

# CONTENTS

|                                   |              |
|-----------------------------------|--------------|
| <i>List of figures and tables</i> | <i>xix</i>   |
| <i>List of contributors</i>       | <i>xx</i>    |
| <i>Preface</i>                    | <i>xxi</i>   |
| <i>Table of cases</i>             | <i>xxiii</i> |
| <i>Table of statutes</i>          | <i>xxxix</i> |
| <i>List of abbreviations</i>      | <i>xlv</i>   |

## INTRODUCTION

|   |          |
|---|----------|
| <b>Chapter 1 Health Law: Frameworks and Context</b> | <b>2</b> |
| Health law  | 3        |
| Our approach  | 5        |
| Health law: terminology and remit                   | 5        |
| Frameworks and context                              | 5        |
| Organisation of the book                            | 6        |

## PART I FRAMEWORKS

### A Theories, Perspectives and Ethics in Health

|   |           |
|---|-----------|
| <b>Chapter 2 Philosophical Bioethics and Health Law</b> | <b>12</b> |
| Introduction  | 13        |
| Rights-based approaches                                 | 13        |
| Utilitarianism  | 15        |
| Virtue ethics   | 17        |
| Feminist approaches to bioethics                        | 19        |
| Autonomy  | 20        |
| Beneficence   | 21        |
| Justice   | 22        |
| How might these three ethical principles work together? | 22        |
| Conclusion  | 23        |

|                  |  |           |
|------------------|--|-----------|
| <b>Chapter 3</b> | <b>Socio-Legal Perspectives on Patient-Doctor Relations</b>                          | <b>24</b> |
|                  | The patient in context   | 26        |
|                  | Patient autonomy   | 27        |
|                  | A question of power  | 30        |
|                  | Good v difficult patients  | 31        |
|                  | Information disclosure and the role of law   | 32        |
|                  | Conclusion   | 33        |
| <b>Chapter 4</b> | <b>Social Determinants of Health and the Role of Law</b>                             | <b>34</b> |
|                  | Introduction   | 35        |
|                  | Social determinants of health in a legal context: social inequities and equality law | 35        |
|                  | Interaction of law and social determinants of health: some examples                  | 38        |
|                  | Indigenous health  | 38        |
|                  | Women's health   | 41        |
|                  | Future children (embryos and fetuses)  | 43        |
|                  | Emerging biomedical approaches to social determinants of health                      | 44        |
|                  | Health in all policies? Advancing social determinants of health policy in Australia  | 45        |
|                  | Conclusion   | 47        |
| <b>Chapter 5</b> | <b>Health and Human Rights Law</b>   | <b>48</b> |
|                  | Introduction   | 49        |
|                  | Human rights law in Australia  | 50        |
|                  | Content of the right to health   | 50        |
|                  | Minimum or core obligations  | 54        |
|                  | Integrating human rights and the social determinants of health                       | 55        |
|                  | Litigation and the human right to health   | 58        |
|                  | Conclusion   | 60        |

## B Institutions and Regulation

|                  |  |           |
|------------------|--|-----------|
| <b>Chapter 6</b> | <b>The Regulatory Framework for Health in Australia</b>  | <b>62</b> |
|                  | Introduction   | 63        |
|                  | The Australian polity – a brief overview   | 63        |
|                  | Constitutional monarchy  | 64        |
|                  | Federation   | 64        |
|                  | Constitutional limitations   | 64        |
|                  | Health powers  | 65        |
|                  | <i>Pharmaceutical Benefits Act 1944</i> (Cth): An early attempt to legislate over health matters | 65        |
|                  | A second run at it – <i>Pharmaceutical Benefits Act 1947</i> (Cth)                               | 66        |
|                  | <i>Health Insurance Act 1973</i> (Cth) – the last hurrah   | 67        |
|                  | The impact of vertical fiscal imbalance  | 67        |
|                  | The Australian health system   | 68        |
|                  | Key aspects of the current health system   | 69        |
|                  | Medicare   | 69        |
|                  | Hospital care  | 70        |
|                  | Prescription pharmaceuticals   | 70        |
|                  | Private health insurance   | 71        |
|                  | What health matters are governed by the states?  | 71        |
|                  | Conclusion   | 72        |
| <b>Chapter 7</b> | <b>Regulating Health Professionals</b>   | <b>73</b> |
|                  | Introduction   | 74        |
|                  | Impetus for reform   | 75        |
|                  | Implementation of the NRAS   | 76        |
|                  | Registration of health professionals   | 78        |
|                  | Health, performance and conduct matters  | 78        |
|                  | NRAS: Advantages   | 93        |
|                  | NRAS: Disadvantages  | 94        |
|                  | Inadequate and inappropriate administration of the NRAS  | 94        |
|                  | Inconsistencies in handling of health, conduct and performance matters                           | 95        |

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| Problems arising from mandatory reporting                                  | 95         |
| Persistence of peer review   | 96         |
| Lack of judicial involvement in decision-making about health professionals | 97         |
| The future of the NRAS   | 97         |
| Conclusion   | 99         |
| <b>Chapter 8 Regulating Patient Safety and Redress</b>                     | <b>100</b> |
| Introduction   | 101        |
| The governance of safety and quality in healthcare in Australia            | 101        |
| Key terms  | 101        |
| The role of law  | 102        |
| Institutional arrangements   | 103        |
| Open disclosure  | 104        |
| Australian Charter of Healthcare Rights                                    | 105        |
| Patient safety education   | 105        |
| Patient redress  | 105        |
| Healthcare complaints process  | 106        |
| Civil legal proceedings  | 108        |
| The coronial system  | 108        |
| The criminal law   | 109        |
| Options for reform   | 110        |
| Conclusion   | 111        |
| <b>PART II CONTEXT</b>   |            |
| <b>A Patients, Doctors and Healthcare</b>                                  |            |
| <b>Chapter 9 Consent to Medical Treatment</b>                              | <b>116</b> |
| Introduction   | 117        |
| Consent: general principles  | 117        |
| Contractual consent and medical practice                                   | 118        |
| Action in breach of contract   | 119        |
| Battery  | 120        |
| Defences other than consent  | 120        |

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| Elements of consent  | 120        |
| Consent must be freely and voluntarily given                   | 120        |
| Consent must relate to the act to be performed                 | 121        |
| Sufficient information must be provided                        | 121        |
| Other circumstances where consent is not valid                 | 122        |
| Competence   | 123        |
| Children   | 123        |
| Statutory provision  | 125        |
| Mental illness, intellectual disability and competency         | 125        |
| Conclusion   | 126        |
| <b>Chapter 10 Substituted Decision-Making</b>                  | <b>127</b> |
| Introduction   | 128        |
| Historical overview  | 128        |
| The ‘best interests’ standard                                  | 129        |
| Substituted mechanisms instigated by individuals with capacity | 130        |
| Common law advance directives                                  | 130        |
| Advance health directives                                      | 130        |
| Enduring Power of Attorney                                     | 131        |
| Statutorily appointed treatment decision-makers                | 132        |
| Emergencies  | 132        |
| Guardianship   | 132        |
| Substituted decision-making in context                         | 134        |
| The human rights challenge to substituted decision-making      | 135        |
| Conclusion   | 137        |
| <b>Chapter 11 Medical Negligence</b>                           | <b>138</b> |
| Introduction   | 139        |
| The basis of negligence  | 139        |
| First principles   | 139        |
| Duty of care   | 140        |
| When does the duty commence?                                   | 140        |
| Breach   | 143        |
| Diagnosis or treatment   | 143        |
| Examples of errors in diagnosis and treatment                  | 144        |

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| Failure to advise of material risks                                  | 145        |
| Causation  | 146        |
| Remoteness   | 147        |
| Conclusion   | 148        |
| <b>Chapter 12 Confidentiality, Privacy and Access to Information</b> | <b>149</b> |
| Introduction   | 150        |
| The rationale for maintaining confidentiality                        | 150        |
| Sources of confidentiality   | 151        |
| Ethics   | 151        |
| Contract   | 151        |
| Equity   | 152        |
| Exceptions to the duty of confidence                                 | 152        |
| Compulsion by law  | 153        |
| Privacy and medical information                                      | 154        |
| <i>Privacy Act 1988 (Cth)</i> and Australian Privacy Principles      | 156        |
| Definitions  | 156        |
| Disclosure of health-related information                             | 156        |
| Use of health information  | 157        |
| Accuracy obligations   | 157        |
| Security obligations   | 157        |
| Unauthorised disclosure  | 157        |
| Access to medical records  | 158        |
| Access   | 158        |
| Correction of health records   | 158        |
| Breaches of the Privacy Act  | 158        |
| Enforcement of orders  | 159        |
| eHealth records scheme   | 159        |
| Conclusion   | 160        |
| <b>B Law at the Beginning and the End of Life</b>                    |            |
| <b>Chapter 13 Regulating Reproduction</b>                            | <b>162</b> |
| Introduction   | 163        |
| Overview of ART regulation and embryo research                       | 163        |

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| Commonwealth regulation  | 165        |
| Prohibition on human cloning   | 165        |
| Requirement for ART clinic accreditation                                 | 165        |
| NHMRC ART Guidelines and the ban on non-medical sex selection            | 166        |
| Some controversial issues in the regulation of ART treatment             | 167        |
| The presumption against treatment and criminal record checks in Victoria | 167        |
| Regulating access to PGD   | 168        |
| Identifying gamete and embryo donors                                     | 171        |
| Storage of embryos   | 172        |
| Embryo disposal  | 172        |
| Posthumous conception and implantation                                   | 173        |
| Prenatal testing   | 174        |
| Abortion   | 176        |
| Surrogacy and parentage  | 177        |
| Conclusion   | 178        |
| <b>Chapter 14 Regulating Emerging Reproductive Technologies</b>          | <b>180</b> |
| Introduction   | 181        |
| Non Invasive Prenatal Testing (NIPT)                                     | 181        |
| Mitochondrial donation and inheritable genetic modification              | 182        |
| Vitrification of human oocytes and the rise of ‘social’ egg freezing     | 183        |
| Stem cells for research and reproduction                                 | 185        |
| Artificial gametes   | 186        |
| Induced pluripotent stem cells   | 187        |
| Conclusion   | 189        |
| <b>Chapter 15 Withdrawal and Withholding of Medical Treatment</b>        | <b>190</b> |
| Introduction   | 191        |
| The prohibition against murder and assisted suicide                      | 192        |
| End-of-life decisions for those with legal competence                    | 193        |
| End-of-life decisions for those who lack legal competence                | 195        |
| State and territory laws   | 196        |
| SA   | 196        |
| NT   | 196        |
| Victoria   | 196        |

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| NSW   | 197        |
| Queensland  | 197        |
| End-of-life decision-making and children                        | 198        |
| The right to demand treatment in end-of-life care               | 199        |
| Conclusion  | 199        |
| <b>Chapter 16 Euthanasia and Assisted Suicide</b>               | <b>201</b> |
| Introduction  | 202        |
| Australia   | 203        |
| England   | 210        |
| Canada  | 213        |
| Conclusion  | 214        |
| <br>  |            |
| <b>C Law and the Human Body</b>                                 |            |
| <b>Chapter 17 Organ and Tissue Donation and Transplantation</b> | <b>216</b> |
| Introduction  | 217        |
| National policy and institutional arrangements                  | 218        |
| Regulation of organ and tissue donation and transplantation     | 220        |
| Key definitions   | 220        |
| Trade and commerce  | 221        |
| Consent to deceased organ donation                              | 224        |
| Opt-in model  | 224        |
| Opt-out model (presumed consent)                                | 224        |
| Required choice   | 225        |
| Family consent  | 225        |
| Key legislative provisions                                      | 226        |
| Diagnosis of death  | 228        |
| Brain death   | 228        |
| Donation after circulatory death                                | 230        |
| Coronial jurisdiction   | 231        |
| Allocation of organs for transplantation from deceased donors   | 232        |
| Organ suitability criteria                                      | 232        |
| Human rights, ethical principles and values                     | 233        |
| Eligibility and allocation criteria                             | 233        |



|  |            |
|--|------------|
| Living organ donation                                    | 234        |
| Ethical issues   | 235        |
| Australian position                                      | 236        |
| Strategies to increase living organ donation             | 237        |
| Financial payment and removal of financial disincentives | 237        |
| Paired kidney exchange programs                          | 238        |
| Legal position   | 238        |
| Adults with capacity                                     | 239        |
| Adults who lack capacity                                 | 240        |
| Children   | 240        |
| Case law   | 241        |
| Tissue banks   | 242        |
| Conclusion   | 244        |
| <b>Chapter 18 Property and Human Tissue</b>              | <b>245</b> |
| Introduction   | 246        |
| Key terms  | 246        |
| No property in the human body                            | 247        |
| Work/skill exception                                     | 248        |
| Case law   | 250        |
| England and Australia                                    | 250        |
| United States  | 252        |
| A property-based approach to human tissue                | 253        |
| Advantages   | 253        |
| Disadvantages  | 254        |
| Legislative position                                     | 255        |
| Conclusion   | 255        |
| <b>Chapter 19 Biobanks</b>                               | <b>256</b> |
| Introduction   | 257        |
| Key definitions  | 257        |
| Key institutions   | 258        |
| Principles   | 258        |
| Governance   | 259        |

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| Ethical, social and legal issues                                 | 260        |
| Consent  | 261        |
| Return of individual or incidental research findings             | 263        |
| Confidentiality and privacy                                      | 264        |
| Property rights  | 265        |
| Commercialisation  | 266        |
| Conclusion   | 268        |
| <b>Chapter 20 Human Genetics and the Law</b>                     | <b>269</b> |
| Introduction   | 270        |
| Historical overview  | 270        |
| Genetics and race  | 272        |
| Genetics and regulation  | 273        |
| Genetic testing  | 273        |
| Genetic discrimination   | 275        |
| Genetic privacy  | 276        |
| Biobanks   | 277        |
| Property rights in genes   | 278        |
| Genetic modification and gene therapy                            | 279        |
| Conclusion   | 280        |
| <b>D Law and Populations</b>                                     |            |
| <b>Chapter 21 Indigenous Health and the Law</b>                  | <b>282</b> |
| Introduction   | 283        |
| Indigenous health: key indicators                                | 283        |
| Indigenous health and the law: a historical overview             | 285        |
| The 'protective' era   | 286        |
| The assimilation era   | 287        |
| Recognition of citizenship and rights                            | 287        |
| Indigenous health, crime and the criminal process                | 288        |
| Indigenous health and the role of the coroner                    | 289        |
| The NT Intervention  | 290        |
| Analysing the relationship between Indigenous health and the law | 292        |
| Conclusion   | 292        |

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| <b>Chapter 22 Health Law and People with Disability</b>   | <b>293</b> |
| Introduction  | 294        |
| Defining disability in law  | 295        |
| Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities<br>and the National Disability Insurance Scheme | 295        |
| Anti-discrimination laws and social welfare benefits  | 297        |
| Defining ‘disability’ in social policy  | 299        |
| Disability at the beginning of life   | 299        |
| Defining disability for statistical purposes  | 300        |
| The DALY and the ICF  | 301        |
| Defining ‘disability’: contemporary scholarship   | 302        |
| The social model  | 302        |
| Disability studies approaches   | 302        |
| Conclusion  | 304        |
| <b>Chapter 23 Mental Health Law</b>   | <b>305</b> |
| Introduction  | 306        |
| Mental health law: from rights to risk  | 306        |
| Mental health legislation in Australia  | 308        |
| Definition of mental illness  | 308        |
| Mental dysfunction or impairment  | 315        |
| Detention and treatment criteria  | 315        |
| The least restrictive requirement   | 324        |
| Capacity  | 324        |
| Treatment   | 324        |
| Human rights, equality and mental health laws   | 328        |
| The CRPD and mental health law reform   | 330        |
| Conclusion  | 332        |
| <b>Chapter 24 Public Health Law</b>   | <b>333</b> |
| Introduction  | 334        |
| Public health law: sources, scope and principles  | 335        |
| Definitions   | 335        |
| Sources of law  | 336        |
| Scope of law  | 337        |

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| Key principles  | 338        |
| Key institutions                                      | 339        |
| Public health laws: some key examples                 | 341        |
| Assessing the present and future of public health law | 345        |
| The limits of self-regulation                         | 346        |
| The political context                                 | 347        |
| Conclusion  | 348        |
| <b>Chapter 25 Global Health and the Law</b>           | <b>349</b> |
| The emergence of the global health agenda             | 350        |
| World Health Organization                             | 350        |
| Recent global initiatives                             | 352        |
| Global health and the role of law                     | 352        |
| The role of human rights law                          | 353        |
| Infectious diseases                                   | 354        |
| The International Health Regulations: key aspects     | 354        |
| Health security                                       | 356        |
| The IHR and WHO's leadership role                     | 356        |
| Non-communicable diseases (NCDs)                      | 358        |
| Global health and trade agreements                    | 359        |
| Conclusion  | 361        |
| <i>Index</i>  | 362        |