

## CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xiii
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xv
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xvii
<i>Table of Legislation</i>	xxix
<i>National Legislation</i>	xxxiii
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Scope	1
1.2 Structure	10
1.3 The Human Trafficking Legal Framework versus the Human Rights Law: Structural Differences	11
<b>PART I The Human Trafficking Legal Framework</b>	<b>17</b>
2 Origins, Context and the Currently Valid Law	19
2.1 The Roots of the Concept of Human Trafficking	19
2.2 Re-emergence of Concerns about Trafficking and the Nexus with Organized Crime	23
2.3 The Palermo Protocols as Transnational Criminal Law Treaties	25
2.4 The CoE Trafficking Convention	27
2.5 The EU Law on Human Trafficking	29
2.6 Conclusion	30
3 The Definition of Human Trafficking in International Law	32
3.1 Not a Form of Exploitation	33
3.1.1 The <i>Mens Rea</i> Attached to the ‘Action’ Element	43
3.1.2 Accomplice Liability and the ‘Action’ Element	48
3.2 Deceptive and Coercive Process	50
3.2.1 The Timing	50
3.2.2 The Threshold	54

3.3	For the Purpose of Sexual Exploitation	57
3.3.1	Drafting the ‘Purpose’ Element	57
3.3.2	Actors in Opposition to the Term ‘Exploitation’	61
3.3.3	Feminist Clashes at Palermo	62
3.4	For the Purpose of Labour Exploitation	66
3.5	Conclusion	72
4	Positive Obligations under the Human Trafficking Legal Framework	74
4.1	Obligation to Criminalize	75
4.1.1	Establishment of Criminal Jurisdiction	75
4.1.2	Approximation of National Substantive Criminal Law	77
4.1.3	Investigation and Punishment	80
4.1.4	Criminalization of the Use of Services of Victims	82
4.2	The Status of a Victim of Human Trafficking	86
4.3	The Procedure for Identifying Victims	91
4.4	Stages in the Identification Procedure	101
4.4.1	The Preliminary Stage under CoE Law	102
4.4.2	The Preliminary Stage under EU Law	111
4.4.3	The Conclusive Stage	114
4.5	Assistance for Victims	117
4.5.1	The Minimum Level	117
4.5.2	Access to the Labour Market	120
4.5.3	Assistance Not Conditional on Cooperation	122
4.5.4	Timeframe of the Assistance	123
4.5.5	Assistance in the Framework of the Criminal Proceedings	129
4.6	Immigration Status in the Host Country	131
4.6.1	Repatriation	131
4.6.2	Residence Permit for Victims Who Cooperate under CoE Law	134
4.6.3	Residence Permit for Victims Who Cooperate under EU Law	136
4.6.4	Residence Permit on Humanitarian Grounds under CoE Law	138
4.7	Protection from Punishment	142
4.7.1	‘... victims ...’	144
4.7.2	‘... to the extent that they have been compelled to do so ...’	146
4.7.3	‘... provide for the possibility ...’	150
4.7.4	‘... in accordance with the basic principles of its legal system’	152
4.7.5	‘... not imposing ...’	155
4.7.6	‘... penalties ...’	157
4.7.7	Comparison with Article 31(1) of the Refugee Convention	158

## CONTENTS

ix

4.8	Immigration Detention of Victims of Trafficking	160
4.8.1	Detention in the Context of Deportation Proceedings	161
4.8.2	Detention in the Context of an Unauthorized Entry	167
4.8.3	Detention during Determination of International Protection Needs and Dublin Transfers	169
4.9	Compensation	172
4.9.1	Access to Information	172
4.9.2	Legal Assistance	172
4.9.3	Compensation from the Perpetrators	177
4.9.4	State Compensation Funds	178
4.10	Conclusion	181
<b>PART II</b>	<b>The Human Rights Law Framework</b>	<b>187</b>
5	The Historical Background	189
5.1	Colonialism and the Differentiation between Slavery and Forced Labour	190
5.2	The Term 'Institutions and Practices Similar to Slavery'	201
5.3	The Conceptual Division under Human Rights Law	206
5.4	Conclusion	215
6	Definitions with Contemporary Relevance	218
6.1	Slavery: Exercise of Powers Attaching to the Right of Ownership	220
6.1.1	The 1953 Secretary General Report	221
6.1.2	The ICC Statute and the Elements of Crimes	222
6.1.3	<i>Kunarac et al.</i>	230
6.1.4	Destruction of Juridical Personality	234
6.1.5	<i>The Queen v. Tang</i> and Its Follow Up	240
6.1.6	The ECtHR and the Definition of Slavery	245
6.1.7	Slavery and Abuses against Migrants	248
6.2	Servitude	251
6.2.1	Particularly Serious Form of Denial of Freedom	257
6.2.2	Usage of Labour Capacity	258
6.3	Forced Labour	260
6.3.1	No Exceptions under Article 4(3) of the ECHR	260
6.3.2	The Disproportionate Burden Test	266
6.4	An Absolute Right	279
6.5	The Distinctions between Slavery, Servitude and Forced Labour	285
6.5.1	The Gradation Model	285
6.5.2	The Distinctiveness of Slavery	287
6.5.3	The Special Stigma of Slavery	288
6.5.4	Why do the Distinctions Matter?	290
6.6	Conclusion	291

- 7 The Relationship between the Concept of Human Trafficking and the Concepts of Slavery, Servitude and Forced Labour 292
- 7.1 ‘Dancing’ on the Borders of Article 4 of the ECHR and *Rantsev v. Cyprus and Russia* 294
- 7.2 Slavery and *Rantsev v. Cyprus and Russia* 301
- 7.3 The Ineffectiveness of the Concept of Human Trafficking in the Context of Abuses against Migrant Prostitutes 307
- 7.4 The Displacement of the Focus from the Actual Abusive Conditions to the Migration Process 310
- 7.5 Addressing Indeterminacy 315
- 7.6 Conclusion 318
- 8 Positive Obligations under Human Rights Law 319
- 8.1 Sources and Means of Interpretation 319
- 8.2 Reasonableness, Proximity and Knowledge 324
- 8.3 Systematization 329
- 8.4 Obligation to Criminalize 330
- 8.4.1 The Interaction between Human Rights Law and National Criminal Law 331
- 8.4.2 Criminalization under the Specific Labels of Slavery, Servitude and Forced Labour 338
- 8.4.3 Defining the Crimes at National Level 344
- 8.5 Obligation to Investigate 351
- 8.5.1 The Conditions Triggering the Obligation to Investigate 352
- 8.5.2 Criteria for Assessing the Effectiveness of the Investigation 360
- 8.5.3 The Test of Reasonableness and the ‘Significant Flaws’ Test 365
- 8.6 Prosecution 367
- 8.7 Obligation to Develop Effective Regulatory Frameworks 369
- 8.7.1 Protection by Law 369
- 8.7.2 The Importance of Labour Law 372
- 8.7.3 Regulating Agencies 378
- 8.7.4 The Clash between Protection and Immigration Control 380
- 8.7.5 The Opportunities and the Limitations of Human Rights Law 387
- 8.8 Obligation to Develop Guarantees in the Identification Procedure 394
- 8.9 Obligation to Take Protective Operational Measures 400
- 8.9.1 The Knowledge Element 402
- 8.9.2 Reasonable Measures 404

## CONTENTS

xi

8.10	Obligation to Provide for Effective Remedy	407	
8.10.1	The Requirements Raised by Article 13 of the ECHR		407
8.10.2	Suspension of Deportation Proceedings and the Procedural Aspect of the Right to Remedy	415	
8.10.3	Non-removal as a Form of Remedy	421	
8.11	Conclusion	424	
9	Conclusion	427	
9.1	Historical Corrective and Conceptual Clarity	427	
9.2	The Criminal Law Approach Subverts the Human Rights Law Approach	430	
9.3	New Possibilities for Challenging States' Immigration Control Interests	431	
9.4	The Historical Account of Slavery as a Cautionary	434	
9.5	The Protection Gap	435	
9.6	Better Definitional Articulation of Criminal Offences	438	
9.7	Interactions between the Legal Frameworks in Relation to the Obligation of Investigating Abuses	439	
9.8	Interactions between the Legal Frameworks in Relation to the Obligation of Identifying Victims	440	
9.9	Limited Entitlements Attached to the Status of Victim of Human Trafficking	442	
9.10	The Difficulty of Ensuring Non-removal under the Existing Legal Parameters	445	
9.11	The EU Law on Human Trafficking Undermines the CoE Standards	448	
	<i>Select Bibliography</i>	453	
	<i>Index</i>	465	