

## *Introduction*

### *Hegel's Encyclopaedia Philosophy of Spirit*

*Marina F. Bykova*

Hegel's system of philosophy is perhaps one of his most enduring legacies. Many of his contemporaries, including Fichte and Schelling, attempted to arrange philosophical disciplines into a complex whole, demonstrating their interconnection and organic unity. Yet Hegel was able to accomplish this task in the most comprehensive and consistent way. The work that depicts Hegel's entire mature system in its basic structure is the *Encyclopaedia of the Philosophical Sciences in Basic Outline*. This is Hegel's only published presentation of his fully developed system consisting of three main parts: Logic, Philosophy of Nature, and Philosophy of Spirit. Hegel began developing the contours of his comprehensive "system of philosophy" during his time in Nuremberg (1808–15) where he worked as the headmaster (principal) and philosophy teacher at a city *Gymnasium* (high school). Apparently, his teaching obligation motivated him to draft an outline of his philosophical system, composing it in the form of successively numbered sections (or paragraphs) (*Enc.* 1B&D viii). This (encyclopedic) form of presentation was not a novelty; it was rather customary at the time for German professors to write thematic encyclopedias to be used as didactic tools, and Hegel followed this tradition. He lectured on his entire philosophical system with the aid of the composed drafts of the *Encyclopaedia* twice – in 1811/12 and 1812/13 – while in Nuremberg (cf. *GW* 13:620ff.) and again – in 1816 – in his first semester as professor of philosophy at the University of Heidelberg.<sup>1</sup> However, the printed (book) version of the *Encyclopaedia* appeared only in the summer of 1817. In its first edition, the *Encyclopaedia* contained 477 paragraphs and was composed as a complete course outline to serve as a basic text for students attending Hegel's lectures.

<sup>1</sup> During his following three semesters at Heidelberg, Hegel repeated the *Encyclopaedia* course twice, but in his later teaching, he relied on the printed version of the work.

Almost immediately after the book came out, Hegel began emending the text, adding supplementary remarks and extensive notes. These revisions served as a basis for the second edition of the *Encyclopaedia*, which Hegel published in 1827 while holding a prestigious chair in philosophy at the University of Berlin (1818–31). The second edition was significantly expanded: it included a hundred new sections and a substantially revised general Introduction, important supplementary material to Logic, and some added elaborations on the Philosophy of Nature and Philosophy of Spirit.<sup>2</sup> Three years later, in 1830, when Hegel issued the third edition of the *Encyclopaedia*, he introduced a few additional revisions, largely to further clarify the main principles and ideas of his philosophical system. He also elaborated in greater detail on a number of topics, including those relevant to his philosophy of spirit.<sup>3</sup>

Because of these numerous emendations, the text of the 1830 *Encyclopaedia* became very dense and difficult to navigate.<sup>4</sup> In order to “unpack” the very compressed material and explicate some of Hegel’s key points, the editors of the first posthumous edition of the master’s work, published in 1832, introduced supplemental notes (the so-called *Zusätze*, or Additions) which were drawn partially from Hegel’s own lecture manuscripts, but mostly from notes taken by students attending his lectures. Although it would be a mistake to regard the Additions as authentic text by Hegel or even a verbatim record of his lectures, they certainly can be considered reliable documents representative of his views. By using largely non-technical language, the Additions are very helpful elucidations of the ideas stated in the main text: they explain and illustrate what would be otherwise a highly dense train of thought formulated in abstract terms. In many cases, however, these explanations are double or triple the length of the main section itself. Combined with Hegel’s own published section remarks, these Additions made the *Encyclopaedia* an enormous book. Responding to this inconvenience, the editors of the first posthumous edition of the work decided to bind each part of the *Encyclopaedia* separately. This practice proved beneficial: in all successive editions of the *Encyclopaedia*, including its contemporary English translations, each of the three parts of the work – Logic, Philosophy of Nature, and Philosophy of Spirit – are published as separate volumes (cf. *Enc.* 1B&CD; *Enc.* 2P; *Enc.* 3I).

<sup>2</sup> For a concise summary of the changes made to the second edition, see Kainz 1996, 39–40.

<sup>3</sup> For a detailed list of the changes between the second and the third edition of the *Encyclopaedia*, see *GW* 20:578–97.

<sup>4</sup> Whereas the third edition contains the same 577 sections as the previous second edition of the work, Hegel added new remarks to some of the sections and, in a few cases, greatly expanded existing ones.

## Introduction

3

In the present collection of essays on the *Encyclopaedia* Philosophy of Spirit, contributors rely on this common practice as well.

This does not mean, however, that our volume studies the Philosophy of Spirit in isolation from its systematic context. On the contrary, one main goal of this collection is to counteract the widespread failure to appreciate the unity of Hegel's work and to surmount the tendency to compartmentalize his philosophy. The unity of the philosophical system as a whole and the interconnection of all its parts were indeed key principles, for which Hegel so rigorously advocated. The logically consistent internal structure of the philosophy methodically executed in the *Encyclopaedia* earned Hegel his reputation as one of the greatest systematic thinkers of all time.

Focusing on the *Encyclopaedia* Philosophy of Spirit, this volume provides a systematic reading emphasizing the role of Philosophy of Spirit within Hegel's mature philosophical system and its importance for understanding the complexity of his project. Such interpretation provides significant scholarly opportunities to scrutinize conceptually rich sections of this part of Hegel's *Encyclopaedia* while also highlighting its connections with other integral elements of the work and important components of Hegel's whole philosophical system. This approach is especially important due to the unique material provided in the *Encyclopaedia*. It remains our main source for certain parts of Hegel's system not presented in any of his other works with some topics being treated there in such a comprehensive and systematic manner that far surpasses any other text by Hegel.

The *Encyclopaedia* Philosophy of Spirit specifies Hegel's concept of spirit in greatest detail, as it is realized in the final stage of its self-development: a systematic presentation of a complex process of how it becomes a free, actual spirit. Thus, the *Encyclopaedia* Philosophy of Spirit is an indispensable source of ideas, and elucidates many features of Hegel's philosophical project.

The mature Philosophy of Spirit<sup>5</sup> offers systematic answers to important questions Hegel addresses. For example, without a clear grasp of Hegel's understanding of "subjective spirit," its relation to what Kant called "practical philosophy" (subsumed by Hegel under "objective spirit"), and its relation to our status as natural beings, Hegel's answers to the most enduring questions of philosophy simply cannot be understood. The

<sup>5</sup> Hegel began exploring topics relevant to philosophy of spirit as early as in 1802 while teaching at Jena. Among his early writings on these themes are *The System of Ethical Life* (1802–3), *Essay on Natural Law* (1803), as well as the two series of his *Lectures on Philosophy of Spirit* offered at Jena in 1803–4 and 1805–6. Those works, which focused on issues later explored in the philosophy of objective spirit, are the earliest surviving versions of Hegel's social theory.

Philosophy of Spirit examines in detail some of the most important Hegelian concepts such as recognition; subjectivity and intersubjectivity; relations between causality and freedom, on the one hand, and human rights and freedom, on the other; moral normativity; the cultural role of art and religion; and other topics central to Hegel's philosophy and contemporary philosophical concerns. These examinations do not simply reiterate ideas Hegel formulates in his other published texts (e.g., the *Phenomenology of Spirit* and the *Elements of Philosophy of Right*). The offered discussions convey new insights which either supplement or diverge from, perhaps improving on, those found in the thinker's more familiar publications. In the Philosophy of Spirit, we have the text that enables us to follow closely the twists and turns of Hegel's thought in relation to some of the central questions animating current Hegel scholarship, and many of the crucial considerations marking Hegel's relevance to contemporary philosophy, both analytic and continental.

Hegel organizes the *Encyclopaedia* Philosophy of Spirit according to his usual triadic pattern, dividing it into three large sections, each with a tripartite subdivision: philosophy of subjective spirit (subdivided into anthropology, phenomenology, psychology), philosophy of objective spirit (subdivided into right, state, ethical life), and philosophy of absolute spirit (subdivided into art, religion, philosophy). In 1820, he published *Elements of Philosophy of Right*, which expanded his philosophy of objective spirit. Hegel's philosophies of subjective and of absolute spirit were elaborated only in Hegel's various lecture series (on philosophies of subjective spirit, art, religion, and on the history of philosophy) in Berlin. While both the *Philosophy of Right* and some of the *Lectures* (particularly *Lectures on the Philosophy of Religion* and *Lectures on the Philosophy of Subjective Spirit*, relatively recently translated into English) have received extensive scholarly attention,<sup>6</sup> the text of the *Encyclopaedia* Philosophy of Spirit has been largely neglected until now.<sup>7</sup> Given the systematic and conceptual importance of the Philosophy of Spirit, the level of scholarly attention it has received is disappointing. In the English-speaking world, it has remained less known and less studied than Hegel's other published texts. The widespread view of this text as merely propaedeutic, which "compresses

<sup>6</sup> See, for example, Neuhouser 2000; Hodgson 2005; Brooks 2007; Pippin 2008; 2014; Moggach 2011; Dorian 2012; Stern 2013; Houlgate 2016a; Westphal 2016–17a; 2016–17b; Brooks and Stein 2017; Pinkard 2017b.

<sup>7</sup> There is not much research, especially in English, devoted to the treatment of the Philosophy of Spirit within the *Encyclopaedia* system. Among publications that at least partially rectify the situation are Stillman 1987; Schnädelbach 2000; Hermann-Sinai and Ziglioli 2016.

the material almost to the point of unintelligibility" (*LPhS* 3), still persists. This attitude is not only mistaken, but it undermines the significance of this major part of the *Encyclopaedia* in realizing the central aim of Hegel's philosophy to constitute a genuine system. It also diminishes the philosophical value of the text, neglecting an array of topics and insights central to Hegelian thought not discussed in such detail in any of his other writings.

The present collection attempts to fill the existing gap in Hegel scholarship by bringing into focus the *Encyclopaedia* Philosophy of Spirit and demonstrating its systematic significance for Hegel's philosophical project, and the wealth of ideas and concepts it presents. The present volume reveals important reasons why such an encounter is warranted. It shows that only in the Philosophy of Spirit is the metaphysical perspective of pure thinking central to Hegel's *Logic* reconciled with the perspective of the thinking, knowing, and acting subject: both in the form of its individual life as subjective spirit and through the objectified forms of its social and cultural life, as objective and absolute spirit, respectively.

The *Encyclopaedia* Philosophy of Spirit is a rich text in which Hegel treats a wide range of topics that, as readers will see, remain vital. Many are central to contemporary debates in the philosophy of mind, philosophy of action, social and political philosophy, philosophy of law, ethics, philosophy of religion, and aesthetics. Drawing on the riches of Hegel's *Encyclopaedia* Philosophy of Spirit, our volume contributes to current discussions in these fields while assessing the consistency of Hegel's claims and delving into his insights. This research is promising because it lays the groundwork for what might well become a serious Hegelian alternative to more familiar models of cognition, moral and social agency, freedom, social ontology, and action theory.

The present volume makes no grand claims to provide a comprehensive examination of all the topics of Hegel's *Encyclopaedia* Philosophy of Spirit. Rather, this collection offers concerted analyses of some central considerations and arguments in the text and its associated writings. The volume consists of twelve new essays, which address specific issues central to Hegel's Philosophy of Spirit that are also prominent in current debates about Hegel and in some relevant fields. As a collection of linked original essays, our *Critical Guide* presents and assesses the state of the art in understanding and evaluating Hegel's Philosophy of Spirit.

This volume does not intend to adopt any specific interpretive agenda or approach. Written by internationally recognized Hegel scholars, the essays included here offer a series of well-researched discussions that

together provide a reliable, thoughtful account of Hegel's views, approached from different perspectives, philosophical schools, and traditions. Along with established readings of the Philosophy of Spirit and its place in Hegel's philosophical system, new interpretations of the thinker's central ideas are also presented and examined in detail. Each essay – as well as the volume as a whole – provides a reliable examination of the topic it considers, highlighting a variety of approaches and ideas and addressing many concerns central to contemporary philosophers working in different traditions.

The volume is structured in four parts, each dealing with specific topics addressed in Hegel's book. Part I, "Philosophy of Spirit and Hegel's Philosophical System," re-examines questions about the conceptual unity of different facets of Hegel's philosophy. It shows that doing full justice to the systematic dimension of Hegel's philosophy requires more than focusing exclusively – as it is still common – on his *Logic*. Hegel's wider systematic framework also requires thorough consideration, most notably his analysis of "spiritual" relations, which illuminates how Hegel's *Logic* unfolds within the realms of nature and spirit, and conversely illuminates some of the most fundamental issues of the *Logic* itself. Part I also examines Hegel's concept of *Geist*, which is here given a non-traditional reading, departing from associations with and connotations of the term "mind," thus renewing our investigation and appreciation of specific historical sources of this concept so central to Hegel.

Part II, "Philosophy of Subjective Spirit," examines a series of specific topics that Hegel discusses in anthropology, phenomenology, and psychology within the *Encyclopaedia* and which are of interest to contemporary debates in relevant fields. Among these are Hegel's insights into human insanity (both the modest form of derangement (*Verrücktheit*) and the more radical form of madness proper [*Wahnsinn*]), and the relation between intuition and representation in Hegel's account of perceptual experience. Special attention is given to the analysis of Hegel's objectives in psychology as developed in his *Encyclopaedia* concept of "Theoretical Spirit." Based on rich historical materials, it is shown how Hegel's cognitive psychology attempts to capitalize on Kant's Critical account of cognitive judgment by grafting it onto Aristotle's account of our embodied rational agency. The essays in Part II, focusing on some of the most interesting of Hegel's ideas and arguments, identify promising new avenues for research within and beyond Hegel scholarship.

Part III, "Philosophy of Objective Spirit," examines a series of philosophical concerns central to Hegel's practical and political philosophy.

## Introduction

7

Many of these topics, such as freedom and equality, the rules of self-conscious human life, subject and subjectivity, moral agency, human sociality, and the state and constitution, are detailed in Hegel's *Elements of Philosophy of Right* and are usually discussed on that basis. However, that book itself is ultimately rooted in the section of the *Encyclopaedia* Philosophy of Spirit on objective spirit. To understand Hegel's aims in his *Philosophy of Right* thus requires comprehending it as a philosophy of objective spirit with its unique role within Hegel's philosophical system. Furthermore, while the *Philosophy of Right*, along with related lectures, presents a more developed version of the philosophy of objective spirit, many concepts have been detailed in the *Encyclopaedia* text in subtly different ways, especially in the later two editions, subsequent to the *Philosophy of Right*. The distinctive features of Hegel's *Encyclopaedia* thus offer opportunities for new, more exacting interpretations and better insights into Hegel's ideas and arguments. Examining the extensive material of the *Encyclopaedia* philosophy of objective spirit, the essays in Part III offer fresh ideas and identify new questions and topics for further examination.

The final part, Part IV, "Philosophy of Absolute Spirit," explores crucial peculiarities of spiritual manifestations in the final stages of spirit's development and of Hegel's philosophical system as a whole. Reflecting on the systematic dimensions of Hegel's philosophy, this part tackles a crucial methodological question of the *Encyclopaedia* transition from objective spirit to absolute spirit, which, among other important revelations, unveils the complex meaning of the absoluteness that Hegel assigns to spirit at this final stage of its self-development. Special emphasis is given to less explored topics of Hegel's philosophies of art and of religion. Hegel's treatment of art in the *Encyclopaedia*'s section on Absolute Spirit in its final (1827/1830) form is only eight paragraphs long, but contains arguably the most systematic and mature account Hegel gave of art, in particular the relation between the philosophy of art and the philosophy of spirit. The chapter on the *Encyclopaedia* philosophy of art traces the historical development of Hegel's aesthetic ideas, highlighting specific relations illuminated in his text: the intricate relations between artist and the produced artwork, and between the artwork and its spectator. Another topical question discussed here is the relation of art to other modes of absolute spirit, i.e., religion and philosophy. The discussion of Hegel's philosophy of religion, while based on ideas stated in the relevant paragraphs of the *Encyclopaedia*, greatly benefits from more detailed treatment of these ideas in the *Lectures on Philosophy of Religion*, most notably, the volume on the Determinate



Religion, which is probably the least read portion of Hegel's corpus. New in this material is Hegel's use of his concept of recognition, incorporated into his account of the Jewish doctrine of God, including both the ideas discussed in the *Phenomenology* section on Unhappy Consciousness and the dynamic of divine master and human slave. This permits Hegel to avoid the sheer negative theology of the sublime, and thus to bring it together with the Greek religion of beauty and humanity. This move also leads Hegel to incorporate his own philosophical trinitarianism of the concept, i.e., the true infinite, which is a higher totality into which both of these are sublated. Until now, this material has been neglected. Yet it clarifies Hegel's view of the relations of these religions as forms of development of absolute spirit—the consummate religion remains rooted in what it consummates.

Even in a special volume such as this, it is not possible to encompass every relevant topic or approach, and some regrettable omissions and gaps were unavoidable. This is testimony to the conceptual richness of Hegel's Philosophy of Spirit; his *Encyclopaedia* text is a true treasure trove of philosophical ideas and arguments still awaiting their due attention, appreciation, and use. My hope is that this *Critical Guide* will prompt further studies, bringing into focus topics and issues Hegel discusses in his Philosophy of Spirit and demonstrating their relevance today.

The present volume will be of interest to those who seek an accurate, current, clear understanding of the main aspects of Hegel's *Encyclopaedia* Philosophy of Spirit and who want to avoid limited, one-sided approaches to Hegel's work mounted from any specific philosophical tradition. I hope readers will appreciate the clarity, analytical precision, and engaging writing style of the essays included in the collection, which still remains a rare treat in scholarly writings on Hegel. Presenting a mixture of valuable approaches, this volume provides a distinctive compendium of scholarship reflecting the quality and diversity of contemporary Hegel studies and offers a sophisticated account of Hegel's Philosophy of Spirit.