

‘This collection of analytic essays on topics ranging from institutions of governance to concepts central to constitutionalism provides a fine introduction to the state of the field.’

Mark Tushnet, William Nelson Cromwell
Professor of Law, Harvard Law School

‘We have entered the golden age of comparative constitutionalism. The digital revolution has made foreign legal sources more easily accessible, modern advances in transportation have made the world smaller, and scholarly collaborations across borders have pushed the boundaries of our knowledge. And yet many fundamental questions in comparative constitutionalism remain contested or even unanswered: how to compare, what to compare, and more importantly why to compare? Masterman and Schütze have assembled an all-star team of leading authorities in the study of constitutionalism to guide both experienced scholars and new students through the most important inquiries in the field. The future of public law is comparative, and this outstanding volume will be an invaluable resource for understanding the stakes and challenges that await.’

Richard Albert, William Stamps Farish
Professor of Law, The University of Texas at Austin

‘This *Cambridge Companion to Comparative Constitutional Law* stands out for its in-depth pursuit of well-selected themes. It offers the scholar and student an authoritative account of the theoretical foundations and historical foundations of global constitutionalism, as well as its core principles, institutions and dynamics.’

Adrienne Stone, Redmond Barry Distinguished Professor,
Melbourne Law School, The University of Melbourne

‘In times of flourishing comparative constitutional law studies, this *Cambridge Companion* addresses the main issues in the field, with a view to orient scholarly approaches towards systematic comparative work. In an ever more connected world, such stimulating enterprise will enhance the comprehension of the challenges at stake, as well as the communication among different methodologies and theories.’

Cesare Pinelli, Professor at the Faculty of Law,
University ‘La Sapienza’

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-16781-0 — The Cambridge Companion to Comparative Constitutional Law
Edited by Roger Masterman, Robert Schütze
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

'This *Companion* assembles a remarkable cast of leading scholars on comparative constitutional law. The chapters adopt a panoramic view in interrogating the field from its theoretical and historical foundations through to its present-day significance. This *Companion* is an important and valuable contribution on a subject of ever-growing significance.'

George Williams, Dean and Anthony Mason Professor,
University of New South Wales

'Combining magnitude and accuracy, here is a new instrument, original in its design, as complete as possible, which will allow any reader to satisfy his curiosity by measuring the importance and interest of this new scientific field. Here is a book that makes it possible to understand better, at the time of globalization, the stakes of a comparative confrontation between the main modes of constitutional arrangement in the world.'

Vlad Constantinesco, Emeritus Professor,
University of Strasbourg

The Cambridge Companion to Comparative Constitutional Law

What is the purpose of comparative constitutional law? Comparing constitutions allows us to consider the similarities and differences in forms of government, and the normative philosophies behind constitutional choices. Constitutional comparisons offer hermeneutic help: they enable us to see 'our' own constitution with different eyes and to locate its structural and normative choices by reference to alternatives evident in other constitutional orders.

This Cambridge Companion presents readers with a succinct yet wide-ranging introduction to a modern comparative constitutional law course. Its twenty-two chapters are arranged into five thematic parts: starting with an exploration of the theoretical foundations (Part I) and some important historical experiences (Part II), it moves on to a discussion of the core constitutional principles (Part III) and state institutions (Part IV); finally it analyses forms of transnational constitutionalism (Part V) that have emerged in our 'global' times.

Roger Masterman is Professor of Constitutional Law at Durham Law School. His research interests are in constitutional law and reform, rights instruments, and in the interplay between national and international constitutional laws. He is a member of the Executive Committee of the UK Constitutional Law Association, and of the editorial committee of *Public Law*.

Robert Schütze is a Professor of European Law and Co-Director of the Global Policy Institute at Durham University as well as Visiting Professor at LUISS Guido Carli University (Rome). He is a constitutional scholar with a particular expertise in the law of the European Union and comparative federalism and co-directs the Oxford Comparative Constitutionalism Series.

Cambridge Companions to Law

Cambridge Companions to Law offers thought-provoking introductions to different legal disciplines, invaluable to both the student and the scholar. Edited by world-leading academics, each offers a collection of essays which both map out the subject and allow the reader to delve deeper. Critical and enlightening, the Companions library represents legal scholarship at its best.

The Cambridge Companion to European Private Law
Edited by Christian Twigg-Flesner

The Cambridge Companion to International Law
Edited by James Crawford and Martti Koskenniemi

The Cambridge Companion to Comparative Law
Edited by Mauro Bussani and Ugo Mattei

The Cambridge Companion to Human Rights Law
Edited by Conor Gearty and Costas Douzinas

The Cambridge Companion to Public Law
Edited by Mark Elliott and David Feldman

The Cambridge Companion to International Criminal Law
Edited by William A. Schabas

The Cambridge Companion to Natural Law Jurisprudence
Edited by George Duke and Robert P. George

The Cambridge Companion to Comparative Family Law
Edited by Shazia Choudhry and Jonathan Herring

The Cambridge Companion to Comparative Constitutional Law
Edited by Roger Masterman and Robert Schütze

The Cambridge Companion to Comparative Constitutional Law

Edited by

Roger Masterman

Durham University

Robert Schütze

Durham University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-16781-0 — The Cambridge Companion to Comparative Constitutional Law
Edited by Roger Masterman, Robert Schütze
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107167810

DOI: 10.1017/9781316716731

© Cambridge University Press 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd, Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Masterman, Roger, editor. | Schütze, Robert, editor.

Title: The Cambridge companion to comparative constitutional law / edited by Roger Masterman, Robert Schütze.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY:

Cambridge University Press, 2019. | Series: Cambridge companions to law

Identifiers: LCCN 2019019723 | ISBN 9781107167810 (hardback) |

ISBN 9781316618172 (paperback)

Subjects: LCSH: Constitutional law – Comparative studies. | BISAC: LAW / Comparative.

Classification: LCC K3165.C34425 2019 | DDC 342–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019019723>

ISBN 978-1-107-16781-0 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-316-61817-2 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

	<i>Notes on Contributors</i>	page xi
	<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xvii
	<i>Table of Cases (Selection)</i>	xix
	<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xxix
	Introduction	1
	The Editors	
	Part I Theoretical Foundations	9
1	Comparative Methodologies Ran Hirschl	11
2	Constitutionalism(s) Robert Schütze	40
	Part II Historical Experiences	67
3	The United Kingdom Constitution Mark Elliott	69
4	French Constitutional Law Denis Baranger	92
5	US Constitutional Law and History Vicki C. Jackson	113
6	The Constitution of the Republic of India Anashri Pillay	141
7	The Constitution of China Qianfan Zhang	171

viii Contents

	Part III Constitutional Principles	199
8	Democracy Paul Craig	201
9	Separation of Powers Christoph Möllers	230
10	The Rule of Law András Sajó	258
11	Human Rights Law Conor Gearty	291
12	Federalism Raffaele Bifulco	312
	Part IV State Institutions	333
13	Parliaments Nicola Lupo	335
14	Governments Philipp Dann	361
15	Administration Susan Rose-Ackerman	391
16	Courts with Constitutional Jurisdiction Cheryl Saunders	414
17	Independent Fiscal Institutions Cal Viney and Thomas Poole	441
	Part V Transnational Constitutionalism	471
18	Multi-Layered Constitutions Roger Masterman	473
19	International Constitutionalism Jan Klabbers	498
20	European Constitutionalism Kaarlo Tuori	521

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-16781-0 — The Cambridge Companion to Comparative Constitutional Law
Edited by Roger Masterman , Robert Schütze
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

	Contents	ix
21	A New Commonwealth Constitutionalism? Claudia Geiringer	554
22	Constitutional Transplants Gábor Halmai	580
	<i>Index</i>	605

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-16781-0 — The Cambridge Companion to Comparative Constitutional Law
Edited by Roger Masterman , Robert Schütze
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Notes on Contributors

Denis Baranger is Professor of Public Law at the Université Panthéon-Assas, Director of the Institut Michel Villey and Co-director of the Law School (*école de droit*). He has received several prizes and distinctions (François Furet Prize, 2001; grand prix de l'académie des sciences morales et politiques, 2018). He has been elected to the Institut Universitaire de France (junior member, active 2008–2013, now honorary). He was a member of the French National Assembly's committee on constitutional reform (2014–2015).

Raffaele Bifulco is Full Professor of Constitutional Law at LUISS Guido Carli University in Rome. His main research interests focus on: federalism, Italian regionalism, state liability and deliberative democracy. He has also been engaged in EU law and more specifically he has written on the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union. He is national leader of the Horizon 2020 project 'Reconciling Europe with its Citizens through Democracy and Rule of Law' (RECONNECT).

Paul Craig is Professor of English Law at St John's College Oxford, FBA QC (Hon). His research covers constitutional law, administrative law, EU law and comparative public law. He is the UK alternative member of the Venice Commission on Law and Democracy.

Philipp Dann is Professor of Public and Comparative Law at Humboldt University of Berlin. He has published widely on comparative constitutional and EU law, on the law of international organizations and 'law and development'. He is the editor-in-chief of the comparative law journal *World Comparative Law/Verfassung und Recht in Übersee* that focuses on issues of public law in the Global South.

Mark Elliott is Professor of Public Law at the University of Cambridge and a Fellow of St Catharine's College, Cambridge. From 2015 to 2019

xii Notes on Contributors

he served as a Legal Adviser to the House of Lords Select Committee on the Constitution.

Conor Gearty is Professor of Human Rights Law at the London School of Economics and Political Science, and a barrister at Matrix Chambers. He is the author of numerous books on human rights, civil liberties and terrorism, most recently *On Fantasy Island: Britain, Strasbourg and Human Rights* (Oxford University Press, 2016). With Costas Douzinas he has edited the *Cambridge Companion to Human Rights Law* (Cambridge University Press, 2012). He has been Director of the LSE's Centre for the Study of Human Rights and (more recently) its Institute of Public Affairs.

Claudia Geiringer holds the Chair in Public Law at Victoria University of Wellington, New Zealand, and is a Co-director of the NZ Centre for Public Law. Her scholarship focuses on the New Zealand Bill of Rights Act in its domestic and comparative context. She has worked for both the New Zealand and Victorian governments, advising on their respective statutory human rights charters, and has appeared in human rights litigation before the New Zealand and Victorian courts.

Gábor Halmai is Professor and Chair of Comparative Constitutional Law, and Director of Graduate Studies at the European University Institute in Florence. His primary research interests are comparative constitutional law, and international human rights. He has published several books and articles, as well as edited volumes on these topics in English, German and Hungarian. His most recent book *Perspectives on Global Constitutionalism* (Eleven International Publishing, 2014) deals with the use of foreign and international law by domestic courts.

Ran Hirschl (PhD Yale University, 1999) is Professor of Political Science and Law at the University of Toronto, and holder of the Alexander von Humboldt Professorship in Comparative Constitutionalism at the University of Göttingen. He is the author of several award-winning books and over one hundred articles on comparative constitutional law and its intersection with closely related fields. In 2014, he was made Fellow of the Royal Society of Canada – the highest academic accolade in that country.

Vicki C. Jackson is the Thurgood Marshall Professor of Constitutional Law at Harvard Law School, and teaches and writes on US constitutional

law, federal courts and comparative constitutional law. Her recent work includes *Proportionality: New Frontiers, New Challenges* (Cambridge University Press, 2017) (co-editor Mark Tushnet); *Comparative Constitutional Law* (Foundation Press, 3rd ed., 2014) (with Mark Tushnet); *Constitutional Engagement in a Transnational Era* (Oxford University Press, 2010).

Jan Klabbers teaches international law at the University of Helsinki, concentrating on international organizations, treaties and matters of global ethics. He is the author of several books on international law, international organizations law, and EU law; co-author of *The Constitutionalization of International Law* (Oxford University Press, 2009), and co-editor of *The Challenge of Inter-Legality* (Cambridge University Press, 2019). He has held visiting positions at various institutions of higher learning, including NYU School of Law, the Graduate Institute of International and Development Studies, the Erasmus Law School Rotterdam, and the Sorbonne.

Nicola Lupo is Full Professor of Public Law and Director of the Center for Parliamentary Studies at LUISS Guido Carli University in Rome. He holds a Jean Monnet chair in 'Understanding European Representative Democracy' and directs a Masters program in 'Parliament and Public Policies'. He was also counsellor at the Italian Chamber of Deputies. His publications concern sources of law, parliamentary rules of procedure, legislative drafting, budgetary procedures, regional councils, parliaments in the EU and the European Parliament.

Roger Masterman is Professor of Constitutional Law at Durham Law School. His research interests are in constitutional law and reform, rights instruments, and in the interplay between national and international constitutional laws. He is a member of the Executive Committee of the UK Constitutional Law Association, and of the editorial committee of *Public Law*.

Christoph Möllers is Professor of Public Law and Jurisprudence at Humboldt University of Berlin and a Permanent Fellow at the Berlin Institute for Advanced Study. His most recent book publications include *The Three Branches* (Oxford University Press, 2011), *Die Möglichkeit der Normen* (Suhrkamp, 2015) and – as co-author – *The Court without Borders* (Oxford University Press, 2019).

xiv Notes on Contributors

Thomas Poole is a Law Professor at the London School of Economics and Political Science. His research focuses on public law, constitutional theory, and the history of law and empire. His most recent book is *Reason of State: Law, Prerogative and Empire* (Cambridge University Press, 2015).

Anashri Pillay is an Associate Professor in Law at Durham University where she teaches Comparative Constitutional Law, International Human Rights and Public International Law. Before joining Durham Law School in 2013, she held posts at the University of Leeds and the University of Cape Town. Anashri's research focuses on the role of judges in giving effect to economic and social rights in South Africa, India and the UK. She has also written on judicial appointments systems in India and South Africa.

Susan Rose-Ackerman is the Henry R. Luce Professor of Law, Emeritus, at Yale Law School. She has published widely on comparative administrative law, the political economy of corruption and regulatory policy. Her most recent books are *Due Process of Lawmaking: The United States, South Africa, Germany and the European Union* (Cambridge University Press, 2015) (with Stephanie Egidy and James Fowkes) and *Corruption and Government: Causes, Consequences and Reform* (2nd ed., Cambridge University Press, 2016) (with Bonnie Palifka).

András Sajó is University Professor at the Central European University, Budapest. He served as Vice-President of the European Court of Human Rights until 2017. He holds a PhD (Hungarian Academy of Sciences) and was recurrent Visiting Professor at various American law schools. He has published extensively on comparative constitutional law, law and emotions and sociology of law. His latest book is *The Constitution of Freedom* (with Renata Uitz, Oxford University Press, 2017).

Cheryl Saunders is Laureate Professor Emeritus at Melbourne Law School. She writes in the field of comparative constitutional law from a global perspective. She is the founding Director of the Centre for Comparative Constitutional Studies, a President Emeritus of the International Association of Constitutional Law, a senior technical advisor to the Constitution Building Program of International IDEA and a joint convener of the Constitution Transformation Network.

Robert Schütze is a Professor of European Law and Co-Director of the Global Policy Institute at Durham University as well as Visiting Professor at LUISS Guido Carli University (Rome). He is a constitutional scholar with a particular expertise in the law of the European Union and comparative federalism. He is a co-editor of the Oxford Series in 'Comparative Constitutionalism' (with Richard Albert) as well as the Hart Series on 'Parliamentary Democracy in Europe' (with Nicola Lupo).

Kaarlo Tuori is Professor Emeritus of Jurisprudence at Helsinki University. He has published extensively in the fields of legal theory and national and transnational public law. His legal theoretical works include *Critical Legal Positivism* (Ashgate, 2002) and *Ratio and Voluntas* (Ashgate, 2011). In European constitutional law his main works are *The Eurozone Crisis – A Constitutional Analysis* (together with Klaus Tuori, Cambridge University Press, 2014) and *European Constitutionalism* (Cambridge University Press, 2015). Tuori is a long-time member and former vice-president of the Venice Commission.

Cal Viney is an Australian lawyer focused on public law and policy. He has served as an adviser to the Premier of Victoria, Australia, and the Prime Minister's Department, Australia, where he has advised on constitutional reform, international public and private law, and public and administrative law. He holds an LLM (Public Law) from the London School of Economics and Political Science, where he studied as a Chevening Scholar, and an LLB/BA from Deakin University.

Qianfan Zhang joined the law faculty of Peking University in 2003, where he is the Director of the Center for the People's Congress and Parliamentary Studies. He has published widely in the areas of Chinese and comparative constitutional law, moral and political philosophy, including *The Constitution of China: A Contextual Analysis* (Hart Publishing, 2012) and *Human Dignity in Classical Chinese Philosophy: Confucianism, Mohism, and Daoism* (Palgrave Macmillan, 2016). He has been the vice president of the Chinese Constitutional Law Association since 2004.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-16781-0 — The Cambridge Companion to Comparative Constitutional Law
Edited by Roger Masterman , Robert Schütze
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Acknowledgements

This *Cambridge Companion to Comparative Constitutional Law* was conceived some years ago when the editors jointly designed a course on comparative constitutional law. The present book, written by over twenty academics, is now – unsurprisingly – much richer than we initially imagined, and we are extremely grateful to the distinct and brilliant voices within this volume. Our fellow contributors have been exemplary collaborators whose patience (and courage) to work with us has been outstanding. We are equally indebted to Cambridge University Press, and especially to Valerie Appleby, who commissioned this work; as well as Marianne Nield, who helped us bring it to fruition. Finally, we wish to offer our profound thanks to María José Pérez-Crespo and Nick Kilford for their invaluable assistance in the preparation of this manuscript.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-16781-0 — The Cambridge Companion to Comparative Constitutional Law
Edited by Roger Masterman , Robert Schütze
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Table of Cases (Selection)

Australia

- Al-Kateb v. Godwin* [2004] HCA 37, 493
Australian Capital Television Pty Ltd v. Commonwealth (1992) 177 CLR 106, 86
In Re Judiciary and Navigation Acts (1921) 29 CLR 257, 418
Lange v. ABC (1997) 189 CLR 520, 481
McCloy v. New South Wales [2015] HCA 34, 494
Momcilovic v. The Queen [2011] HCA 34, 494

Canada

- British Columbia (Attorney General) v. Christie* 2007 SCC 21 [2007];
 1 SCR 873, 277
British Columbia v. Imperial Tobacco Canada Ltd. 2005 SCC 49; [2005]
 2 SCR 473, 277
Canada (AG) v. PHS Community Services Society [2011] 3 SCR 134, 283
Quebec v. Montreal 2000 SCC 27; [2000] 1 SCR 665, 573
R v. Drybones [1970] SCR 282, 558
Reference re s 94(2) of Motor Vehicle Act (British Columbia) [1985]
 2 SCR 486, 281, 283
Reference re Secession of Quebec [1998] 2 SCR 217, 476
Roncarelli v. Duplessis [1959] SCR 121, 275, 276
Winnipeg School Division No 1 v. Craton [1985] 2 SCR 150, 573

European Convention on Human Rights

- Al-Dulimi and Montana Management Inc. v. Switzerland*, Application
 No 5809/08 (21 June 2016), 266, 276
Baka v. Hungary, Application No. 20261/12 (23 June 2016), 284
Běleš and Others v. the Czech Republic, Appl. No. 47273/99 (12 November
 2002), 276
Blokhin v. Russia, Application No. 47152/06 (23 March 2016), 271
Čudak v. Lithuania, Application No. 15869/02 (23 March 2010), 278

xx Table of Cases (Selection)

- Golder v. The United Kingdom*, Application No. 4451/70 (21 February 1975), 277
Hirst v. United Kingdom (No.2) (2006) 42 EHRR 41, 485
Ibrahim and Others v. The United Kingdom, Applications Nos. 50541/08, 50571/08, 50573/08 and 40351/09 (13 September 2016), 275
Ireland v. United Kingdom (1979–1980) 2 EHRR 25, 487
Loizidou v. Turkey (1995) 20 EHRR 99, 487
Lombardi Vallauri v. Italy, No. 39128/05 (20 October 2009), 284
Malone v. United Kingdom, Application No. 8691/79 (2 August 1984), 283
Olga Tellis & Ors v. Mumbay Municipal Corporation & Ors (10 July 1985), 285
Otto-Preminger Institute v. Austria (1995) 19 EHRR 34, 490
Rekvényi v. Hungary, Application No. 25390/94 (20 May 1999), 288
Salduz v. Turkey, Application No. 36391/02 (27 November 2008), 275
Talpis v. Italy, Application No. 41237/14 (2 March 2017), 266
Teltronic-CATV v. Poland, Application No. 48140/99 (10 January 2006), 262
Weissman and Others v. Romania, Application No. 63945/00 (24 May 2006), 262

European Union Cases

- Case 26/62 *Van Gend en Loos v. Nederlandse Administratie der Belastingen* [1963] ECR 3, 103, 527
 Case 6/64 *Flaminio Costa v. ENEL* [1964] ECR 585, 103, 487, 527
 Case 11/70 *Internationale Handelsgesellschaft v. Einfuhr- und Vorratstelle für Getreide und Futtermittel* [1970] ECR 1125, 211, 527
 Case C-294/83 *Parti Ecologiste 'Les Verts' v. Parliament* [1986] ECR 1365, 529
 Case C-112/00 *Schmidberger* [2003] ECR I-5659, 540
 Case C-36/02 *Omega Spielhallen* [2004] ECR I-9609, 540
 Case C-341/05 *Laval un Partneri* [2007] ECR I-11767, 540
 Joined Cases C-402/05 P and C-415/05 P *Yassin Abdullah Kadi and Al Barakaat International Foundation v. Council of the European Union and Commission of the European Communities* [2008] ECR I-06351, 280
 Case C-438/05 *International Transport Workers' Federation and Finnish Seamen's Union* [2007] ECR I-10779, 540
 Case C-101/08 *Audiolux and Others v. Groupe Bruxelles Lambert and Others* [2009] ECR I-9823, 530
 Cases 293 and 594/12 *Digital Rights Ireland Ltd v. Minister for Communications, Marine and Natural Resources* EU:C:2014:238, 214
 Case C-362/14 *Maximilian Schrems v. Data Protection Commissioner* EU:C:2015:650, 214

France

- Cadot* (1889), 106
 Décision 1974–54 (*Interruption volontaire de grossesse*), 109

- Décision 1985–189 (*Loi relative à la définition et à la mise en œuvre de principes d'aménagement*), 111
 Décision 1988–244 (*Loi portant amnistie*), 111
 Décision 1990–283 (*Loi relative à la lutte contre le tabagisme et l'alcoolisme*), 110
 Décision 1992–308 (*Traité sur l'Union européenne*), 104
 Décision 1992–312 (*Traité sur l'Union européenne*), 104
 Décision 1992–313 (*Traité sur l'Union européenne*), 104
 Décision 1998–400 (*Droit de vote et d'éligibilité aux élections municipales*), 110
 Décision 2011–183/184 QPC (*Association France Nature Environnement*), 411
 Décision 2011–635 DC (*Loi sur la participation des citoyens au fonctionnement de la justice pénale et le jugement des mineurs*), 111

Germany

- BVerfGE 37, 271 (1974) (*Solange I*), 485
 BVerfGE 60, 253 (1982) (*Anwaltsschulden*), 274
 BVerfGE 61, 149 (1982) (*Amtshaftung*), 279
 BVerfGE 68, 361 (1985) (*Eigenbedarf I*), 285
 BVerfGE 72, 200 (1986) (*Einkommenssteuerrecht*), 288
 BVerfGE 73, 339 (1986) (*Solange II*), 485
 BVerfGE 91, 148 (1994) (*Umlaufverfahren*), 378
 BVerfGE 100, 313 (1999) (*Telekommunikationsüberwachung I*), 274, 279
 BVerfGE 118, 168 (2007) (*Kontostammdaten*), 276
 BVerfGE 123, 267 (2009) (*Lissabon*), 488
 BVerfGE 134, 242 (2013) (*Garzweiler*), 283
 BVerfGE 142, 123 (2016) (*OMT*), 358, 546
 BVerfGE 143, 38 (2016) (*Rindfleischetikettierung*), 248
 Judgment of 6 December 2016 (1BvR 282/11, 1BvR 321/12, 1BvR 1456/12) (*Atomgesetz*), 409

India

- Additional District Magistrate, Jabalpur v. SS Shukla (Habeas Corpus)* 1976 SCR 17, 161
Aravali Golf Club 2007 (12) SCR1084; 2008(1) SCC 683, 166, 167
Ashoka Thakur v. Union of India (2008) 6 SCC 1, 150, 151
Balakrishnan and others v. Union of India and others 2009(5) SCC 507, 167
Bandhua Mukti Morcha v. Union of India and others 1984 SCR (2) 67, 162
Calcutta Electricity Supply Corporation (CESC) Ltd. Etc. v. Subash Chandra Bose and Ors, 1991 SCR Supl (2) 267, 165
Consumer Education and Research Centre v. India (1995) 3 SCC 42, 163

xxii Table of Cases (Selection)

- Danial Latifi v. Union of India* (2001) 7 SCC 740, 154
Francis Coralie Mullin v. The Administrator, Union Territory of India and others
 1981 SCR 516, 163
Golaknath case, 1967 SCR (2) 762, 158
Indian Council for Enviro-Legal Action and others v. Union of India and others
 1996 (2) SCR 503, 162
Indira Gandhi v. Raj Narain (Election case) AIR 1975 SC 2299, 160
Indra Sawhney v. Union of India 1992 Supp (3) SCC 217, 149, 150
Kamana Dayaram, Shetty v. The International Airport Authority of India [1979]
 3 SCR 1014, 276
Karimbil Kunhikoman v. State of Kerala 1961 AIR 723, 158
Kesavananda Bharati Sripadagalvaru and Ors v. State of Kerala and another AIR
 1973 SC 1461, 152, 159
Kesavananda Bharati v. State of Kerala (1973) 4 SCC 225, 421
Maneka Gandhi v. Union of India and Another (1978) 1 SCC 248, 163
Minerva Mills Ltd. and Others v. Union of India and Others, AIR 1980 SC
 1789, 53
Mohammed Ahmad Khan v. Shah Bano AIR 1985 SC 945, 153
Narmada Bachao Andolan v. Union of India case (2000) 10 SCC 664, 165
Olga Tellis and Others v. Bombay Municipal Corporation and Others 1986 AIR
 180, 164, 282
Paschim Banga Ket Mazdoor Samity v. State of West Bengal (1996) 4
 SCC 37, 163
Peoples' Union for Civil Liberties v. Union of India (2001) 5 SCALE 303; 7
 SCALE 484, 167
S.P. Gupta v. President of India AIR 1982 SC 149, 156
Shankari Prasad Singh v. Union of India and State of Bihar (and other cases)
 1952 SCR 89, 158
Sharaya Bano v. Union of India and others Writ Petition No. 118 of 2016 (22
 August 2017), 153
Special Reference No. 1 of 1998 (1998) 7 SCC 729 (*Third Judges*), 164
State of West Bengal v. Mrs Bela Banerjee and others 1954 SCR 558, 158
Sunil Batra v. Delhi Administration and others 1979 SCR (1) 392, 162
*Supreme Court Advocates-on-Record Association and others v. Union of
 India and others*, WP (C) 13/2015 (Supreme Court, 16 October 2015),
 157, 164
Supreme Court Advocates-on-Record Association v. Union of India (1993) 4 SCC
 441, 156
Unni Krishnan JP v. State of Andhra Pradesh 1993 AIR 217, 1993 SCR (1)
 594, 157
Unnikrishnan v. State of Andhra Pradesh 1993 (1) SCC 645, 164, 305

New Zealand

Attorney-General v. Taylor [2018] NZSC 104, 558, 572
Attorney-General v. Taylor [2017] NZCA 215; [2017] 3 NZLR 24, 572
R v. Pora [2001] 2 NZLR 37, 573

South Africa

S v. Makwanyane (1995) 3 SA 391, 21, 588, 592
S v. Lawrence, S. v. Negal, S. v. Solberg (1997) SA 1176, 599

United Kingdom

A v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [2005] 2 AC 68, 221
Anisminic Ltd v. Foreign Compensation Commission [1969] 2 AC 147, 85
AS (Somalia) v. Entry Clearance Officer (Addis Ababa) [2009] UKHL 32, 221
Associated Provincial Picture Houses Limited v. Wednesbury Corporation [1948] 1 KB 223, 281
Ellen Street Estates v. Minister of Health [1934] 1 KB 590, 558
Evans v. Information Commissioner [2012] UKUT 313 (AAC), 75
Ghaidan v. Godin-Mendoza [2004] 2 AC 557, 218, 220, 221
H v. Lord Advocate [2012] UKSC 24; [2013] 1 AC 413, 79, 573
Huang v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [2007] 2 AC 167, 223
Kennedy v. Charity Commission [2014] UKSC 20; [2015] AC 455, 87
Liversidge v. Anderson [1942] AC 206, 281
Malone v. Commissioner for the Metropolitan Police (No.2) [1979] 1 Ch 344, 263
Matthews v. Ministry of Defence [2003] UKHL 4, 218, 278
R (Animal Defenders International) v. Secretary of State for Culture, Media and Sport [2008] 1 AC 1312, 224
R (Carson) v. Secretary of State for Work and Pensions [2006] 1 AC 173, 224
R (Clift) v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [2007] 1 AC 484, 221
R (Daly) v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [2001] UKHL 26; [2001] 2 AC 532, 69, 281
R (Guardian News and Media Ltd) v. City of Westminster Magistrates' Court [2012] EWCA Civ 420; [2013] QB 618, 87
R (Hooper) v. Secretary of State for Work and Pensions [2005] 1 WLR 1681, 225
R (Lord Carlile of Berriew QC) v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [2014] UKSC 60, 223
R (Miller) v. Secretary of State for Exiting the European Union [2016] EWHC 2768, 358

xxiv Table of Cases (Selection)

- R (Miller) v. Secretary of State for Exiting the European Union* [2017] UKSC 5, 75, 79, 358
- R (Nicklinson) v. Ministry of Justice* [2014] UKSC 38, 224
- R (on the application of Buckinghamshire County Council) v. Secretary of State for Transport* [2014] UKSC 3; [2014] 1 WLR 324, 489
- R (on the application of Evans) v. Attorney-General* [2015] UKSC 21; [2015] AC 1787, 494
- R (on the application of International Transport Roth GmbH) v. Secretary of State for the Home Department* [2003] QB 728, 218
- R (ProLife Alliance) v. BBC* [2004] 1 AC 185, 223
- R (Wilkinson) v. Inland Revenue Commissioners* [2005] 1 WLR 1718, 221
- R (Wright) v. Secretary of State for Health* [2009] 1 AC 739, 221
- R v. A* [2002] 1 AC 45, 220
- R v. DPP, ex parte Kebilene* [2000] 2 AC 326, 223
- R v. Lambert* [2002] 2 AC 545, 220
- R v. Secretary of State for the Home Department, ex parte Brind* [1991] 1 AC 696, 484, 493
- R v. Secretary of State for Transport, ex parte Factortame Ltd (No. 2)* [1991] 1 AC 603, 79, 488
- R v. Lord Chancellor, ex parte Witham* [1998] QB 575, 85
- R (F) v. Secretary of State for the Home Department* [2011] 1 AC 331, 221
- R (HS2 Action Alliance Ltd.) v. Secretary of State for Transport* [2014] UKSC 3; [2014] 1 WLR 324, 79
- R (Jackson) v. Attorney General* [2005] UKHL 56; [2006] 1 AC 262, 88
- R (Osborn) v. Parole Board* [2013] UKSC 61; [2014] AC 1115, 87
- R (UNISON) v. Lord Chancellor* [2017] UKSC 51; [2017] 3 WLR 409, 88
- Re McKerr* [2004] UKHL 12, 484
- Re S (children: care plan)* [2002] 2 AC 291, 218, 220
- Secretary of State for the Home Department v. AF* [2008] EWCA Civ 1148, 280
- Secretary of State for the Home Department v. AF and another* [2009] UKHL 28, 280
- Thoburn v. Sunderland City Council* [2002] EWHC 195 (Admin); [2003] QB 151, 79, 573
- Triquet v. Bath* (1764) 3 Burr 1478, 486
- Watkins v. Secretary of State for the Home Department* [2006] UKHL 17; [2006] 2 AC 395, 86
- Wheeler v. Leicester City Council* [1985] AC 1054, 81

United States

- 44 Liquormart v. Rhode Island* 517 US 44 (1996), 136
- Adarand Constructors, Inc. v. Peña* 515 US 200 (1996), 130
- Armour v. City of Indianapolis* 566 US 673 (2012), 131

- Barron v. Baltimore* 32 US 243, 250 (1833), 126
Betts v. Brady 316 US 455 (1942), 126
Bivens v. Six Unknown Named Agents 403 US 388 (1971), 279
Bolling v. Sharpe 347 US 497 (1954), 119
Bowers v. Hardwick 478 US 186 (1986), 132, 133, 134
Brown v. Board of Education 347 US 483 (1954), 114, 121, 127
Brown v. Mississippi 297 US 278 (1936), 125
Burdick v. Takashi 504 US 428 (1992), 132
Bush v. Gore 531 US 98 (2000), 140, 307
Carter v. Carter Coal 298 US 238 (1936), 122
Cent. Hudson Gas & Elec. Corp. v. Pub. Serv. Comm'n of New York 447 US 557 (1980), 136
Chambers v. Florida 309 US 227 (1940), 125
Chaplinsky v. New Hampshire 315 US 568 (1942), 137
Chevron USA, Inc. v. Natural Resources Defense Council, Inc. 467 US 837 (1984), 281
Chicago, B. & Q. R. Co. v. Chicago 166 US 226 (1897), 126
Citizens United v. Fed. Election Comm'n 558 US 310 (2010), 136, 137
City of Boerne v. Flores 521 US 507 (1997), 122
Cooley v. Bd of Wardens 53 US 299 (1851), 123
Cooper v. Aaron 358 US 1 (1958), 121, 139
Craig v. Boren 429 US 190 (1976), 130
Dandridge v. Williams 397 US 471 (1970), 127
Deshaney v. Winnebago Cty. Soc'l Serv. Dept 489 US 189 (1989), 135
District of Columbia v. Heller 554 US 570 (2008), 119, 138
Dred Scott v. Sandford 60 US 393 (1857), 113
Duncan v. Louisiana, 391 US 145 (1968), 127
Fisher v. Univ. of Texas at Austin 136 S Ct 2198 (2016), 131
Frontiero v. Richardson 411 US 677 (1973), 130
Gibbons v. Ogden 22 US 1 (1824), 122, 123
Gideon v. Wainwright 372 US 335 (1963), 126, 127, 285
Goldberg v. Kelly 397 US 254 (1970), 283, 284, 306
Gratz v. Michigan 539 US 244 (2003), 130
Gregg v. Georgia 428 US 153 (1976), 136
Griffin v. Illinois 351 US 12 (1956), 127
Griggs v. Duke Power Co. 401 US 424 (1971), 129
Grutter v. Bollinger 539 US 306 (2003), 131
Hamdi v. Rumsfeld 542 US 507 (2004), 280
Hammer v. Dagenhart 247 US 251 (1918), 122
Harper v. Va. State Bd of Elections 383 US 663 (1966), 127
Humphrey's Executor v. United States 295 US 602 (1935), 370
Hunter v. Underwood 471 US 222 (1985), 129
Indus. Union Dept. v. Amer. Petroleum Inst. 448 US 607 (1980), 283
INS v. Chadha 462 US 919 (1983), 248

xxvi Table of Cases (Selection)

- James v. City of Boise, Idaho* 136 S. Ct. 6875 (2016), 122
Johnson v. Zerbst 304 US 458 (1938), 126, 285
Kennedy v. Louisiana, 554 US 407 (2008), 135
Kent v. the United States, 383 US 541 (1966), 271
Korematsu v. United States 323 US 214 (1944), 130
Lawrence v. Texas 539 US 558 (2003), 132, 133, 134
Lochner v. New York 198 US 45 (1905), 120, 123, 131, 134
Lockett v. Ohio 438 US 586 (1978), 136
Loving v. Virginia 388 US 1 (1967), 128, 129, 132
Mapp v. Ohio 367 US 643 (1961), 127
Marbury v. Madison 5 US (1 Cranch) 137 (1803), 50, 95, 121, 122, 206, 268, 297,
 355, 419
McCulloch v. Maryland 17 US 316 (1819), 121
Missouri ex rel Gaines v. Canada 305 US 377 (1938), 128
Moore v. City of East Cleveland 431 US 494 (1977), 131
Moore v. Dempsey 261 US 86 (1923), 125
*Motor Vehicle Manufacturers' Association v. State Farm Mutual Automobile
 Insurance Co.* 463 US 29 (1983), 407
Murphy v. National Collegiate Athletic Ass'n 138 S. Ct. 1461 (2018), 124
Muskrat v. United States 219 US 346 (1911), 418
New York City Transit Auth. v. Beazer 440 US 568 (1979), 131
New York Times Co. v. United States 403 US 713 (1971), 137
New York Times v. Sullivan 376 US 254 (1964), 136, 138
New York v. United States 505 US 144 (1992), 124
NFIB v. Sebelius 567 US 519 (2012), 123, 124
NLRB v. Jones & Laughlin Steel Corp. 301 US 1 (1937), 123
Obergefell v. Hodges 135 S Ct 2584 (2015), 132, 134
Palko v. Connecticut 302 US 319 (1937), 177
Personnel Adm'r of Mass v. Feeney 442 US 256 (1979), 129
Philadelphia v. New Jersey 437 US 617 (1978), 123
Pierce v. Society of Sisters 268 US 510 (1925), 131
Planned Parenthood of Southeastern Pennsylvania v. Casey 505 US 833
 (1992), 132
Plessy v. Ferguson 163 US 537 (1896), 128
Plyler v. Doe 457 US 202 (1982), 131
Powell v. Alabama 287 US 45 (1932), 125, 126
R.A.V. v. St. Paul 505 US 377 (1992), 137
Reed v. Reed 404 US 71 (1971), 130
Regents, University of California v. Bakke 438 US 265 (1978), 130
Roe v. Wade 410 US 113 (1973), 131
Rogers v. Richmond 365 US 534 (1961), 125
Romer v. Evan 517 US 620 (1996), 132
Roper v. Simmons 543 US 551 (2005), 135
San Antonio Indep. Sch. School Dist. v. Rodriguez 411 US 1 (1973), 127

- Seminole Tribe of Florida v. Florida* 517 US 44 (1996), 125
Sessions v. Dimaya 584 US (2018), 248
Shapiro v. Thompson 394 US 618 (1969), 306
Smith v. Allwright 321 US 649 (1944), 129
Snyder v. Phelps 562 US 443 (2011), 137
Sorrell v. IMS Health Inc. 564 US 552 (2011), 136
Sosa v. Alvarez-Machain 542 US 692 (2004), 486
Strauder v. West Virginia 100 US 303 (1879), 128
Sweatt v. Painter 339 US 629 (1950), 128
Town of Castle Rock v. Gonzalez 545 US 748 (2005), 135
Twining v. New Jersey 211 US 78 (1908), 126
United States v. E.C. Knight 156 US 1 (1895), 122
United States v. Nova Scotia Food Prods. Corp. 568 F. 2d 240 (1977), 405
United States v. Carolene Products Company 304 US 144 (1938), 120, 131, 282
United States v. Morrison (2000) 529 US 598, 481
United States v. Lopez 514 US 549 (1995), 123
United States v. Miller 307 US 174 (1939), 138
United States v. Morrison 529 US 598 (2000), 123, 481
United States v. Nixon 418 US 683 (1974), 139
US Term Limits, Inc v. Thornton 514 US 779 (1995), 62, 478
Washington v. Davis 426 US 229 (1976), 129
West Coast Hotel Co. v. Parrish 300 US 379 (1937), 120, 123
Wickard v. Filburn 317 US 111 (1942), 123
Wolf v. Colorado 338 US 25 (1949), 127
Worcester v. Georgia 31 US (6 Pet) 515 (1832), 295
Yick Wo v. Hopkins 118 US 356 (1886), 129

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-16781-0 — The Cambridge Companion to Comparative Constitutional Law
Edited by Roger Masterman , Robert Schütze
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Abbreviations

BverfGE	Entscheidungen des Bundesverfassungsgerichts
CA	Constituent Assembly
CC	<i>Conseil Constitutionnel</i> (France)
CCP	Chinese Communist Party
DHR	Directorate of Human Rights
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
ECJ	European Court of Justice
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
EU	European Union
GC	German Constitution
GFC	Global Financial Crisis
HRA	Human Rights Act
IFI	Independent Fiscal Institution
IMF	International Monetary Fund
LPG	Local People's Government
NPC	National People's Congress
OBR	Office for Budget Responsibility
PIL	Public Interest Litigation
RoL	Rule of Law
SPC	Supreme People's Court
TFEU	Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union
TEU	Treaty on European Union
UN	United Nations
WTO	World Trade Organization

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-16781-0 — The Cambridge Companion to Comparative Constitutional Law
Edited by Roger Masterman , Robert Schütze
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)
