CONTENTS

Acknowledgements xiii
Abbreviations xv
Table of Cases xvii
Table of Legislation xxix
National Legislation xxxiii

1 Introduction 1
  1.1 Scope 1
  1.2 Structure 10
  1.3 The Human Trafficking Legal Framework versus the Human Rights Law: Structural Differences 11

PART I The Human Trafficking Legal Framework 17

2 Origins, Context and the Currently Valid Law 19
  2.1 The Roots of the Concept of Human Trafficking 19
  2.2 Re-emergence of Concerns about Trafficking and the Nexus with Organized Crime 23
  2.3 The Palermo Protocols as Transnational Criminal Law Treaties 25
  2.4 The CoE Trafficking Convention 27
  2.5 The EU Law on Human Trafficking 29
  2.6 Conclusion 30

3 The Definition of Human Trafficking in International Law 32
  3.1 Not a Form of Exploitation 33
     3.1.1 The Mens Rea Attached to the ‘Action’ Element 43
     3.1.2 Accomplice Liability and the ‘Action’ Element 48
  3.2 Deceptive and Coercive Process 50
     3.2.1 The Timing 50
     3.2.2 The Threshold 54
3.3 For the Purpose of Sexual Exploitation 57
  3.3.1 Drafting the ‘Purpose’ Element 57
  3.3.2 Actors in Opposition to the Term ‘Exploitation’ 61
  3.3.3 Feminist Clashes at Palermo 62
3.4 For the Purpose of Labour Exploitation 66
3.5 Conclusion 72

4 Positive Obligations under the Human Trafficking Legal Framework 74
  4.1 Obligation to Criminalize 75
    4.1.1 Establishment of Criminal Jurisdiction 75
    4.1.2 Approximation of National Substantive Criminal Law 77
    4.1.3 Investigation and Punishment 80
    4.1.4 Criminalization of the Use of Services of Victims 82
  4.2 The Status of a Victim of Human Trafficking 86
  4.3 The Procedure for Identifying Victims 91
  4.4 Stages in the Identification Procedure 101
    4.4.1 The Preliminary Stage under CoE Law 102
    4.4.2 The Preliminary Stage under EU Law 111
    4.4.3 The Conclusive Stage 114
  4.5 Assistance for Victims 117
    4.5.1 The Minimum Level 117
    4.5.2 Access to the Labour Market 120
    4.5.3 Assistance Not Conditional on Cooperation 122
    4.5.4 Timeframe of the Assistance 123
    4.5.5 Assistance in the Framework of the Criminal Proceedings 129
  4.6 Immigration Status in the Host Country 131
    4.6.1 Repatriation 131
    4.6.2 Residence Permit for Victims Who Cooperate under CoE Law 134
    4.6.3 Residence Permit for Victims Who Cooperate under EU Law 136
    4.6.4 Residence Permit on Humanitarian Grounds under CoE Law 138
  4.7 Protection from Punishment 142
    4.7.1 ‘. . . victims . . .’ 144
    4.7.2 ‘. . . to the extent that they have been compelled to do so . . .’ 146
    4.7.3 ‘. . . provide for the possibility . . .’ 150
    4.7.4 ‘. . . in accordance with the basic principles of its legal system’ 152
    4.7.5 ‘. . . not imposing . . .’ 155
    4.7.6 ‘. . . penalties . . .’ 157
    4.7.7 Comparison with Article 31(1) of the Refugee Convention 158
CONTENTS

4.8 Immigration Detention of Victims of Trafficking 160
   4.8.1 Detention in the Context of Deportation Proceedings 161
   4.8.2 Detention in the Context of an Unauthorized Entry 167
   4.8.3 Detention during Determination of International Protection Needs and Dublin Transfers 169

4.9 Compensation 172
   4.9.1 Access to Information 172
   4.9.2 Legal Assistance 172
   4.9.3 Compensation from the Perpetrators 177
   4.9.4 State Compensation Funds 178

4.10 Conclusion 181

PART II The Human Rights Law Framework 187

5 The Historical Background 189
   5.1 Colonialism and the Differentiation between Slavery and Forced Labour 190
   5.2 The Term ‘Institutions and Practices Similar to Slavery’ 201
   5.3 The Conceptual Division under Human Rights Law 206
   5.4 Conclusion 215

6 Definitions with Contemporary Relevance 218
   6.1 Slavery: Exercise of Powers Attaching to the Right of Ownership 220
      6.1.1 The 1953 Secretary General Report 221
      6.1.2 The ICC Statute and the Elements of Crimes 222
      6.1.3 Kunarac et al. 230
      6.1.4 Destruction of Juridical Personality 234
      6.1.5 The Queen v. Tang and Its Follow Up 240
      6.1.6 The ECtHR and the Definition of Slavery 245
      6.1.7 Slavery and Abuses against Migrants 248
   6.2 Servitude 251
      6.2.1 Particularly Serious Form of Denial of Freedom 257
      6.2.2 Usage of Labour Capacity 258
   6.3 Forced Labour 260
      6.3.1 No Exceptions under Article 4(3) of the ECHR 260
      6.3.2 The Disproportionate Burden Test 266
   6.4 An Absolute Right 279
   6.5 The Distinctions between Slavery, Servitude and Forced Labour 285
      6.5.1 The Gradation Model 285
      6.5.2 The Distinctiveness of Slavery 287
      6.5.3 The Special Stigma of Slavery 288
      6.5.4 Why do the Distinctions Matter? 290
   6.6 Conclusion 291
## Table of Contents

### 7 The Relationship between the Concept of Human Trafficking and the Concepts of Slavery, Servitude and Forced Labour  292
- 7.1 ‘Dancing’ on the Borders of Article 4 of the ECHR and *Rantsev v. Cyprus and Russia*  294
- 7.2 Slavery and *Rantsev v. Cyprus and Russia*  301
- 7.3 The Ineffectiveness of the Concept of Human Trafficking in the Context of Abuses against Migrant Prostitutes  307
- 7.4 The Displacement of the Focus from the Actual Abusive Conditions to the Migration Process  310
- 7.5 Addressing Indeterminacy  315
- 7.6 Conclusion  318

### 8 Positive Obligations under Human Rights Law  319
- 8.1 Sources and Means of Interpretation  319
- 8.2 Reasonableness, Proximity and Knowledge  324
- 8.3 Systematization  329
- 8.4 Obligation to Criminalize  330
  - 8.4.1 The Interaction between Human Rights Law and National Criminal Law  331
  - 8.4.2 Criminalization under the Specific Labels of Slavery, Servitude and Forced Labour  338
  - 8.4.3 Defining the Crimes at National Level  344
- 8.5 Obligation to Investigate  351
  - 8.5.1 The Conditions Triggering the Obligation to Investigate  352
  - 8.5.2 Criteria for Assessing the Effectiveness of the Investigation  360
  - 8.5.3 The Test of Reasonableness and the ‘Significant Flaws’ Test  365
- 8.6 Prosecution  367
- 8.7 Obligation to Develop Effective Regulatory Frameworks  369
  - 8.7.1 Protection by Law  369
  - 8.7.2 The Importance of Labour Law  372
  - 8.7.3 Regulating Agencies  378
  - 8.7.4 The Clash between Protection and Immigration Control  380
  - 8.7.5 The Opportunities and the Limitations of Human Rights Law  387
- 8.8 Obligation to Develop Guarantees in the Identification Procedure  394
- 8.9 Obligation to Take Protective Operational Measures  400
  - 8.9.1 The Knowledge Element  402
  - 8.9.2 Reasonable Measures  404
## CONTENTS

8.10 Obligation to Provide for Effective Remedy 407
  8.10.1 The Requirements Raised by Article 13 of the ECHR 407
  8.10.2 Suspension of Deportation Proceedings and the Procedural Aspect of the Right to Remedy 415
  8.10.3 Non-removal as a Form of Remedy 421

8.11 Conclusion 424

9 Conclusion 427
  9.1 Historical Corrective and Conceptual Clarity 427
  9.2 The Criminal Law Approach Subverts the Human Rights Law Approach 430
  9.3 New Possibilities for Challenging States’ Immigration Control Interests 431
  9.4 The Historical Account of Slavery as a Cautionary 434
  9.5 The Protection Gap 435
  9.6 Better Definitional Articulation of Criminal Offences 438
  9.7 Interactions between the Legal Frameworks in Relation to the Obligation of Investigating Abuses 439
  9.8 Interactions between the Legal Frameworks in Relation to the Obligation of Identifying Victims 440
  9.9 Limited Entitlements Attached to the Status of Victim of Human Trafficking 442
  9.10 The Difficulty of Ensuring Non-removal under the Existing Legal Parameters 445
  9.11 The EU Law on Human Trafficking Undermines the CoE Standards 448

Select Bibliography 453

Index 465