

# HEALTH LAW

## FRAMEWORKS AND CONTEXT

Drawing upon a range of disciplinary perspectives, *Health Law: Frameworks and Context* adopts a theoretically informed and principles-based approach to examining health law.

Appealing to students and academic scholars alike, the text moves beyond traditional medical law frameworks to provide a broader contextual understanding of the way in which law intersects with health.

A clear and accessible style of writing, combined with a sophisticated and nuanced approach, takes this rich and challenging field to a new level of analysis.

Written by respected academics within the field, *Health Law: Frameworks and Context* is essential reading for students and scholars looking to grasp the fundamental concepts of this rapidly expanding area of law, as well as those who wish to deepen their knowledge and understanding of health law in Australia and internationally.

**Anne-Maree Farrell:** Professor and Chair of Health Law and Society, ARC Future Fellow and Director, Centre for Health Law and Society, La Trobe University, Melbourne.

**John Devereux:** Professor of Law, TC Beirne School of Law, University of Queensland.

**Isabel Karpin:** Professor of Law, Faculty of Law, University of Technology Sydney.

**Penelope Weller:** Associate Professor, Graduate School of Business and Law, RMIT University, Melbourne.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-45547-4 — Health Law

Anne-Maree Farrell , John Devereux , Isabel Karpin , Penelope Weller

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

# HEALTH LAW

FRAMEWORKS AND CONTEXT

Anne-Maree Farrell, John Devereux,  
Isabel Karpin & Penelope Weller



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-45547-4 — Health Law  
Anne-Maree Farrell , John Devereux , Isabel Karpin , Penelope Weller  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom  
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryaganj, Delhi – 110002, India  
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781107455474](http://www.cambridge.org/9781107455474)

© Cambridge University Press 2017

This publication is copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

Cover designed by Tanya De Silva-McKay  
Typeset by Integra Software Services Pvt. Ltd.  
Printed in China by C & C Offset Printing Co. Ltd., February 2017

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*A Cataloguing-in-Publication entry is available from the catalogue of the National Library of Australia at [www.nla.gov.au](http://www.nla.gov.au)*

ISBN 978-1-107-45547-4 Paperback

### **Reproduction and communication for educational purposes**

The Australian *Copyright Act 1968* (the Act) allows a maximum of one chapter or 10% of the pages of this work, whichever is the greater, to be reproduced and/or communicated by any educational institution for its educational purposes provided that the educational institution (or the body that administers it) has given a remuneration notice to Copyright Agency Limited (CAL) under the Act.

For details of the CAL licence for educational institutions contact:

Copyright Agency Limited  
Level 15, 233 Castlereagh Street  
Sydney NSW 2000  
Telephone: (02) 9394 7600  
Facsimile: (02) 9394 7601  
E-mail: [info@copyright.com.au](mailto:info@copyright.com.au)

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

*Please be aware that this publication may contain several variations of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander terms and spellings; no disrespect is intended. Please note that the terms 'Indigenous Australians' and 'Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander peoples' may be used interchangeably in this publication.*

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-45547-4 — Health Law

Anne-Maree Farrell , John Devereux , Isabel Karpin , Penelope Weller

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

---

*For Josephine Upton Farrell*

# CONTENTS

<i>List of figures and tables</i>	<i>xix</i>
<i>List of contributors</i>	<i>xx</i>
<i>Preface</i>	<i>xxi</i>
<i>Table of cases</i>	<i>xxiii</i>
<i>Table of statutes</i>	<i>xxxii</i>
<i>List of abbreviations</i>	<i>xlv</i>

## INTRODUCTION

<b>Chapter 1 Health Law: Frameworks and Context</b>	<b>2</b>
Health law	3
Our approach	5
Health law: terminology and remit	5
Frameworks and context	5
Organisation of the book	6

## PART I FRAMEWORKS

### A Theories, Perspectives and Ethics in Health

<b>Chapter 2 Philosophical Bioethics and Health Law</b>	<b>12</b>
Introduction	13
Rights-based approaches	13
Utilitarianism	15
Virtue ethics	17
Feminist approaches to bioethics	19
Autonomy	20
Beneficence	21
Justice	22
How might these three ethical principles work together?	22
Conclusion	23

<b>Chapter 3</b>	<b>Socio-Legal Perspectives on Patient-Doctor Relations</b>	<b>24</b>
	The patient in context	26
	Patient autonomy	27
	A question of power	30
	Good v difficult patients	31
	Information disclosure and the role of law	32
	Conclusion	33
<b>Chapter 4</b>	<b>Social Determinants of Health and the Role of Law</b>	<b>34</b>
	Introduction	35
	Social determinants of health in a legal context: social inequities and equality law	35
	Interaction of law and social determinants of health: some examples	38
	Indigenous health	38
	Women's health	41
	Future children (embryos and fetuses)	43
	Emerging biomedical approaches to social determinants of health	44
	Health in all policies? Advancing social determinants of health policy in Australia	45
	Conclusion	47
<b>Chapter 5</b>	<b>Health and Human Rights Law</b>	<b>48</b>
	Introduction	49
	Human rights law in Australia	50
	Content of the right to health	50
	Minimum or core obligations	54
	Integrating human rights and the social determinants of health	55
	Litigation and the human right to health	58
	Conclusion	60

## B Institutions and Regulation

<b>Chapter 6</b>	<b>The Regulatory Framework for Health in Australia</b>	<b>62</b>
	Introduction	63
	The Australian polity – a brief overview	63
	Constitutional monarchy	64
	Federation	64
	Constitutional limitations	64
	Health powers	65
	<i>Pharmaceutical Benefits Act 1944</i> (Cth): An early attempt to legislate over health matters	65
	A second run at it – <i>Pharmaceutical Benefits Act 1947</i> (Cth)	66
	<i>Health Insurance Act 1973</i> (Cth) – the last hurrah	67
	The impact of vertical fiscal imbalance	67
	The Australian health system	68
	Key aspects of the current health system	69
	Medicare	69
	Hospital care	70
	Prescription pharmaceuticals	70
	Private health insurance	71
	What health matters are governed by the states?	71
	Conclusion	72
<b>Chapter 7</b>	<b>Regulating Health Professionals</b>	<b>73</b>
	Introduction	74
	Impetus for reform	75
	Implementation of the NRAS	76
	Registration of health professionals	78
	Health, performance and conduct matters	78
	NRAS: Advantages	93
	NRAS: Disadvantages	94
	Inadequate and inappropriate administration of the NRAS	94
	Inconsistencies in handling of health, conduct and performance matters	95

	Problems arising from mandatory reporting	95
	Persistence of peer review	96
	Lack of judicial involvement in decision-making about health professionals	97
	The future of the NRAS	97
	Conclusion	99
<b>Chapter 8</b>	<b>Regulating Patient Safety and Redress</b>	<b>100</b>
	Introduction	101
	The governance of safety and quality in healthcare in Australia	101
	Key terms	101
	The role of law	102
	Institutional arrangements	103
	Open disclosure	104
	Australian Charter of Healthcare Rights	105
	Patient safety education	105
	Patient redress	105
	Healthcare complaints process	106
	Civil legal proceedings	108
	The coronial system	108
	The criminal law	109
	Options for reform	110
	Conclusion	111
<b>PART II</b>	<b>CONTEXT</b>	
<b>A</b>	<b>Patients, Doctors and Healthcare</b>	
<b>Chapter 9</b>	<b>Consent to Medical Treatment</b>	<b>116</b>
	Introduction	117
	Consent: general principles	117
	Contractual consent and medical practice	118
	Action in breach of contract	119
	Battery	120
	Defences other than consent	120



Elements of consent	120
Consent must be freely and voluntarily given	120
Consent must relate to the act to be performed	121
Sufficient information must be provided	121
Other circumstances where consent is not valid	122
Competence	123
Children	123
Statutory provision	125
Mental illness, intellectual disability and competency	125
Conclusion	126
<b>Chapter 10 Substituted Decision-Making</b>	<b>127</b>
Introduction	128
Historical overview	128
The ‘best interests’ standard	129
Substituted mechanisms instigated by individuals with capacity	130
Common law advance directives	130
Advance health directives	130
Enduring Power of Attorney	131
Statutorily appointed treatment decision-makers	132
Emergencies	132
Guardianship	132
Substituted decision-making in context	134
The human rights challenge to substituted decision-making	135
Conclusion	137
<b>Chapter 11 Medical Negligence</b>	<b>138</b>
Introduction	139
The basis of negligence	139
First principles	139
Duty of care	140
When does the duty commence?	140
Breach	143
Diagnosis or treatment	143
Examples of errors in diagnosis and treatment	144

Failure to advise of material risks	145
Causation	146
Remoteness	147
Conclusion	148
<b>Chapter 12 Confidentiality, Privacy and Access to Information</b>	<b>149</b>
Introduction	150
The rationale for maintaining confidentiality	150
Sources of confidentiality	151
Ethics	151
Contract	151
Equity	152
Exceptions to the duty of confidence	152
Compulsion by law	153
Privacy and medical information	154
<i>Privacy Act 1988</i> (Cth) and Australian Privacy Principles	156
Definitions	156
Disclosure of health-related information	156
Use of health information	157
Accuracy obligations	157
Security obligations	157
Unauthorised disclosure	157
Access to medical records	158
Access	158
Correction of health records	158
Breaches of the Privacy Act	158
Enforcement of orders	159
eHealth records scheme	159
Conclusion	160
<b>B Law at the Beginning and the End of Life</b>	
<b>Chapter 13 Regulating Reproduction</b>	<b>162</b>
Introduction	163
Overview of ART regulation and embryo research	163

Commonwealth regulation	165
Prohibition on human cloning	165
Requirement for ART clinic accreditation	165
NHMRC ART Guidelines and the ban on non-medical sex selection	166
Some controversial issues in the regulation of ART treatment	167
The presumption against treatment and criminal record checks in Victoria	167
Regulating access to PGD	168
Identifying gamete and embryo donors	171
Storage of embryos	172
Embryo disposal	172
Posthumous conception and implantation	173
Prenatal testing	174
Abortion	176
Surrogacy and parentage	177
Conclusion	178
<b>Chapter 14 Regulating Emerging Reproductive Technologies</b>	<b>180</b>
Introduction	181
Non Invasive Prenatal Testing (NIPT)	181
Mitochondrial donation and inheritable genetic modification	182
Vitrification of human oocytes and the rise of ‘social’ egg freezing	183
Stem cells for research and reproduction	185
Artificial gametes	186
Induced pluripotent stem cells	187
Conclusion	189
<b>Chapter 15 Withdrawal and Withholding of Medical Treatment</b>	<b>190</b>
Introduction	191
The prohibition against murder and assisted suicide	192
End-of-life decisions for those with legal competence	193
End-of-life decisions for those who lack legal competence	195
State and territory laws	196
SA	196
NT	196
Victoria	196

NSW	197
Queensland	197
End-of-life decision-making and children	198
The right to demand treatment in end-of-life care	199
Conclusion	199
<b>Chapter 16 Euthanasia and Assisted Suicide</b>	<b>201</b>
Introduction	202
Australia	203
England	210
Canada	213
Conclusion	214
<b>C Law and the Human Body</b>	
<b>Chapter 17 Organ and Tissue Donation and Transplantation</b>	<b>216</b>
Introduction	217
National policy and institutional arrangements	218
Regulation of organ and tissue donation and transplantation	220
Key definitions	220
Trade and commerce	221
Consent to deceased organ donation	224
Opt-in model	224
Opt-out model (presumed consent)	224
Required choice	225
Family consent	225
Key legislative provisions	226
Diagnosis of death	228
Brain death	228
Donation after circulatory death	230
Coronial jurisdiction	231
Allocation of organs for transplantation from deceased donors	232
Organ suitability criteria	232
Human rights, ethical principles and values	233
Eligibility and allocation criteria	233

Living organ donation	234
Ethical issues	235
Australian position	236
Strategies to increase living organ donation	237
Financial payment and removal of financial disincentives	237
Paired kidney exchange programs	238
Legal position	238
Adults with capacity	239
Adults who lack capacity	240
Children	240
Case law	241
Tissue banks	242
Conclusion	244
<b>Chapter 18 Property and Human Tissue</b>	<b>245</b>
Introduction	246
Key terms	246
No property in the human body	247
Work/skill exception	248
Case law	250
England and Australia	250
United States	252
A property-based approach to human tissue	253
Advantages	253
Disadvantages	254
Legislative position	255
Conclusion	255
<b>Chapter 19 Biobanks</b>	<b>256</b>
Introduction	257
Key definitions	257
Key institutions	258
Principles	258
Governance	259

Ethical, social and legal issues	260
Consent	261
Return of individual or incidental research findings	263
Confidentiality and privacy	264
Property rights	265
Commercialisation	266
Conclusion	268
<b>Chapter 20 Human Genetics and the Law</b>	<b>269</b>
Introduction	270
Historical overview	270
Genetics and race	272
Genetics and regulation	273
Genetic testing	273
Genetic discrimination	275
Genetic privacy	276
Biobanks	277
Property rights in genes	278
Genetic modification and gene therapy	279
Conclusion	280
<b>D Law and Populations</b>	
<b>Chapter 21 Indigenous Health and the Law</b>	<b>282</b>
Introduction	283
Indigenous health: key indicators	283
Indigenous health and the law: a historical overview	285
The 'protective' era	286
The assimilation era	287
Recognition of citizenship and rights	287
Indigenous health, crime and the criminal process	288
Indigenous health and the role of the coroner	289
The NT Intervention	290
Analysing the relationship between Indigenous health and the law	292
Conclusion	292

<b>Chapter 22 Health Law and People with Disability</b>	<b>293</b>
Introduction	294
Defining disability in law	295
Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities and the National Disability Insurance Scheme	295
Anti-discrimination laws and social welfare benefits	297
Defining ‘disability’ in social policy	299
Disability at the beginning of life	299
Defining disability for statistical purposes	300
The DALY and the ICF	301
Defining ‘disability’: contemporary scholarship	302
The social model	302
Disability studies approaches	302
Conclusion	304
<b>Chapter 23 Mental Health Law</b>	<b>305</b>
Introduction	306
Mental health law: from rights to risk	306
Mental health legislation in Australia	308
Definition of mental illness	308
Mental dysfunction or impairment	315
Detention and treatment criteria	315
The least restrictive requirement	324
Capacity	324
Treatment	324
Human rights, equality and mental health laws	328
The CRPD and mental health law reform	330
Conclusion	332
<b>Chapter 24 Public Health Law</b>	<b>333</b>
Introduction	334
Public health law: sources, scope and principles	335
Definitions	335
Sources of law	336
Scope of law	337

Key principles	338
Key institutions	339
Public health laws: some key examples	341
Assessing the present and future of public health law	345
The limits of self-regulation	346
The political context	347
Conclusion	348
<b>Chapter 25 Global Health and the Law</b>	<b>349</b>
The emergence of the global health agenda	350
World Health Organization	350
Recent global initiatives	352
Global health and the role of law	352
The role of human rights law	353
Infectious diseases	354
The International Health Regulations: key aspects	354
Health security	356
The IHR and WHO's leadership role	356
Non-communicable diseases (NCDs)	358
Global health and trade agreements	359
Conclusion	361
<i>Index</i>	362



# FIGURES AND TABLES

<b>Figure 6.1</b>	Health services funding and responsibility	68
<b>Figure 13.1</b>	ART Regulation in Australia	164
<b>Table 7.1</b>	Regulation of health professionals in Australia	80
<b>Table 16.1</b>	International legislation permitting active voluntary euthanasia	204
<b>Table 23.1</b>	Involuntary treatment criteria	309
<b>Table 23.2</b>	Definitions of mental illness	316
<b>Table 23.3</b>	Definitions of treatment	325
<b>Table 24.1</b>	Key public health laws in Australia	342

# CONTRIBUTORS

- Stephen Gray** Senior Lecturer in Law, Monash University (Chapter 21)
- Kate Mulvany** Trial Division Researcher, Supreme Court of Victoria (Chapter 24)
- Justin Oakley** Associate Professor, Centre for Human Bioethics, Monash University (Chapter 2)
- Karen O'Connell** Senior Lecturer in Law, University of Technology Sydney (Chapters 4 and 20, co-authored with Isabel Karpin)
- Gabrielle Wolf** Lecturer in Law, Deakin University (Chapter 7)

# PREFACE

This book explores health in its socio-legal context in Australia and beyond. It critically examines key frameworks and contexts which underpin the relationship between law and health. This is done with a view to better conceptualising this relationship in what is a burgeoning area of national and international academic study and policy interest. As such, it offers a new way forward within legal scholarship in the field, which will be of interest to a range of audiences, including academics, policy-makers, health professionals and students. As we developed this approach, we have been greatly assisted by the insightful feedback we have received on each of the chapters from independent peer reviewers. We would like to thank them for their time and contribution. The policy and law described in this book is current as at 1 January 2017.

Anne-Maree Farrell would like to acknowledge the support of the Australian Research Council (ARC) in relation to Chapters 17, 18 and 19, which draw on research undertaken while in receipt of the ARC Future Fellowship, *Regulating Human Body Parts: Principles Institutions and Politics* (FT130101768). Isabel Karpin would like to acknowledge the support of the ARC in relation to Chapters 4 and 20 (together with Karen O'Connell) and 22, which draw in part on research undertaken for the ARC Discovery Grant, *The Legal Regulation of Behaviour as a Disability* (DP150102935). In relation to Chapter 13, Isabel Karpin would also like to acknowledge such support in relation to the ARC Discovery Grant, *Regulating Relations: Forming Families Inside and Outside Law's Reach* (DP150101057).

The authors would also like to acknowledge the ongoing support provided by Cambridge University Press throughout this project, in particular by Lucy Russell, Senior Academic Commissioning Editor. We very much appreciate the contribution of additional individual chapters by our academic colleagues Stephen Gray, Kate Mulvany, Justin Oakley, Karen O'Connell and Gabrielle Wolf. We are also very grateful for the research and editorial assistance provided by Naomi Burstyner, as well as by Valerie Gutenev-Hale, Sarah McHutchison, Kate Mulvany and Marnie Manning. Finally, we would also like to thank our families for their support and patience throughout the process of writing this book. As always, it is much appreciated.

# TABLE OF CASES

## Australia

- ABY, ABZ v Patient Review Panel* [2011] VCAT 905 168
- Alexander v Heise* [2001] NSWSC 69 145
- Antunovic v Dawson* (2010) 30 VR 355 50
- Attorney-General (Vic); Ex rel Dale v Commonwealth* (1945) 71 CLR 237 65
- Australian Red Cross Society v BC* [1991] VSC 87 (7 March 1991) 154
- Bazley v Wesley Monash IVF Pty Ltd* [2011] 2 Qd R 207 250–1
- BC v Australian Red Cross Society* [1991] VSC 85 (25 February 1991) 153–4
- Berger v Mutton* (unreported, NSW District Court, Twigg DCJ, 22 November 1994) 146
- Breen v Williams* (1996) 186 CLR 71 118, 119, 154–5
- Brightwater Care Group v Rossiter* (2009) 40 WAR 84 28, 130, 193, 194
- Briginsbaw v Briginsbaw* (1938) 60 CLR 336 77
- BT v Oei* [1999] NSWSC 1082 142
- Burgess v Director of Housing* [2014] VSC 648 50
- Bustos v Hair Transplant Pty Ltd and Peter Wearne* (unreported, NSW District Court, 20 December 1994) 146
- Castles v Secretary of the Department of Justice* (2010) 28 VR 141 50
- Cattanach v Melchior* (2003) 215 CLR 1 118, 147
- CES v Superclinics v Superclinics (Australia) Pty Ltd* (1995) 38 NSWLR 47 177
- Chapman v Hearse* (1961) 106 CLR 112 148
- Chappel v Hart* (1998) 195 CLR 232 32, 147
- Cole v South Tweed Heads Rugby League Football Club Ltd* (2004) 217 CLR 469 336
- D v S* (1981) 93 LS (SA) JS 405 123
- D'Arcy v Myriad Genetics Inc* (2014) 224 FCR 479 279
- D'Arcy v Myriad Genetics Inc* (2015) 325 ALR 100 279
- Dean v Pbung* [2012] NSWCA 223 122
- Dekker v Medical Board of Australia* [2014] WASCA 216 141–2
- Dobler v Halverson* (2007) 70 NSWLR 151 144
- Doodeward v Spence* (1908) 6 CLR 406 248–9
- DPP v Riordan* (unreported, Victorian Supreme Court, Cummins J, 20 November 1998) 208
- DPP v Rolfe* (2008) 191 A Crim R 213 208
- Federal Council of the British Medical Association in Australia v Commonwealth* (1949) 79 CLR 201 66–7
- FI v Public Guardian* [2008] NSWADT 197
- Fleming v Reid* (1991) 4 OR (3d) 74 194
- Flinders Medical Centre v Waller* (2005) 91 SASR 378 145

- Geissman v O'Keefe* (unreported, Supreme Court of New South Wales, Simpson J, 25 November 1994) **143, 144**
- General Practitioner Society in Australia v Commonwealth* (1980) 145 CLR 532 **67**
- Gett v Tabet* [2009] NSWCA 76 **139–40**
- Giurelli v Girgis* (1980) 24 SASR 264 **144**
- H Ltd v J* (2010) 107 SASR 352 **123, 193, 194–5**
- Hancock v Queensland* [2002] QSC 27 **145**
- Hargrave v Goldman* (1963) 110 CLR 40 **140**
- Harriton v Stephens* (2006) 226 CLR 52 **147**
- Harvey v PD* (2004) 59 NSWLR 639 **142**
- Hawkins v Van Heerden* (2014) 240 A Crim R 364 **336**
- Healing (Sales) Pty Ltd v Inglis Electrix* (1968) 121 CLR 584 **247**
- Hocking v Bell* (1947) 75 CLR 125 **145**
- Hoffman v Medical Board of Australia* [2012] WASAT 110 **141**
- Hunter and New England Area Health Service v A* (2009) 74 NSWLR 88 **123, 130, 191, 193, 194, 195**
- Ingram v QBE Insurance (Australia) Ltd* [2015] VCAT 1936 **59**
- Justice Health, Application of; Re a Patient* (2011) 80 NSWLR 354 **197**
- John Stuart Godfrey* (unreported, Tasmanian Supreme Court, Underwood J, 26 May 2004) **208**
- JS and LS v Patient Review Panel* [2011] VCAT 856 **166–7**
- JT International SA v Commonwealth of Australia* (2012) 291 ALR 669 **340**
- Justins v The Queen* (2010) 79 NSWLR 544 **208**
- Kite v Malycha* (1988) 71 SASR 321 **145**
- Korp v Deputy State Coroner* [2006] VSC 282 **196**
- Kosky v Trustees of the Sisters of Charity* [1982] VR 961 **142**
- Kracke v Mental Health Review Board* (2009) 29 VAR 1 **50**
- Kryommydas v Sydney West Area Health Service* [2006] NSWSC 901 **229**
- Lergesner v Carroll* [1991] 1 Qd R 206 **122**
- Lloyd v Osborne* (1899) 15 WN (NSW) 267 **247**
- Lowns v Woods* (1996) Aust Torts Reports 81–376 **141**
- Mabo v Queensland (No 2)* (1992) 175 CLR 1 **285**
- March v E & MH Stramere Pty Ltd* (1991) 171 CLR 506 **146**
- Markaboui v Western Sydney Area Health Service* [2005] NSWSC 649 **144**
- McBain v Victoria* (2000) 99 FCR 116 **37**
- McCabe v British American Tobacco Australia Services Ltd* [2002] VSC 73 **336**
- McCann v Buck* [2000] WADC 81 **143**
- Medical Board of Australia v Al-Naser* [2015] ACAT 15 **77**
- Medical Board of Australia v Dieu* [2014] VCAT 1597 **77**
- Medical Board of Australia v Forrest* [2014] NTHPRT 1 **77**
- Melchior v Cattanach* (2001) 217 ALR 640 **118**
- Mense and Ampere Electrical Manufacturing Co Pty Ltd v Milenkovic* [1973] VR 784 **152**
- Messiba v South East Health* [2004] NSWSC 1061 **28, 197**
- Mulligan v National Disability Insurance Agency* (2015) 146 ALD 418 **296**

- Northern Sydney and Central Coast Area Health Service v CT* [2005] NSWSC 551 **241**
- Northbridge v Central Sydney Area Health Service* (2000) 50 NSWLR 549 **197**
- O'Shea v Sullivan and Macquarie Pathological Services* (1994) Aust Torts Report 81–273 **145**
- Papadimitropoulos v The Queen* (1957) 98 CLR 249 **122**
- Pape v Federal Commissioner of Taxation* (2009) 238 CLR 1 **65–6**
- Patel v The Queen* (2012) 247 CLR 531 **75**
- Patient Review Panel v ABY and ABZ* [2012] 37 VR 634 **168**
- Penfolds Wines Pty Ltd v Elliott* (1946) 74 CLR **247**
- PJB v Melbourne Health* (2011) 39 VR 373 **50, 129**
- Proudfoot v Australian Capital Territory Board of Health* (1992) EOC 92–417 **37, 43**
- Public Advocate v RCS (Guardianship)* [2004] VCAT 1880 **196**
- Qumsieh v Guardianship and Administration Board* [1998] VSCA 45 **121**
- R v Ann Leith* (unreported, Melbourne Magistrates Court, Lesser J, 15 April 2010) **208**
- R v Bayliss & Cullen* (1986) 9 Qld Lawyer Reps 8 **177**
- R v Catherine Anne Pryor* (unreported, Tasmanian Supreme Court, Hill AJ, 19 January 2005) **208**
- R v Fred Thompson* (unreported, NSW Magistrates Court, Railton J, 25 January 2005) **208**
- R v Hood* (2002) 130 A Crim R 473 **208**
- R v Justins* [2008] NSWSC 1194 **208**
- R v Justins* [2011] NSWSC 568 **208**
- R v Marden* [2000] VSC 558 **208**
- R v Mathers* [2011] NSWSC 339 **208**
- R v Maxwell* [2003] VSC **208**
- R v Nicol* [2005] NSWSC 547 **208**
- R v Nielsen* [2012] QSC 29 **208**
- R v Patel* [2010] QSC 199 **75**
- R v Patel* [2013] QDC Martin SC DCJ 21/11/2013 **75**
- R v Raabe* [1985] 1 Qd R 115 **122**
- R v Reeves* [2011] Woods QC DCJ 1/7/2011 **75**
- R v Victor Rijn* (unreported, Melbourne Magistrates Court, Letherbridge J, 23 May 2011) **208**
- R v Wald* (1971) 3 DCR (NSW) 25 **177**
- Re Alex* (2009) 248 FLR 312 **125, 198**
- Re Alex (hormonal treatment for gender dysphoria)* (2004) 31 Fam LR 503 **125**
- Re BWV; Ex parte Gardner* (2003) 7 VR 487 **196**
- Re Edwards* (2011) 81 NSWLR 198 **251, 252**
- Re GWW and CMW* (1997) FLC 92–478 **242**
- Re H, AE (No 2)* [2012] SASC 177 **251**
- Re H, AE (No 3)* (2013) 118 SASR 259 **251**
- Re HG* [2006] QGAAT 26 **198**
- Re Inaya (Special Medical Procedure)* (2007) 38 Fam LR 546 **242**
- Re JS* [2014] NSWSC 302 **194**
- Re McBain* (2002) 209 CLR 372 **37**

- Reeves v The Queen* (2013) 227 A Crim R 444 75  
*Roblin v Public Trustee for the Australian Capital Territory* (2015) 10 ACTLR 300 251  
*Roche v Douglas* (2000) 22 WAR 331 249  
*Rogers v Whitaker* (1992) 175 CLR 479 27, 32, 33, 122, 130, 140, 143, 146, 155, 193, 194  
*Rosenberg v Percival* (2001) 205 CLR 434 32, 144  
*S v South Eastern Sydney and Illawarra Area Health Service* [2010] NSWSC 178 307, 324  
*Secretary, Department of Health and Community Services v JWB and SMB* (1992) 175 CLR 218 27, 124–5, 130, 191, 194, 198  
*Shaw v Thomas* [2010] NSWCA 169 144  
*Slaveski v Austin Health* (2010) 32 VR 129 196–7  
*South Australia v Commonwealth* (1942) 65 CLR 373 67  
*Sullivan v Moody* (2001) 207 CLR 562 143  
*Tai v Hatzistavrou* [1999] NSWCA 306 145  
*Thomson v Davison* [1975] Qd R 93 142  
*Wake v Northern Territory* (1996) 109 NTR 1 209  
*Wallace v Kam* (2013) 250 CLR 375 32, 148  
*Wang v Central Sydney Area Health Service* (2000) Aust Tort Reports 81-574 145  
*Wighton v Arnot* [2005] NSWSC 637 145  
*Williams v Commonwealth* (2012) 248 CLR 156 66  
*WK v Public Guardian* (No. 2) [2006] NSWADT 121 197  
*Wong v Commonwealth* (2009) 236 CLR 573 67  
*Wood v Queensland Medical Laboratories* (unreported, Supreme Court of Queensland, Cullinane J, 16 December 1994) 145  
*X v Sydney Children's Hospitals Network* [2013] NSWCA 320 198  
*X v Sydney Children's Hospitals Network* [2014] HCASL 97 198

## Canada

- Beausoleil v The Sisters of Charity* (1964) 53 DLR (2d) 65 120  
*Carter v Canada (Attorney-General)* (2012) 287 CCC (3d) 1 213  
*Carter v Canada (Attorney-General)* [2013] BCCA 435 213  
*Carter v Canada (Attorney-General)* [2015] 1 SCR 331 214  
*Chasney v Anderson* (1950) 4 DLR 223 145  
*Coughlan v Kuntz* [1990] 2 WWR 737 123  
*Cuthbertson v Rasouli* [2013] 3 SCR 341 196  
*Kelly v Hazlett* (1976) 15 OR (2d) 290 123  
*Malette v Shulman* (1990) 67 DLR (4th) 321 121, 132, 194, 195  
*Marshall v Curry* (1933) 3 DLR 260 121  
*Murray v McMurchy* [1949] 2 DLR 442 120, 121  
*Nancy B v Hotel de Québec* (1992) 86 DLR (4th) 385 194  
*Norberg v Wynrib* (1992) 92 DLR (4th) 449 155  
*R v Maurantonia* [1967] 65 DLR (2d) 674 122  
*Reibl v Hughes* [1980] 2 SCR 880 194  
*Rodriguez v British Columbia (Attorney-General)* [1993] 3 SCR 519 213  
*Schweizer v Central Hospital* (1974) 53 DLR (3d) 494 121

## Colombia

Constitutional Court of Colombia Judgment T-760/08, 31 July 2008 58

## Europe

*ABC v Ireland* App. No. 25579/05 59  
*AK v Latvia* App. No. 33011/08 59  
*Belashev v Russia; Branduse v Romania* App. No. 6586/03 59  
*Elefteriadis v Romania* App. 38427/05 59  
*Fyodorov and Fyodorova v Ukraine* App. No. 39229/03 59  
*Gladkiy v Russia* App. No. 3242/03 59  
*Gross v Switzerland* (2014) 58 EHRR 7 212  
*Haas v Switzerland* (2011) 53 EHRR 33 212  
*Hajol v Poland* App No. 1127/06 59  
*Jalloh v Germany* App No. 54810/00 59  
*KH v Slovakia* App. No. 32881/04 59  
*Kharchenko v Ukraine* App. No. 40107/02 59  
*Khudobin v Russia* App No. 59696/00 59  
*Kiyutin v Russia* App. No. 2700/10 59  
*Koch v Germany* (2013) 56 EHRR 6 212  
*L v Lithuania* App. No. 27527/03 59  
*LH v Latvia* App. No. 52019/07 59  
*Mechenkov v Russia* App. No. 35421/05 59  
*MSS v Belgium and Greece*. App. No. 30696/09 59  
*Munjaz v United Kingdom* App. No. 2913/06 59  
*NB v Slovakia* App. No. 29518/10 59  
*Nicklinson and Lamb v United Kingdom* Apps 2478/15 and 1787/15 212  
*Pretty v United Kingdom* (2002) 35 EHRR 1 210, 211  
*RR v Poland* App. No. 27617/04 59  
*Salakhov and Islyamova v Ukraine* (2013) App. No. 28005/08 59  
*Shelly v United Kingdom* App No. 23800/06 59  
*Shtukaturov v Russia* App. No. 44009/05 59  
*Slawomir Muial v Poland* App. No. 28300/06 59  
*Stanev v Bulgaria* App. No. 36760/06 59  
*Sykora v Czech Republic* App. No. 23419/07 59  
*Testa v Croatia* App. No. 20877/04 59  
*Tysiac v Poland* (2007) 45 EHRR 42 59, 199  
*VC v Slovakia* App. No. 18968/07 59

## India

*Francis Coralie Mullin v Union Territory of Delhi* (1981) AIR 1981 SC 746 58  
*Pascim Banga Khet Mazdoor Samity v State of West Bengal* (1966) AIR SC 2426/(1996) 4  
 SCC 37 58  
*Rakesh Chandra Narayan v Union of India* (1989) AIR 1989 SC 148 58  
*State of Punjab v Mohinder Singh Chawla* (1997) 2 SCC 83 58



## New Zealand

*Auckland Area Health Board v Attorney-General* [1993] 1 NZLR 235 194  
*Duncan v Medical Practitioners Disciplinary Committee* [1986] 1 NZLR 513 153  
*Furniss v Fitchett* [1958] NZLR 396 151

## United Kingdom

*Abmad v Secretary of State for the Home Department* [2015] 1 All ER 953 58  
*Airedale NHS Trust v Bland* [1993] AC 789 129, 191, 192, 193, 194, 229  
*B v NHS Trust* [2002] EWHC 429 194  
*B(RB) v B(J)* [1968] P 466 123  
*Bailiffs of Dunwich v Sterry* (1831) 109 ER 995 247  
*Banbury v Bank of Montreal* [1918] AC 626 119  
*Barker v Furlong* (1891) 2 Ch 172 247  
*Barnett v Chelsea and Kensington Hospital Management Committee* [1968] 2 WLR 422 146  
*Bolam v Friern Barnet Hospital Management Committee* [1957] 1 WLR 582 143  
*Chatterton v Gerson* [1981] QB 432 121, 122  
*Chester v Afshar* [2005] 1 AC 134 27  
*Chin Keow v Government of Malaysia* [1967] 1 WLR 813 144  
*Coco v AN Clark (Engineers) Ltd* [1969] RPC 41 152  
*Coggs v Bernard* (1703) 92 ER 107 119  
*Cole v Turner* (1704) 87 ER 907 120  
*Dobson v North Tyneside Health Authority* [1996] 4 All ER 474 249  
*Donoghue v Stevenson* [1932] AC 562 140  
*Evans v Mayor of Liverpool* [1906] 1 KB 160 142  
*Exelby v Handyside* (1749) 2 East PC 652 248  
*Eyre v Measday* [1986] 1 All ER 488 119  
*Freeman v Home Office (No 2)* [1984] QB 524 120  
*Gillick v West Norfolk and Wisbech Area Health Authority* [1986] AC 112 124  
*Greaves & Co (Constructions) Ltd v Baynbam Meikle & Partners* [1975] 1 WLR 1095 119  
*Hayne's case* (1614) 12 Co Rep 113 248  
*HE v A Hospital NHS Trust* [2003] EWHC 1017 195  
*Hunter v Mann* [1974] QB 767 153  
*Lindsey County Council v Marshall* [1937] AC 97 142  
*Mabon v Osborne* [1939] 2 KB 14 145  
*Montgomery v Lanarkshire Health Board* [2015] UKSC 11 27, 146  
*Ms B v An NHS Hospital Trust* (2002) 2 FCR 1 193  
*North West Lancashire Health Authority v A* [1999] EWCA Civ 2022 59  
*Overseas Tankship (UK) Ltd v Morts Dock & Engineering Co Ltd* [1961] AC 388 147  
*Paris v Stepney Borough Council* [1951] AC 367 144  
*Pharmaceutical Society of Great Britain v Boots Cash Chemists (Southern) Ltd* [1953] 1 QB 401 118  
*Potts v North West Regional Health Authority*, (unreported, *The Guardian*, 23 July 1983) 122

- Powell v McFarlane* (1979) 38 P & CR 452 **246**
- R (A) (a child) v Secretary of State for Health* [2015] EWCA Civ 771 **58**
- R (Axon) v Secretary of State for Health* [2006] EWCA 37 **124**
- R (Burke) v General Medical Council* [2004] EWHC 1879 (Admin) **199**
- R (Burke) v General Medical Council* [2005] EWCA Civ 1003 **28, 199**
- R (Nicklinson) v A Primary Care Trust* [2013] EWCA Civ 961 **194**
- R (Nicklinson) v Ministry of Justice* [2012] EWHC 2381 (Admin) **211, 212, 213**
- R (Nicklinson) v Ministry of Justice* [2014] UKSC 38 **211–12**
- R (Pretty) v Director of Public Prosecutions* (2001) 1 AC 800 **210**
- R (Pretty) v Director of Public Prosecutions* [2001] EWHC Admin 788 **210**
- R (Purdy) v Department of Public Prosecutions* [2010] 1 AC 34 **211**
- R (Purdy) v Director of Public Prosecutions* [2008] EWHC 2565 (Admin) **211**
- R (YA) v Secretary of State for Health* [2009] EWCA Civ 225 **58**
- R v Brown* [1993] 2 All ER 75 **238**
- R v Coney* (1882) 8 QBD 534 **238**
- R v Kelly and Lindsay* [1999] QB 621 **249**
- R v Malcherek; R v Steel* [1981] 2 All ER 422 **229**
- R v Mental Health Act Commission; Ex parte X* (1991) 9 BMLR 77 **122, 123**
- R v Naveed Tabassum* [2000] 2 Cr App R 328 **122**
- R v Richardson* (1998) 2 Cr App R 200 **122**
- R v Williams* [1923] 1 KB 430 **122**
- Re A (Medical Treatment: Male Sterilisation)* [2000] 1 FCR 193 **129**
- Re A* [1992] 3 Med LR 303 **229**
- Re Baby D (No 2)* (2011) 258 FLR 290 **125, 198**
- Re C (adult: refusal of medical treatment)* [1994] 1 All ER 819 **123, 130, 331**
- Re C* [1994] 1 WLR 290 **194**
- Re F (Mental Patient: Sterilisation)* [1990] 2 AC 1 **120, 132, 193**
- Re MB* [1997] 2 FCR 541 **193, 194, 196**
- Re MB* [1997] EWCA Civ 1361 **123**
- Re R (a minor) (wardship: consent to treatment)* [1992] Fam 11 **124**
- Re T (adult: refusal of medical treatment)* [1992] EWCA Civ 18 **130**
- Re T (adult: refusal of medical treatment)* [1993] Fam 95 **27, 117, 121, 123, 194**
- Re W (a minor) (medical treatment: courts jurisdiction)* [1993] Fam 64 **124**
- Roe v Minister of Health* [1954] 2 QB 66 **143**
- Sidaway v Board of Governors of Bethlem Royal Hospital* [1985] AC 871 **118**
- Stokes v Guest, Keen and Nettlefold (Bolts and Nuts) Ltd* [1968] 1 WLR 1776 **142**
- Thake v Maurice* [1986] 1 All ER 497 **119**
- Tharpe v Stallwood* (1843) 5 Man and G 760 **247**
- W v Egdell* [1990] Ch 359 **152–3**
- Wilsber v Essex Area Health Authority* [1988] AC 1074 **143**
- X Health Authority v Y* [1988] RPC 379 **153**
- Yearworth v North Bristol NHS Trust* [2010] QB 1 **249–50, 251, 252**

**United States of America**

- Association for Molecular Pathology v Myriad Genetics Inc*, 133 S Ct 2017 (2013) **279**
- Baxter v Montana* 2009 MT 449 **206**
- Bowia v Superior Court of Los Angeles County*, 179 Cal App 3d 1127 (1986) **194**
- Burlington Northern and Santa Fe Railway Co v Sheila White*, 126 S Ct 2405 (2006) **276**
- Bush v Schiavo*, 885 So 2d 321 (2004) **191**
- Cruzan v Director, Missouri Department of Health*, 497 US 261 (1990) **195**
- Greenberg v Miami Children's Hospital Research Institute Inc*, 264 F Supp 2d 1064 (2003) **253, 278**
- Guardianship of Doe*, 583 NE 2d 1263 (1992) **193**
- Matter of Conroy*, 486 A 2d 1209 (1985) **193**
- McConnell v Beverly Enterprises-Connecticut*, 533 A 2d 596 (1989) **193**
- McKay v Bergstedt*, 801 P 2d 617 (1990) **193**
- Moore v Regents of the University of California*, 793 P 2d 479 (1990) **187, 252, 278**
- National Federation of Independent Businesses v Sebelius, Secretary of Health and Human Services*, 132 S Ct 2566 (2012) **58**
- Pelman v McDonald's Corporation*, 237 F Supp 2d 512 (2003) **336**
- Re Quinlan*, 355 A 2d 647 (1976) **191**
- Schloendorff v Society of New York Hospital*, 105 NE 92 (1914) **123, 193**
- Sutton v United Airlines Inc*, 527 US 471 (1999) **299**
- Tarasoff v Regents of the University of California*, 17 Cal 3d 425 (1976) **152**
- Washington University v Catalona*, 490 F 3d 667 (2007) **253, 278**

# TABLE OF STATUTES

## Commonwealth of Australia

*Aboriginal Land Rights Act 1975* 287

*Australian Citizenship Act 2007* 178

*Australian Organ and Tissue Donation  
and Transplantation Authority Act  
2008* 219

*Competition and Consumer Act 2010*

sch 2 108

sch 2 ch 1 s 7 108

sch 2 ch 3 pt 3.2 div 1 108

sch 2 ch 3 s 9 108

*Constitution*

s 51 65

s 51(i) 163

s 51(ii) 345

s 51(ix) 65, 345

s 51(xiv) 65

s 51(xx) 163

s 51(xxiii) 65

s 51(xxiiiA) 66

s 51(xxix) 163

s 61 66

s 81 65, 66

s 96 67

s 109 242

s 128 65

*Criminal Code Act 1995*

div 270 248

*Disability Discrimination Act 1992*

s 4 297–8

s 4(1) 275

s 41(1)(g) 276

s 46(1)(f) 276

*Euthanasia Laws Act 1997* 209

*Family Law Act 1975* 242

s 60CA 198

s 64B(2)(i) 198

s 67ZC 198

*Family Law Act Regulations 1984*

reg 21D 274

*Health Insurance Act 1973* 67

s 10 69

s 10AA 69

s 11 70

s 19A 70

s 66 70

sch 1 70

sch 1A 70

*Healthcare Identifiers Act 2010* 159

Medical Services (Dying with Dignity) Bill  
2014 209

*Medicare Levy Act 1986* 71

*National Disability Insurance Scheme Act  
2013* 295–7, 300

s 24 296

s 24(1)(c) 296

ss 18–20 296

ss 21–25 296

*National Health Act 1953*

pt VII 70

*National Health Reform Act 2011*

ch 2 103

*National Health Security Act*

2007 354

pt 2 div 2 s 7 354

pt 2 div 5 s 11 354

*Northern Territory National Emergency  
Response Act 2007*

pt 3 291

pt 4 291

pt 7 291

*Patents Act 1990*

s 18(1) 279

s 18(1A) 279

s 18(2) 279

- Personally Controlled Electronic Health  
 Records Act 2012*  
 pt 2 159  
 s 13A 159
- Pharmaceutical Benefits Act 1944* 65–6  
*Pharmaceutical Benefits Act 1947* 66–7
- Plain Packaging Legislation Act  
 2011* 358
- Privacy Act 1988* 156–9, 277  
 s 6(1) 156  
 s 13G 159  
 s 16B 156  
 s 16B(4) 277  
 s 36 158  
 s 40 158  
 s 40A 158  
 s 44 158  
 s 46 158  
 s 55A 159  
 s 65 158
- Private Health Insurance Act 2007* 71  
 div 23 71  
 div 34 71  
 div 55 71  
 pt 4–4 71
- Private Health Insurance (Prudential  
 Supervision) Act 2015* 71
- Prohibition of Human Cloning Act  
 2002* 165
- Prohibition of Human Cloning for  
 Reproduction Act 2002* 163, 165, 185  
 s 9 165, 183  
 s 13 183  
 s 14 185  
 s 15 165, 186  
 s 17 165  
 s 18 165  
 s 20(3) 188  
 s 20(4) 188  
 s 20(4)(f) 186, 188  
 s 22 185, 188
- Racial Discrimination Act 1975* 291
- Research Involving Human Embryos Act  
 2002* 163, 165, 185  
 s 8 188
- s 9 166  
 s 10 165, 273  
 s 11 165, 273  
 s 19(3) 185  
 s 20 188
- Sex Discrimination Act 1984* 37  
 s 22 37
- Social Security and Other Legislation  
 Amendment (Welfare Reform  
 and Reinstatement of Racial  
 Discrimination Act) Act 2010* 291
- Stronger Futures in the Northern Territory  
 Act 2012* 291
- Therapeutic Goods Act 1989* 243, 273–4  
*Therapeutic Goods (Medical Devices)  
 Regulations 2002*  
 sch 2A 274
- Tobacco Plain Packaging Act 2011* 340
- Australian Capital Territory**
- Births, Deaths and Marriages Registration  
 Act 1997*  
 ss 33–5 154
- Children and Young People Act 2008*  
 s 356 154
- Coroners Act 1997*  
 s 13(1)(c) 108  
 s 13(1)(d) 108  
 s 13(4) 108  
 s 77 154, 231
- Crimes Act 1900*  
 s 16 202  
 s 17 193, 203  
 ss 12(1)(a)–(b) 203
- Freedom of Information Act 1989* 158
- Guardianship and Management of  
 Property Act 1991* 195  
 s 69 240  
 s 70 240
- Health Act 1993* 176  
 s 10 177  
 ss 80–3 177
- Health Practitioner Regulation National  
 Law (ACT) Act 2010* 76, 95

<i>Health Records (Privacy and Access) Act</i>	s 8 239
1997 156, 158	s 9 239
<i>Human Cloning and Embryo Research Act</i>	s 9(5) 240
2004 163	s 10 239
<i>Human Rights Act 2004</i> 4	s 13(1) 241
s 10 50	s 13(2) 241
s 13 50	s 14(1) 240
<i>Human Rights Commission Act 2005</i> 76,	s 14(3) 240
106	s 14(4) 240
<i>Medical Treatment (Health Directions) Act</i>	s 14(6) 240
2006 195	s 16A 240
pt 2 195	s 24 241
pt 3 195	s 25(1) 241
s 19 131	s 27(1) 226, 227
s 139 131	s 27(2) 227
<i>Mental Health Act 2015</i> 308	s 27(4) 227
s 5(c) 324	s 28 227
s 10 316	s 28(3) 227
s 11 316	s 44(1) 222
s 58(2) 309	s 44(2) 222
s 58(2)(a) 308	s 44(3) 222
s 58(2)(c) 315	s 44(4) 222
s 66(2) 309	s 45 228
ss 19–23 331	ss 20–3 221
<i>Parentage Act 2004</i> 164	<i>Dictionary</i> 220, 221, 228
s 8 178	
s 28 178	
s 41 177	
<i>Powers of Attorney Act 2006</i> 195	
s 6 131	
s 13 130	
s 37 131, 132	
ss 12–14 131	
<i>Public Health Act 1997</i> 341	
pt 6 154	
<i>Radiation Protection Regulation 2007</i>	
reg 5 345	
<i>Road Transport (Alcohol and Drugs) Act</i>	
1977	
div 2.2 154	
div 2.5 154	
div 2.7 154	
<i>Transplantation and Anatomy Act 1978</i>	
s 2 220	
s 6 220	

## New South Wales

*Assisted Reproductive Technology Act*  
 2007 164

s 15 175

s 23 173

s 37 171

ss 32–41M 171

*Birth, Deaths and Marriages Registration*  
*Act 1995*

s 39 154

*Civil Liability Act 2002*

s 5D(1)(a) 147

s 5D(1)(b) 148

s 5D(2) 147

s 5D(3) 147

s 5D(3)(b) 32

s 5D(4) 148

s 5E 144