Paternalism Beyond Borders

We live in a world in which the international community aspires to protect and promote the quality of human life. To do so often requires the exercise of control over the very individuals, societies, states, and peoples that are the objects of concern. In other words, power is a prominent feature of a global ethics of care. This book examines paternalism beyond borders from the nineteenth century to the present, and in everyday practices of humanitarianism, human rights, development, and other projects designed to improve the lives of others. It offers a provocative look at the subtle and variable ways that power works its way in and through global ethics, and considers whether and when paternalism might be justified.

Paternalism Beyond Borders

Edited by
Michael N. Barnett

The George Washington University
Contents

Notes on Contributors vii
Acknowledgments xi

Introduction: International Paternalism: Framing the Debate 1
MICHAEL N. BARNETT

Part I The Boundaries of Paternalism 45
1 Only in the Ballpark of Paternalism: Arrogance and Liberty-Limitation in International Humanitarian Aid 47
HENRY S. RICHARDSON
2 Rethinking Paternalism: The Meaning of Gender and Sex in the Politics of Asylum 75
DIDIER FASSIN

Part II Paternalism, Old and New 97
3 Eurocentric Pitfalls and Paradoxes of International Paternalism: Decolonizing Liberal Humanitarianism 2.0 99
JOHN M. HOBSON
4 The New International Paternalism: International Regimes 132
DAVID CHANDLER

Part III The Social Relations of Paternalism 159
5 Paternalism and Peacebuilding: Capacity, Knowledge, and Resistance in International Intervention 161
SÉVERINE AUTESSERRE
Contents

vi

6  Enabling or Disabling Paternalism: (In)attention to Gender and Women’s Knowledge, Capacity, and Authority in Humanitarian Contexts 185
   AISLING SWAINE

7  The Limits of Consent: Sex Trafficking and the Problem of International Paternalism 224
   SALLY ENGLE MERRY AND VIBHUTI RAMACHANDRAN

8  Modernity at the Cutting Edge: Human Rights Meets FGM 256
   STEPHEN HOPGOOD

9  Humanitarian Refusals: Palestinian Refugees and Ethnographic Perspectives on Paternalism 292
   ILANA FELDMAN

   Conclusion: The World According to Paternalism 316
   MICHAEL N. BARNETT

Index 345
Contributors

Séverine Autesserre is an Associate Professor of Political Science, specializing in international relations and African studies, at Barnard College, Columbia University (USA). She works on civil wars, peacebuilding, peacekeeping, humanitarian aid, and African politics. She has written many articles and two award-winning books Peaceland: Conflict Resolution and the Everyday Politics of International Intervention, and The Trouble with the Congo: Local Violence and the Failure of International Peacebuilding. Before becoming an academic, she worked for humanitarian and development agencies in Afghanistan, Kosovo, the Democratic Republic of Congo, Nicaragua, and India.


David Chandler is Professor of International Relations, Department of Politics and International Relations, University of Westminster, London and editor of the journal Resilience: International Policies, Practices and Discourses. His most recent books are The Neoliberal Subject: Resilience, Adaptation and Vulnerability (2016) and Resilience: The Governance of Complexity (2014).

Didier Fassin is Professor of Social Science at the Institute for Advanced Study in Princeton and Director of Studies at the École des Hautes Études en Sciences Sociales in Paris. A former vice-president of Médecins Sans Frontières, he is currently President of the French Medical Committee for Exiles. His recent publications include: Contemporary States of Emergency: The Politics of Military and Humanitarian Interventions.
Ilana Feldman is Professor of Anthropology, History, and International Affairs at The George Washington University. She is the author of Governing Gaza: Bureaucracy, Authority, and the Work of Rule, 1917–67 (2008) and Police Encounters: Security and Surveillance in Gaza under Egyptian Rule (2015); and co-editor (with Miriam Ticktin) of In the Name of Humanity: The Government of Threat and Care (2010). Her current project traces the Palestinian experience with humanitarianism in the years since 1948, exploring both how this aid apparatus has shaped Palestinian social and political life and how the Palestinian experience has influenced the broader post-war humanitarian regime.

John M. Hobson is Professor of Politics and International Relations at the University of Sheffield and is a Fellow of the British Academy. His theoretical and empirical work is situated in the vortex of global historical sociology, international relations/IPE and post-colonialism. He has published eight books, the latest of which is The Eurocentric Conception of World Politics: Western International Theory, 1760–2010 (Cambridge University Press, 2012). His current research, which picks up from his earlier non-Eurocentric book, The Eastern Origins of Western Civilisation (Cambridge University Press, 2004), seeks to chart the formation and development of the world economy in the last millennium in an IPE context.

Stephen Hopgood is Professor of International Relations and co-Director of the Centre for the International Politics of Conflict, Rights and Justice at SOAS, University of London. He is the author of The Endtimes of Human Rights (2013), Keepers of the Flame: Understanding Amnesty International (2006), “The Last Rites of Humanitarian Intervention: Darfur, Sri Lanka and R2P,” Global Responsibility to Protect 6, 2 (2014) and is co-editor (with Jack

Sally Engle Merry is Silver Professor of Anthropology at New York University. She is also a Faculty Director of the Center for Human Rights and Global Justice at the New York University School of Law, and past president of the American Ethnological Society. She is the author or editor of fifteen books, including Colonizing Hawai‘i (2000), Human Rights and Gender Violence (2006), Gender Violence: A Cultural Perspective (2009), The Practice of Human Rights (co-edited with Mark Goodale, Cambridge University Press, 2007), and, most recently, The Seductions of Quantification: Measuring Human Rights, Gender Violence, and Sex Trafficking (2016). She received the Hurst Prize for Colonizing Hawai‘i in 2002, the Kalven Prize for scholarly contributions to sociological scholarship in 2007, and the J.I. Staley Prize for Human Rights and Gender Violence in 2010. In 2013 she received an honorary degree from McGill School of Law and was the focus of an Author Colloquium at the Center for Interdisciplinary Research (ZIF) at the University of Bielefeld, Germany. She is an adjunct professor at Australian National University.

Vibhuti Ramachandran is a Ph.D. candidate in Anthropology at New York University. Her research interests span prostitution in legal and activist frameworks; anthropological perspectives on law and the state; NGOs; and governmentality. She is currently writing her doctoral dissertation, “Immoral Traffic”: Law, Prostitution and the Politics of Truth Production in India, which examines how courts, shelters, and NGOs in India respond to prostitution.

Henry S. Richardson is Professor of Philosophy at Georgetown University. He is the author of three books: Practical Reasoning about Final Ends (Cambridge University Press, 1994), Democratic Autonomy: Public Reasoning about the Ends of Policy (2002), and Moral Entanglements: Medical Researchers’ Ancillary-Care Obligations (2012). He was a member of the World Commission on the Ethics of Science and Technology (a UNESCO body) 2010–2013 and its rapporteur from 2011 to 2013 and president of the Human Development and Capability Association from 2014 to 2016. He is currently the editor of Ethics.
Aisling Swaine is Associate Professor of Practice of International Affairs at the Elliott School of International Affairs, The George Washington University. She received her Ph.D. in law from the Transitional Justice Institute, Ulster University (2012) and her MSc. in Humanitarian Assistance (2000) and B.A. (1999) from University College Dublin, Ireland. She teaches and researches on issues of violence against women related to armed conflict, global gender equality policy; the women, peace, and security agenda; feminist legal theory and transitional justice. Prior to her current post, Swaine worked extensively with the United Nations and international non-governmental aid organizations in humanitarian settings, as well as at international policy levels. She has worked as an independent consultant to a number of international organizations including UN Women, the Trust Fund for Victims of the International Criminal Court, and Irish Aid.
This volume has been many years in the making, which means that there are many people and institutions that require thanks. The project began to come together at a conference at The George Washington University in October 2014. It was made possible by funding from The George Washington University and the Elliott School of International Affairs’ Program on Humanitarian Governance, and the extraordinary organizational skills of Jessica Anderson. In addition to the contributors, several others participated in the lively discussion: Jens Meierhenrich, Steve Krasner, Kathryn Sikkink, Martha Finnemore, Jennifer Brinkerhoff, Ron Waldman, Biju Rao, and James Foster.

I have been wrestling with the question of international paternalism for many years, and my thinking has evolved as a consequence of presentations at various conferences and institutions, and conversations with many individuals. I have given talks at the Graduate Institute of International and Development Studies, Simon Fraser University, the University of Minnesota, Northwestern University, Yale University, Georgetown University, McGill University, the World Health Organization, MSF-Geneva, University of Texas-Austin, Cambridge University, University of London-SOAS. Special thanks to the following people: Peter Trubowitz, Antje Weiner, Joe Soss, Ron Krebs, Bud Duvall, Joan Tronto, Leslie Vinjamuri, Keith Krause, Eric Grynaviski, Shannon Powers, Allan Dafoe, David Kennedy, Ian Hurd, and Karen Alter. A special thanks to Shannon Powers for helping get the manuscript into shape, and Danielle Gilbert for putting it through its final paces.