

UKRAINE - DEFINITIVE SAFEGUARD MEASURES ON CERTAIN PASSENGER CARS

Report of the Panel WT/DS468/R

*Adopted by the Dispute Settlement Body
on 20 July 2015*

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
1. INTRODUCTION	3128
1.1 Complaint by Japan	3128
1.2 Panel Establishment and Composition	3128
1.3 Panel Proceedings.....	3129
1.3.1 General	3129
1.3.2 Working procedures on BCI	3129
2. FACTUAL ASPECTS.....	3130
2.1 The Measure at Issue	3130
2.2 Other Factual Aspects.....	3130
3. PARTIES' REQUESTS FOR FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....	3132
4. ARGUMENTS OF THE PARTIES	3134
5. ARGUMENTS OF THE THIRD PARTIES	3134
6. INTERIM REVIEW	3134
6.1 Preliminary Matters	3135
6.2 Claims Relating to Unforeseen Developments and the Effect of the Obligations Incurred under the GATT 1994	3136
6.3 Claims Relating to Increased Imports.....	3136
6.4 Claims Relating to Threat of Serious Injury.....	3137
6.5 Claims Relating to Causation	3138
6.6 Claims Relating to the Application, Duration, and Liberalization of the Safeguard Measure at Issue	3138
6.7 Claims under Article II:1(b) of the GATT 1994	3140

Report of the Panel

6.8	Claims Relating to the Conduct of the Investigation and the Investigation Report	3140
6.9	Claims Relating to Notifications, Prior Consultations, and the Level of Concessions	3141
6.10	Conclusions	3143
7.	FINDINGS	3143
7.1	Preliminary Matters.....	3143
7.1.1	The safeguard measure at issue.....	3143
7.1.2	Procedure carried out by the competent authorities.....	3145
7.1.3	Overview of claims and order of the Panel's analysis...	3150
7.1.4	Standard of review	3153
7.1.5	Relevant Ukrainian documents	3156
7.2	Claims Relating to Unforeseen Developments and the Effect of the Obligations Incurred under the GATT 1994	3159
7.2.1	Claims under Article XIX:1(a) of the GATT 1994.....	3160
7.2.1.1	Unforeseen developments and the effect of GATT 1994 obligations.....	3161
7.2.1.2	Unforeseen developments.....	3166
7.2.1.2.1	The unforeseen developments alleged in this case	3166
7.2.1.2.2	Logical connection between the unforeseen developments and the relative increase in imports	3173
7.2.1.3	Effect of GATT 1994 obligations	3174
7.2.1.3.1	Identification of the effect of relevant GATT 1994 obligations.....	3175
7.2.1.3.2	Logical connection between the effect of GATT 1994 obligations and the relative increase in imports	3177
7.2.1.4	Overall conclusion	3178
7.2.2	Claim under Article 11.1(a)	3178
7.2.3	Claims under Articles 3.1 and 4.2(c)	3178
7.3	Claims Relating to Increased Imports	3180
7.3.1	Claims under Article 2.1	3180
7.3.1.1	Increased imports	3182
7.3.1.2	"[I]n such increased quantities"	3182

Ukraine - Passenger Cars

	7.3.1.2.1	Analysis of intervening trends in imports.....	3183
	7.3.1.2.2	Sudden, sharp, and significant increase.....	3189
	7.3.1.2.3	Amounts of imports.....	3192
	7.3.1.3	"[I]s being imported".....	3194
	7.3.1.4	"[U]nder such conditions".....	3205
	7.3.1.5	Overall conclusion.....	3206
7.3.2		Claims under Articles 3.1, 4.2(a), 4.2(c), and 11.1(a), and Article XIX:1(a).....	3207
	7.3.2.1	Claims under Articles 4.2(a) and 11.1(a), and Article XIX:1(a).....	3207
	7.3.2.2	Claims under Article 3.1, last sentence, and Article 4.2(c).....	3208
7.4		Claims Relating to Threat of Serious Injury.....	3209
	7.4.1	Claim under Article 4.2(a).....	3209
	7.4.1.1	The competent authorities' determination	3212
	7.4.1.2	Analysis of threat of serious injury	3214
	7.4.1.2.1	"Significant overall impairment".....	3215
	7.4.1.2.2	"Clearly imminent".....	3219
	7.4.1.2.3	Evaluation of relevant factors in a threat of serious injury determination.....	3219
	7.4.1.3	The competent authorities' analysis of threat of serious injury.....	3220
	7.4.1.3.1	The share of the domestic market taken by increased imports.....	3226
	7.4.1.3.2	The rate and amount of the increase in imports.....	3227
	7.4.1.3.3	Capacity of key exporting countries to generate exports.....	3228
	7.4.1.3.4	Injury factors pertaining directly to the situation of the domestic industry	3231
	7.4.1.3.5	Overall conclusion.....	3233
7.4.2		Claims under Articles 2.1, 3.1, 4.1(a), 4.1(b), 4.2(b), 4.2(c), 11.1(a) and Article XIX:1(a).....	3233

 Report of the Panel

	7.4.2.1	Articles 2.1, 4.1(a), 4.1(b), 4.2(b), 11.1(a) and Article XIX:1(a).....	3234
	7.4.2.2	Articles 3.1 and 4.2(c).....	3234
7.5		Claims Relating to Causation.....	3235
	7.5.1	Claims under Article 4.2(b).....	3236
	7.5.1.1	Demonstration of the existence of a causal link.....	3237
	7.5.1.2	Non-attribution analysis.....	3244
	7.5.2	Claims under Articles 2.1, 3.1, 4.1(a), 4.1(b), 4.2(a), 4.2(c), 11.1(a), and Article XIX:1(a).....	3252
	7.5.2.1	Claims under Articles 2.1, 4.1(a), 4.1(b), 4.2(a), 11.1(a) and Article XIX:1(a).....	3252
	7.5.2.2	Claims under Articles 3.1 and 4.2(c).....	3253
7.6		Claims Relating to the Application, Duration, and Liberalization of the Safeguard Measure at Issue.....	3253
	7.6.1	Claim under Article 7.4, first sentence.....	3254
	7.6.2	Claims under Articles 3.1, 4.2(c), 5.1, 7.1, and 11.1(a), and Article XIX:1(a).....	3259
	7.6.2.1	Claims under Articles 5.1 and 7.1.....	3260
	7.6.2.1.1	Claims under Articles 5.1 and 7.1 concerning "the extent necessary to facilitate adjustment".....	3260
	7.6.2.1.2	Claim under Article 5.1 concerning necessity "to prevent or remedy serious injury".....	3262
	7.6.2.2	Claims under Article 11.1(a) and Article XIX:1(a).....	3263
	7.6.2.3	Claims under Article 3.1, last sentence, and Article 4.2(c).....	3264
7.7		Claims under Article II:1(b) of the GATT 1994.....	3266
7.8		Claims Relating to the Conduct of the Investigation and the Investigation Report.....	3267
	7.8.1	Claim under Article 3.1, second sentence.....	3267
	7.8.1.1	Reasonable public notice.....	3269
	7.8.1.2	Public hearings or other appropriate means to present evidence and views, including an opportunity to respond to the presentations of others.....	3271

	Ukraine - Passenger Cars
7.8.1.3	Conclusion..... 3278
7.8.2	Claims under Article 3.1, last sentence, and Article 4.2(c) 3278
7.8.3	Claim under Article 3.1, first sentence..... 3284
7.9	Claims Relating to Notifications, Prior Consultations, and the Level of Concessions..... 3286
7.9.1	Claims under Article 12.1 3286
7.9.1.1	Notification requirements under Article 12.1 3287
7.9.1.1.1	Claim under Article 12.1(a)..... 3289
7.9.1.1.2	Claims under Articles 12.1(b) and (c)..... 3292
7.9.2	Claim under Article 12.2..... 3299
7.9.2.1	"All pertinent information"..... 3300
7.9.2.2	The competent authorities' notification 3301
7.9.3	Claim under Article 12.3..... 3305
7.9.4	Claim under Article 12.5..... 3311
7.9.5	Claim under Article 8.1 3312
8.	CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS 3314