



Doomed Interventions

Between 2002 and 2013 bilateral donors spent over \$64 billion on AIDS intervention in low- and middle-income countries. During the same period, nearly 25 million people died of AIDS and more than 32 million were newly infected with HIV. In this book for students of political economy and public policy in Africa, as well as global health, Kim Yi Dionne tries to understand why AIDS interventions in Africa often fail. The fight against AIDS requires the coordination of multiple actors across borders and levels of governance in highly affected countries, and these actors can be the primary sources of the problem. Dionne observes misaligned priorities along the global chain of actors, and argues that this misalignment can create multiple opportunities for failure. Analyzing foreign aid flows and public opinion polls, Dionne shows that while the international community prioritizes AIDS, ordinary Africans view AIDS as but one of the many problems they face daily.

KIM YI DIONNE is Assistant Professor of Government at Smith College. She collected much of the data for this book when she was a Fulbright Scholar in Malawi in 2008. She earned her PhD in political science from UCLA, where she was a Foreign Language and Area Studies (FLAS) fellow in Swahili. Her work has been published in *African Affairs*, *Comparative Political Studies*, *World Development*, and other academic journals. She has also written essays for *Foreign Affairs* and *Foreign Policy*, and is an editor for *The Monkey Cage*, a blog on politics and political science at *The Washington Post*.

Doomed Interventions

The Failure of Global
Responses to AIDS in Africa

KIM YI DIONNE
Smith College, Massachusetts



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-19559-2 — Doomed Interventions
Kim Yi Dionne
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107195592

DOI: 10.1017/9781108157797

© Kim Yi Dionne 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-107-19559-2 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-316-64688-5 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Dedicated to my mother, Chong Hui Kim Shimakawa

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> ix
<i>List of Tables</i>	xi
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xiii
1 Misaligned Priorities: How Disconnect between Donors and Citizens Doomed AIDS Intervention in Africa	1
1.1 Global Hierarchy, Grassroots Opinions	6
1.2 Data and Methods	9
1.3 Outline of the Book	10
2 AIDS in Africa: A Significant Challenge and a Disconnected Response	13
2.1 HIV/AIDS in Africa: A Brief Overview	13
2.2 Responding to AIDS	18
2.3 Examples of Disconnected AIDS Interventions in Mozambique and Botswana	32
2.4 Why the Disconnect in Global AIDS Response?	34
2.5 Conclusion	37
3 Principal–Agent Problems and AIDS Interventions in Africa	39
3.1 Principal–Agent Framework	41
3.2 Principals and Agents of AIDS Interventions	46
3.3 How a Hierarchy of Principal–Agent Relationships Goes Wrong: Kenya’s KHADREP Corruption Scandal	50
3.4 The Problems with Potential Solutions for Principal– Agent Problems	53
3.5 Agents Navigate Competing Pressures of Dueling Principals	57
3.6 Conclusion	59
4 AIDS in Malawi	60
4.1 A Context of Competing Challenges	61
4.2 Democratic Shift, Dictatorial Legacy	63
	vii

viii	<i>Contents</i>
4.3 Donor Dependency	68
4.4 HIV/AIDS in Malawi	70
4.5 Responses to AIDS in Malawi	76
4.6 Malawi Data Used in This Book	89
4.7 Study Sample Characteristics	96
4.8 Conclusion	100
5 Policy Priorities in the Time of AIDS	101
5.1 Prioritization of AIDS in Corridors of Power	102
5.2 What Influences Whether Citizens Prioritize AIDS?	104
5.3 Prioritization of AIDS in Africa	107
5.4 Prioritization of AIDS in Malawi	110
5.5 Alternative Measures of Prioritizing AIDS	114
5.6 Alternative Explanations for Low Prioritization of AIDS	117
5.7 Conclusion	123
6 Seeing Like a Village: Headmen as Agents of the Global AIDS Intervention	126
6.1 Chieftaincy in Africa	128
6.2 Chieftaincy in Malawi	133
6.3 How Village Headmen Act against AIDS	138
6.4 Village Headmen and Their Priorities	145
6.5 Chiefs Acting against AIDS beyond Malawi	151
6.6 Alternative Village-Level Agents	155
6.7 Conclusion	156
7 Conclusion	160
7.1 Summary of Findings	161
7.2 Implications	163
7.3 Going Forward	168
<i>Bibliography</i>	169
<i>Index</i>	193

Figures

1.1 HIV/AIDS intervention stakeholders in Tanzania and Mozambique	<i>page 7</i>
2.1 Adult HIV prevalence in Africa, 2015	17
3.1 Global hierarchy of HIV/AIDS intervention	47
3.2 Potential for corruption in nested principal–agent relationships, Kenya’s HIV/AIDS Disaster Response Project (KHADREP)	54
4.1 Malawi HIV prevalence, 1999–2014	72
4.2 PEPFAR funding flow in Malawi, 2014	86
4.3 Map of Malawi Research Sites	95
5.1 Official development assistance for health and HIV in sub-Saharan Africa, in millions (USD)	103
5.2 Disease burden and donor funding for HIV/AIDS and malaria in sub-Saharan Africa	103
5.3 HIV prevalence and demand for AIDS resources	108
5.4 Should government devote more resources to AIDS?	109
5.5 Villagers’ policy priorities, by importance	113
5.6 Predicted probabilities of villagers’ prioritization of HIV/AIDS programs	115
6.1 Malawi’s chieftaincy hierarchy	135
6.2 Headmen’s policy rankings, by importance	146
6.3 Comparing headmen and their villagers	148
6.4 Predicted probabilities of headmen’s prioritization of HIV/AIDS programs	152

Tables

4.1 A timeline of HIV/AIDS in Malawi	<i>page</i> 79
4.2 Summary statistics of MLSFH study sample	97
4.3 Summary statistics of villages and their headmen	99
5.1 Ordered logit regression of villager prioritization of HIV/AIDS	114
6.1 Headmen prioritization of HIV/AIDS programs	150

Acknowledgments

My debts are many.

None of this work would have been possible without the participation of rural Malawians who invited us into their homes, shared intimate details of their lives, and, in most cases, gave blood samples to test for HIV. The same is true for the survey respondents across Africa who have shared their experiences with Afrobarometer and the Demographic and Health Surveys, both of which I draw on in this book. I would have nothing to write were it not for the everyday people who gave survey interviewers their time, knowledge, and opinions. I thank them for their thoughtfulness.

When conducting research in Malawi, I benefited from the support of affiliation with the US Embassy, thanks to Ulemu Malindi and Pamela Kuwali. I also benefited from connection to the Political and Administrative Studies Department at Chancellor College, University of Malawi, thanks to faculty member Richard Tambulasi. My extended field research in 2008 was financially supported by a Fulbright IIE grant as well as funding from an NICHD grant awarded to Principal Investigator Hans-Peter Kohler (R01 Grant #RHD053781). The California Center for Population Research at UCLA, Sara's Wish Foundation, Invest in Knowledge Initiative-Malawi, and the Globalization Research Center-Africa at UCLA also funded various parts of my field research.

I am grateful to my Malawian research assistants and fieldwork colleagues for helping me collect – and later make sense of – the data used in this manuscript. Kondwani Chavula, Wyson Chimesya, Humphreys Chingaipe, Davie Chitenje, Augustine Harawa, Austine Jana, Francis Kudzula, Eric Lungu, Paul Mwera, Synab Njerenga, Memory Phiri, and the late Fanizo George encountered numerous challenges with me in the field and yet managed to make fieldwork not only successful but enjoyable. I am particularly grateful to Hastings Honde for listening to my ideas and being frank with me about what seemed on the right track and what seemed half-baked. I also appreciate the hard

work by research assistants back in the United States: Amanda Edgell, Lynn Hancock, Juliana Mishkin, Jacob Olivo, Amy Polglase, Gretchen Walch, and Mindy White – three of whom went on to pursue doctorates in political science! For the friendship and insights they offered in the field and beyond, I thank Jim Adams, Nicole Angotti, Crystal Biruk, Muhammad Chilungo, Pete Fleming, Lauren Gaydosh, Richard Kusseni, James Mwera, Michelle Poulin, Iddo Tavory, Sara Yeatman, and all the other “Let’s Chat” alumni.

I am indebted to a number of people who helped shape how I translated what I learned when collecting data into something resembling an argument and evidence. This project started as a dissertation at UCLA and I thank the members of my dissertation committee, James Honaker, Evan Lieberman, Arthur Stein, Susan Watkins, and especially my chair Dan Posner, who pushed me to venture beyond the policy implications of a serious social problem to be a critical social scientist. I also thank Leo Arriola, Asiyati Chiweza, Blessings Chinsinga, Mark Daku, Boniface Dulani, Karen Grépin, Bob Harmel, Seth Hill, Marisa Kellam, Sylvia Manzano, John McCauley, Amy Patterson, Francisco Pedraza, Jemima Pierre, Rachel Beatty Riedl, Tyson Roberts, Laura Seay, Candis Watts Smith, Lahra Smith, Ann Swidler, Peter VonDoepp, and Rick Wilson for their feedback, support, and advice at various stages of this project.

Drafts from this work were presented at the Better Governance for Better Health Conference at Stanford University, the Princeton AIDS Initiative, a Working Group in African Political Economy Meeting, the 2009 meeting of the American Political Science Association, a 2011 conference at Mount Holyoke College on Corruption and the Pursuit of Accountability in Africa, the 2015 African Studies Association annual meeting, and invited talks at UNC-Charlotte, Middlebury College, and Johns Hopkins/SAIS. I thank participants – especially Beth Whitaker, Sarah Stroup, and Dan König – for useful feedback. I am also grateful to Zulema Valdez and Tanya Golash-Boza for inviting me to the Creative Connections Retreat in Yosemite National Park in 2016, when I made critical progress on this project.

Much of the writing for this book happened after I joined the faculty at Smith College. Luck would have it that another colleague was writing a book about principal–agent problems at the same time; Brent Durbin shared helpful insights about the book’s arguments and his family has been a great reminder to me and mine about what’s really important in life. Monday morning write-on-sites at the Lewis Global

Acknowledgments

xv

Studies Center and Wednesday writing retreats in the Bechtel Environmental Classroom at the MacLeish Field Station gave me (regular) space to get 'er done. Fellow writers Carrie Baker, Holly Hanson, Liz Klarich, and Regine Spector helped me keep my eyes on the prize. College support via a Picker Fellowship and Connexions grant facilitated the time and attention needed to finish the book. Crucial feedback from Adia Benton and Jenny Trinitapoli who read entire drafts as the book neared completion greatly improved the manuscript. Adia Benton, Mlada Bukovansky, Brent Durbin, Elliot Fratkin, Howard Gold, Holly Hanson, Alice Hearst, Zaza Kabayadondo, and Greg White participated in a book workshop at Smith where they all helped me to sharpen the argument and tell the story I wanted people to learn. Also helpful was the feedback I received from students enrolled in my Spring 2016 course on AIDS in Africa.

My editor at Cambridge University Press, Maria Marsh, has always been a light of hope in the darkness only first-time book authors know. I thank her for her support of this project. I also thank the three anonymous referees who gave critical, thorough reviews of the manuscript. Of course, only I retain responsibility for the arguments and evidence presented in the book.

Finally, I would like to thank my family for their support in this endeavor. I met Josh during my first visit to Malawi in 2006 and because of his belief in my work, he took a leap of faith with me in bringing our young daughter Kezia to live for seven months in a country where many children don't see their fifth birthday. Both of them gave me something to look forward to at the end of a long day's work collecting data. Amayi Malaya took great care of the three of us and Kezia especially, allowing both Josh and I to get work done. Josh's mother Angela (aka "Oma") pitched in more times than I can count when we returned to the United States. Josh, Kezia, and later Asher gave me space to work on this project and good reason to set it aside from time to time. My sister from another mister, Noelia Ochoa, has always supported me and my work, and for all she has given me, I can never give enough thanks. Perhaps my greatest debt is to my mother, Chong Hui Kim Shimakawa, who was rather nervous about my decision to go and study a place she knew very little about. Her own ambitions to venture beyond her rural Korean village about four decades ago inspired me to seek more than that available in the small farming community where I grew up. It is to her and her dreams of my success that I dedicate this book.