

## Ontological Arguments

Ontological arguments are one of the main classes of arguments for the existence of God, and have been influential from the Middle Ages right up until our own time. This accessible volume offers a comprehensive survey and assessment of them starting with a sequence of chapters charting their history – from Anselm and Aquinas, via Descartes, Leibniz, Kant and Hegel, to Gödel, Plantinga, Lewis and Tichý. This is followed by chapters on the most important topics to have emerged in the discussion of ontological arguments: the relationship between conceivability and possibility, the charge that ontological arguments beg the question, and the nature of existence. The volume as a whole shows clearly how these arguments emerged and developed, how we should think about them, and why they remain important today.

**Graham Oppy** is Professor of Philosophy at Monash University and is a Fellow of the Australian Academy of Humanities. He has published a number of books, most recently *Reinventing Philosophy of Religion* (2014), *Describing Gods* (2014), *Naturalism and Religion* (2018) and, co-authored with Nick Trakakis, *Interreligious Philosophical Dialogues* (2018).

## Classic Philosophical Arguments

Over the centuries, a number of individual arguments have formed a crucial part of philosophical enquiry. The volumes in this series examine these arguments, looking at the ramifications and applications which they have come to have, the challenges which they have encountered and the ways in which they have stood the test of time.

### Titles in the Series

The Prisoner's Dilemma

Edited by Martin Peterson

The Original Position

Edited by Timothy Hinton

The Brain in a Vat

Edited by Sanford C. Goldberg

Pascal's Wager

Edited by Paul Bartha and Lawrence Pasternack

Ontological Arguments

Edited by Graham Oppy

Newcomb's Problem

Edited by Arif Ahmed

# Ontological Arguments

---

Edited by  
Graham Oppy  
Monash University



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781107559127](http://www.cambridge.org/9781107559127)

DOI: 10.1017/9781316402443

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2018

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data*

Names: Oppy, Graham, 1960- editor.

Title: Ontological arguments / edited by Graham Oppy, Monash University.

Description: 1 [edition]. | New York : Cambridge University Press, 2018. |

Series: Classic philosophical arguments | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2018030094 | ISBN 9781107123632 (hardback : alk. paper) |

ISBN 9781107559127 (pbk. : alk. paper)

Subjects: LCSH: God–Proof, Ontological.

Classification: LCC BT103 .O58 2018 | DDC 212/.1–dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2018030094>

ISBN 978-1-107-12363-2 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-107-55912-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

List of Contributors	<i>page vii</i>
Acknowledgements	<i>ix</i>
Introduction: Ontological Arguments in Focus Graham Oppy	1
1 Anselm Peter Millican	19
2 Aquinas Brian Leftow	44
3 Descartes Lawrence Nolan	53
4 Leibniz Maria Rosa Antognazza	75
5 Kant Lawrence Pasternack	99
6 Hegel Michael Inwood	121
7 Gödel Alexander Pruss	139
8 Lewis Michael J. Almeida	155
9 Plantinga Joshua Rasmussen	176
10 Tichý Graham Oddie	195
11 Conceivability and Possibility Joshua Spencer	214

vi Contents

12	Begging the Question	238
	Peter van Inwagen	
13	Characterisation, Existence and Necessity	250
	Graham Priest	
	Bibliography	270
	Index	280

## Contributors

**Michael J. Almeida** is Professor of Philosophy in the Department of Philosophy and Classics in the University of Texas at San Antonio. He is the author of *The Metaphysics of Perfect Beings* (2008), *Freedom, God, and Worlds* (2012) and *Cosmological Arguments*.

**Maria Rosa Antognazza** is Professor of Philosophy at King's College London. She is the author of *Leibniz on the Trinity and the Incarnation: Reason and Revelation in the Seventeenth Century* (2007), *Leibniz: An Intellectual Biography* (2009) and *Leibniz: A Very Short Introduction* (2016).

**Michael Inwood** is Emeritus Fellow of Trinity College at the University of Oxford. His books include *A Hegel Dictionary* (1992), *A Heidegger Dictionary* (1999), *Hegel: Arguments of the Philosophers* (2002), *Heidegger: A Very Short Introduction* (2002), *A Commentary on Hegel's Philosophy of Mind* (2010) and *Heidegger* (2011).

**Brian Leftow** is William P. Alston Professor of the Philosophy of Religion at Rutgers University. He is the author of: *Time and Eternity* (1991), *God and Necessity* (2012), and *Anselm's Proofs* (2019).

**Peter Millican** is Gilbert Ryle Fellow and Professor of Philosophy at Hertford College in the University of Oxford. He is the author of *Reading Hume on Human Understanding: Essays on the First Enquiry*, and co-editor, with Andy Clark, of *The Legacy of Alan Turing*, two volumes (1996).

**Lawrence Nolan** is Professor of Philosophy at California State University at Long Beach. He is the editor of *Primary and Secondary Qualities: The Historical and Ongoing Debate* (2011) and the *Cambridge Descartes Lexicon* (2016).

**Graham Oddie** is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Colorado at Boulder. His books include *Likeness to Truth* (1986) and *Value, Reality, and Desire* (2005); he is also co-editor, with Roy Perret, of *Justice, Ethics and New Zealand Society* (1993) and, with David Boonin, of *What's Wrong? Applied Ethicists and their Critics* (2004).

**Lawrence Pasternack** is Professor of Philosophy at Oklahoma State University. He is the author of *Immanuel Kant's Groundwork for the Metaphysics of Morals in Focus* (2002) and *Kant's Religion with the Boundaries of Mere Reason: An*

*Interpretation and Defence* (2014). He is also co-editor, with Pablo Muchnik, of *Immanuel Kant's Sources in Translation, Volumes I–IV* (2016–).

**Graham Priest** is Distinguished Professor of Philosophy at the CUNY Graduate Center, City University of New York. His books include *In Contradiction: A Study of the Transconsistent* (1987), *Beyond the Limits of Thought* (1995), *Logic: A Very Short Introduction* (2000), *An Introduction to Non-Classical Logic* (2001), *Towards Non-Being: The Logic and Metaphysics of Intentionality* (2005) and *Doubt Truth to be a Liar* (2006).

**Alexander Pruss** is Professor of Philosophy at Baylor University in Waco, Texas. His books include *The Principle of Sufficient Reason: A Reassessment* (2010), *Actuality, Possibility, and Worlds* (2011), *One Body: An Essay in Christian Sexual Ethics* (2012) and, with Joshua Rasmussen, *Necessary Existence* (2018).

**Joshua Rasmussen** is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Azura Pacific University. His books include *Defending the Correspondence Theory of Truth* (2014) and, with Alexander Pruss, *Necessary Existence* (2018).

**Joshua Spencer** is Associate Professor of Philosophy in the University of Wisconsin at Milwaukee. His dissertation was on material objects in tile space–time. He has published on various metaphysical topics in *The Monist*, *Philosophical Studies*, *Analysis*, *Erkenntnis*, *Philosophy Compass* and *Oxford Studies in Metaphysics*.

**Peter van Inwagen** is John Cardinal O'Hare Professor of Philosophy at the University of Notre Dame. His books include *An Essay on Free Will* (1983), *Material Beings* (1990), *Metaphysics* (1993), *God, Knowledge, and Mystery* (1995), *Ontology, Identity, and Modality* (2002), *The Problem of Evil* (2006), *Existence: Essays in Ontology* (2014) and *Thinking about Free Will* (2017).



## Acknowledgements

This volume would not exist but for those wonderfully talented and generous philosophers who wrote the chapters that it comprises. The volume also would not exist but for the initiative and expert guidance of Hilary Gaskin and other members of the team at Cambridge University Press, including Marianne Nield and Ian McIver. Given that work on this book began in March 2014, there are many other people who made less direct contributions to it, including my friends and colleagues at Monash University – in the Department of Philosophy, the School of Philosophical Historical and International Studies, the Faculty of Arts and the University at large – and my wider circle of friends and colleagues within and beyond the Australasian academy. Special thanks to my immediate family – Camille, Gil, Cal and Alf – who are the ground for all of my possibilities.