

RUSSIA AND THE EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS

Why has there been a human rights backlash in Russia despite the country being having been part of the European human rights protection system since the late 1990s? To what extent does Russia implement judgments of the Strasbourg Court, and to what extent does it resist the implementation?

This fascinating study investigates Russia's turbulent relationship with the European Court of Human Rights and examines whether the Strasbourg Court has indeed had the effect of increasing the protection of human rights in Russia. Researchers and scholars of law and political science with a particular interest in human rights and Russia will benefit from this in-depth exploration of the background of this subject.

LAURI MÄLKSOO is Professor of International Law at the University of Tartu in Estonia. He is the author of *Illegal Annexation and State Continuity* (2003) and *Russian Approaches to International Law* (2015).

WOLFGANG BENEDEK is a former head of the Institute of International Law and International Relations and Director of European Training and Research Centre for Human Rights and Democracy at University of Graz.

RUSSIA AND THE EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS

The Strasbourg Effect

Edited by

LAURI MÄLKSOO

University of Tartu

WOLFGANG BENEDEK

Karl-Franzens-Universität Graz, Austria



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
 978-1-108-41573-6 — Russia and the European Court of Human Rights
 Edited by Lauri Mälksoo, Wolfgang Benedek
 Excerpt
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
 a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
 education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108415736

DOI: 10.1017/9781108235075

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions
 of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take
 place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2018

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Names: Mälksoo, Lauri, editor. | Benedek, Wolfgang, editor.

Title: Russia and the European Court of Human Rights : the Strasbourg Effect / edited by
 Lauri Mälksoo, University of Tartu; Wolfgang Benedek,

Karl-Franzens-Universität Graz, Austria.

Description: Cambridge [UK] ; New York : Cambridge University Press, 2017. |

Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2017024634 | ISBN 9781108415736 (hardback : alk. paper) |

ISBN 9781108401999 (pbk. : alk. paper)

Subjects: LCSH: Human rights–Russia (Federation) | European Court of Human Rights. |
 Human rights–Europe.

Classification: LCC KLB2460 .R89 2017 | DDC 342.4708/5–dc23 LC record
 available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2017024634>

ISBN 978-1-108-41573-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence
 or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this
 publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will
 remain, accurate or appropriate.

CONTENTS

List of contributors vii
Preface xiii
Foreword by Dmitry Dedov xvii
List of abbreviations xxii

PART I Setting the scene 1

Introduction: Russia, Strasbourg, and the paradox of a
human rights backlash 3
LAURI MÄLKSOO

1 Russia in the Council of Europe: Participation à la carte 26
PETRA ROTER

**PART II Interaction between the ECtHR and
 Russian courts 57**

**2 The use of European human rights law in
 Russian courts 59**
ANTON BURKOV

**3 ECtHR and the Russian Constitutional Court:
 duet or duel? 93**
SERGEY MAROCHKIN

**4 The Russian Constitutional Court and the
 Strasbourg Court: judicial pragmatism in a dual state 125**
ALEXEI TROCHEV

**5 Philosophy behind human rights:
 Valery Zorkin vs. the West? 150**
MIKHAIL ANTONOV

vi	CONTENTS
6	Russia’s cases in the ECtHR and the question of implementation 188
	BILL BOWRING
7	Russia’s impact on the Strasbourg system, as seen by two former judges of the European Court of Human Rights 222
	ELISABET FURA AND RAIT MARUSTE
	PART III Specific rights and violations: case studies 253
8	Egregious human rights violations in Chechnya: appraising the pursuit of justice 255
	PHILIP LEACH
9	Property rights in Russia: reconsidering the socialist legal tradition 295
	VLADISLAV STARZHENETSKIY
10	LGBT rights in Russia and European human rights standards 326
	DMITRI BARTENEV
	PART IV Interpretations of the Strasbourg Effect and Russia’s responses to the ECtHR 353
11	Nativist ideological responses to European/liberal human rights discourses in contemporary Russia 355
	BENEDIKT HARZL
12	Russia and the European Court of Human Rights: some general conclusions 385
	WOLFGANG BENEDEK
	<i>Index</i> 400

CONTRIBUTORS

MIKHAIL ANTONOV is Professor of Law associated with the Law Faculty at the National Research University Higher School of Economics. He teaches legal theory and comparative law. His research interests focus on the Russian philosophy of law and contemporary legal theory. His main publications in recent years include, among others, *Law and Society in the Conception of Georges Gurvitch* (2013, in Russian) and *History of the Russian Legal Thought* (2017, in Russian).

DMITRI BARTENEV is an associate professor of international law at St Petersburg State University. He teaches international law and human rights and has also taught comparative constitutional law and medical law. He is a member of the European Commission on Sexual Orientation Law. As a practicing attorney he has represented clients in a number of topical cases at the European Court of Human Rights and the UN human rights bodies in anti-discrimination, mental disability, LGBT, and freedom of speech cases. His publications include *Fundamentals of Constitutional Law of Finland* (2004), *Implementation of Shtukaturv v. Russia: Challenges and Strategies* (2011), and *Justice or Complicity* (2016).

WOLFGANG BENEDEK is a former head of the Institute of International Law and International Relations and Director of European Training and Research Centre for Human Rights and Democracy at University of Graz.

BILL BOWRING is a practicing barrister and teaches international law and human rights at Birkbeck College. He has represented many applicants at the European Court of Human Rights since 1992, against Armenia, Azerbaijan, Estonia, Georgia, Latvia, Russia, and Turkey. He is founder and Chair of European Human Rights Advocacy Centre and is President of European Lawyers for Democracy and Human Rights, active in eighteen European countries. He has more than 100 publications to his name,

including two monographs, the most recent of which is *Law, Rights and Ideology in Russia: Landmarks in the Destiny of a Great Power* (2013).

ANTON BURKOV is a chair of the European and Comparative Law Department at the University of Humanities. Since 1998 he has been practicing and teaching human rights law. During his twenty years of practice as a human rights lawyer with the NGO Sutyajnik (<http://sutyajnik.org/>), Anton litigated cases in district and regional courts, the Supreme Court and the Constitutional Court of the Russian Federation, and the European Court of Human Rights. He is involved in some of Sutyajnik's most recent cases: *Burkov v. Google* (IT and privacy), *Mikhaylova v. Russia* (free legal aid), *Sablina and Others v. Russia* (secret organ harvesting), and *Korolevs v. Russia* (rights of prisoners and their families to conjugal meetings and artificial insemination). He has authored, coauthored, and edited nine books and more than twenty papers in major Russian law journals and in English-language law journals. In 2000 Anton was awarded a citywide legal prize, the "Profi-Yekaterinburg" in the area of "Jurisprudence." In 2001 he was awarded the highest legal prize in Russia, the "Femida" award, "for contributions toward the creation of a democratic society and the development of state legal institutions." In 2002 he set up a human rights news agency, *Sutyajnik-Press*.

DMITRY DEDOV currently serves as judge elected from the Russian Federation at the European Court of Human Rights. He worked as a professor of law at Lomonosov State University in Moscow from 1994 to 2013, writing various books on methodology including the theory of corporate governance, conflict of interests, general good, principle of proportionality, democracy, and sustainable development. He has broad experience and knowledge in the application of the rule-of-law concept and its fundamental principles to civil and criminal matters on national and international levels as a judge and a scholar.

ELISABET FURA recently retired from the position as chief parliamentary ombudsman in Sweden. Before that she served for nine years as judge in the European Court of Human Rights, and before that she was a partner of Vinge law firm, Stockholm, Sweden and Paris, France. She is Juris Doctor Honoris Causa of the law faculty of Stockholm University, former president of the Swedish Bar Association, and head of the Swedish delegation to the CCBE (the Bar Council of the EU). She was awarded a medal for achievements in the legal field by His Majesty the King of Sweden.

CONTRIBUTORS

ix

BENEDIKT HARZL is an Austrian Marshall Plan Foundation Fellow at Johns Hopkins University/SAIS and Assistant Professor at the Russian East European Eurasian Studies Centre (REEES) of the Law Faculty of the University of Graz. He worked in various research institutions across Europe, among them at the European Academy of Bolzano/Bozen (Italy) in 2007–12. While the University of Graz is Harzl's alma mater, he completed his PhD in law at the University of Frankfurt. His research foci include human rights and post-Soviet state building as well as the law and politics of ethnic conflicts in the post-Soviet space.

PHILIP LEACH is Professor of Human Rights Law at Middlesex University, a solicitor, and Director of the European Human Rights Advocacy Centre (EHRAC: www.ehrac.org.uk), also based at Middlesex University. He researches and publishes widely in the field of international human rights law. He was a member of the Independent Advisory Panel on Deaths in Custody from 2009 to 2015 and a member of the *Harris Review* from 2014 to 2015. He is a former trustee of the Media Legal Defence Initiative and the Human Dignity Trust and is a member of the Advisory Board of the Open Society Justice Initiative. He has extensive experience of representing applicants before the European Court of Human Rights, in particular against Russia and other former Soviet states, as well as the United Kingdom and Turkey.

LAURI MÄLKSOO is Professor of International Law at the University of Tartu in Estonia. He is the author of *Illegal Annexation and State Continuity* (2003) and *Russian Approaches to International Law* (2015).

SERGEY MAROCHKIN is Director of the Institute of State Law at the University of Tyumen. He is an Honored Jurist of the Russian Federation (2007, conferred by the President of Russia) and Member of the Executive Committee of the Russian Association of International Law (since 1993). Sergei is a coauthor of monographs, textbooks, chapters in international edited books, and articles published in Europe, Canada, China, and the United States. He was a visiting professor and lecturer (2007–12) at the University of Lorraine (France) and at the University of Tartu (Estonia) (2012) and Coordinator of the Russian team of reporters for the Amsterdam-Oxford multinational project International Law in Domestic Courts (ILDC) since 2007. His awards include the Russian Academy of Sciences' F. F. Martens Prize Laureate (2013), G. Tunkin Medal, and Russian Association of International Law.

RAIT MARUSTE was a law professor at Tartu University until 1998 and President of the Supreme Court of Estonia after restoration of Estonian independence. In 1998 he received the state decoration White Star II class (II klassi Valge Tähe orden). From 1998 to 2010, he was a judge at the European Court of Human Rights, and from 2011 to 2015 he was a member of the Estonian Parliament (Riigikogu) chairing the Constitutional Committee. From 2015 he was an ad hoc legal advisor for government and a visiting professor at Tartu University. He has written more than 100 articles and books on judiciary, human rights, and constitutional law, including *Constitutionalism and Protection of Fundamental Rights* (2004).

PETRA ROTER is Associate Professor of International Relations at the University of Ljubljana, Faculty of Social Sciences, and a senior researcher at the Centre of International Relations at the same faculty. She is Slovenia's national director for the European Master in Human Rights and Democratisation (Venice; EMA) and a coordinator of the MA program in International Relations at her faculty. She has published on international minority protection, conflict management, post-conflict reconstruction and human rights (including in *Parliamentary Affairs*, *Journal of International Relations and Development*, *Mediterranean Politics*, *Mediterranean Quarterly*) and coauthored *Mapping the New World Order* (2009). She is President of the Advisory Committee of the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities (2016–18).

VLADISLAV STARZHENETSKIY is Associate Professor at the Chair of International Public and Private International Law, Faculty of Law, Higher School of Economics. He also serves as First Deputy Dean of the Law Faculty. His research interests include international law, private international law, human rights, property law, and intellectual property law. He graduated from the Moscow Institute of International Relations (MGIMO) with a degree in International Law. In 2003, he received his PhD for his dissertation dedicated to comparative analysis of property rights concepts under the ECHR and Russian law. From 1998 to 2014, he has been working at the Russian Federation's Supreme Commercial Court and was heading the Department of International Law and Cooperation from 2011 to 2014; this has afforded him a fine opportunity to trace the evolution of the Russian legal and judicial systems.

CONTRIBUTORS

xi

ALEXEI TROCHEV is the author of *Judging Russia: The Role of the Constitutional Court in Russian Politics, 1990–2006*. He edits the journal *Statutes and Decisions: The Laws of the USSR and Its Successor States*, which has recently covered issues of judicial politics in Ukraine, police reform in Russia, criminal justice reforms in Kazakhstan, and the administrative court proceedings in Russia. His latest article, “Between Convictions and Reconciliations: Processing Criminal Cases in Kazakhstani Courts,” has appeared in *Cornell International Law Journal*. His current research projects explore the judicial profession in Kazakhstan and comparative judicial behavior outside the courthouses.