

## DEPENDENCY AND DIRECTIONALITY

The direction in which the structure of sentences and filler–gap dependencies are built is a topic of fundamental importance to linguistic theory and its applications. This book develops an integrated understanding of structure building, movement, and locality embedded in a syntactic theory that constructs trees from the top down, presenting an explicit counterweight to the bottom-up derivations pervading the Chomskian mainstream. It combines a compact and comprehensive historical perspective on structure building, the cycle, and movement with detailed discussions of island effects, the typology of long-distance filler–gap dependencies, and the special problems posed by the subject in clausal syntax. Providing introductions to the main issues, reviewing extant arguments for bottom-up and top-down approaches, and presenting several case studies in its development of a new theory, this book should be of interest to all students and scholars of language interested in syntactic structures and the dependencies inside them.

MARCEL DEN DIKKEN (PhD, Leiden, 1992) has held university appointments in Amsterdam, Groningen, Tilburg, Los Angeles, and New York City, and is currently a research professor in Budapest. He is the author of three monographs, co-author of *Syntax of Dutch: Nouns and Noun Phrases* (volume 2), editor of *The Cambridge Handbook of Generative Syntax*, and series editor of *Studies in Natural Language and Linguistic Theory*.

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-17756-7 – Dependency and Directionality  
Marcel den Dikken  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN LINGUISTICS

*General Editors:* P. AUSTIN, J. BRESNAN, B. COMRIE, S. CRAIN,  
W. DRESSLER, C. J. EWEN, R. LASS, D. LIGHTFOOT, K. RICE,  
I. ROBERTS, S. ROMAINE, N. V. SMITH

---

*In this series*

116. GILLIAN CATRIONA RAMCHAND: *Verb Meaning and the Lexicon: A First Phase Syntax*
117. PIETER MUYSKEN: *Functional Categories*
118. JUAN URIAGEREKA: *Syntactic Anchors: On Semantic Structuring*
119. D. ROBERT LADD: *Intonational Phonology (Second Edition)*
120. LEONARD H. BABBY: *The Syntax of Argument Structure*
121. B. ELAN DRESHER: *The Contrastive Hierarchy in Phonology*
122. DAVID ADGER, DANIEL HARBOUR and LAUREL J. WATKINS: *Mirrors and Microparameters: Phrase Structure Beyond Free Word Order*
123. NIINA NING ZHANG: *Coordination in Syntax*
124. NEIL SMITH: *Acquiring Phonology*
125. NINA TOPINTZI: *Onsets: Suprasegmental and Prosodic Behaviour*
126. CEDRIC BOECKX, NORBERT HORNSTEIN and JAIRO NUNES: *Control as Movement*
127. MICHAEL ISRAEL: *The Grammar of Polarity: Pragmatics, Sensitivity, and the Logic of Scales*
128. M. RITA MANZINI and LEONARDO M. SAVOIA: *Grammatical Categories: Variation in Romance Languages*
129. BARBARA CITKO: *Symmetry in Syntax: Merge, Move and Labels*
130. RACHEL WALKER: *Vowel Patterns in Language*
131. MARY DALRYMPLE and IRINA NIKOLAEVA: *Objects and Information Structure*
132. JERROLD M. SADOCK: *The Modular Architecture of Grammar*
133. DUNSTAN BROWN and ANDREW HIPPLISLEY: *Network Morphology: A Defaults-Based Theory of Word Structure*
134. BETTELOU LOS, CORRIEN BLOM, GEERT BOOIJ, MARION ELENBAAS and ANS VAN KEMENADE: *Morphosyntactic Change: A Comparative Study of Particles and Prefixes*
135. STEPHEN CRAIN: *The Emergence of Meaning*
136. HUBERT HAIDER: *Symmetry Breaking in Syntax*
137. JOSÉ A. CAMACHO: *Null Subjects*
138. GREGORY STUMP and RAPHAEL A. FINKEL: *Morphological Typology: From Word to Paradigm*
139. BRUCE TESAR: *Output-Driven Phonology: Theory and Learning*
140. ASIER ALCÁZAR AND MARIO SALTARELLI: *The Syntax of Imperatives*
141. MISHA BECKER: *The Acquisition of Syntactic Structure: Animacy and Thematic Alignment*
142. MARTINA WILTSCHKO: *The Universal Structure of Categories: Towards a Formal Typology*
143. FAHAD RASHED AL-MUTAIRI: *The Minimalist Program: The Nature and Plausibility of Chomsky's Biolinguistics*
144. CEDRIC BOECKX: *Elementary Syntactic Structures: Prospects of a Feature-Free Syntax*
145. PHOEVOS PANAGIOTIDIS: *Categorial Features: A Generative Theory of Word Class Categories*
146. MARK BAKER: *Case: Its Principles and its Parameters*
147. WILLIAM BENNETT: *The Phonology of Consonants: Dissimilation, Harmony and Correspondence*
148. ANDREA SIMS: *Inflectional Defectiveness*

149. GREGORY STUMP: *Inflectional Paradigms: Content and Form at the Syntax-Morphology Interface*
150. ROCHELLE LIEBER: *English Nouns: The Ecology of Nominalization*
151. JOHN BOWERS: *Deriving Syntactic Relations*
152. ANA TERESA PÉREZ-LEROUX, MIHAELA PIRVULESCU and YVES ROBERGE: *Direct Objects and Language Acquisition*
153. MATTHEW BAERMAN, DUNSTAN BROWN and GREVILLE CORBETT: *Morphological Complexity*
154. MARCEL DEN DIKKEN: *Dependency and Directionality*

Earlier issues not listed are also available

# DEPENDENCY AND DIRECTIONALITY

MARCEL DEN DIKKEN

*Eötvös Loránd University*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-17756-7 – Dependency and Directionality  
Marcel den Dikken  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,  
New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781107177567](http://www.cambridge.org/9781107177567)

DOI: 10.1017/9781316822821

© Marcel den Dikken 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

Names: Dikken, Marcel den, 1965– author.

Title: Dependency and directionality / Marcel den Dikken, Eotvos Lorand University, Hungary.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2017. | Series: Cambridge studies in linguistics ; 153 | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2017018416 | ISBN 9781107177567 (acid-free paper)

Subjects: LCSH: Deep structure (Linguistics) | Language and languages – Syntax.

Classification: LCC P158.16 .D55 2017 | DDC 415.01/84–dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2017018416>

ISBN 978-1-107-17756-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-17756-7 – Dependency and Directionality  
Marcel den Dikken  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

**For my wonderful wife**

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-17756-7 – Dependency and Directionality  
Marcel den Dikken  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---



# Contents

---

	<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>page xv</i>
<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
	1.1 Dependency	1
	1.2 Directionality	2
	1.3 The Objectives of the Book	8
	1.4 The Structure of the Book	9
	1.4.1 Chapter 2: The Directionality of Structure Building	9
	1.4.2 Chapter 3: Find the Gap	10
	1.4.3 Chapter 4: A Syntactic Typology of Long $\bar{A}$ -Dependencies	11
	1.4.4 Chapter 5: The Trouble with Subjects	11
	1.4.5 Chapter 6: Conclusion	12
	1.5 A Note to the Reader	12
<b>2</b>	<b>The Directionality of Structure Building</b>	<b>14</b>
	2.1 Introduction	14
	2.2 What Makes Trees Grow	15
	2.2.1 Endocentricity and Extended Projection	18
	2.2.2 Guiding the Guessing: The Numeration	21
	2.2.3 Top-down Versus Left-to-right: A Brief Note on Linear Order	22
	2.2.4 On the Internal Organisation of Functional Structures	23
	2.3 Working from the Bottom up: The Cycle	25
	2.3.1 Clausal Recursion and the Cycle	25
	2.3.1.1 Clausal Subordination: Bridge Verbs, Factive Verbs and Pronominal Heralds	26
	2.3.1.2 Object Positions and Presuppositionality	28
	2.3.1.3 Back to Clausal Recursion	32
	2.3.1.4 Conclusions and Consequences Concerning the Cycle and Directionality	37
	2.3.1.5 Appendix: Verb Phrase Structure and Linearisation	40
		ix

x *Contents*

2.3.2	Cyclicity and Opacity: On the Phase	48
2.3.2.1	Opaque Domains: By Decree or Algorithm?	48
2.3.2.2	Cyclic Spell-out	54
2.3.2.3	Directionality	59
2.3.3	Feature Inheritance and the Structural Subject	61
2.3.4	Successive Cyclicity	64
2.3.5	Conclusion	70
2.4	Working from the Top Down: Constituency Conflicts and Dependencies	71
2.4.1	Constituency Conflicts: Phillips (1996, 2003)	71
2.4.1.1	Temporary Constituency	72
2.4.1.2	C-command and Binding: ‘Pesetsky Paradoxes’	75
2.4.1.3	Conclusion	90
2.4.2	Filler–gap Dependencies: Chesi (2007, 2015)	91
2.4.2.1	Successive Cyclicity	91
2.4.2.2	Strong Islands	95
2.4.2.3	Parasitic Gaps	96
2.4.2.4	On the Relationship Between Parasitic Gaps and <i>wh</i> -scope Marking	98
2.4.2.5	Closing remarks on Chesi (2007, 2015)	100
2.5	Conclusion	101
<b>3</b>	<b>Find the Gap</b>	<b>103</b>
3.1	Introduction	103
3.2	A Broad Sketch of the Top-down Approach to Filler–gap Dependencies	104
3.2.1	Step 1: Uploading a Copy of the Filler onto a Pushdown Stack	104
3.2.2	Step 2: Downloading the Pushdown Stack onto the Edge of the First Predication Structure	105
3.2.3	Step 3: Tracing	105
3.2.4	Step 4 (Only in ‘Weak Island’ Contexts Involving Argument Dependencies): Re-uploading	106
3.2.5	Direct Filler–gap Dependencies and What Obstructs Them	107
3.3	Absolute Islands	108
3.3.1	Absolute Islands for Agreement	108
3.3.2	Absolute Islands for Filler–gap Dependencies	111
3.3.2.1	The Subject Condition	113
3.3.2.2	The Complex Noun Phrase Constraint	116
3.3.2.3	The Specificity Condition	120
3.3.2.4	Factive Islands	124
3.3.2.5	The Adjunct Condition	126

3.4	Intervention Islands	139
3.4.1	<i>Wh</i> -islands	140
3.4.1.1	Re-uploading and the Argument/Non-argument Asymmetry	141
3.4.1.2	Long Subject Dependencies and the Subject/Object Asymmetry	143
3.4.1.3	On the Severity of <i>Wh</i> -island Violations Involving Arguments	148
3.4.2	Paths and the Pathology of Intervention Islands	150
3.4.2.1	Multiple Fillers, Multiple Paths	152
3.4.2.2	Path Containment	153
3.4.2.3	<i>Why</i> <i>Why</i> and <i>Whether Are Different</i>	158
3.4.3	Beck-style Intervention Effects and ‘Inner Islands’	172
3.4.3.1	Construction Types Exhibiting Beck-style Intervention Effects	172
3.4.3.2	Harmful and Harmless Interveners	173
3.4.3.3	The Signature and Locus of Beck-style Intervention Effects	175
3.4.3.4	A Top-down Syntactic Analysis of Beck-style Intervention Effects and ‘Inner Islands’	177
3.5	Islands: Bottom-up or Top-down?	190
3.5.1	Absolute Islands	190
3.5.2	Intervention Islands	191
3.5.3	A Note on Derivation Versus Representation	192
<b>4</b>	<b>A Syntactic Typology of Long <math>\bar{A}</math>-dependencies</b>	<b>194</b>
4.1	Introduction	194
4.2	Hungarian in Focus	200
4.2.1	Upstairs Agreement with the Complement Clause (DEF)	201
4.2.1.1	The a-sentences: Direct Long-distance Filler-gap Dependencies	201
4.2.1.2	The b-sentences: Resumptive Prolepsis with an Oblique Matrix <i>Wh</i> -expression	206
4.2.2	Upstairs Indefinite Agreement with the <i>Wh</i> -phrase (INDEF)	210
4.2.2.1	The c-sentences: Resumptive Prolepsis with an Accusative Matrix <i>Wh</i> -expression	210
4.2.2.2	The d-sentences: <i>Wh</i> -topic Drop	216
4.2.2.3	The e-sentences: <i>Wh</i> -scope Marking	226
4.2.3	The Landscape of Hungarian Long $\bar{A}$ -dependencies in a Nutshell	228
4.2.4	Appendix: Further Issues in the Syntax of Hungarian Long $\bar{A}$ -dependencies	231
4.2.4.1	A Specificity Effect with a Parallel in French	232

xii *Contents*

4.2.4.2	Inner Islands	233
4.2.4.3	A Word-order Restriction in Multiple Wh-fronting	234
4.3	<i>Wh</i> -copying as Concordial Scope Marking	236
4.3.1	Not Literal Copying	237
4.3.2	Concordial Scope Marking	238
4.3.3	A Different Kind of ‘ <i>Wh</i> -copying’	240
4.3.4	On the Cross-linguistic Distribution of Concordial Scope Marking	241
4.4	<i>Wh</i> -control	244
4.5	Conclusion	247
4.6	The Case of Dinka Long-distance $\bar{A}$ -fronting	248
<b>5</b>	<b>The Trouble with Subjects</b>	<b>254</b>
5.1	Introduction	254
5.2	A Concise Historical Perspective	255
5.2.1	The Subject Function: Some Preliminaries	255
5.2.2	The Filler Requirement for the Structural Subject Position: The ‘EPP’	257
5.2.3	Infinitives: Raising, Control, and PRO	260
5.2.4	Subject Extraction and the ‘ECP’	265
5.2.4.1	The Empirical Core	265
5.2.4.2	The ECP	269
5.2.4.3	A Positional Account and Its Limitations	276
5.2.4.4	A Labelling Account and Its Limitations	278
5.3	A New Analysis	283
5.3.1	The Theoretical Core	283
5.3.2	On Agree in a Top-down Grammar	284
5.3.3	The Locality of Agree Relations	286
5.3.4	Co-projection	287
5.3.5	The EPP and Cross-linguistic Variation in the Filling of SpecTP	291
5.3.6	Complementiser Omission	292
5.3.7	The Generalised Complementiser-trace Effect	293
5.3.8	The <i>Do</i> -trace Effect	295
5.3.9	The Effect of a High Adverbial on Complementiser Omission and Subject Extraction	296
5.3.10	The Effect of a High Adverbial on C–T Chain Formation	298
5.3.11	On PRO	299
5.3.12	Null Operator Relatives and the ‘Anti- <i>that</i> -trace Effect’	301
5.3.13	Long Null-operator Dependencies	303

		<i>Contents</i>	xiii
	5.3.14 <i>Convince</i> -class Clausal Complementation		311
	5.3.14.1 The Empirical Lie of the Land		312
	5.3.14.2 Previous Scholarship		317
	5.3.14.3 What Makes the Two Verb Classes Different		318
	5.3.14.4 Long-distance <i>Wh</i> -Dependencies in <i>Convince</i> -class Constructions: <i>Wh</i> -control		322
	5.3.14.5 The Ban on Long Subject Dependencies in <i>Convince</i> -class Constructions Explained		328
	5.3.14.6 Non-argument Dependencies in <i>Convince</i> -class Constructions Revisited		329
	5.3.14.7 The Location of the Gap Bound by the Matrix <i>Wh</i> -filler		330
	5.3.14.8 An <i>Of</i> -trace Effect		334
	5.3.15 Other Long Subject Dependencies Across an Absolute Island		337
	5.3.16 On the Selective Transparency of Highest-subject Relative Clauses		339
	5.3.17 Subject Extraction from <i>Wh</i> -islands		349
	5.3.18 Multiple <i>Wh</i> -fronting and Superiority		352
	5.4 Summary and Conclusion		356
<b>6</b>	<b>Conclusion</b>		359
	<i>Abstracts and Keywords</i>		361
	<i>References</i>		369
	<i>Index</i>		384

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-17756-7 – Dependency and Directionality  
Marcel den Dikken  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

Part of the research done for this work was financially supported by Hungarian Scientific Research Fund (OTKA) grant #84217, to Balázs Surányi, which is very gratefully acknowledged.

Budapest, August 2016

---

*Department of English Linguistics  
Eötvös Loránd University  
1088 Budapest  
Rákóczi út 5  
Hungary  
marcel.den.dikken@nytud.mta.hu*

*Research Institute for Linguistics  
Hungarian Academy of Sciences  
1394 Budapest  
P.O. Box 360  
Hungary*

## *Acknowledgements*

---

This book could not start without the prominent acknowledgement of Janet Dean Fodor's influence on its birth and development. It was thanks to her initiative to team-teach a graduate seminar entitled 'The psycholinguistics of minimalism' in the spring of 2012 that I first started thinking in earnest about the feasibility of a top-down approach to the building of syntactic structures and the establishment of filler-gap dependencies within them. She introduced me and the students in the seminar to the work of Cristiano Chesì and Sandiway Fong, which has left a major mark on this book. The seminar also gave me an excellent opportunity to put Colin Phillips' seminal work on top-down syntax under the microscope. The paper that I wrote during the semester laid the foundations for the present monograph. Like the class on Universal Grammar and explanatory power, which Janet and I team-taught in 2003, the seminar on the psycholinguistics of minimalism was tremendously rewarding, thanks first and foremost to Janet's inspiring teaching and collaboration. Without Janet, this book would never have come into existence. I hope she will read this fruit of our 2012 seminar with approval.

I would like to pay explicit tribute to my employers during the long period in which this book was composed: the Linguistics Program at the CUNY Graduate Center in New York City, my home for 17 years, where the work began; the Research Institute for Linguistics of the Hungarian Academy of Sciences in Budapest, which first gave me a year to work on this project as a Distinguished Guest Scientist (in the 2014–15 academic year) and subsequently, thanks to the wonderful support from its director, István Kenesei, employed me on a long-term basis; the Department of English Linguistics at Eötvös Loránd University (ELTE) in Budapest, which welcomed me as a Research Professor at the start of the 2015–16 academic year (special thanks here to Mark Newson and Péter Szigetvári at the department, János Kenyeres at the School of English and American Studies, and two successive Deans of the Faculty of the Humanities for their full support); and Balázs Surányi's project funded by the Hungarian Scientific Research Fund (OTKA grant #84217), which 'housed' me during the final stages of the writing. The support and encouragement I have received from

xvi *Acknowledgements*

all these academic communities has been tremendous, and cannot be praised enough.

The preparation of the final manuscript of this work has benefited in many important ways from the comments and questions I have received on (larger or smaller) subparts of the text from a multitude of audiences, including the graduate students at the Linguistics Program of the CUNY Graduate Center and the Department of English Linguistics of Eötvös Loránd University, and the participants of conferences, lectures, or lecture series at Amsterdam, Bangor, Brno, Budapest, Cambridge, Chicago, Debrecen, Geneva, Groningen, Hong Kong, Konstanz, Lagodekhi, Leiden, Leipzig, Lubbock, Lisbon, MIT, Piliscsaba, Seoul, Storrs, Szeged, Tilburg, and Utrecht. I heartily thank the organisers of these events for their invitations, and the audiences for their copious feedback.

A special ‘thank you’ goes to Krisztina Szécsényi, with whom I team-taught a full-semester seminar based on the entire book manuscript in the spring of 2016, and who provided immensely valuable comments on the complete text. Márton Kucsera gave me very helpful feedback, too.

I would also like to express my gratitude to Neil Smith for the highly supportive and encouraging clearance report he wrote for the Press.

At the Press, Helen Barton deserves a special mention for her never-failing optimism and support. I would also like to acknowledge the good work done by the production staff at Cambridge University Press. Working with competent, constructive, and cheerful people is such a blessing.

I dedicate this book to Éva Dékány, who is the source and force behind everything good in my work and life.