#### **Cause and Correlation in Biology**

A User's Guide to Path Analysis, Structural Equations and Causal Inference with R

Second Edition

Many problems in biology require an understanding of the relationships among variables in a multivariate causal context. Exploring such cause–effect relationships through a series of statistical methods, this book explains how to test causal hypotheses when randomised experiments cannot be performed.

This completely revised and updated edition features detailed explanations for carrying out statistical methods using the popular, and freely available, R statistical language. Sections on d-sep tests, latent constructs that are common in biology, missing values, phylogenetic constraints and multilevel models are also an important feature of this new edition.

Written for biologists and using a minimum of statistical jargon, the concept of testing multivariate causal hypotheses using structural equations and path analysis is demystified. Assuming only a basic understanding of statistical analysis, this new edition is a valuable resource for students and practising biologists alike.

**Bill Shipley** is a Professor in the Department of Biology at Université de Sherbrooke, Canada. His research interests centre upon plant ecophysiology, functional and community ecology and statistical modelling. He is the author of *From Plant Traits to Vegetation Structure: Chance and Selection in the Assembly of Ecological Communities*, published by Cambridge University Press.

# Cause and Correlation in Biology

A User's Guide to Path Analysis, Structural Equations and Causal Inference with R

Second Edition

BILL SHIPLEY Université de Sherbrooke, Canada





University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107442597

© Cambridge University Press 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2000 Second edition 2016

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

ISBN 978-1-107-44259-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

À ma petite Rhinanthe toujours aussi belle, à David et à Élyse.

1

2

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-44259-7 - Cause and Correlation in Biology: A User's Guide to Path Analysis, Structural Equations and Causal Inference with R: Second Edition Bill Shipley Frontmatter More information

## Contents

Prefe	ace	<i>page</i> xi
Prefe	ace to the second edition	xiii
Preli	minaries	1
1.1	The shadow's cause	1
1.2	Fisher's genius and the randomised experiment	5
1.3	The controlled experiment	11
1.4	Physical controls and observational controls	13
From	a cause to correlation and back	17
2.1	Translating from causal to statistical models	17
2.2	Directed graphs	20
2.3	Causal conditioning	23
2.4	D-separation	23
2.5	Probability distributions	27
2.6	Probabilistic (conditional) independence	29
2.7	The Markov condition	31
2.8	The translation from causal models to observational models	32
2.9	Counter-intuitive consequences and limitations of d-separation:	
	conditioning on a causal child	33
2.10	Counter-intuitive consequences and limitations of d-separation:	
	conditioning due to selection bias	36
2.11	Counter-intuitive consequences and limitations of d-separation: feedback	
	loops and cyclic causal graphs	36
2.12	Counter-intuitive consequences and limitations of d-separation: imposed	
	conservation relationships	38
2.13	Counter-intuitive consequences and limitations of d-separation:	
	unfaithfulness	39
2.14	Counter-intuitive consequences and limitations of d-separation:	
	context-sensitive independence	41
	The logic of causal inference	42
2.16	Statistical control is not always the same as physical control	47
2.17	A taste of things to come	54

viii	Conte	ents			
3	Sewall Wright, path analysis and d-separation				
	3.1	A bit of history	56		
	3.2	Why Wright's method of path analysis was ignored	57		
	3.3	D-sep tests	60		
	3.4	Independence of d-separation statements	61		
	3.5	Testing for probabilistic independence	63		
	3.6	Permutation tests of independence	68		
	3.7	Form-free regression	69		
	3.8	Conditional independence	71		
	3.9	Spearman partial correlations	74		
	3.10	Seed production in St Lucie cherry	78		
	3.11	Generalising the d-sep test	81		
4	Path	analysis and maximum likelihood	87		
	4.1	Testing path models using maximum likelihood	89		
	4.2	Decomposing effects in path diagrams	105		
	4.3	Multiple regression expressed as a path model	109		
	4.4	Maximum-likelihood estimation of the gas exchange model	111		
	4.5	Using lavaan to fit path models	114		
5	Measurement error and latent variables				
	5.1	Measurement error and the inferential tests	127		
	5.2	Measurement error and the estimation of path coefficients	130		
	5.3	A measurement model	131		
	5.4	Fitting a measurement model in lavaan	140		
	5.5	The nature of latent variables	142		
	5.6	Horn dimensions in bighorn sheep	146		
	5.7	Body size in bighorn sheep	147		
	5.8	The worldwide leaf economic spectrum	149		
	5.9	Name calling	151		
6	The s	structural equation model	153		
-	6.1	Parameter identification	154		
	6.2	Structural under-identification with measurement models	155		
	6.3	Structural under-identification with structural models	159		
	6.4	Representing composite variables using latents	163		
	6.5	Behaviour of the maximum-likelihood chi-square statistic with small			
		sample sizes	165		
	6.6	Behaviour of the maximum-likelihood chi-square statistic with data that			
	010	do not follow a multivariate normal distribution	169		
	6.7	Solutions for modelling non-normally distributed variables	175		
	6.8	Alternative measures of 'approximate' fit	177		
	6.9	Bentler's comparative fit index (CFI)	180		
		Approximate fit measured by the root mean square error of approximation	100		
	0.10	(RMSEA)	182		

		Contents	ix		
	6.11	Missing data	183		
	6.12	Reporting results in publications	184		
	6.13	An SEM analysis of the Bumpus house sparrow data	185		
7	Multigroup models, multilevel models and corrections for the non-independence of observations				
		Nested models	188 189		
		Dealing with causal heterogeneity: multigroup models	190		
	7.2	The dangers of hierarchically structured data	200		
	7.3	Multilevel SEM	210		
8	Explo	pration, discovery and equivalence	221		
	8.1	Hypothesis generation	221		
	8.2	Exploring hypothesis space	222		
	8.3	The shadow's cause revisited	224		
	8.4	Obtaining the undirected dependency graph	226		
	8.5	The undirected dependency graph algorithm	228		
	8.6	Interpreting the undirected dependency graph	231		
	8.7	Orienting edges in the undirected dependency graph using unshielded			
		colliders assuming an acyclic causal structure	234		
	8.8	The orientation algorithm using unshielded colliders	236		
	8.9	Orienting edges in the undirected dependency graph using definite			
		discriminating paths	239		
	8.10	The causal inference algorithm	241		
	8.11	Equivalent models	242		
	8.12	Detecting latent variables	243		
	8.13	Vanishing tetrad algorithm	247		
	8.14	Separating the message from the noise	248		
	8.15	The causal inference algorithm and sampling error	252		
	8.16	The vanishing tetrad algorithm and sampling variation	257		
	8.17	Empirical examples	258		
	8.18	Orienting edges in the undirected dependency graph without assuming an			
		acyclic causal structure	264		
	8.19	The cyclic causal discovery algorithm	268		
	8.20	In conclusion	272		
	Appe	endix: A cheat-sheet of useful R functions	273		
	Refer	rences	290		
	Index	r	297		

#### Preface

This book describes a series of statistical methods for testing causal hypotheses using observational data – but it is not a statistics book. It describes a series of algorithms, derived from research in artificial intelligence (AI), that can discover causal relationships from observational data – but it is not a book about artificial intelligence. It describes the logical and philosophical relationships between causality and probability distributions – but it is certainly not a book about the philosophy of statistics. Rather, it is a *user's guide*, written for biologists, whose purpose is to allow the practising biologist to make use of these important new developments when causal questions cannot be answered with randomised experiments.

I have written the book assuming that you have no previous training in these methods. If you have taken an introductory statistics course – even if it was longer ago than you want to acknowledge – and have managed to hold on to some of the basic notions of sampling and hypothesis testing using statistics then you should be able to understand the material in this book. I recommend that you read each chapter through in its entirety even if you do not feel that you have mastered all the notions. This will at least give you a general feeling for the goals and vocabulary of each chapter. You can then go back and pay closer attention to the details.

The book is addressed to biologists, mostly because I am a practising biologist myself, but I hope that it will also be of interest to statisticians, scientists in other fields and even philosophers of science. I have not written the book as a textbook simply because the discipline to which the material in this book naturally belongs does not yet exist. Whatever the name eventually given to this new discipline, I firmly believe that it will exist, and be generally recognised as a distinct discipline, in the future. The questions that this new discipline addresses, and the elegance of its results, are too important for this not to be the case. Nonetheless, the chapters follow a logical progression that would be well suited to an upper-level undergraduate, or graduate, course. I have used the manuscript of this book for such a purpose, and every one of my students is still alive.

It is a pleasure and an honour to acknowledge the many people who have contributed to this project. First, Jim and Marg Shipley started everything. Robert van Hulst supplied much of the initial impulse through our conversations about science and causality while I was still an undergraduate. He has also read every one of the manuscript chapters and suggested many useful changes. Paul Keddy kept my interest burning during my PhD studies and also commented on the first two chapters. As usual, his comments went to the heart of the matter.

#### xii Preface

The late Robert Peters had a large impact on my thoughts about causality and even convinced me, for a number of years, that ecologists are best to give up on the concept – not because he viewed the notion of causality as meaningless (he never believed this, despite his empiricist reputation) but because it was simply too slippery a notion to demonstrate without randomised experiments. His constant prodding must have caused me to stop while wandering through the library one day when, almost subconsciously, I saw a book with the following provocative title: *Discovering Causal Structure: Artificial Intelligence, Philosophy of Science, and Statistical Modeling* (Glymour et al. 1987). That book was my introduction to a more sophisticated understanding of causality. Rob Peters was much too young when he passed away, and I am sorry that he never got to read the book that you are about to begin. I am not sure that he would have approved of everything in it but I know that he would have appreciated the effort.

Martin Lechowicz introduced me to the notion of path analysis at a time when this method had been mostly forgotten by biologists. He and I have collaborated for a number of years on this topic, and he read the entire manuscript of this book, providing many insightful comments. Steve Coté and Jim Grace also read parts of this book. Jim, in particular, provided some important counterpoint to my thoughts on latent variable models. Marco Festa-Bianchet provided the unpublished data that are reported in Chapter 5. I must also acknowledge my graduate students, Margaret McKenna, Driss Meziane, Jarceline Almeida-Cortez, Luc St-Pierre and Muhaymina Sari, as well as the many members of the SEMNET Internet discussion group.

Finally, I want to thank Judea Pearl for kindly responding to my many e-mails about d-separation and basis sets and to Clark Glymour, Richard Scheines and Peter Spirtes of Carnegie Mellon University for their generosity in extending an invitation to visit with them and for patiently answering my many questions about their discovery algorithms. Clark Glymour read and commented on some of the manuscript chapters.

I hope that you find this book to be useful, interesting and readable. I welcome your comments and feedback – especially if you don't agree with me.

Sherbrooke, 1999

### Preface to the second edition

I had two motives, one positive and one more selfish, in writing the first edition of this book. The positive motive was to provide a detailed introduction of these methods to practising biologists, since they were largely unknown to students and researchers in this discipline. The more selfish motive was to provide a detailed *justification* of these methods to practising biologists. You see, I was frustrated. My research manuscripts that included these methods were being rejected by reviewers, who viewed the analyses as the statistical equivalents of conjurer's tricks. I concluded that a book-length explanation that was written specifically for biologists would provide such a justification. Now, writing fifteen years later, the situation is quite different. These methods have been increasingly adopted by biologists working in ecology, evolution, genetics and molecular biology. I hope that the first edition of this book, as well as Jim Grace's (2006) very fine book, have contributed to this change. Virtually every chapter has been updated in this second edition. These changes include, inter alia, new additions to the d-sep test, the inclusion of phylogenetic information and an expanded treatment of latent variables. The most extensive change is the detailed explanation for implementing these methods using the R programming language. The only computer programs for structural equation modelling that were available when I wrote the first edition were commercial ones. Since I didn't want to become a salesman for any particular commercial package, I didn't include the actual code and steps for carrying out the analyses. However, a 'user's guide' that omits such vital information is clearly lacking. Now that the freely available R program has become so ubiquitous for statistical analysis by biologists, and now that the methods in this book have been included in several R libraries, I have included detailed instructions in this second edition for carrying out the analyses.

Sherbrooke, 2014