EMOTIONS AND MASS ATROCITY

The study of genocide and mass atrocity abounds with references to emotions: fear, anger, horror, shame, and hatred. Yet we don't understand enough about how 'ordinary' emotions behave in such extreme contexts. Emotions are not merely subjective and interpersonal phenomena; they are also powerful social and political forces, deeply involved in the history of mass violence. Drawing on recent insights from philosophy, psychology, history, and the social sciences, this volume examines the emotions of perpetrators, victims, and bystanders. Editors Thomas Brudholm and Johannes Lang have brought together an interdisciplinary group of prominent scholars to provide an in-depth analysis of the nature, value, and role of emotions as they relate to the causes and dynamics of mass atrocities. The result is a new perspective on the social, political, and moral dimensions of emotions in the history of collective violence and its aftermath.

Thomas Brudholm is Associate Professor in the Department of Cross-Cultural and Regional Studies at the University of Copenhagen, Denmark.

Johannes Lang is Senior Researcher at the Danish Institute for International Studies in Copenhagen, Denmark.

Emotions and Mass Atrocity

PHILOSOPHICAL AND THEORETICAL EXPLORATIONS

Edited by

THOMAS BRUDHOLM

University of Copenhagen

JOHANNES LANG Danish Institute for International Studies



CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-56704-7 — Emotions and Mass Atrocity Edited by Thomas Brudholm , Johannes Lang Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107567047 DOI: 10.1017/9781316563281

© Cambridge University Press 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018 First paperback edition 2019

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data NAMES: Brudholm, Thomas, 1969– editor. | Lang, Johannes, 1979– editor. TITLE: Emotions and mass atrocity : philosophical and theoretical explorations / edited by Thomas Brudholm, University of Copenhagen, Johannes Lang, Danish Institute for International Studies. DESCRIPTION: New York : Cambridge University Press, 2017. | Includes bibliographical references. IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2017040061 | ISBN 9781107127739 SUBJECTS: LCSH: Political violence. | Violence. | Political atrocities. | Atrocities. CLASSIFICATION: LCC JC328.6.E46 2017 | DDC 303.601–dc23 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2017040061

ISBN 978-1-107-12773-9 Hardback ISBN 978-1-107-56704-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-56704-7 — Emotions and Mass Atrocity Edited by Thomas Brudholm , Johannes Lang Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

Contents

List	t of Contributors	<i>page</i> vii
Ack	enowledgments	xii
1	Introduction: Emotions and Mass Atrocity Thomas Brudholm and Johannes Lang	1
	PART I CAUSES AND DYNAMICS	21
2	Mass Exterminations and the History of Emotions: The View from Classical Antiquity David Konstan	23
3	Fear, Hope, and the Formation of Specific Intention in Genocide Neta C. Crawford	4 ²
4	The Proud Executioner: Pride and the Psychology of Genocide Johannes Lang	64
5	Pondering Hatred Thomas Brudholm and Birgitte Schepelern Johansen	81
6	Social Science and the Study of Perpetrators Arne Johan Vetlesen	104
	PART II EMOTIONAL RESPONSES	121
7	"Destroy Your Sight with a New Gorgon": Mass Atrocity and the Phenomenology of Horror Adriana Cavarero	123

vi	Contents	
8	Perpetrator Disgust: A Morally Destructive Emotion <i>Ditte Marie Munch-Jurisic</i>	142
9	Unraveling the Meaning of Survivor Shame Alba Montes Sánchez and Dan Zahavi	162
10	Beyond Empathy and Compassion: Genocide and the Emotional Complexities of Humanitarian Politics Andrew A. G. Ross	185
	PART III REPAIR AND COMMEMORATION	209
11	Hope(s) after Genocide Margaret Urban Walker	211
12	Traumatic Emotions Jeffrey Blustein	234
13	Embarrassment and Political Repair Nir Eisikovits	262
References		277
Index		301

Contributors

- Jeffrey Blustein is the Arthur Zitrin Professor of Bioethics and Professor of Philosophy at City College of the City University of New York and a member of the graduate faculty of the City University Graduate Center. He is the author of several books, including *Care and Commitment: Taking the Personal Point of View* (1991); *The Moral Demands of Memory* (2008), which was selected as a Choice Outstanding Academic Title for 2008; and *Forgiveness and Remembrance: Remembering Wrongdoing in Personal and Public Life* (2014). Blustein is co-director of the Historical Memory Project, located at John Jay College of Criminal Justice, CUNY, an initiative that seeks to preserve historical memory of state violence and genocide in Latin America during the Cold War years. His research interests include the morality of memory, the moral psychology of emotions, and the nature of forgiveness.
- Thomas Brudholm is Associate Professor at the University of Copenhagen, Department of Cross-Cultural and Regional Studies. His main fields of expertise are within philosophy and studies of emotions, mass atrocities, and their aftermaths. Currently, Brudholm is focusing on the concept of hatred, combining classical philosophical sources with current legal and political discourses on hate crime and hate speech. Brudholm is the author of *Resentment's Virtue: Jean Améry and the Refusal to Forgive* (2008) and coeditor of several books, including *The Religious in Responses to Mass Atrocity* (Cambridge University Press, 2009, with Thomas Cushman). He has contributed articles to journals such as the *Journal of Applied Philosophy, Law & Contemporary Problems, Journal of Human Rights,* and *Journal of Genocide Research*.
- Adriana Cavarero is Professor of Political Philosophy at the University of Verona. A feminist thinker and president of the scientific board at the

viii

List of Contributors

Hannah Arendt Center of Political Studies, University of Verona, she focuses on philosophy, politics, and literature, and, in particular, on the issue of violence. Her books in English include *In Spite of Plato* (1995); *Relating Narratives* (2000); *Stately Bodies* (2002); *For More Than One Voice* (2005); *Horrorism: Naming Contemporary Violence* (2009); and *Inclinations: A Critique of Rectitude* (2016). In 2017, the University of Brighton hosted an international conference dedicated entirely to the work of Adriana Cavarero.

- Neta C. Crawford is Professor of Political Science at Boston University. Her research interests include international relations theory, normative theory, foreign policy decision-making, sanctions, peace movements, discourse ethics, post-conflict peace-building, emotions, and the costs and consequences of war. Her books include Accountability for Killing: Moral Responsibility for Collateral Damage in America's Post-9/11 Wars (2013) and Argument and Change in World Politics: Ethics, Decolonization, Humanitarian Intervention (Cambridge University Press, 2002), which was a co-winner of the 2003 American Political Science Association's Jervis and Schroeder Award for best book in International History and Politics. Crawford's articles have appeared in journals such as International Organization, Security Studies, Perspectives on Politics, International Theory, and International Security. She was recognized with the Distinguished Scholar Award of the International Ethics section of the International Studies Association in 2018.
- Nir Eisikovits is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Massachusetts in Boston, where he serves as Founding Director of the Applied Ethics Center. He writes about transitional justice and the ethics of war. Eisikovits' first book, *Sympathizing with the Enemy* (2009), which provided a philosophical account of political reconciliation, was the subject of a special symposium in *Review of International Affairs*. His second book, *A Theory of Truces* (2015), took up the ethics and moral psychology of truces. It was the subject of a special issue of the *Journal of Global Ethics*. Eisikovits is also co-editor of *Theorizing Transitional Justice* (2015) and guest editor of a special issue of *Theoria* on the concept of peace in the age of asymmetrical warfare. In addition to his scholarly work, Eisikovits writes regularly for American newspapers and magazines, including *The Boston Globe, The Christian Science Monitor, The Miami Herald*, and *The National Interest*.

List of Contributors

Birgitte Schepelern Johansen is Associate Professor of Minority Studies and Migration Studies at the University of Copenhagen. Her research focuses on the formation of groups and group identities within asymmetrical power relations, processes of exclusion, ethnic and religious hostility, and state governance of (especially religious) minorities. She is currently working on a project on anti-hate crime policies and the European "war on hate," which investigates the connection between state governance of emotions, liberal politics, and the criminalization of hate; a project that received one of the Danish Research Council's Young Elite Researcher awards for 2011. Her work has been published in journals like the *Journal of Muslims in Europe, Journal of Contemporary Religion*, and *Emotion*, Space, and *Society*.

- **David Konstan** is Professor of Classics at New York University. His research focuses on ancient Greek and Latin literature, especially comedy and the novel, and on classical philosophy. In recent years, he has investigated the emotions and value concepts of classical Greece and Rome, and has written books on friendship, pity, the emotions, forgiveness, and beauty. He has also published a verse translation of the two Senecan tragedies about Hercules. Konstan serves on the editorial boards of numerous journals around the world. He has been president of the American Philological Association and is a fellow of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences and the Australian Academy of the Humanities. He has been awarded fellowships by the National Endowment for the Humanities, the American Council of Learned Societies, and the Guggenheim Foundation.
- Johannes Lang is a Senior Researcher at the Danish Institute for International Studies. His research interests include social-psychological aspects of war and mass atrocity, trauma theory, social and political theory, as well as theories of emotion. Lang has been a lecturer in psychology at the University of Copenhagen, a visiting postdoctoral fellow in cultural sociology at Yale, and the recipient of a Young Elite Researcher award from the Danish Research Council for Independent Research. He is currently codirecting a project on the relationship between war and psychological science in the twenty-first century. Lang's work has appeared in *Holocaust and Genocide Studies, Theory and Psychology, History and Theory*, and *The Anthem Companion to Hannah Arendt* (edited by Peter Baehr and Philip Walsh).
- Ditte Marie Munch-Jurisic is Postdoctoral Fellow in the Philosophy Department at Roskilde University. Her PhD dissertation on perpetrator

ix

х

List of Contributors

disgust, accepted by the University of Copenhagen (Philosophy and Minority Studies), explored the connection between aversive physical reactions, emotions, and morality. Papers on the subject appeared in *Metaphilosophy* and Danish-language publications. Funded by a Carlsberg Foundation grant, her current research focuses on aversive emotions and implicit bias. She has previously been a visiting PhD student in philosophy at the University of Chicago, an education and outreach officer at the Department of Holocaust and Genocide Studies at the Danish Institute for International Studies, and an intern for the prosecution at the International Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia at The Hague.

- Andrew A. G. Ross is Associate Professor of Political Science at Ohio University. His work lies at the intersection of international relations theory, political theory, and the cultural study of politics. He is the author of *Mixed Emotions: Beyond Fear and Hatred in International Conflict* (2014), as well as articles on emotion and the politics of emotion published in the *European Journal of International Relations, Millennium: Journal of International Studies, International Theory*, and *International Organization.* He is currently working on a book about the sensory and affective impact of digital media in the fields of diplomacy, humanitarianism, and remote warfare.
- Alba Montes Sánchez is Postdoctoral Fellow at the Center for Subjectivity Research at the University of Copenhagen. Her work focuses on topics in the philosophy of emotions and moral psychology, at the intersection of philosophy of mind and phenomenology. Her PhD dissertation sought to elucidate the ethical significance of shame. Subsequently, Montes Sánchez has broadened her research to collective and group-based forms of shame and other self-conscious emotions, namely pride and envy. In the framework of the multidisciplinary project on The Genomic History of Denmark, she is currently addressing issues of personal identity and group membership as well as ethical questions arising in connection with population genetics and its findings about our "deep past." Her contributions have been published in journals such as *Frontiers in Psychology, Journal of Consciousness Studies, Etica e Politica / Ethics and Politics*, and Azafea.
- Arne Johan Vetlesen is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Oslo. He works within the fields of ethics and social philosophy, studying, among other things, evil and its manifestations (e.g., the Holocaust and ethnic cleansing in Bosnia), the role of emotions in mass atrocity, and the importance of emotions in morality. Vetlesen is a member of the Norwegian

List of Contributors

Academy of Science and Letters. His articles have appeared in *Revue internationale de philosophie*, *Thesis Eleven*, and *Philosophy and Social Criticism*, among other journals. Vetlesen has authored and co-authored numerous books, including *Perception*, *Empathy, and Judgment* (1994); *Evil and Human Agency* (Cambridge University Press, 2005); and A *Philosophy of Pain* (2009).

- Margaret Urban Walker is Donald J. Schuenke Chair Emerita in Philosophy at Marquette University. She is author of *Moral Understandings: A Feminist Study in Ethics*, 2nd Edition (2007); *Moral Contexts* (2003); *Moral Repair: Reconstructing Moral Relations after Wrongdoing* (Cambridge University Press, 2006); and What Is Reparative Justice? (2010). She has contributed to projects with the International Center for Transitional Justice on gender and reparations (published in *The Gender of Reparations*, Cambridge University Press, 2009) and on truth commissions. Walker's research interests include moral epistemology and moral psychology, human rights, transitional justice, and restorative justice. Her current work focuses on reparations and reparative truth-telling in the aftermath of political violence, repression, and historical injustice. She is working on a book on reparations and reparative justice.
- Dan Zahavi is Professor of Philosophy and Director of the Center for Subjectivity Research at the University of Copenhagen. Zahavi writes on phenomenology, especially the philosophy of Edmund Husserl, and has worked systematically on topics such as selfhood, self-consciousness, and social cognition. He is co-editor of the journal Phenomenology and the Cognitive Sciences and author of a number of books, including Husserl's Phenomenology (2003); Subjectivity and Selfhood: Investigating the First-Person Perspective (2005); (with Shaun Gallagher) The Phenomenological Mind (2012); Self and Other: Exploring Subjectivity, Empathy, and Shame (2014); and Husserl's Legacy: Phenomenology, Metaphysics, and Transcendental Philosophy (2017).

xi

Acknowledgments

In the making of this book we have had the great fortune of collaborating with a group of scholars whose knowledge, commitment, and patience made them a delight to work with. We would like to thank the contributors for being willing to follow us in bridging the divide between emotion theory and genocide studies. A generous grant from the Danish Research Council for Independent Research enabled us to meet with most of the authors in Copenhagen. We hope that our lively conversations have left their mark on the volume as a whole. Finally, thanks go to our anonymous peer reviewers for qualified and helpful comments, and to Senior Editor John Berger for his persistence and good spirits.