

## REPRESENTATION AND SCEPTICISM FROM AQUINAS TO DESCARTES

In this book Han Thomas Adriaenssen offers the first comparative exploration of the sceptical reception of representationalism in medieval and early modern philosophy. Descartes is traditionally credited with inaugurating a new kind of scepticism by saying that the direct objects of perception are images in the mind, not external objects, but Adriaenssen shows that as early as the thirteenth century, critics had already found similar problems in Aquinas's theory of representation. He charts the attempts of philosophers in both periods to grapple with these problems, and shows how in order to address the challenges of scepticism and representation, modern philosophers in the wake of Descartes often breathed new life into old ideas, remoulding them in ways that we are just beginning to understand. His book will be valuable for historians interested in the medieval background to early modern thought, and to medievalists looking at continuity with the early modern period.

HAN THOMAS ADRIAENSSEN is Assistant Professor in the Faculty of Philosophy at the University of Groningen. He has published a number of journal articles on medieval and early modern philosophy.

REPRESENTATION AND  
SCEPTICISM FROM  
AQUINAS TO DESCARTES

HAN THOMAS ADRIAENSSEN



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-18162-5 — Representation and Scepticism from Aquinas to Descartes  
Han Thomas Adriaenssen  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom  
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryaganj, Delhi – 110002, India  
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.  
It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of  
education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781107181625](http://www.cambridge.org/9781107181625)  
DOI: 10.1017/9781316855102

© Han Thomas Adriaenssen 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written  
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

ISBN 978-1-107-18162-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of  
URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication  
and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain,  
accurate or appropriate.

## *Contents*

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	viii
Introduction	I
PART I THE VEIL OF SPECIES	II
1 Through Species to the World: Aquinas and Henry of Ghent	13
1.1 Cognition, Change and Assimilation	14
1.2 Apprehending Species and the Directness of Cognition	20
1.3 Species and Scepticism	25
1.4 Henry of Ghent	29
2 Perception without Intermediaries: Olivi's Critique of Species	40
2.1 Challenging the Species Theory	41
2.2 Augustinian Alternatives	53
2.3 Olivi's Direct Realism	57
2.4 Olivi on Representational Content	64
2.5 Conceptual Cognition: The Limits of Olivi's Direct Realism	71
3 Direct Realism about Perception and Beyond: Auriol and Ockham	81
3.1 Auriol on Perception	82
3.2 Auriol on Conceptual Thought	87
3.3 Ockham on Seeing without Species	99
3.4 Acts of the Imagination and Their Objects	110
3.5 Thinking of Universals	114
PART II THE VEIL OF CARTESIAN IDEAS	121
4 Transformations of Cartesianism: Malebranche and Arnauld	125
4.1 Descartes	126
4.2 Malebranche's Intervention	143
4.3 The Vision in God	148

vi	<i>Contents</i>	
4.4	Arnauld and the Charge of Idealism	155
4.5	Arnauld's Alternative	159
5	Ideas and Objects in Desgabets's Radical Cartesianism	169
5.1	Problems from Foucher	171
5.2	Desgabets and Direct Realism	174
5.3	Desgabets's Intentionality Principle	176
5.4	Reinterpreting the Essential Being	186
5.5	A Destruction of Pyrrhonism?	193
6	The Solid Philosophy of John Sergeant	198
6.1	Cartesianism as a Religious Threat	199
6.2	Sergeant's Critique	205
6.3	Sergeant's Way of Notions	211
6.4	Things in the Mind	214
	PART III REPRESENTATIONS AND SCEPTICISM	221
7	From Representation to Object	223
7.1	Unused Representations	224
7.2	Ontological Problems	227
7.3	Ontology and the Objective Being	235
8	Criteriological Problems	238
8.1	Epistemic Optimism	239
8.2	Can We Trust Our Ideas?	246
	Conclusion	255
	<i>Bibliography</i>	260
	<i>Index</i>	275

## *Acknowledgements*

This book has grown out of a dissertation written under the supervision of Lodi Nauta at the University of Groningen. I am grateful to Lodi for all his advice. Thanks are also due to Paul Bakker, Henrik Lagerlund, Russell Friedman and Robert Pasnau, who kindly agreed to serve as examiners of the thesis. The University of Groningen has been a wonderful place to rework the project. With colleagues such as Sander de Boer, Martin Lenz, Lodi, Detlev Pätzold, Andrea Sangiacomo and Emily Thomas, it is hard to imagine a friendlier and more inspiring environment to work on late medieval and early modern thought.

Some of the chapters in this book have been presented at conferences in Nijmegen, Sherbrooke, London, New York, Liège and Mainz, and I have learned a lot from the participants and audiences at all of these occasions. At a conference in Groningen, Dominik Perler provided a set of constructive comments on a paper that has developed into Chapter 5 of this book. Two anonymous readers have provided extensive and very helpful reports. I am grateful to them, and to Cambridge University Press for arranging these reports.

Although the book mostly consists of new material, I gratefully acknowledge permissions from editors and publishers to reuse portions from earlier papers. Chapter 2 makes use of some material from my ‘Peter John Olivi on Perceptual Representation’, which appeared in *Vivarium*, 49. Chapters 2 and 3 incorporate portions from ‘Peter John Olivi and Peter Auriol on Conceptual Thought’, *Oxford Studies in Medieval Philosophy*, 2. Some material from ‘The Representation of Hercules. Ockham’s Critique of Species’ in *Documenti e Studi*, 26 appears in Chapter 3. A section from Chapter 5 builds on ‘The Radical Cartesianism of Robert Desgabets and the Scholastic Heritage’, *British Journal for the History of Philosophy*, 23, published by Taylor and Francis. Permission to use Vermeer’s *The Art of Painting* has kindly been granted by the KHM-Museumsverband, Vienna.

Finally, and on a more personal note, I want to express my gratitude to Clazina, who has shared with me in both the joys and the pains of preparing this book.

## *Abbreviations*

AT	Descartes, <i>Œuvres de Descartes</i>
CdC	Desgabets, <i>Critique de la Critique</i>
CSM	Descartes, <i>Philosophical Writings of Descartes</i>
CSMK	Descartes, <i>Philosophical Writings of Descartes. Correspondence</i>
D	Malebranche, <i>Dialogues on Metaphysics and on Religion</i>
DM	Suárez, <i>Disputationes metaphysicae</i>
ES	Auriol, <i>Electronic Scriptum super primum Sententiarum</i>
HO	Henry of Ghent, <i>Henrici de Gandavo Opera Omnia</i>
LO	Malebranche, <i>The Search after Truth</i>
OA	Arnauld, <i>Œuvres de Messire Antoine Arnauld</i>
OCM	Malebranche, <i>Œuvres complètes de Malebranche</i>
Oph.	Ockham, <i>Opera Philosophica</i>
OTh.	Ockham, <i>Opera Theologica</i>
QDV	Aquinas, <i>Quaestiones disputatae de veritate</i>
SCG	Aquinas, <i>Summa contra gentiles</i>
SDA	Aquinas, <i>Sentencia libri De anima</i>
SL	Ockham, <i>Summa logicae</i>
SQO	Henry of Ghent, <i>Summa quaestionum ordinarium</i>
ST	Aquinas, <i>Summa theologiae</i>
Summa	Olivi, <i>Quaestiones in secundum librum Sententiarum</i>
TDV	Pasnau, 'Petri Ioanni Olivi Tractatus de Verbo'

References to Aquinas give page numbers in the Leonine edition when possible. References to books I–III of the *Sentences* commentary cite the Mandonnet edition, and the earlier Parma edition for book IV. References to Olivi's *Summa* specify volume and page number in the Jansen edition between brackets. The *Electronic Scriptum* is cited by line rather than page number. Unless indicated otherwise, all translations are my own.