ independence from government (DSU 8.9), 30

number (DSU 8.5), 71

parties’ agreement to augment, 71

proposals for nomination by Secretariat (DSU 8.6), 72

opposition, “compelling grounds” requirement (DSU 8.6), 72

relevant experience (DSU 8.1), 29, 72

selection pool, 72

time-frames, request to Director-General to appoint in case of failure to meet, 73

panel, establishment

agreement of respondent, relevance (DSU 4.3 and 6.1), 13, 55

in cases of urgency (DSU 4.8), 55

consensus

veto, right of at first DSB meeting,

60

- multiple complainants, single/
 multiple panels (DSU 9.1), 62
- right to, Uruguay Round changes to
 dispute settlement system and,
 331
- panel, establishment, request for**
 application of negative consensus
 rule, 60
- as notification of legal basis for
 complaint, 58
- as official document, 57
- legal basis of complaint, 60
- importance of precision, 58–60
- public document, 57
- requests for preliminary ruling, 60
- requirements (DSU 6.2),
 consultations, whether held, 57
- specific measures at issue,
 identification of, 58–9
- terms of reference, dependence on
 (DSU 7.1), 58
- time-frames for submission to DSB
 meeting (Rules of Procedure,
 Rule 3), 59
- panel, experts.** *See* experts, panel's
 right to consult (DSU 13)
- panel, function**
 mutually agreed solution consistent
 with covered agreements (DSU
 3.7), 50, 77
- opportunity for complainant to
 protect rights, 57
- opportunity for respondent to
 correct facts/interpretation of
 WTO Agreement, 57
- panel procedures (DSU 12/Appendix 3)**
 accelerated procedures, timetable
 (Appendix 3)
- developing countries and
 (Decision of 5 April 1966), 77,
 178–9
- administrative, technical and legal
 support, Secretariat (DSU 27.1),
 30, 242
- amicus curiae* briefs (DSU 12/
 Appendix 3), 164. *See also*
amicus curiae briefs
- justification for (DSU 12.2/13), 164
- assessment of relevant factual
 questions and legal issues, 86
- attempts to reach consensual view,
 83
- collegial nature of panel, 73
- deliberations following conclusion of
 oral hearings, 83–4. *See also*
 panel, reports
- dispute settlement registry, 79
- evidence. *See* burden of proof;
 evidence; standard of review
 (DSU 11)
- flexibility, 74
- multiple complainants, right to
 receive (DSU 9.2), 79
- mutually agreed solutions after
 recommendations and rulings,
 170
- order of analysis, 91
- organizational meeting, 81
- preliminary ruling requests, 78
- recording of, 81
- SCM Agreement, 77
- SPS Agreement, 75
- suspension at request of complaining
 party (DSU 12.12), 170
- suspension at request of complaining
 party, time-limits (DSU 12.12),
 77
- third parties, 80
- time-limits, developing countries,
 176–7
- timetable (Appendix 3), 74
- developing countries and
 (Decision of 5 April 1966),
 178
- multiple complaints,
 harmonization (DSU 9.3), 62
- SCM Agreement, 77–8
- SPS Agreement, 75
- translation of other official language
 submissions into language of
 the panel, 75
- written rebuttals, third parties and,
 79
- time-frames, 78
- written submissions (DSU 12/
 Appendix 3),

- panel procedures (DSU 12/Appendix 3)**
 (cont.)
- confidentiality (DSU 18.2), 79–80, 160
 - content, 79
 - executive summary, possibility of, 80
 - parties' right to disclose/publish (DSU 18.2), 80, 160
 - summary in panel report, 80, 160
 - transmission (DSU 12.6), 79
- panel procedures (DSU 12/Appendix 3), oral hearings**
- closed sessions, 80
 - meeting with experts, 81
 - first substantive meeting, 81
 - multiple complainants, right to be present (DSU 9.2), 82
 - participation, 81
 - questions before and after hearings, 82
 - second substantive meeting, 81–2
 - third-party session (DSU 10.2), 82–3
- panel, recommendations.** *See also*
- implementation of recommendations and rulings (DSU 21)
 - adoption procedure, 331
 - adoption procedure, negative consensus, 25
 - for challenged measure to be brought into conformity with the provisions of the covered agreements (DSU 19.1), 101–2
 - interim review (DSU 15), 100
 - as public document, 103
 - circulation to Members, 78
 - descriptive part (DSU 12), 99
 - DSB responsibility, 24
 - expert advice, incorporation, 35–6
 - findings and recommendations (DSU 12.7), 85, 99, 101, 170, 362
 - applicable law, 99
 - implementation, suggestions for (DSU 19.1), 101–2
 - inconsistencies, need to avoid, 62
 - interim report, absence of, 100
 - interim review (DSU 15), 100–1
 - legal effect of panel reports, 128
 - negative consensus, 25, 112, 126
 - non-violation complaint (DSU 26.1 (b)), 102
 - preparation, confidentiality (DSU 14.1), 117
 - SCM Agreement (SCM 4.7), 103
 - separate opinions (e.g. concurring statements, dissenting opinions, separate views), anonymity (DSU 14.3), 84
 - time-frames for DSB decisions (DSU 20), 14
 - submission to parties, 76
 - translation into official languages, 103
- panel, reports.** *See also* Dispute Settlement Body (DSB), recommendations and rulings
- adoption,
 - DSB responsibility, 125–8
 - notification of appeal, effect on (DSU 16.4), 126
 - adoption procedure
 - AB report and, 130
 - Members' right of comment (DSU 16.4), 128
 - notification of appeal, effect on (DSU 16.4), 263
 - time-frames (DSB 16.4), 126
 - completion
 - time-frames, 76
 - descriptive part (DSU 12)
 - inclusion of arguments in final report (DSU 15.3), 101
 - parties' involvement (DSU 15.1), 100
 - expert advice, incorporation, 35–6
 - final report
 - issuance and circulation of, 103
 - interim review (DSU 15), periods of time, 100–1
 - joint proceedings, 103
 - languages, 103
 - multiple complaints (DSU 9.2), 79
 - mutually agreed solution (DSU 12.7), 170

- preparation, confidentiality (DSU 14.1), 83
- preparation, prohibition of *ex parte* communications (DSU 18.1), 83
- time-frames
- delay, action in case of (DSU 12.9), 77
 - from establishment to circulation of report to Members (DSU 12.9), 77
 - in case of urgency (DSU 12.8), 77
- panel, terms of reference (DSU 7)**, 64–6
- request for establishment, need to draft with sufficient precision, 58
 - special terms of reference
 - agreement of parties, need for, 64–6
 - DSB chairperson, role, 27
 - right of any Member to raise point (DSU 7.3), 64
- panel, third parties.** *See* third parties, panels
- panels (DSU 10)**
- conclusions and recommendations, exclusion from, 62
 - preliminary rulings and interim reports distinguished, 101
 - right to initiate separate proceedings (DSU 10.4), 62
 - Secretariat exploring improvements in, 78
 - written submissions, right to make (DSU 10.2), 68
- parties.** *See also* *amicus curiae* briefs; legal representation; multiple complainants (DSU 9); third parties
- arbitration (DSU 25), 167
 - definitions
 - complainant, 22
 - respondent, 22
 - NGOs, role, 22
 - WTO Member governments, limitation to, 21, 39
- Plurilateral Trade Agreements**
- Agreement on Trade in Civil Aircraft, 46
 - Agreement on Government Procurement, 46
- applicability of DSU, 46
 - as covered agreements, 46
 - dispute settlement provisions (Tokyo Round Codes), 330
 - need for consent, 46
- preliminary rulings**
- adequacy of consultations (DSU 4.4), 155
 - admissibility of evidence, 156
 - alleged conflicts of interest, 156
 - amicus curiae* briefs, 156
 - BCI procedures and other confidentiality issues, 156
 - consistency of a panel request (DSU 6.2), 60
 - consultations with scientific experts, 156
 - enhanced third-party rights, 156
 - interpretation in a non-official language of the WTO, 156
 - jurisdictional issues, 155
 - matters related to panel composition, 156
 - open hearings, 156
 - panel's timetable, 156
 - participation of private counsel or industry experts, 156
- preservation of rights and obligations, security and predictability**
- AB's role, 32
- prima facie case**
- definition, 94
- prompt settlement of disputes (DSU 3.3)**, 2, 13–14. *See also* time-frames
- agreement to consultations (DSU 4.3), 13, 55
 - comparison with time-frames of dispute settlement systems, 14
 - complexity of issues, 14
 - reasons for longer proceedings, 14
- public documents**
- AB reports, 123
 - panel, request for establishment, 57
- reasonable period of time (RPT)**
- DSU guideline, 134

- reasonable period of time (RPT)**
 (cont.)
 implementation of
 recommendations and rulings
 (DSU 21.3), 34, 132–6
 range of RPTs provided, 133
- recommendations and rulings.** *See*
 Appellate Body (AB),
 recommendations; Dispute
 Settlement Body (DSB),
 recommendations and rulings;
 implementation of
 recommendations and rulings
 (DSU 21); panel,
 recommendations
- regional government or subdivision
 of government, government's
 obligations in respect of**, 40
- regional or local governments**
 dispute settlement provisions of the
 covered agreements (DSU 22), 41
- registry, dispute settlement**, 29, 68
 Digital Dispute Settlement Registry,
 114
- remedies.** *See* compensation (DSU 22);
 countermeasures (DSU 22);
 withdrawal of inconsistent
 measure (DSU 3.7)
- rules and procedures.** *See also*
 arbitration, procedures, parties'
 freedom to determine (DSU
 25.2); DSU objectives (DSU
 3.2); panel procedures (DSU 12/
 Appendix 3)
amicus curiae briefs, 163–6
 special or additional rules and
 procedures, 19
 special or additional rules and
 procedures (DSU 1.2), conflict
 or difference, 20
 uniformity of application (DSU 1.1),
 18. *See also* special and
 differential treatment
 (developing countries)
- rules and procedure, special or
 additional rules and
 procedures (DSU 1.2)**
 mediation by DSB chairperson, 27
- Rules of Conduct of the DSU**, 37–8.
See also impartiality
 covered persons, 37
 Secretariat staff, 37–8
 violation as ground for challenge,
 38
- SCM Agreement**
 adoption of reports, 126
 countermeasures, 150–1
 “appropriate”, 150
 arbitral review of
 “appropriateness” (SCM 4.11),
 150
 arbitral review of relationship with
 degree and nature of adverse
 effects (SCM 7.9), 151
 DSB authorization in case of
 failure to comply with
 recommendation within, time-
 frames, 150
 negative consensus (SCM 4.10),
 150
 establishment of panel, negative
 consensus, 77
 recommendations in case of
 violation (SCM 4.7), 103
 time-frames
 accelerated procedures (SCM 4),
 77–8
 actionable subsidies (SCM 7), 78
 appellate review, 125
 circulation of panel reports (SCM
 4.6), 78
 composition and terms of
 reference (SCM 7.4), 78
 implementation (SCM 4.7), 131
- Secretariat (WTO)**
 Appellate Body Secretariat
 distinguished, 33
 assistance to arbitrations, 34
 assistance to Members in respect
 of dispute settlement (DSU
 27.2), 28
 assistance to panels (DSU 27.1),
 28
 challenge for violation of Rules of
 Conduct, 38

- competence and functions
 - administrative support to DSB, 28, 30
- impartiality, 180
 - challenge for violation of Rules of Conduct, 38
- improving the panel review process, 78
- legal advice and assistance to developing countries (DSU 27.2), 180
- panel membership
 - indicative list (DSU 9.4), 29, 72
- proposal of nominations (DSU 8.6), 28, 72
- receipt and transmission of submissions to panel (DSU 12.6), 79
- request for consultations (DSB Working Practices), 52
- role in receiving request for consultations, 52
- special training courses (DSU 27.3), 181
- written submissions to panels, transmission of, 79
- sequencing (DSU 21.5 and 22, relationship)**, 151–2
- situation complaints (DSU 26.2)**
 - definition, 47
 - panel report and, 154
- special and differential treatment (developing countries)**, 176–9. *See also* developing countries; special procedures involving least-developed countries (DSU 24)
 - accelerated procedure – Decision of 5 April 1966, 178–9
 - additional/privileged procedures, 20
 - consultations (DSU 4.10), 176
 - good offices, conciliation and mediation (DSU 24.2)
 - Director-General, 173
 - implementation
 - reasonable period of time (DSU 21.2), 177
 - panel proceedings (DSU 12.10), 176–7
 - panel stage, 176–7
 - panel’s obligation to explain application (DSU 12.11), 177
 - surveillance (DSU 21.7/21.8), 178
 - time-frames, 20
 - extension by DSB chairperson (DSU 10), 379
 - panel proceedings (DSU 12.10), 176–9
- special procedures involving least-developed countries (DSU 24)**, 179–80. *See also* developing countries; special and differential treatment (developing countries)
 - good offices, conciliation and mediation (DSU 24.2)
 - Director-General, 28, 180
 - DSB chairperson, 27, 180
 - restraint, need for (DSU 24.1), 180
- standard of proof**
 - prima facie* case, 94
- standard of review (DSU 11)**, 84–9
 - Anti-Dumping Agreement (AD 17.6) distinguished, 88–9
 - deliberate disregard, distortion or misrepresentation of evidence, 85
 - in case of safeguard measures, 85
 - neither *de novo* review nor “total deference”, 85
 - objective assessment of the facts, 84–9
- standing. See parties**
- surveillance of implementation of recommendations and rulings (DSU 21).** *See* implementation of recommendations and rulings (DSU 21)
- suspension of concessions.** *See* countermeasures (DSU 22)
- technical advice, panel’s right to seek.** *See* experts, panel’s right to consult (DSU 13)
- third parties.** *See also* individuals, role of; NGOs, role; parties
 - appellate review and, 109–10. *See also* appellate review, third parties

third parties (cont.)

- GATS Arts XXII:1 and XXIII:1 distinguished, 53
- consultations (DSU 11),
 - consent of respondent, need for, 56
 - enhanced third-party rights, 69
 - right to request separate consultations in case of refusal (DSU 4.8), 57
 - “substantial interest” requirement (DSU 10.2), 56
- limitation to, 68
- mutually agreed solution and, 56
- panels (DSU 10)
 - as alternative to non-participation, 61
 - for establishment as notification of legal basis for complaint, 58
 - notification to DSB (DSU 10.2), 66
 - participation in consultations, relevance (DSU 10.2), 66
 - “substantial interest” requirement (DSU 10.2), 66
 - time-frames for request, 56, 67
 - written rebuttals, right to receive, 70
 - written submissions and oral presentation: at first substantive meeting (DSU 10.3), 69:
 - clarificatory questions, 83: filing of submissions, 79: special hearing (DSU 10.2), 68: written rebuttals distinguished, 79
 - written submissions, right to make (DSU 10.2), 66
- WTO Member governments,
 - limitation to, 21
- time-frames**
 - agreement to (DSU 4), 54–5
 - appellate review
 - adoption of reports (DSU 17.14), 125–8
 - completion, 124–5
 - extension, 126
 - other/cross-appeal (WP (AB) 23 (1)), 108–9
 - third participants, 110
 - written submissions (WP (AB) 21 (2)), 114–15
 - arbitration award (DSU 21.3(c)), 133, 135
 - compliance proceedings (DSU 21.5), 137
 - consultations
 - agreement to (DSU 4), 13, 55
 - developing countries (DSU 12.10), 176
 - countermeasures, DSB authorization, 147
 - developing countries (DSU 12.10), 27
 - DSB meetings, submission of items for inclusion, 26, 58
 - from establishment of panel to determination of reasonable period of time (DSU 21.4), 136
 - for consultations, failure to meet, right to request establishment of panel, 51
 - implementation of
 - recommendations and rulings (DSU 21.3), 131–6
 - notification of intentions, 131
 - situation complaint, 126
 - notice of intention (DSU 16.4), 104, 112
 - panel, 76. *See also* panel reports
 - accelerated procedures (Decision of 5 April 1966), 77–8, 178–9
 - decisions (DSU 20), 14
 - proceedings (DSU 12/Appendix 3), suspension at request of complaining party (DSU 12.12), 74, 77, 81
 - reasonable period of time, 34, 132–6
 - reports: adoption 188: interim review, 100, 112
 - written rebuttals, 78
 - SCM Agreement, 77–8
 - special and differential treatment (developing countries), 20, 176–9, 379
 - third party request to participate, 56, 67–8
 - Uruguay Round changes to dispute settlement system and, 331

- Tokyo Round Codes**, 330, 379. *See also* GATT 1947 dispute settlement
- training courses (DSU 27.3)**, 28, 181
- transmission (DSU 12.6), written submissions**
 order of filing (DSU 12.6), 78–9
- TRIPS**
 as a covered agreement, 46
 authorization to suspend obligations, 141
 countermeasures, 145
 cross-retaliation, 147
 positive implementation action, failure to take as basis for complaint, 41
- unilateral determination, exclusion (DSU 23.2(a))**, 15–16
- Uruguay Round changes to dispute settlement system**, 331. *See also* GATT 1947 dispute settlement
 appellate review, 31–2, 331
 Decision of 12 April 1989 on Improvements to the GATT 1947 Dispute Settlement Rules and Procedures, 331
 negative consensus rule, 331
 countermeasures, 331
 panel reports, adoption procedure, 331
 panel, right to, 331
 time-frames, 331
- Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties (1969) (VCLT)**. *See also* interpretation of DSU
 general rule of interpretation (VCLT 31), text, 8
 interpretation of treaties
 authenticated in two or more languages (VCLT 33), text, 9
 supplementary means of interpretation (VCLT 32), text, 9
- withdrawal of inconsistent measure (DSU 3.7)**, 6, 130
 challenges to measures “as such” and “as applied”, 43
 non-violation complaint, 153
- Working Procedures**. *See also* Appellate Body; panel procedures (DSU 12/ Appendix 3)
 additional working procedures, 19
 Article 22.6 DSU arbitration working procedures, 34
 BCI working procedures, 97
 compliance panel working procedures, 137
 original panel working procedures, 138
 working procedures including expert consultation, 76
- WTO Agreement**. *See also* compliance review (DSU 21.5); Dispute Settlement Body (DSB), recommendations and rulings; jurisdiction/object of complaint, challenge to measure “as such” and “as applied”
 as package, 16
 obligation of compliance (WTO XVI:4), 43