

Index

- a priori* arguments, evaluation of, 16
- acosmism, 129
- Anderson, R. Lanier, 117–19
- Anselm of Canterbury
 - Monologion*, 209
 - ontological argument, *See Proslogion*;
 - Proslogion II*; *Proslogion III*
 - Reply to Gaunilo*, 20, 36
 - response to Gaunilo's criticism, 258
- Aquinas, Thomas
 - approach to ontological arguments, 44
 - on arguments from simplicity, 49–51
 - on atheism as consistent view, 47–8
 - Commentary on Boethius' De Trinitate*, 50
 - critique of *Proslogion II* argument, 2, 29–30, 44–7
 - critique of *Proslogion III* argument, 2
 - on Damascene's argument, 51–2
 - Disputed Questions on Truth*, 52
 - on existence of God as self-evident, 44, 47–8, 50
 - on key assumption of *Proslogion II*, 49
 - on question-begging in *Proslogion II*, 48–9
 - on reasoning in *Proslogion III*, 45
 - Scriptum Super Sententiis*, 49
 - Summa Contra Gentiles*, 2, 45–6, 50–1
 - Summa Theologiae*, 2, 48–9, 52
- argument from design, 121
- Aristotle
 - cosmological arguments, 1
 - Metaphysics*, 1
 - Physics*, 1
- Barnes, J., 12–13
- beliefs
 - inferential beliefs, 18
 - justification of, 17
- Bonaventure (Saint)
 - Disputed Questions on the Mystery of the Trinity*, 50–1
- Cameron, Ross, 169
- Cartesian ontological arguments, 3
- Characterization Principle, 250
 - in Anselm's ontological argument, 256–7
 - in Descartes' ontological argument, 250–2
 - in Gödel's ontological argument, 268
 - and Kant's objections to ontological argument, 253–5
 - in Leibniz's ontological argument, 252–3
 - Meinong and, 262–3
- classical possibilism, 159
- Commentary on Boethius' De Trinitate* (Aquinas), 50
- Complete Cancellation Objection, 103–4
- compositional pluralism, 164
- conceivability
 - and modal ontological argument, 231–6
 - and conceptual consistency, 224–31
 - Epistemic Constraint, 217, 220, 222–3, 225, 230–1
 - Explanatory Constraint, 218, 222, 225, 230–1
 - Fifth Imagination Account, 222–4, 232–3
 - First Imagination Account, 218–19
 - Fourth Imagination Account, 221, 223–4
 - as imaginability, 218–24
 - Imagination Account and Representation Constraint, 219–21
 - Initial Conceptual Account, 225
 - Modal Conceptualism, 225–6
 - perceivability and, 215–18
 - philosophical conceivability, 218
 - premise (1) and conceiving as imagining, 232–3
 - premise (1) and Conceptual Accounts, 233–6
 - Primary Conceptual Account, 231
 - Representation Constraint, 217, 225, 231
 - Representation Constraint and Imagination Account, 219–21
 - Second Imagination Account, 219–20
 - Secondary Conceptual Account, 230, 233
 - Sophisticated Modal Conceptualism, 225–31, 234
 - Third Imagination Account, 220–1
- Conceivability Principle, 42
- atheism, as consistent view, 47–8
- cosmological argument, 1, 94
- cosmological proof of God's existence, 121–2, 126–8
- Critique of Pure Reason* (Kant), 3, 30, 100, 254
- Curley, Edwin, 66, 68

- Damascene, St John, 51–2
 deductive arguments, 14–16
 derivations, and evaluation of arguments, 16–17
 Descartes' ontological argument
 characterization of God, 250–2
 dependence of all knowledge on knowledge of God, 58–9
 Discourse on Method, 3, 58
 disputes over, 53–4
 doctrine of divine simplicity, 71
 essence of God, 61–5
 existence as predicate or property, 72–4
 existence of God as self-evident, 2–3, 57, 70
 formulation of, 9–10
 Gassendi's objection to, 72
 grounds for intuitionism, 57–65
 intuitionist account, 54–7
 Kant's objection to, 30–1, 73
 Leibniz's objections to, 71–2, 252–3
 Meditations on First Philosophy, 3, 53, 56, 58–9, 65, 71, 74, 250
 Mersenne's objection, 71
 necessary versus possible existence, 69–71
 objections to, 71–4
 Perfection Argument, 67–9
 Principles of Philosophy, 3, 53, 57–9
 syllogism, 65–7
 theory of interference, 60–1
Discourse on Method (Descartes), 3, 58, 60
Disputed Questions on the Mystery of the Trinity (Bonaventure), 50–1
Disputed Questions on Truth (Aquinas), 52
 divine simplicity, 71

 Eckhard, Arnold, 83, 90, 93
 essence of God, 61–5
 evaluation of ontological arguments, 14–18
 existence of God
 from standpoint of every world, 173–4

 Findlay, John N., 5, 247
Foundations of Arithmetic (Frege), 259
 Free Logic Movement, 115, 119
 Frege, Gottlob
 Foundations of Arithmetic, 259
 on existence, 196–8, 259–60
 Frege–Russell view of existence claims, 198, 203

 Gassendi, Pierre, 3, 72, 76–7, 79
 Gaunilo of Marmoutiers, 79
 critique of *Proslogion II*, 2, 64, 76
 parody of *Proslogion II* argument, 2, 257–8
 genealogy of ontological arguments, 11
 Gödel's ontological argument
 argument and axioms, 266–8
 Characterization Principle in, 268
 formulation of, 9–10, 139–41
 higher-order modal logic, 3–4, 266
 Leibniz's influence on, 3, 266
 positive properties, 266
 Gödelian family of ontological arguments
 arguments, 139–45
 compossibility of positives, 148–9
 evaluation, 151–3
 Oppy's naturalness parody, 151
 positivity and the formal axioms, 146–9
 refinements to original formulation, 142–5
 substantive axioms, 149–50

 Hartshorne, Charles
 modal ontological argument, 2, 4, 19, 178, 238, 264–5
 on *Proslogion III*, 264
 Hegel, Georg
 absolute idea, 136
 on 'being', 132
 conflation of God and the world, 122–4
 defence of ontological argument, 3
 Doctrine of the Concept, 134–6
 on first ontological proof, 132–4
 on infinity, 123
 on infinity of God, 125–7
 on Kant's objection to ontological proof, 124–5
 physico-theological proof, 122
 on relation between cosmological and ontological proofs, 127–8
 resuscitation of proofs of God's existence, 121–2
 on second ontological proof, 130–1
 on Spinoza as an acosmist, 128–30
 Hume, David, 42, 72
 Hume's Fork, 41

 idealization, and evaluation of arguments, 17
 inferential beliefs, 18
 infinity of God, 123, 125–7
 intuitionist account of ontological argument, 54–7

- Jacobi, Friedrich Heinrich, 121, 128, 131
Jäsche Logic (Kant), 108
 Johnston, M., 12
- Kant, Immanuel
 analytic objections to ontological argument, 103–6
 Complete Cancellation Objection, 103–4
 criticism of ontological argument, 3, 102
 Critique of Pure Reason, 3, 30, 99–100, 254
 existence is not a predicate, 30, 72, 99, 107, 114–19
 Ideal of Pure Reason, 100–2, 112
 introduction of term ‘ontological argument’, 1, 9, 238
 Mere Tautology Objection, 104–6
 object and concept, 111–13
 objections to ontological argument, 30–1, 72–3, 99, 253–5
 Only Possible Argument in Support of a Demonstration of the Existence of God, 3, 99, 103, 113
 Perfection Argument, 67
 positing versus predication, 111
 predication and determination, 110–11
 proofs of existence of God, 1
 Synthetic Contradictionless Objection, 106
 types of predicates, 107–10
- Kenny, Anthony, 71
- Lateran Councils, 54
Laws (Plato), 1
- Leibniz’s ontological argument
 a posteriori approach, 94
 a priori argument, 76
 additional premise, 105
 Ens necessarium and existence, 86–9
 Ens perfectissimum and pure positivity, 90–4
 God’s essence, existence and perfection, 78–86
 influence of, 3
 Meditationes de Cognitione, Veritate et Ideis, 78, 85
 modal argument, 86–9
 Monadology, 91
 Nouveaux Essais, 85, 95
 objections to Anselm’s ontological argument, 75
 objections to Descartes’ ontological argument, 71–2, 75, 252–3
 on perfection, 80–1
 and Perfection Argument in Descartes, 67
 positive idea of God, 75–8
 presumption and possibility, 94–6
 Principles of Nature and Grace, 95
- Lewis, David
 on Anselm’s first premise, 156–60
 on Anselm’s second premise, 160–5
 on Anselm’s third premise, 165–71, 173
 on existence, 199
 metaphysical modality theory applied to *Proslogion II* argument, 4
 translation of Anselm’s arguments into counterpart theory, 155–6
- logical atomism, 260–1
- Longuenesse, Beatrice, 103–4
- Malcolm, Norman
 modal ontological argument, 4, 19, 178
Meditationes de Cognitione, Veritate et Ideis (Leibniz), 85
Meditations on First Philosophy (Descartes), 3, 53, 56, 58–9, 65, 71, 74, 250
- Meinong, Alexius, 5, 199, 262–3
- Meinong’s theory of pure objects, 204
- Meinongianism, 198, 253
- Mere Tautology Objection, 104–6
- Mersenne, Marin, 3, 66, 71
- Metaphysical Foundations of Natural Science* (Kant), 110
- Metaphysics* (Aristotle), 1
- modal continuity, 184
- modal ontological arguments
 conceivability and, 231–6
 dismissal of existence is not a predicate, 119
 epistemic neutrality, 242–6
 formulation, 239–42
 higher-order modal logic, 3–4, 266
 Proslogion III as inspiration for, 19
 question-begging in, 239
 rational permissibility, 246–9
- Monadology* (Leibniz), 91
- Monologion* (Anselm), 209
- Nagasawa, Yujin, 36
- Nature of Necessity* (Plantinga), 5
- non-existent objects, theories of, 5
- Nouveaux Essais* (Leibniz), 85, 95
- offices and their occupants, 5, 198–202
- Only Possible Argument in Support of a Demonstration of the Existence of God* (Kant), 3, 99, 103, 113

- ontological arguments
 - arguments versus proofs, 238
 - as begging the question, 6, 13
 - Characterization Principle, 250
 - claims about God's existence, 6
 - connections between conceivability and possibility, 5
 - in early modern philosophy, 250–5
 - genealogy of, 11
 - hard questions about, 8
 - history of discussion of, 2–5
 - intrinsically interesting philosophical topics, 5–8
 - introduction of term, 1, 9
 - modal versions, *See* modal ontological arguments
 - objections to, 12–14, 53
 - parodying of, 7–8
 - question-begging in, 13, 239
 - standards for evaluation, 14–18
 - taxonomy, 9–11, 238
 - and theory of argumentation, 6–7
- ontological proof of God's existence, 121–2
- ontological saturation principles, 171
- parodying of ontological arguments
 - Gaunilo on Anselm's argument, 2, 257–8
 - Oppy's naturalness parody, 151
 - strong parodies, 150
 - to discredit arguments, 7–8
 - weak parodies, 150
- Parsons, Terence, 5
- perceivability, conceivability and, 215–18
- Perfection Argument, 67–9
- Phaedo* (Plato), 1
- Physics* (Aristotle), 1
- Plantinga's ontological argument
 - assessment of Anselm's argument, 176–8
 - assessment of extended argument, 192–4
 - assumption about logic of possibility, 179–80
 - claim for maximally great being, 11, 188–9
 - existence of perfect being, 246–9
 - formulation of, 9–10
 - on gratuitous bad, 189–90
 - on greatness, 168
 - on Hartshorne and Malcolm's ontological argument, 178
 - island argument, 190–2
 - Nature of Necessity*, 5
 - objections to extended version, 188–92
 - problem of parallel arguments, 180–2
 - Proslogion III* and, 2
 - and Value Argument, 182–7
 - as 'victorious' version, 178–80
- Plato
 - cosmological arguments, 1
 - Laws*, 1
 - Phaedo*, 1
 - teleological arguments, 1
 - Timaeus*, 1
- positivity
 - anti-negative view, 147–8
 - comparative view, 146
 - compossibility of positives, 148–9
 - excellence view, 146–8
 - Gödelian axioms, 146–9
 - Leibnizian view, 147
 - no-entailed-limit view, 147
- Priest, Graham, 5
- Principles of Nature and Grace* (Leibniz), 95
- Principles of Philosophy* (Descartes), 3, 53, 57–9, 62
- proofs of God's existence
 - cosmological proof, 121
 - Hegel's resuscitation of, 121–2
 - non-ontological proofs, 122
 - ontological proof, 121–2
 - relation between cosmological and ontological proofs, 127–8
 - teleological proof, 121
- Proslogion* (Anselm)
 - pivotal text on ontological arguments, 2
- Proslogion II* (Anselm)
 - Almeida's translation of third premise, 171–3
 - ambiguity of Anselm's formula, 39–40
 - Aquinas's critique of, 2, 29–30, 44–7
 - as centrepiece of *Proslogion*, 2
 - characterization of God, 256–7
 - characterization versus description, 27–9
 - concepts and philosophical charity, 25–6
 - existence in the mind, 21–2
 - existence in the mind and in reality, 23–5
 - formulation of ontological argument, 9–10
 - Gaunilo's critique of, 2
 - greatness notion, 21, 32–5
 - key assumption, 49
 - Lewis's translation of first premise, 156–60
 - Lewis's translation of second premise, 160–5
 - Lewis's translation of third premise, 165–71, 173
 - metaphysical modality applied to, 4
 - options for recasting argument, 8
 - original version of ontological argument, 19
 - parodies of argument, 2

Proslogion II (Anselm) (cont.)

- Plantinga's assessment of argument, 176–8
- principle of superiority of existence, 35–6
- question-begging in, 48–9
- reconceiving as external description of key concept, 32–41
- reductio ad absurdum* reasoning, 19–20, 23, 46–7, 256
- something-than-which-nothing-greater-can-be-thought exists in the mind, 20–2
- supreme greatness, 36–8
- switching between something-TWNG and that-TWNG, 26
- that-than-which-a-greater-cannot-be-thought, 27
- that-than-which-a-greater-cannot-be-thought cannot exist in the mind alone, 23–6
- that-than-which-nothing-greater-can-be-thought, 40
- theories of non-existent objects and, 5
- translation of arguments into counterpart theory, 155–6

Proslogion III (Anselm)

- Aquinas on reasoning in, 45
- Aquinas's critique, 2
- axiology of existence, 209–13
- inspiration for modal forms of ontological argument, 19
- logical and axiological validity, 5, 195
- objective of, 2
- ontological argument, 4, 207–9

question-begging

- in modal ontological arguments, 239
- in *Proslogion II*, 48–9
- in ontological arguments, 239
- sufficient condition for accusation of, 239

Rationality Principle, 246–9

- reductio ad absurdum* reasoning, 19–20, 23, 71
- Reply to Gaunilo* (Anselm), 20, 36
- Rules for the Direction of the Mind* (Descartes), 60
- Russell, Bertrand
 - 'On Denoting', 260
 - on analysis of definite descriptions, 201
 - on Anselm's ontological argument, 41
 - on Descartes' ontological argument, 53

- on existence, 198
- on failure of ontological argument, 260, 262
- on Hegelian ontological argument, 4
- on existence, 260–2
- on naive Characterization Principle, 263
- support for ontological argument, 1

Sartre, Jean-Paul, 246

Scotus, John Duns, 36, 215

Scriptum Super Sententias (Aquinas), 49*Sentences* (Lombard), 2

Sidelle, Alan, 226

simplicity, arguments from, 49–51

Spinoza, 92, 128–30

Stang, N., 116

Summa Contra Gentiles (Aquinas), 2, 45–6, 50–1*Summa Theologiae* (Aquinas), 2, 48–9, 52

super-essentialists, 199

superiority of existence principle, 35–6

Sylvan (né Routley), Richard, 5, 261

Synthetic Contradictionless Objection, 106

taxonomy of ontological arguments, 9–11, 238

teleological argument, 1

teleological proof of God's existence, 121–2, 126–7

Tichý, Pavel

- on Anselm's axiology of existence, 209–13
- on argument in *Proslogion III*, 5, 195, 207–9
- on existence claims, 195–8
- on existence, requisite and essence, 202–5
- on greatness and God's nature, 205–7
- on offices and their occupants, 5, 198–202

Timaeus (Plato), 1*Towards Non-Being* (Priest), 261

Traditional Conventionalism, 225

transcendental theology, 99, 102

Value Argument, 182–7

Van Cleve, James, 115

William of Ockham, 36, 41

Wolffian Logic, 116

Yablo, Stephen, 217–18

Zalta, Ed, 5