Virtue in Business

The virtue approach to business ethics is a topic of increasing importance within the business world. Focusing on Aristotle's theory that the virtues of character, rather than actions, are central to ethics, Edwin M. Hartman introduces readers of this book to the value of applying Aristotle's virtue approach to business. Using numerous real-world examples, he argues that business leaders have good reason to take character seriously when explaining and evaluating individuals in organizations. He demonstrates how the virtue approach can deepen our understanding of business ethics and how it can contribute to contemporary discussions of character, rationality, corporate culture, ethics education, and global ethics. Written by one of the foremost Aristotelian scholars working in the field today, this authoritative introduction to the role of virtue ethics in business is a valuable text for graduate students and academic researchers in business ethics, applied ethics, and philosophy.

EDWIN M. HARTMAN was Visiting Professor of Business Ethics and codirector of the Paduano Seminar in Business Ethics at the Stern School of Business in New York University until his retirement in December 2009. Before joining Stern, he taught for more than twenty years in the business school and the philosophy department at Rutgers University, where he was founding director of the Prudential Business Ethics Center at Rutgers. He is the author of *Substance, Body, and Soul: Aristotelian Investigations, Conceptual Foundations of Organization Theory,* and *Organizational Ethics and the Good Life* (named Book of the Year [2003] by the Social Issues in Management Division of the Academy of Management).

Business, Value Creation, and Society

Series editors

R. Edward Freeman, University of Virginia Jeremy Moon, Nottingham University Mette Morsing, Copenhagen Business School

The purpose of this innovative series is to examine, from an international standpoint, the interaction of business and capitalism with society. In the twenty-first century it is more important than ever that business and capitalism come to be seen as social institutions that have a great impact on the welfare of human society around the world. Issues such as globalization, environmentalism, information technology, the triumph of liberalism, corporate governance, and business ethics all have the potential to have major effects on our current models of the corporation and the methods by which value is created, distributed, and sustained among all stakeholders – customers, suppliers, employees, communities, and financiers.

Published titles:

Fort Business, Integrity, and Peace Gomez and Korine Entrepreneurs and Democracy Crane, Matten, and Moon Corporations and Citizenship Painter-Morland Business Ethics as Practice Yaziji and Doh NGOs and Corporations Rivera Business and Public Policy Sachs and Rühli Stakeholders Matter Mansell Capitalism, Corporations and the Social Contract

Forthcoming titles:

Hemingway Corporate Social Entrepreneurship Maak and Pless Responsible Leadership de Bruin Ethics in Finance

Virtue in Business

Conversations with Aristotle

EDWIN M. HARTMAN



CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107642300

© Edwin M. Hartman 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2013 First paperback edition 2015

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Hartman, Edwin, 1941– Virtue in business : conversations with Aristotle / Edwin M. Hartman. pages cm. – (Business, value creation, and society) Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 978-1-107-03075-6 (hardback) 1. Business ethics. 2. Virtue. 3. Aristotle. I. Title. HF5387.H37324 2013 174'.4 – dc23 2013011345 ISBN 978-1-107-03075-6 Hardback ISBN 978-1-107-64230-0 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

For M. S. H. and S. M. H. sine quibus non

Contents

Foreword by R. Edward Freeman		<i>page</i> ix
Acknowledgments		xi
	Introduction to Aristotle, virtue ethics, and this book	1
1	Virtues and principles	25
2	Virtues and decisions	64
3	Virtues, good reasons, and the good life	94
4	Developing character	127
5	Virtues in and among organizations	161
6	Teaching virtue in business school	189
7	Ethical conflict and the global future	211
Bibliography		253
Index		268

Foreword

Ed Hartman has brought Aristotle to life for the business world of the twenty-first century. This book leaves no doubt about the relevance and importance of Aristotle's wisdom for today's executives and management thinkers. And Hartman shows that it is not just a matter of the importance of virtues and the golden mean. He shows in detail how understanding the strengths and weaknesses of Aristotle's worldview enlightens how we can think about business today.

There is very little certainty in today's business world. There are breathtaking technologies that change everything from life spans to how we see each other. And there seems to be an increasing shortage of "common sense." Hartman navigates these waters with an Aristotelian sense of what is important and what is not. He does not founder on dichotomies such as "normative vs. positive" or "business vs. ethics" or "science vs. philosophy." He shows how a modern-day pragmatist in the spirit of both Dewey and Rorty can read Aristotele as contributing to the theoretical conversation in business ethics, and as yielding practical insights into how organizations need to be managed in this new world.

Hartman brings a career of philosophical training, teaching in business schools, and work as a management consultant to the task. He has studied with some of the best philosophical minds in the world, and has worked with senior executives from industry and education. He has given us a new interpretation of Aristotle that is both philosophically deep and practically relevant.

For instance, in Chapter 4 he makes Aristotle relevant to those behavioral theorists who question our ability to deliberate and improve the kinds of decisions we might make. Chapter 5 has much to say to socalled "new institutionalists" who want to work only at a very abstract level in organizations. Yet Chapter 7 is quite relevant to the policy analysts who want to prescribe how issues such as globalization should unfold with the help of mediating institutions, including businesses.

Foreword

Aristotle had a remarkably comprehensive view of his own world, and Hartman follows suit, but he is able to make Aristotle speak to others who do not share or even understand Aristotle's worldview. Yet perhaps some of the most remarkable passages in the book are the stories of people from Hartman's own consulting experience. He then goes on to interpret how Aristotle would see these situations, not in terms of the world of Ancient Greece, but in our modern terms. These passages bring Aristotle to life for business in a way that has never been done.

It is a pleasure to publish this book in the series on Business, Value Creation, and Society. The purpose of this series is to stimulate new thinking about value creation and trade, and its role in the world of the twenty-first century. Our old models and ideas simply are not appropriate today. Hartman's interpretation makes Aristotle a citizen and an important voice in this new world. We need more new scholarship like this that builds on the work of our intellectual heroes yet offers the alternative of a world of hope, freedom, and human flourishing.

> R. Edward Freeman University Professor and Elis and Signe Olsson Professor The Darden School University of Virginia Charlottesville, Virginia, USA

х

Acknowledgments

Interpreting Aristotle is a humbling task. One stands on the shoulders of giants; occasionally one steps on their toes. The giants include not only the great interpreters of Aristotle but also leading scholars in fields to which Aristotle has something to say: ethics, psychology, sociology, politics, and so on and on. So much has been written about trust, social capital, the commons, individualism, rationality, liberalism, baseball, and much else that it would be difficult for one scholar to encompass them all. For this scholar it is impossible. The most I can reasonably hope is that those whose mastery of these subjects exceeds mine will learn from my work that Aristotle has something interesting to say to them.

Over the years I have learned about Aristotle from many sources. I can no longer recall exactly who taught me what, so I cannot fairly acknowledge all my debts. It will be obvious that, as I have worked on this book in recent years, I have been much influenced by the work of Terence Irwin, Julia Annas, and Daniel Russell on the Nicomachean Ethics and that of Fred Miller on the Politics. I am sure I also owe thanks to Rosalind Hursthouse, Nancy Sherman, Martha Nussbaum, Sarah Broadie, John Cooper, and others for their work on Aristotle's ethics. I am grateful to John Keaney for a graduate seminar on the Politics nearly fifty years ago. My great teachers of the Metaphysics were Richard Rorty, Gwilym Owen, Richard Woods, and Terry Penner. Penner, my very patient thesis adviser, gave me a good start on Aristotle's De Anima, and David Furley contributed to my further work on it. Gregory Vlastos was my guide to Socrates and Plato. On philosophical issues generally I learned most from Rorty, Antony Kenny, and Donald Davidson. James Ward Smith, Alan Montefiore, and Richard Hare taught me a great deal about ethics. Nick Sturgeon, Don Waterfall, Frank Lewis, Richard Kraut, Hardy Wieting, and Alexander Nehamas were good influences in many areas of philosophy, starting but not ending in graduate school. Where social

xii

Acknowledgments

psychology offers insights to virtue ethics, the great recent influence on my thought has been the work of Jonathan Haidt, though John Doris and Daniel Kahneman are deservedly highlighted here as well. But social psychologists have been working on me since I took an undergraduate class with David Rosenhan.

I had the pleasure of working with Alejo Sison and Joan Fontrodona in editing a special number of *Business Ethics Quarterly* on the virtue approach to business ethics. I learned a great deal from them and from the contributors, and I profited from their encyclopedic knowledge of the literature of the field.

But for the encouragement of Ed Freeman, I might still be in management consulting rather than business ethics. I trust that his efforts have improved both fields. Ed has offered good advice on this book, as on much else that I have written.

Concerning virtue ethics as an approach to business ethics I am, as so many are, most in debt to the late Bob Solomon. Miguel Alzola, Robert Audi, Jerry Cavanagh, Joe DesJardins, Ron Duska, Gabriel Flynn, Kevin Jackson, Daryl Koehn, Domenec Mele, Dennis Moberg, Geoff Moore, Craig Walton, and Gary Weaver have contributed to the virtue approach and to my work. I will add Pat Werhane's name, though it may not have occurred to her that she is a virtue ethicist. Other names deserving of mention appear in the Bibliography. It was my privilege to have Miguel Alzola as a student. I doubt that I have taught him as much as he has taught me.

Many Rutgers colleagues helped me in my years there. I thank Jeff Buechner, Wayne Eastman, Harvey Feder, George Gordon, Candace Hetzner, Nancy Holmstrom, Doug Husak, Jim Livingston, Don McCabe, Brian McLaughlin, Michael Rohr, Mike Stouder, Mike Valdman, Pheroze Wadia, and Danielle Warren. I appreciate the administrative support I received from Annette Allen, George Benson, David Blake, Ivan Brick, Steve Diner, Hal Eastman, Phil Furmanski, David Hosford, Lisa Hull, Barbara Kovach, Art Kraft, Fran Lawrence, Marc Mappen, Rosa Oppenheim, Jerry Rosenberg, Norman Samuels, Glenn Shafer, Jeff Slovak, Cecile Stolbaugh, my late friend Howard Tuckman, and Emilio Venezian.

The Prudential Foundation generously funded the Prudential Business Ethics Center at Rutgers. During my tenure as director, Harold Davis, the guiding spirit of the Center, and Oliver Quinn were Chief Ethics Officers at Prudential and invaluable colleagues.

Acknowledgments

I thank Rutgers for giving me two leaves of absence to work on this book. In addition the University gave an Academic Excellence Grant to the Prudential Business Ethics Center and the Eagleton Institute of Politics at Rutgers for a project on ethics in New Jersey. It was a pleasure to work with and learn from Ruth Mandel, Don Linky, and others at the Institute.

At Rutgers I was twice a fellow of the Center for the Critical Analysis of Contemporary Culture, an extraordinary laboratory of ideas. I am especially grateful to Andy Abbott, Amanda Anderson, George Levine, Jonathan Loesberg, Candace McCoy, Dennis Patterson, Pat Roos, Renee Weber, and Bruce Wilshire.

At New York University's Stern School of Business I was fortunate to be able to participate in the Paduano Seminar and to converse with some outstanding colleagues, including Bruce Buchanan, Bob Frank, Rex Mixon, Gary Simon, and David Velleman. The Seminar's fellows and guest speakers taught us all a great deal. Tom Cooley and Ingo Walter offered excellent administrative support.

I profited from speaking and listening at California State University at Sacramento, the University of Montreal, Gettysburg College, the University of New Mexico, the Witherspoon Institute, the Eller School at the University of Arizona, IESE Business School of the University of Navarra, and the Wharton School. At the Darden School I taught PhD seminar modules on Aristotle's ethics to some extraordinary students. Dave Schmidtz, the director of the always stimulating Freedom Center at the University of Arizona, made it possible for me to meet Mark LeBar, Dan Russell, and others. I attended the Ruffin Lectures at Darden many times and always came away enlightened and energized.

George Bragues was a helpful editor of the section of the Handbook of the Philosophical Foundations of Business Ethics (Springer) to which I contributed. Chapter 4 of this book is a later version of my contribution. Dan Russell edited the Cambridge Companion to Virtue Ethics and offered good advice on my piece. James Bailey shepherded a contribution of mine to publication in Academy of Management Learning and Education. Some parts of that article reappear in Chapter 6. Al Gini did the same with my contributions to Business Ethics Quarterly, and Robert Baum played that role at Business and Professional Ethics Journal. Many anonymous reviewers, including some at the Journal of Business Ethics, improved my work.

xiii

xiv

Acknowledgments

In addition to those I have already mentioned, I am indebted to many in business ethics who have been generous with their ideas: John Boatright, Norm Bowie, George Brenkert, Joanne Ciulla, Daylian Cain, Deb Cohen, Richard DeGeorge, Robbin Derry, John Dienhart, Tom Donaldson, our late friend Tom Dunfee, Ed Epstein, Tim Fort, Bill Frederick, Dan Gilbert, Ken Goodpaster, Stewart Herman, Mike Hoffman, Nien-he Hsieh, Ian Maitland, Joshua Margolis, Dave Messick, Christopher Michaelson, Jennifer Moore, Laura Nash, Lisa Newton, Richard Nielsen, Wayne Norman, Lynn Paine, Bobby Parmar, Rob Phillips, Gordon Sollars, Alan Strudler, Manny Velasquez, and Andy Wicks. I am sure there are others, to whom I apologize.

For insights on a variety of topics I thank the Philosophers of the Oracle Inn.

Mary S. Hartman has been, as always, an invaluable source of intellectual and moral support and immeasurably more. Our son, Sam Hartman, is an inspiration to us both.

Two anonymous reviewers for Cambridge University Press offered encouragement and incisive criticism. They are responsible for having improved this book, but not for any of my errors of omission or commission.

Ed Freeman, Paula Parish, and Claire Poole have been the most conscientious editors imaginable. Ekta Vishnoi guided me ably through the mysteries of indexing. Harry Langford helped make my text readable. I thank them all for their highly professional assistance.

Earlier versions of some claims I make in this book have appeared in these places:

- 2013. "The virtue approach to business ethics." In D. Russell (Ed.), *Cambridge Companion to Virtue Ethics*, 240–64. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- 2012. "Aristotle on character formation." In C. Luetge (Ed.), *Handbook of the Philosophical Foundations of Business Ethics*, Vol. 1, 67–88. New York: Springer-Verlag.
- 2011. "Win-win and the common good." In R. Phillips (Ed.), Stakeholder Theory: Impact and Prospects, 76–98. Cheltenham, UK: Edward Elgar Publishing.
- 2011. "Virtue, profit, and the separation thesis: an Aristotelian view." *Journal of Business Ethics*, 99, 5–17.
- 2008. "Socratic questions and Aristotelian answers: a virtue-based approach to business ethics." *Journal of Business Ethics*, 78, 313–28.

Acknowledgments

2008. "Reconciliation in business ethics: some advice from Aristotle." Business Ethics Quarterly, 18, 253-65.

- 2006. "Can we teach character? An Aristotelian answer." Academy of Management Learning and Education, 5, 68–81.
- 2004. "De rerum natura." In R. E. Freeman and P. Werhane (Eds.), *Business, Science, and Ethics*, 201–20. The Ruffin Series No. 4 (a special edition of *Business Ethics Quarterly*).
- 2001. "Character and leadership." *Business and Professional Ethics Journal*, 20, 3–21.
- 2001. "An Aristotelian approach to moral imagination." Professional Ethics, 8, 58-77.
- 1998. "The role of character in business ethics." *Business Ethics Quarterly*, 8, 547–59.
- 1996. Organizational Ethics and the Good Life. New York: Oxford University Press.