

WORLD TRADE ORGANIZATION

Dispute Settlement Reports

2015
Volume VI

Pages 3115-3564

THE WTO DISPUTE SETTLEMENT REPORTS

The *Dispute Settlement Reports* of the World Trade Organization (the "WTO") include panel and Appellate Body reports, as well as arbitration awards, in disputes concerning the rights and obligations of WTO Members under the provisions of the *Marrakesh Agreement Establishing the World Trade Organization*. The *Dispute Settlement Reports* are available in English. Volumes comprising one or more complete cases contain a cumulative list of published disputes. The cumulative list for cases that cover more than one volume is to be found in the first volume for that case.

This volume may be cited as DSR 2015:VI

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryaganj, Delhi – 110002, India
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107191792
10.1017/9781108123679

© World Trade Organization 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2016

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-107-19179-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
Ukraine - Definitive Safeguard Measures on Certain Passenger Cars (WT/DS468)	
Report of the Panel	3117
Peru - Additional Duty on Imports of Certain Agricultural Products (WT/DS457)	
Report of the Appellate Body	3403
Cumulative List of Published Disputes	3537

UKRAINE - DEFINITIVE SAFEGUARD MEASURES ON CERTAIN PASSENGER CARS

Report of the Panel WT/DS468/R

*Adopted by the Dispute Settlement Body
on 20 July 2015*

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
1. INTRODUCTION	3128
1.1 Complaint by Japan	3128
1.2 Panel Establishment and Composition	3128
1.3 Panel Proceedings.....	3129
1.3.1 General	3129
1.3.2 Working procedures on BCI	3129
2. FACTUAL ASPECTS.....	3130
2.1 The Measure at Issue	3130
2.2 Other Factual Aspects.....	3130
3. PARTIES' REQUESTS FOR FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....	3132
4. ARGUMENTS OF THE PARTIES	3134
5. ARGUMENTS OF THE THIRD PARTIES	3134
6. INTERIM REVIEW	3134
6.1 Preliminary Matters	3135
6.2 Claims Relating to Unforeseen Developments and the Effect of the Obligations Incurred under the GATT 1994	3136
6.3 Claims Relating to Increased Imports.....	3136
6.4 Claims Relating to Threat of Serious Injury.....	3137
6.5 Claims Relating to Causation	3138
6.6 Claims Relating to the Application, Duration, and Liberalization of the Safeguard Measure at Issue	3138
6.7 Claims under Article II:1(b) of the GATT 1994	3140

Report of the Panel

6.8	Claims Relating to the Conduct of the Investigation and the Investigation Report	3140
6.9	Claims Relating to Notifications, Prior Consultations, and the Level of Concessions	3141
6.10	Conclusions	3143
7.	FINDINGS	3143
7.1	Preliminary Matters.....	3143
7.1.1	The safeguard measure at issue.....	3143
7.1.2	Procedure carried out by the competent authorities.....	3145
7.1.3	Overview of claims and order of the Panel's analysis...	3150
7.1.4	Standard of review	3153
7.1.5	Relevant Ukrainian documents	3156
7.2	Claims Relating to Unforeseen Developments and the Effect of the Obligations Incurred under the GATT 1994	3159
7.2.1	Claims under Article XIX:1(a) of the GATT 1994.....	3160
7.2.1.1	Unforeseen developments and the effect of GATT 1994 obligations.....	3161
7.2.1.2	Unforeseen developments.....	3166
7.2.1.2.1	The unforeseen developments alleged in this case	3166
7.2.1.2.2	Logical connection between the unforeseen developments and the relative increase in imports	3173
7.2.1.3	Effect of GATT 1994 obligations	3174
7.2.1.3.1	Identification of the effect of relevant GATT 1994 obligations.....	3175
7.2.1.3.2	Logical connection between the effect of GATT 1994 obligations and the relative increase in imports	3177
7.2.1.4	Overall conclusion	3178
7.2.2	Claim under Article 11.1(a)	3178
7.2.3	Claims under Articles 3.1 and 4.2(c)	3178
7.3	Claims Relating to Increased Imports	3180
7.3.1	Claims under Article 2.1	3180
7.3.1.1	Increased imports	3182
7.3.1.2	"[I]n such increased quantities"	3182

	7.3.1.2.1	Analysis of intervening trends in imports.....	3183
	7.3.1.2.2	Sudden, sharp, and significant increase.....	3189
	7.3.1.2.3	Amounts of imports.....	3192
	7.3.1.3	"[I]s being imported".....	3194
	7.3.1.4	"[U]nder such conditions".....	3205
	7.3.1.5	Overall conclusion.....	3206
7.3.2		Claims under Articles 3.1, 4.2(a), 4.2(c), and 11.1(a), and Article XIX:1(a).....	3207
	7.3.2.1	Claims under Articles 4.2(a) and 11.1(a), and Article XIX:1(a).....	3207
	7.3.2.2	Claims under Article 3.1, last sentence, and Article 4.2(c).....	3208
7.4		Claims Relating to Threat of Serious Injury.....	3209
	7.4.1	Claim under Article 4.2(a).....	3209
	7.4.1.1	The competent authorities' determination	3212
	7.4.1.2	Analysis of threat of serious injury	3214
	7.4.1.2.1	"Significant overall impairment".....	3215
	7.4.1.2.2	"Clearly imminent".....	3219
	7.4.1.2.3	Evaluation of relevant factors in a threat of serious injury determination.....	3219
	7.4.1.3	The competent authorities' analysis of threat of serious injury.....	3220
	7.4.1.3.1	The share of the domestic market taken by increased imports.....	3226
	7.4.1.3.2	The rate and amount of the increase in imports.....	3227
	7.4.1.3.3	Capacity of key exporting countries to generate exports.....	3228
	7.4.1.3.4	Injury factors pertaining directly to the situation of the domestic industry	3231
	7.4.1.3.5	Overall conclusion.....	3233
7.4.2		Claims under Articles 2.1, 3.1, 4.1(a), 4.1(b), 4.2(b), 4.2(c), 11.1(a) and Article XIX:1(a).....	3233

 Report of the Panel

	7.4.2.1	Articles 2.1, 4.1(a), 4.1(b), 4.2(b), 11.1(a) and Article XIX:1(a).....	3234
	7.4.2.2	Articles 3.1 and 4.2(c).....	3234
7.5		Claims Relating to Causation.....	3235
	7.5.1	Claims under Article 4.2(b).....	3236
	7.5.1.1	Demonstration of the existence of a causal link.....	3237
	7.5.1.2	Non-attribution analysis.....	3244
	7.5.2	Claims under Articles 2.1, 3.1, 4.1(a), 4.1(b), 4.2(a), 4.2(c), 11.1(a), and Article XIX:1(a).....	3252
	7.5.2.1	Claims under Articles 2.1, 4.1(a), 4.1(b), 4.2(a), 11.1(a) and Article XIX:1(a).....	3252
	7.5.2.2	Claims under Articles 3.1 and 4.2(c).....	3253
7.6		Claims Relating to the Application, Duration, and Liberalization of the Safeguard Measure at Issue.....	3253
	7.6.1	Claim under Article 7.4, first sentence.....	3254
	7.6.2	Claims under Articles 3.1, 4.2(c), 5.1, 7.1, and 11.1(a), and Article XIX:1(a).....	3259
	7.6.2.1	Claims under Articles 5.1 and 7.1.....	3260
	7.6.2.1.1	Claims under Articles 5.1 and 7.1 concerning "the extent necessary to facilitate adjustment".....	3260
	7.6.2.1.2	Claim under Article 5.1 concerning necessity "to prevent or remedy serious injury".....	3262
	7.6.2.2	Claims under Article 11.1(a) and Article XIX:1(a).....	3263
	7.6.2.3	Claims under Article 3.1, last sentence, and Article 4.2(c).....	3264
7.7		Claims under Article II:1(b) of the GATT 1994.....	3266
7.8		Claims Relating to the Conduct of the Investigation and the Investigation Report.....	3267
	7.8.1	Claim under Article 3.1, second sentence.....	3267
	7.8.1.1	Reasonable public notice.....	3269
	7.8.1.2	Public hearings or other appropriate means to present evidence and views, including an opportunity to respond to the presentations of others.....	3271

	Ukraine - Passenger Cars
7.8.1.3 Conclusion.....	3278
7.8.2 Claims under Article 3.1, last sentence, and Article 4.2(c)	3278
7.8.3 Claim under Article 3.1, first sentence.....	3284
7.9 Claims Relating to Notifications, Prior Consultations, and the Level of Concessions.....	3286
7.9.1 Claims under Article 12.1	3286
7.9.1.1 Notification requirements under Article 12.1	3287
7.9.1.1.1 Claim under Article 12.1(a).....	3289
7.9.1.1.2 Claims under Articles 12.1(b) and (c).....	3292
7.9.2 Claim under Article 12.2.....	3299
7.9.2.1 "All pertinent information".....	3300
7.9.2.2 The competent authorities' notification	3301
7.9.3 Claim under Article 12.3.....	3305
7.9.4 Claim under Article 12.5.....	3311
7.9.5 Claim under Article 8.1	3312
8. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	3314

Report of the Panel

LIST OF ANNEXES

ANNEX A

WORKING PROCEDURES OF THE PANEL

Contents		Page
Annex A-1	Working Procedures of the Panel	3319
Annex A-2	Additional Working Procedures concerning business confidential information	3326

ANNEX B

ARGUMENTS OF THE PARTIES

Contents		Page
Annex B-1	Integrated executive summary of the arguments of Japan	3329
Annex B-2	Integrated executive summary of the arguments of Ukraine	3353

ANNEX C

ARGUMENTS OF THE THIRD PARTIES

Contents		Page
Annex C-1	Integrated executive summary of the arguments of Australia	3375
Annex C-2	Integrated executive summary of the arguments of the European Union	3379
Annex C-3	Oral statement of Korea, Republic of	3386
Annex C-4	Integrated executive summary of the arguments of Turkey	3388
Annex C-5	Integrated executive summary of the arguments of the United States	3394

WTO AND GATT CASES CITED IN THIS REPORT

Short title	Full case title and citation
<i>Argentina – Footwear (EC)</i>	Appellate Body Report, <i>Argentina – Safeguard Measures on Imports of Footwear</i> , WT/DS121/AB/R, adopted 12 January 2000, DSR 2000:I, p. 515
<i>Argentina – Footwear (EC)</i>	Panel Report, <i>Argentina – Safeguard Measures on Imports of Footwear</i> , WT/DS121/R, adopted 12 January 2000, as modified by Appellate Body Report WT/DS121/AB/R, DSR 2000:II, p. 575
<i>Argentina – Import Measures</i>	Appellate Body Reports, <i>Argentina – Measures Affecting the Importation of Goods</i> , WT/DS438/AB/R / WT/DS444/AB/R / WT/DS445/AB/R, adopted 26 January 2015
<i>Argentina – Preserved Peaches</i>	Panel Report, <i>Argentina – Definitive Safeguard Measure on Imports of Preserved Peaches</i> , WT/DS238/R, adopted 15 April 2003, DSR 2003:III, p. 1037
<i>Australia – Salmon</i>	Appellate Body Report, <i>Australia – Measures Affecting Importation of Salmon</i> , WT/DS18/AB/R, adopted 6 November 1998, DSR 1998:VIII, p. 3327
<i>Canada – Wheat Exports and Grain Imports</i>	Appellate Body Report, <i>Canada – Measures Relating to Exports of Wheat and Treatment of Imported Grain</i> , WT/DS276/AB/R, adopted 27 September 2004, DSR 2004:VI, p. 2739
<i>Chile – Price Band System</i>	Panel Report, <i>Chile – Price Band System and Safeguard Measures Relating to Certain Agricultural Products</i> , WT/DS207/R, adopted 23 October 2002, as modified by Appellate Body Report WT/DS207AB/R, DSR 2002:VIII, p. 3127
<i>Dominican Republic – Safeguard Measures</i>	Panel Report, <i>Dominican Republic – Safeguard Measures on Imports of Polypropylene Bags and Tubular Fabric</i> , WT/DS415/R, WT/DS416/R, WT/DS417/R, WT/DS418/R, and Add.1, adopted 22 February 2012, DSR 2012:XIII, p. 6775

Report of the Panel

Short title	Full case title and citation
<i>EC – Bananas III (Article 21.5 – Ecuador II) / EC – Bananas III (Article 21.5 – US)</i>	Appellate Body Reports, <i>European Communities – Regime for the Importation, Sale and Distribution of Bananas – Second Recourse to Article 21.5 of the DSU by Ecuador</i> , WT/DS27/AB/RW2/ECU, adopted 11 December 2008, and Corr.1 / <i>European Communities – Regime for the Importation, Sale and Distribution of Bananas – Recourse to Article 21.5 of the DSU by the United States</i> , WT/DS27/AB/RW/USA and Corr.1, adopted 22 December 2008, DSR 2008:XVIII, p. 7165
<i>EC – IT Products</i>	Panel Reports, <i>European Communities and its member States – Tariff Treatment of Certain Information Technology Products</i> , WT/DS375/R / WT/DS376/R / WT/DS377/R, adopted 21 September 2010, DSR 2010:III, p. 933
<i>India – Patents (US)</i>	Appellate Body Report, <i>India – Patent Protection for Pharmaceutical and Agricultural Chemical Products</i> , WT/DS50/AB/R, adopted 16 January 1998, DSR 1998:I, p. 9
<i>Korea – Dairy</i>	Appellate Body Report, <i>Korea – Definitive Safeguard Measure on Imports of Certain Dairy Products</i> , WT/DS98/AB/R, adopted 12 January 2000, DSR 2000:I, p. 3
<i>Korea – Dairy</i>	Panel Report, <i>Korea – Definitive Safeguard Measure on Imports of Certain Dairy Products</i> , WT/DS98/R and Corr.1, adopted 12 January 2000, as modified by Appellate Body Report WT/DS98/AB/R, DSR 2000:I, p. 49
<i>Mexico – Anti-Dumping Measures on Rice</i>	Appellate Body Report, <i>Mexico – Definitive Anti-Dumping Measures on Beef and Rice, Complaint with Respect to Rice</i> , WT/DS295/AB/R, adopted 20 December 2005, DSR 2005:XXII, p. 10853
<i>Mexico – Taxes on Soft Drinks</i>	Panel Report, <i>Mexico – Tax Measures on Soft Drinks and Other Beverages</i> , WT/DS308/R, adopted 24 March 2006, as modified by Appellate Body Report WT/DS308/AB/R, DSR 2006:I, p. 43
<i>US – Cotton Yarn</i>	Appellate Body Report, <i>United States – Transitional Safeguard Measure on Combed Cotton Yarn from Pakistan</i> , WT/DS192/AB/R, adopted 5 November 2001, DSR 2001:XII, p. 6027

Ukraine - Passenger Cars

Short title	Full case title and citation
<i>US – Lamb</i>	Appellate Body Report, <i>United States – Safeguard Measures on Imports of Fresh, Chilled or Frozen Lamb Meat from New Zealand and Australia</i> , WT/DS177/AB/R, WT/DS178/AB/R, adopted 16 May 2001, DSR 2001:IX, p. 4051
<i>US – Lamb</i>	Panel Report, <i>United States – Safeguard Measures on Imports of Fresh, Chilled or Frozen Lamb Meat from New Zealand and Australia</i> , WT/DS177/R, WT/DS178/R, adopted 16 May 2001, as modified by Appellate Body Report WT/DS177/AB/R, WT/DS178/AB/R, DSR 2001:IX, p. 4107
<i>US – Line Pipe</i>	Appellate Body Report, <i>United States – Definitive Safeguard Measures on Imports of Circular Welded Carbon Quality Line Pipe from Korea</i> , WT/DS202/AB/R, adopted 8 March 2002, DSR 2002:IV, p. 1403
<i>US – Steel Safeguards</i>	Appellate Body Report, <i>United States – Definitive Safeguard Measures on Imports of Certain Steel Products</i> , WT/DS248/AB/R, WT/DS249/AB/R, WT/DS251/AB/R, WT/DS252/AB/R, WT/DS253/AB/R, WT/DS254/AB/R, WT/DS258/AB/R, WT/DS259/AB/R, adopted 10 December 2003, DSR 2003:VII, p. 3117
<i>US – Steel Safeguards</i>	Panel Reports, <i>United States – Definitive Safeguard Measures on Imports of Certain Steel Products</i> , WT/DS248/R / WT/DS249/R / WT/DS251/R / WT/DS252/R / WT/DS253/R / WT/DS254/R / WT/DS258/R / WT/DS259/R / and Corr.1, adopted 10 December 2003, as modified by Appellate Body Report WT/DS248/AB/R, WT/DS249/AB/R, WT/DS251/AB/R, WT/DS252/AB/R, WT/DS253/AB/R, WT/DS254/AB/R, WT/DS258/AB/R, WT/DS259/AB/R, DSR 2003:VIII, p. 3273
<i>US – Tuna II (Mexico)</i>	Appellate Body Report, <i>United States – Measures Concerning the Importation, Marketing and Sale of Tuna and Tuna Products</i> , WT/DS381/AB/R, adopted 13 June 2012, DSR 2012:IV, p. 1837

Report of the Panel

Short title	Full case title and citation
<i>US – Tyres (China)</i>	Appellate Body Report, <i>United States – Measures Affecting Imports of Certain Passenger Vehicle and Light Truck Tyres from China</i> , WT/DS399/AB/R, adopted 5 October 2011, DSR 2011:IX, p. 4811
<i>US – Upland Cotton</i>	Appellate Body Report, <i>United States – Subsidies on Upland Cotton</i> , WT/DS267/AB/R, adopted 21 March 2005, DSR 2005:I, p. 3
<i>US – Wheat Gluten</i>	Appellate Body Report, <i>United States – Definitive Safeguard Measures on Imports of Wheat Gluten from the European Communities</i> , WT/DS166/AB/R, adopted 19 January 2001, DSR 2001:II, p. 717
<i>US – Wheat Gluten</i>	Panel Report, <i>United States – Definitive Safeguard Measures on Imports of Wheat Gluten from the European Communities</i> , WT/DS166/R, adopted 19 January 2001, as modified by Appellate Body Report WT/DS166/AB/R, DSR 2001:III, p. 779
<i>US – Wool Shirts and Blouses</i>	Appellate Body Report, <i>United States – Measure Affecting Imports of Woven Wool Shirts and Blouses from India</i> , WT/DS33/AB/R, adopted 23 May 1997, and Corr.1, DSR 1997:I, p. 323

ABBREVIATIONS USED IN THIS REPORT

Abbreviation	Description
Anti-Dumping Agreement	Agreement on Implementation of Article VI of the General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade 1994
BCI	Business Confidential Information
Commission	The Interdepartmental Commission on Foreign Trade of Ukraine
DSB	Dispute Settlement Body
DSU	Understanding on Rules and Procedures Governing the Settlement of Disputes
GATT 1994	General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade 1994
Key Findings	Key Findings of the Ministry of Economic Development and Trade of Ukraine Based on Special investigation on Imports of Motors Cars to Ukraine Regardless of the Country of Origin and Export
Ministry	The Ministry of Economic Development and Trade of Ukraine
Notice of 14 March 2013	Notice of Imposition of Safeguard Measures on Imports of Motor Cars to Ukraine Regardless of Country of Origin and Export, as published in the <i>Uryadovyi Kuryer</i> No. 48 of 14 March 2013
SCM Agreement	Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures
Safeguards Law	Ukraine's Law on Application of Safeguard Measures Against Imports to Ukraine, 22 December 1998, No. 332-XIV
<i>The Shorter Oxford Dictionary</i> (1993)	New Shorter Oxford English Dictionary, 1993 (4 th edition), Volumes 1 and 2
<i>The Shorter Oxford Dictionary</i> (2002)	New Shorter Oxford English Dictionary, 2002 (5 th edition), Volumes 1 and 2
<i>The Shorter Oxford Dictionary</i> (2007)	New Shorter Oxford English Dictionary, 2007 (6 th edition), Volumes 1 and 2
WTO	World Trade Organization
WTO Agreement	Marrakesh Agreement Establishing the WTO