

HUMAN TRAFFICKING AND SLAVERY RECONSIDERED

By reconsidering the definitions of human trafficking, slavery, servitude and forced labour, Vladislava Stoyanova demonstrates how, in embracing the human trafficking framework, the international community has sidelined the human rights law commitments against slavery, servitude and forced labour that in many respects provide better protection for abused migrants. Stoyanova proposes two corrective steps to this development: placing a renewed emphasis on determining the definitional scope of slavery, servitude or forced labour, and gaining a clearer understanding of states' positive human rights obligations. This book compares the anti-trafficking and human rights frameworks side-by-side and focuses its analysis on the Council of Europe's Trafficking Convention and Article 4 of the ECHR. With innovative arguments and pertinent case studies, this book is an important contribution to this field and will appeal to students, scholars and legal practitioners interested in human rights law, migration law, criminal law and EU law.

VLADISLAVA STOYANOVA is a postdoctoral fellow at the Faculty of Law, Lund University, Sweden. She is a lecturer in Migration Law and Human Rights Law and the director of the Migration Law course. She has extensively published in the field of human trafficking, slavery, migration law, refugee law and human rights law. She is an expert in Bulgarian migration and refugee law.

HUMAN TRAFFICKING AND SLAVERY RECONSIDERED

Conceptual Limits and States' Positive
Obligations in European Law

VLADISLAVA STOYANOVA
Lund University, Sweden



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-16228-0 — Human Trafficking and Slavery Reconsidered
Vladislava Stoyanova
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryaganj, Delhi – 110002, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107162280

DOI: 10.1017/9781316677070

© Vladislava Stoyanova 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Stoyanova, Vladislava, author.

Title: Human trafficking and slavery reconsidered : conceptual limits and states' positive obligations in European law / Vladislava Stoyanova.

Description: New York : Cambridge University Press, 2017. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2016049393 | ISBN 9781107162280 (hardback)

Subjects: LCSH: Human trafficking—European Union countries. | Human smuggling—European Union countries. | Human rights—European Union countries. | Slavery—Europe. | BISAC: POLITICAL SCIENCE / Political Freedom & Security / Human Rights.

Classification: LCC KJE8781.H86 S76 2017 | DDC 345.24/02551—dc23 LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2016049393>

ISBN 978-1-107-16228-0 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-16228-0 – Human Trafficking and Slavery Reconsidered

Vladislava Stoyanova

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

С благодарност към родителите ми, Недялка Стоянова
и Петър Стоянов, и баба ми, Дочка Делчева, за техните
грижи

За моето малко ангелче Амéррис

CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xiii
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xv
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xvii
<i>Table of Legislation</i>	xxix
<i>National Legislation</i>	xxxiii
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Scope	1
1.2 Structure	10
1.3 The Human Trafficking Legal Framework versus the Human Rights Law: Structural Differences	11
PART I The Human Trafficking Legal Framework	17
2 Origins, Context and the Currently Valid Law	19
2.1 The Roots of the Concept of Human Trafficking	19
2.2 Re-emergence of Concerns about Trafficking and the Nexus with Organized Crime	23
2.3 The Palermo Protocols as Transnational Criminal Law Treaties	25
2.4 The CoE Trafficking Convention	27
2.5 The EU Law on Human Trafficking	29
2.6 Conclusion	30
3 The Definition of Human Trafficking in International Law	32
3.1 Not a Form of Exploitation	33
3.1.1 The <i>Mens Rea</i> Attached to the ‘Action’ Element	43
3.1.2 Accomplice Liability and the ‘Action’ Element	48
3.2 Deceptive and Coercive Process	50
3.2.1 The Timing	50
3.2.2 The Threshold	54

3.3	For the Purpose of Sexual Exploitation	57
3.3.1	Drafting the ‘Purpose’ Element	57
3.3.2	Actors in Opposition to the Term ‘Exploitation’	61
3.3.3	Feminist Clashes at Palermo	62
3.4	For the Purpose of Labour Exploitation	66
3.5	Conclusion	72
4	Positive Obligations under the Human Trafficking Legal Framework	74
4.1	Obligation to Criminalize	75
4.1.1	Establishment of Criminal Jurisdiction	75
4.1.2	Approximation of National Substantive Criminal Law	77
4.1.3	Investigation and Punishment	80
4.1.4	Criminalization of the Use of Services of Victims	82
4.2	The Status of a Victim of Human Trafficking	86
4.3	The Procedure for Identifying Victims	91
4.4	Stages in the Identification Procedure	101
4.4.1	The Preliminary Stage under CoE Law	102
4.4.2	The Preliminary Stage under EU Law	111
4.4.3	The Conclusive Stage	114
4.5	Assistance for Victims	117
4.5.1	The Minimum Level	117
4.5.2	Access to the Labour Market	120
4.5.3	Assistance Not Conditional on Cooperation	122
4.5.4	Timeframe of the Assistance	123
4.5.5	Assistance in the Framework of the Criminal Proceedings	129
4.6	Immigration Status in the Host Country	131
4.6.1	Repatriation	131
4.6.2	Residence Permit for Victims Who Cooperate under CoE Law	134
4.6.3	Residence Permit for Victims Who Cooperate under EU Law	136
4.6.4	Residence Permit on Humanitarian Grounds under CoE Law	138
4.7	Protection from Punishment	142
4.7.1	‘... victims ...’	144
4.7.2	‘... to the extent that they have been compelled to do so ...’	146
4.7.3	‘... provide for the possibility ...’	150
4.7.4	‘... in accordance with the basic principles of its legal system’	152
4.7.5	‘... not imposing ...’	155
4.7.6	‘... penalties ...’	157
4.7.7	Comparison with Article 31(1) of the Refugee Convention	158

CONTENTS

ix

4.8	Immigration Detention of Victims of Trafficking	160
4.8.1	Detention in the Context of Deportation Proceedings	161
4.8.2	Detention in the Context of an Unauthorized Entry	167
4.8.3	Detention during Determination of International Protection Needs and Dublin Transfers	169
4.9	Compensation	172
4.9.1	Access to Information	172
4.9.2	Legal Assistance	172
4.9.3	Compensation from the Perpetrators	177
4.9.4	State Compensation Funds	178
4.10	Conclusion	181
PART II The Human Rights Law Framework		187
5	The Historical Background	189
5.1	Colonialism and the Differentiation between Slavery and Forced Labour	190
5.2	The Term 'Institutions and Practices Similar to Slavery'	201
5.3	The Conceptual Division under Human Rights Law	206
5.4	Conclusion	215
6	Definitions with Contemporary Relevance	218
6.1	Slavery: Exercise of Powers Attaching to the Right of Ownership	220
6.1.1	The 1953 Secretary General Report	221
6.1.2	The ICC Statute and the Elements of Crimes	222
6.1.3	<i>Kunarac et al.</i>	230
6.1.4	Destruction of Juridical Personality	234
6.1.5	<i>The Queen v. Tang</i> and Its Follow Up	240
6.1.6	The ECtHR and the Definition of Slavery	245
6.1.7	Slavery and Abuses against Migrants	248
6.2	Servitude	251
6.2.1	Particularly Serious Form of Denial of Freedom	257
6.2.2	Usage of Labour Capacity	258
6.3	Forced Labour	260
6.3.1	No Exceptions under Article 4(3) of the ECHR	260
6.3.2	The Disproportionate Burden Test	266
6.4	An Absolute Right	279
6.5	The Distinctions between Slavery, Servitude and Forced Labour	285
6.5.1	The Gradation Model	285
6.5.2	The Distinctiveness of Slavery	287
6.5.3	The Special Stigma of Slavery	288
6.5.4	Why do the Distinctions Matter?	290
6.6	Conclusion	291

- 7 The Relationship between the Concept of Human Trafficking and the Concepts of Slavery, Servitude and Forced Labour 292
- 7.1 ‘Dancing’ on the Borders of Article 4 of the ECHR and *Rantsev v. Cyprus and Russia* 294
- 7.2 Slavery and *Rantsev v. Cyprus and Russia* 301
- 7.3 The Ineffectiveness of the Concept of Human Trafficking in the Context of Abuses against Migrant Prostitutes 307
- 7.4 The Displacement of the Focus from the Actual Abusive Conditions to the Migration Process 310
- 7.5 Addressing Indeterminacy 315
- 7.6 Conclusion 318
- 8 Positive Obligations under Human Rights Law 319
- 8.1 Sources and Means of Interpretation 319
- 8.2 Reasonableness, Proximity and Knowledge 324
- 8.3 Systematization 329
- 8.4 Obligation to Criminalize 330
- 8.4.1 The Interaction between Human Rights Law and National Criminal Law 331
- 8.4.2 Criminalization under the Specific Labels of Slavery, Servitude and Forced Labour 338
- 8.4.3 Defining the Crimes at National Level 344
- 8.5 Obligation to Investigate 351
- 8.5.1 The Conditions Triggering the Obligation to Investigate 352
- 8.5.2 Criteria for Assessing the Effectiveness of the Investigation 360
- 8.5.3 The Test of Reasonableness and the ‘Significant Flaws’ Test 365
- 8.6 Prosecution 367
- 8.7 Obligation to Develop Effective Regulatory Frameworks 369
- 8.7.1 Protection by Law 369
- 8.7.2 The Importance of Labour Law 372
- 8.7.3 Regulating Agencies 378
- 8.7.4 The Clash between Protection and Immigration Control 380
- 8.7.5 The Opportunities and the Limitations of Human Rights Law 387
- 8.8 Obligation to Develop Guarantees in the Identification Procedure 394
- 8.9 Obligation to Take Protective Operational Measures 400
- 8.9.1 The Knowledge Element 402
- 8.9.2 Reasonable Measures 404

CONTENTS

xi

8.10	Obligation to Provide for Effective Remedy	407	
8.10.1	The Requirements Raised by Article 13 of the ECHR		407
8.10.2	Suspension of Deportation Proceedings and the Procedural Aspect of the Right to Remedy	415	
8.10.3	Non-removal as a Form of Remedy	421	
8.11	Conclusion	424	
9	Conclusion	427	
9.1	Historical Corrective and Conceptual Clarity	427	
9.2	The Criminal Law Approach Subverts the Human Rights Law Approach	430	
9.3	New Possibilities for Challenging States' Immigration Control Interests	431	
9.4	The Historical Account of Slavery as a Cautionary	434	
9.5	The Protection Gap	435	
9.6	Better Definitional Articulation of Criminal Offences	438	
9.7	Interactions between the Legal Frameworks in Relation to the Obligation of Investigating Abuses	439	
9.8	Interactions between the Legal Frameworks in Relation to the Obligation of Identifying Victims	440	
9.9	Limited Entitlements Attached to the Status of Victim of Human Trafficking	442	
9.10	The Difficulty of Ensuring Non-removal under the Existing Legal Parameters	445	
9.11	The EU Law on Human Trafficking Undermines the CoE Standards	448	
	<i>Select Bibliography</i>	453	
	<i>Index</i>	465	

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book is an adaptation of my doctoral thesis, which was written at the Faculty of Law, Lund University, Sweden. The greatest debt of gratitude is owed to Gregor Noll, my thesis supervisor, for his overall support, for the time spent reading my text, for all the meetings that we had and for his general guidance on human rights law and migration law. These will stay with me in my future work. Thanks also to my second supervisor Johanna Niemi for being so supportive and for always showing me alternative perspectives. I also owe a weighty debt of gratitude to my examiners, James Hathaway, Cathryn Costello, Elspeth Guild, Ryszard Piotrowicz and the late Ida Koch. Particular thanks must also go to Leila Brännström for her comments on earlier drafts.

I would like to thank the Faculty of Law at Lund and the Ragnar Söderbergs Stiftelse for providing the material support necessary for the completion of this book. Being a foreigner in Lund was not easy, and in this respect I am very grateful to my colleagues Aleksandra Popovic, Niklas Selberg, Linnéa Wegerstad, Anna Bruce and Moa De Lucia Dahlbeck for helping me. I would like to also mention Matthew Scott, Eleni Karageorgiou, Letizia Lo Giacco, Mariagiulia Giuffré, Ulf Linderfalk, Xavier Groussot, Sverker Jönsson, Radu Mares, Markus Gunneflo, Christoffer Wong and Eduardo Gill-Pedro, with whom I have had exchanges valuable for the progression of my work. Thanks are also due to Mark Gibney for his support and useful guidance. With great diligence John Harbord edited the language of the manuscript, for which I am grateful.

The book has greatly benefited from my research visit at the University of Michigan Law School as a Michigan Grotius Research Scholar. I would like to thank James Hathaway, Rebecca Scott, Bridgette Carr and Bénédicte Bourgeois for their support during my stay in Ann Arbor, Michigan. The chapters on positive obligations have been informed by my discussions with Eva Brems and Laurens Lavrysen from the Human Rights Center at Ghent University, Belgium.

I was privileged to publish parts of the book at various stages of development. Sections 7.1 and 7.2 contain an updated version of a previous article ‘Dancing on the Borders of Article 4. Human Trafficking and the European Court of Human Rights in the Rantsev Case’ 30(2) *Netherlands Quarterly of Human Rights* (2012). Section 8.4 draws on ‘Article 4 of the ECHR and the Obligation of Criminalising Slavery, Servitude, Forced Labour and Human Trafficking’ 3(2) *Cambridge Journal of International and Comparative Law* (2014).

The roots of my interests in human rights law and the rights of migrants are in my home country, where I was part of a project, remarkable at that time for a country like Bulgaria, aimed at providing asylum-seekers and undocumented migrants with free legal assistance. The project was run by Blagody Vidin and Valeria Ilareva. Valeria is my initiator in refugee and migration law, and I acknowledge an intellectual and personal debt of gratitude to her.

My warm thanks to Olga Nikolova, Nikolay Ilchev, Nezabravka Vazelova, Anna Tzvetkova and Daniel Nilsson for their friendship. Thanks are also due to Nicu Costea for sparking the idea of me doing a PhD and challenging me with his critical observations.

No words can capture my gratitude to my parents, Petar Stoyanov and Nelyalka Stoyanova, my sister, Dilyana Stoyanova, and my grandmother Dochka Delcheva, for their love and care. The birth of my son, Amérris, when I was in the middle of the project, made the process of writing more joyful.

ABBREVIATIONS

App.	Application
CETS	Council of Europe Treaty Office
CoE	Council of Europe
Comm.	Communication
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
ECJ	Court of Justice of the European Union
ECOSOC	United Nations Economic and Social Council
ECR	European Court Reports
EU	European Union
EWCA	Court of Appeal of England and Wales
EWHC	England and Wales High Court
GC	Grand Chamber of the European Court of Human Rights
GRETA	Group of Experts on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings
HRC	Human Rights Committee
IACHR	Inter-American Court on Human Rights
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia
IEHC	Ireland High Court
IESC	Supreme Court of Ireland
ILC	International Law Commission

xvi

ABBREVIATIONS

ILO	International Labour Organization
ILabC	International Labour Conference
LNTS	League of Nations Treaty Series
MS	EU Member State
NGO	Non-governmental Organization
NICC	Crown Court for Northern Ireland
NIQB	High Court of Justice in Northern Ireland Queen's Bench Division
OJ	Official Journal of the European Union
SSH D	Secretary of State for the Home Department
TFEU	Treaty on the Functioning of the EU
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UK	United Kingdom
UKEAT	United Kingdom Employment Appeal Tribunal
UKHL	United Kingdom House of Lords
UKSC	United Kingdom Supreme Court
UKUP	United Kingdom Upper Tribunal
UN	United Nations
UNHCR	United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
UNODC	United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime
UNTS	United National Treaty Series
VCLT	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties

TABLE OF CASES

European Court of Human Rights

- A. v. the United Kingdom*, App. No. 100/1997/884/1096, 23 September 1998 281, 320
- Abdolkhani and Karimnia v. Turkey*, App. No. 30471/08, 22 September 2009 409
- Abdulaziz, Cabales and Balkandali v. the United Kingdom*, App. No. 9214/80,
28 May 1985 173
- Aden Ahmed v. Malta*, App. No. 55352/12, 23 July 2013 162, 166
- Airey v. Ireland*, App. No. 6289/73, 9 October 1979 396, 409
- Aksoy v. Turkey*, App. No. 21987/93, 18 December 1996 410, 420
- Al-Adsani v. the United Kingdom*, [GC] App. No. 35763/97, 21 November 2001 13
- Ali and Ayse Duran v. Turkey*, App. No. 42942/02, 8 April 2008 368
- Al-Nashif v. Bulgaria*, App. No. 50963/99, 20 June 2002 371
- Al-Skeini and Others v. the United Kingdom*, [GC] App. No. 55721/07, 7 July 2011 362
- Amuur v. France*, App. No. 19776/92, 25 June 1996 161
- B.A. v. France*, App. No. 74694/14, Decision 25 August 2015 (struck out of the list) 415
- B.S. v. Spain*, App. No. 47159/08, 24 July 2012 365
- Baklanov v. Ukraine*, App. No. 44425/08, 24 October 2013 408
- Bayatan v. Armenia*, [GC] App. No. 23459/03, 7 July 2011 214, 265
- Beganovic v. Croatia*, App. No. 46423/06, 25 June 2009 320, 326, 352, 360
- Bensaid v. the United Kingdom*, App. No. 44599/98, 6 February 2001 422
- Berlinski v. Poland*, App. No. 27715/95 and 30209/96, 20 June 2002 282
- Biao v. Denmark*, [GC] App. No. 38590/10, 24 May 2016 173
- Blumberga v. Latvia*, App. No. 70930/01, 14 October 2008 365
- Bonger v. the Netherlands*, App. No. 10154/04, Decision 15 September 2005
(inadmissible) 416
- Botta v. Italy*, App. No. 21439/93, 24 February 1998 324
- Boyle and Rice v. the United Kingdom*, App. No. 9659/82, 27 April 1988 408

- Branko Tomasic and Others v. Croatia*, App. No. 46598/06, 15 January 2009 322
- Bucha v. Slovakia*, App. No. 43259/07, Decision 20 September 2011 269
- Budayeva and Others v. Russia*, App. No. 15339/02, 20 March 2008 412
- Butolen v. Slovenia*, App. No. 41356/08, 26 April 2012 360
- C.A.S. and C.S. v. Romania*, App. No. 26692/05, 20 March 2012 351, 352, 353, 360, 366
- C.N. v. the United Kingdom*, App. No. 4239/08, 13 November 2012 255, 311, 331, 351
- C.N. and V. v. France*, App. No. 67724/09, 11 October 2012 254, 307, 324, 331, 351
- Calvelli and Ciglio v. Italy*, [GC] App. No. 32967/96, 17 January 2002 367
- Chahal v. the United Kingdom*, [GC] App. No. 22414/93, 15 November 1996 161
- Chitos v. Greece*, App. No. 51637/12, 4 June 2015 270
- Choreftakis and Choreftaki v. Greece*, App. No. 46846/08, 17 January 2012 402
- Christine Goodwin v. the United Kingdom*, [GC] App. No. 28957/95, 11 July 2002 320
- Ciorap v. Moldova*, App. No. 12066/02, 19 June 2007 282
- Čonka v. Belgium*, App. No. 51564/99, 5 February 2002 407, 408, 409, 412
- D. v. the United Kingdom*, App. No. 30240/96, 2 May 1997 422
- D.J. v. Croatia*, App. No. 42418/10, 24 July 2012 391
- Danilenkov and Others v. Russia*, App. No. 67336/01, 30 July 2009 371
- Del Sol v. France*, App. No. 46800/99, 26 February 2002 409
- Demir and Baykara v. Turkey*, [GC] App. No. 34503/97, 12 November 2008 13, 306
- Denis Vasilyev v. Russia*, App. No. 32704/04, 17 December 2009 351, 353
- De Souza Ribeiro v. France*, [GC] App. No. 22689/07, 13 December 2012 419
- De Wilde, Ooms and Versyp ('Vagrancy') v. Belgium*, App. Nos. 2832/66, 2835/66, 2899/66, 18 June 1971 261
- E. and Others v. the United Kingdom*, App. No. 33218/96, 26 November 2002 328, 405
- Elisabeth Kawogo v. the United Kingdom*, App. No. 56921/09 Decision 3 September 2013 (struck out of the list) 311
- Engel and Others v. the Netherlands*, App. No. 5100/71; 5101/71; 5102/71; 5354/72; 5370/72, 8 June 1976 157
- Eremia v. the Republic of Moldova*, App. No. 3564/11, 28 May 2013 402
- F.A. v. the United Kingdom*, App. No. 20658/11, Decision 10 September 2013 (inadmissible) 142
- Fadeyeva v. Russia*, App. No. 55723/00, 9 June 2005 371, 392
- Floroiu v. Romania*, App. No. 15303/10, Decision 12 March 2013 265
- G.J. v. Spain*, App. No. 59172/12, Decision 21 June 2016 (inadmissible) 404
- G.R. v. the Netherlands*, App. No. 22251/07, 10 January 2012 397

TABLE OF CASES

xix

- Gäfgen v. Germany*, [GC] App. No. 22978/05, 1 June 2010 280, 369
Gaskin v. the United Kingdom, App. No. 10454/83, 7 July 1989 397
Gaygusuz v. Austria, App. No. 17371/90, 16 September 1996 173
Golder v. the United Kingdom, App. No. 4451/70, 21 February 1975 378
Gorovensky and Bugara v. Ukraine, App. No. 36146/05, 12 January 2012 401
Graziani-Weiss v. Austria, App. No. 31950/06, 18 October 2011 268, 269
Güler and Öngel v. Turkey, App. Nos. 29612/05 and 30668/05, 4 October 2011 282
Idemugia v. France, App. No. 4125/11, Decision 27 March 2012 (inadmissible) 423
Iovchev v. Bulgaria, App. No. 41211/98, 2 February 2006 409, 413
Iversen v. Norway, App. No. 1468/62, 17 December 1963 266
J.A. v. France, App. No. 45310/11, Decision 27 May 2014 (inadmissible) 361, 402
J. and Others v. Austria, App. No. 58216/12, 17 January 2017 88, 298, 300, 362, 399
Jabari v. Turkey, App. No. 40035/98, 11 July 2002 397
Jalloh v. Germany, [GC] App. No. 54810/00, 11 July 2006 276
Jeunesse v. the Netherlands, [GC] App. No. 12738/10, 3 October 2014 381
K.U. v. Finland, App. No. 2872/02, 2 December 2008 328
Karlheinz Schmidt v. Germany, App. No. 13580/88, 18 July 1994 261, 263
Kasymakhunov and Saybatalov v. Russia, App. Nos. 26261/05 and 26377/06,
 14 March 2013 336
Khashiyev and Akayeva v. Russia, App. No. 57942/00, 24 February 2005 410, 411
Klass and Others v. Germany, App. No. 5029/71, 6 September 1978 408
Khlaifia and Others v. Italy, [GC], App. No. 16483/12, 15 December 2016 419
Kokkinaksi v. Greece, App. No. 14307/88, 25 May 1993 336
Koky and Others v. Slovakia, App. No. 13624/03, 12 June 2012 353, 360, 364, 365
Konrova v. Slovakia, App. No. 7510/04, 31 May 2007 403, 413
Korbely v. Hungary, App. No. 9174/02, 19 September 2008 336
Kudła v. Poland, [GC] App. No. 30210/96, 26 October 2000 407
L.C.B. v. the United Kingdom, App. No. 14/1997/798/1001, 9 June 1998 326
L.E. v. Greece, App. No. 71545/12, 21 January 2016 281, 361, 397, 398, 399, 401
L.R. v. the United Kingdom, App. No. 49113/09, Decision 14 June 2011 (struck out
 of the list) 415
Labita v. Italy, [GC] App. No. 26772/95, 6 April 2000 356
Lombardi Vallauri v. Italy, App. No. 39128/05, 20 October 2009 397
López Guió v. Slovakia, App. No. 10280/12, 3 June 2014 398
M. and C. v. Romania, App. No. 29032/11, 27 September 2011 366

- M. and Others v. Italy and Bulgaria*, App. No. 40020/03, 31 July 2012 247, 259, 351
- M. and Others v. Bulgaria*, App. No. 41416/08, 26 July 2011 394, 397
- M.A. v. Cyprus*, App. No. 41872/10, 23 July 2013 164
- M.C. v. Bulgaria*, App. No. 39272/98, 4 December 2003 331, 344
- M.S.S. v. Belgium and Greece*, [GC] App. No. 30696/09, 21 January 2011 12
- Maaouia v. France*, App. No. 39652/98, 5 October 2000 417
- Maiorano and Others v. Italy*, App. No. 28634/06, 15 December 2009 402
- Marckx v. Belgium*, App. No. 6833/74, 13 June 1979 371
- Mastromatteo v. Italy*, [GC] App. No. 37703/97, 24 October 2002 327, 328, 401
- McCann and Others v. the United Kingdom*, App. No. 18984/91, 27 September 1995 372
- Medova v. Russia*, App. No. 25385/04, 15 January 2009 320, 411
- Meier v. Switzerland*, App. No. 10109/14, 9 February 2016 268
- Menson v. the United Kingdom*, App. No. 47916/99, Decision 6 May 2003 (inadmissible) 352
- Mihal v. Slovakia*, App. No. 23360/08, Decision 28 June 2011 (inadmissible) 269
- Mikheyev v. Russia*, App. No. 77617/01, 26 January 2006 365
- Milanović v. Serbia*, App. No. 44614/07, 14 December 2010 352, 364, 403
- Morshed Chowdury and Others v. Greece*, App. No. 21884/15 (communicated on 9 September 2015) 341
- Mubilanzila Mayeka and Kaniki Mitunga v. Belgium*, App. No. 13178/03, 12 October 2006 166
- N. v. the United Kingdom*, [GC] App. No. 26565/05, 27 May 2008 389, 422
- Nabil and Others v. Hungary*, App. No. 62116/12, 12 September 2015 163
- Nachova and Others v. Bulgaria*, App. No. 43577/98 and 43579/98, 6 July 2005 371
- O.G.O. v. the United Kingdom*, App. No. 13950/12, Decision 18 February 2014 (struck out of the list) 415
- O'Keefe v. Ireland*, [GC] App. No. 35810/09, 28 January 2014 324, 325, 328, 371
- Okkali v. Turkey*, App. No. 52067/99, 17 October 2006 368
- Öneryildiz v. Turkey*, [GC] App. No. 48939/99, 30 November 2004 329, 367, 412
- Opuz v. Turkey*, App. No. 33401/02, 9 June 2009 332
- Osman v. the United Kingdom*, [GC] App. No. 23452/94, 28 October 1998 400
- P. and S. v. Poland*, App. No. 57375/08, 30 October 2012 397
- P. C. and S. v. the United Kingdom*, App. No. 56547/00, 16 July 2001 176
- P., F. and E.F. v. the United Kingdom*, App. No. 28326/09, Decision 23 November 2010 (inadmissible) 406
- Paposhvili v. Belgium* [GC], App. No. 41738/10, 13 December 2016 423

TABLE OF CASES

xxi

- Peck v. the United Kingdom*, App. No. 44647/98, 28 January 2003 409
- Perez v. France*, [GC] App. No. 47287/99, 12 February 2004 369
- Piechowicz v. Poland*, App. No. 20071/07, 17 April 2012 282
- Plattform Ärzte für das Leben v. Austria*, App. No. 10126/82, 21 June 1988 321
- R.R. v. Poland*, App. No. 27617/04, 26 May 2011 371
- R.U. v. Greece*, App. No. 2237/08, 7 June 2011 161
- Rahimi v. Greece*, App. No. 8687/08, 5 April 2011 409
- Rantsev v. Cyprus and Russia*, App. No. 25965/04, 7 January 2010 12, 246, 295, 323
- Redfearn v. the United Kingdom*, App. No. 47335/06, 6 November 2012 394
- Riad and Idiab v. Belgium*, App. Nos. 29787/03 and 29810/03, 24 January 2008 161
- Roche v. the United Kingdom*, [GC] App. No. 32555, 19 October 2005 396
- S. and Marper v. the United Kingdom*, [GC] App. No. 30562/04, 4 December 2008 397
- S.M. v. Croatia*, App. No. 60561/14 (communicated on 9 February 2015) 361
- Saadi v. the United Kingdom*, [GC] App. No. 13229/03, 29 January 2008 168
- Salakhov and Islyamova v. Ukraine*, App. No. 28005/08, 14 March 2013 328
- Salman v. Turkey*, [GC] App. No. 21986/93, 27 June 2000 282
- Sandra Jankovic v. Croatia*, App. No. 38478/05, 5 March 2009 368
- Savda v. Turkey*, App. No. 42730, 12 June 2012 396
- Schneider v. Germany*, App. No. 17080/07, 15 September 2011 397
- Siliadin v. France*, App. No. 73316/01, 26 July 2005 245, 324, 331
- Silih v. Slovenia*, App. No. 71463/01, 9 April 2009 351
- Silver and Others v. the United Kingdom*, App. No. 7136/75, 25 March 1983 409
- Söderman v. Sweden*, [GC] App. No. 5786/08, 12 November 2013 325, 366, 368
- Stanev v. Bulgaria*, App. No. 36760/06, 17 January 2012 413
- Stec and Others v. the United Kingdom* [GC] App. No. 65731/01 and 65900/01,
 Decision 6 July 2005 (party admissible) 321, 323
- Steel and Morris v. the United Kingdom*, App. No. 68416/01, 15 February 2005 409
- Steindl v. Germany*, App. No. 29878/07, Decision 14 September 2010
 (inadmissible) 262, 264, 269
- Stummer v. Austria*, [GC] App. No. 37452/02, 7 July 2011 262, 264, 268
- Sunday Times v. the United Kingdom*, App. No. 6538/74, 26 April 1979 335
- Szula v. the United Kingdom*, App. No. 18727/06, Decision 4 January 2007
 (inadmissible) 367, 368
- T.I. and Others v. Greece*, App. No. 40311/10 (communicated on 6 September 2016) 402
- T.M. and C.M. v. the Republic of Moldova*, App. No. 26608/11, 28 January 2014 353
- Ternovszky v. Hungary*, App. No. 67545/09, 14 December 2010 370

- Turlueva v. Russia*, App. No. 63638/09, 20 June 2013 360
- Tyrer v. the United Kingdom*, App. No. 5856/72, 25 April 1978 321, 336
- Tysiac v. Poland*, App. No. 5410/03, 20 March 2007 370, 397
- Young, James and Webster v. the United Kingdom*, App. No. 7601/76,
13 August 1981 372
- V. v. the United Kingdom*, App. No. 24888/94, 16 December 1999 367
- V.C. v. Slovakia*, App. No. 18968/07, 8 November 2011 397
- V.F. v. France*, App. No. 7196/10, Decision 29 November 2011 (inadmissible) 402
- Valiuliene v. Lithuania*, App. No. 33234/07, 26 March 2013 320, 353, 368
- Van der Mussele v. Belgium*, App. No. 8919/80, 23 November 1983
260, 261, 263, 268, 273
- Van Droogenbroeck v. Belgium*, App. No. 7906/77, Decision 5 July 1979
(partly admissible) 252, 254, 261
- Velikova v. Bulgaria*, App. No. 41488/98, 18 May 2000 360
- VgT Verein Gegen Tierfabriken v. Switzerland*, App. No. 24699/94, 28 June 2001 372
- X. and Y. v. the Netherlands*, App. No. 8978/80, 26 March 1985 331
- Yoh-Ekale Mwanje v. Belgium*, App. No. 10486/10, 20 December 2011 166
- Yordanova and Others v. Bulgaria*, App. No. 25446/06, 24 April 2012 397
- Z. and Others v. the United Kingdom*, [GC] App. No. 29392/95, 10 May 2001
280, 378, 409, 413
- Zarb Adami v. Malta*, App. No. 17209/02, 20 June 2006 261, 264
- Zhelyazkov v. Bulgaria*, App. No. 11332/04, 9 October 2012 265

European Committee of Social Rights

- Confédération générale du travail (CGT) v. France*, Complaint No. 55/2009, Decision on
the Merits 23 June 2010 275
- Defence of Children International v. the Netherlands*, Complaint No. 47/2008, Decision
on the Merits 20 October 2009 275
- Federation of Catholic Family Associations in Europe (FAFCE) v. Ireland*, Complaint No.
89/2013, Decision on the Merits 12 September 2014 92
- Quaker Council for European Affairs (QCEA) v. Greece*, Complaint No. 8/2000, Decision
on the Merits 25 April 2001 269

Court of Justice of the EU

- Adccaten voor de Wereld VZW v. Leden van de Ministerraad*, Case C-303/05,
3 May 2007, [2007] ECR I-03633 33
- Åklagaren v. Hans Åkerberg Fransson*, Case C-617/10, 26 February 2013 15

TABLE OF CASES

xxiii

- Bashir Mohamed Ali Mahdi*, Case C-146/14 PPU, 5 June 2014, [2014] OJ C 253/14 161
- Ben Alaya*, Case C-491/13, 10 September 2014, [2014] OJ C 409/18 136
- Deutsche Energiehandels- und Beratungsgesellschaft mbH v. Bundesrepublik Deutschland*,
 Case C-279/09, 22 December 2010, [2010] ECR I-13849 176
- Hassan El-Dridi alias Karim Soufi*, Case C-61/11 PPU, 28 April 2011, [2011] ECR I-3015 161
- J. McB. v. L.E.*, Case C-400/10 PPU, 5 October 2010, [2010] ECR I-08965 15
- Mehrdad Ghezelbash v. Staatssecretaris van Veiligheid en Justitie*, Case C-63/15, 7
 June 2016, [2016] OJ C 296/12 171
- N.S. v. S.S.H.D. and M.E and Others v. Refugee Applications Commissioner and Minister
 for Justice, Equality and Law Reform*, Joined Cases C-411/10 and
 C-493/10, 21 December 2011, [2011] ECR I-13905 15
- Opinion of Advocate General Trstenjak in Case C-411/10 N.S. v. Secretary of State for the
 Home Department*, 22 September 2011 15
- Panayotova and Others v. Minister voor Vreemdelingenzaken en Integratie*, Case
 C-327/02, 16 November 2004, [2004] ECR I-11055 137
- Said Shamilovich Kadzoev*, Case C-357/09 PPU, 30 November 2009, [2009] ECR
 I-11189 161
- Sélina Affum*, Case C-47/15, 7 June 2016 167
- Tümer v. Raad van bestuur van het Uitvoeringsinstituut werknemersverzekeringen*,
 Case C-311/13, 5 November 2014 378
- Volker und Markus Schencke GbR and Hartmut Eifert v. Land Hassen*, Joined Cases
 C-92/09 and C-93/09, 9 November 2010, [2010] ECR I-11063 15
- Z. Zh. and O.*, Case C-554/13, 11 June 2015 114

Inter-American Court of Human Rights

- Anzualdo Castro v. Peru*, 22 September 2009, Series C No. 202 238, 239
- Bámaca Velásquez v. Guatemala*, 25 November 2000, Series C No. 70 265, 237, 238
- Expelled Dominicans and Haitians v. Dominican Republic*, 28 August 2014,
 Series C No. 282 237
- Fazenda Brasil Verde v. Brasil*, Petition No. 12.066 (judgment pending) 239
- Gudiel Álvarez et al. v. Guatemala*, 20 November 2012, Series C No. 253 238
- Indigenous Community Sawhoyamaxa v. Paraguay*, 29 March 2006, Series C No. 146 237
- José Pereira v. Brazil*, Report No. 95/03, Petition No. 11.289, 24 October 2003
 (friendly settlement) 239
- Osorio Rivera and Family Members v. Peru*, 26 November 2013, Series C No. 274 238
- The Girls Yean and Bosico v. Dominica Republic*, 8 September 2005, Series C No. 130 237
- The Saramaka People v. Suriname*, 28 November 2007, Series C No. 172 237

UN Human Rights Committee

- Adam Hassan Aboussedra v. Libya*, Comm. No. 1751/2008, 25 October 2010 236
- Bernadette Faure v. Australia*, Comm. No. 1036/2001, 23 November 2005 266, 267, 218
- Cenk Atasoy and Arda Sarkut v. Turkey*, Comm. Nos. 1853–1854/2008, 29 March 2012 214, 218
- Darwinia Rosa Mónaco de Galliccio v. Argentina*, Comm. No. 400/1990, 27 April 1995 236
- Dieter Wolf v. Panama*, Comm. No. 289/1988, 26 March 1992 218
- I. S. v. Belarus*, Comm. No. 1994/2010, 28 April 2011 218
- M.P. v. Spain*, Comm. No. 1398/2005, 20 January 2012 218
- Marijan Radosevic v. Germany*, Comm. No. 1292/2004, 5 August 2005 218
- Sima Booteh v. the Netherlands*, Comm. No. 1204/2003, 30 March 2005 236
- Yeo-Bum Yoon and Myung-Jin Choi v. Republic of Korea*, Comm. No. 1321–1322/2004, 23 January 2007 214, 218

International Court of Justice

- Armed Activities on the Territory of the Congo (Congo v. Uganda)*, Judgment 19 December 2005. 327

International Criminal Court

- Prosecutor v. Bosco Ntaganda*, ICC-01/04-02/06-309, Pre-trial Chamber II, 9 June 2014 226
- Prosecutor v. Katanga and Ngudjolo Chui*, ICC-01/04-01/07, Judgment, 7 March 2014 225

International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia

- Prosecutor v. Kunarac et al*, IT-96-23-T and IT-96-23/1-T, Trial Chamber, 22 February 2001 231, 232
- Prosecutor v. Kunarac et al*, IT-96-23 & IT-96-23/1-A, Appeals Chamber, 12 June 2002 231, 233

Special Court for Sierra Leone

- Taylor*, SCSL-03-01-T, Trial Chamber Judgment, 18 May 2012 240

Economic Community of West Africa States Community Court of Justice

- Hadijatou Mani Koraou v. Republic of Niger*, Judgment No. ECW/CCJ/JUD/06/08, 27 October 2008 220

TABLE OF CASES

XXV

National Case Law*United Kingdom*

- A.A. (Iraq) v. S.S.H.D.* [2012] EWCA Civ 23, 24 January 2012 56
- A.B. v. S.S.H.D.* [2015] EWHC 1490 (Admin), 22 May 2015 101
- A.S. (Afghanistan) v. S.S.H.D.* [2013] EWCA Civ 1469 99
- A.T., N.T., M.L., A.L. v. Gavril Dulghieru and Tamara Dulghieru* [2009] EWHC 225 (GB), 19 February 2009 177
- Allen (Nee Aboyade-Cole) v. Hounga and Another* [2011] UKEAT/0326/10/3103, 31 March 2011 373
- Attorney General's Reference Nos. 37, 38 and 65 of 2010* [2010] EWCA Crim 2880 278
- Benkharbouche and Janah v. Embassy of the Republic of Sudan, Libya and the Secretary of State for Foreign and Commonwealth Affairs* [2015] EWCA Civ 33, 5 February 2015 177
- Cristy Ferrer Poquiz v. S.S.H.D.* [2015] EWHC 1759, 23 June 2015 116
- D.S.D. v. Commissioner of Police of the Metropolis* [2014] EWHC 436 (GB), 28 February 2014 363
- E. v. S.S.H.D.* [2012] EWHC 1927 (Admin) 17 July 2012 36, 100
- E.K. (Article 4 ECHR: Anti-trafficking Convention) Tanzania* [2013] UKUT 00313 (Immigration and Asylum Chamber) 423
- E.K. v. S.S.H.D.* [2016] EWHC 56 (Admin), 18 January 2016 101
- F.M. v. S.S.H.D.* [2015] EWHC 844 (Admin), 26 March 2015 95
- Gudanaviciene and Ors v. The Director of Legal Aid Casework and Ors* [2014] EWCA Civ 1622, 15 December 2014 120
- Hoang Anh Minh v. S.S.H.D.* [2015] EWHC 1725 (Admin), 18 June 2015 125, 359
- Houng (Appellant) v. Allen and Another (Respondents)* [2014] UKSC 47, 30 July 2014 178
- K. v. S.S.H.D.* [2015] EWHC 3668 (Admin), 21 December 2015 139
- L., H.V.N., T.H.N. v. R (The Children's Commissioner for England and Equality and Human Rights Commission)* [2013] EWCA Crim 991, 21 June 2013 145, 147, 149
- L.M., M.B., D.G., Betti Tabot and Yutunde Tijani v. The Queen* [2010] EWCA Crim 2327, 21 October 2010 143, 147, 151, 153
- Limbuela (Conjoined Appeals)* [2005] UKHL 66, 3 November 2005 390
- M.S. v. S.S.H.D.* [2016] UKUT 226 (Immigration and Asylum Chamber), 23 March 2016 416

- Mary Houngra v. Adenike Allen and Kunle Allen* [2012] EWCA Civ 609,
 15 May 2012 373, 374
- Mutesi v. S.S.H.D* [2015] EWHC 2467 (Admin), 18 June 2015 34, 101
- Nhan Thi Nguyen v. S.S.H.D.* [2015] UKUT 170 (Immigration and Asylum Chamber),
 25 March 2015 125
- O.O.O. v. The Commissioner of the Police for the Metropolis* [2011] EWHC 1246 (QB),
 20 May 2011 358
- Public Law Project v. The Lord Chancellor* [2015] EWCA Civ 193, 25 November
 2015 173
- R. (BG) v. S.S.H.D.* [2016] EWHC 786 (Admin), 12 April 2016 34, 35, 47, 171
- R. v. N. and R. v. L.E.* [2012] EWCA Crim 189, 20 February 2012 153
- R. v. O.* [2011] EWCA Crim 2226, 9 September 2011 145
- R. (on the application of Reilly and another) v. Secretary of State for Work and Pensions*
 [2013] UKSC 68, 30 October 2013 278
- R. (on the application of the Public Law Project) v. Lord Chancellor* [2016] UKSC 39,
 13 July 2016 173
- R. (on the application of TDT, by his litigation friend, Tara Topteagarden) v. S.S.H.D*
 [2016] EWHC 1912 (Admin), 29 July 2016 403
- R. (Atamewan) v. SSHD* [2013] EWHC 2727 (Admin), 06 September 2013 413, 416
- R. v. Elisabeth Delgado-Fernandez Godwin Zammit and R. v. Thanh Hue Thi* [2007]
 EWCA Crim 762, 6 March 2007 308
- R. v. Pearson-Gaballonie* [2007] EWCA Crim 3504, 3 October 2007 347
- R. v. Roman Pacan, Ali Arslan, Edward Facuna and Martin Doci* [2009] EWCA Crim
 2436, 16 October 2009 308
- R. v. Shaban Maka* [2005] EWCA Crim 3365, 16 November 2005 308
- R. v. Uxbridge Magistrates Court and Another, Ex parte Adimi* [1999] EWHC Admin
 765, 29 July 1999 157, 159
- Re Officer L* [2007] UKHL 36, 31 July 2007 404
- Regina v. Helen Ajayi*, [2010] EWCA Crim 471, 23 February 2010 142
- Regina v. S.K.* [2011] EWCA Crim 1691, 8 July 2011 246, 286, 346
- Reyes and Suryadi v. Al-Malki* [2015] EWCA Civ 32, 5 February 2015 177
- S.F. v. S.S.H.D* [2015] EWHC 2705, 30 September 2015 101
- S.H.L. v. S.S.H.D. (Tracing obligation/Trafficking) Afghanistan* [2013] UKUT 312 (IAC),
 16 June 2013 98
- Smith v. Chief Constable of Sussex* [2008] EWCA Civ 39, 5 February 2008 404
- S.S.H.D. v. Hoang Anh Mihn* [2016] EWCA Civ 565, 20 June 2016 359

TABLE OF CASES

xxvii

- T.D. and A.D. (Trafficked Women) v. S.S.H.D.* [2016] UKUT 00092 (IAC),
 23 February 2016 140
- The Queen (on the application of Antanas Galdikas, Rimantas Tamosaitis, Edgaras Subatkis and Edviana Subatkis) v. S.S.H.D.* [2016] EWHC 942, 26
 April 2016 129, 137
- Vakante v. Governing Body of Addey and Stanhope School (No. 2)* [2004] EWCA Civ 106,
 30 July 2004 373
- Vinh van Dao, Hoang Mai, Muoi Thi Nguyen v. Regina* [2012] EWCA Crim 1717,
 31 July 2012 153
- William Connors, James Connors, John Connors and Miles Connors v. R* [2013] EWCA
 Crim 324, 26 March 2013 257, 286
- Zarkasi v. Anindita and Another* [2012] UKEAT 0400/11/1801, 18 January 2012 373

Northern Ireland

- In the Matter of an Application by W for Judicial Review* [2012] NIQB 37,
 31 May 2012 406
- Queen v. Matyas Pis, No.* [2012] NICC 14, 25 April 2012 308
- Re W's Application* [2004] NIQB 67, 27 October 2004 404
- Re's Application* [2014] NIQB 15, 4 February 2014 400
- The Queen v. Rong Chen, Simon Dempsey and Jason Owen Hinton* [2012] NICC 26,
 6 July 2012 51

Ireland

- Hussein v. The Labour Court and Another* [2012] IEHC 364, 31 August 2012 375
- Hussein v. The Labour Court* [2015] IESC 58, 25 June 2015 375
- Lin v. Governor of Cloverhill Prison, Ireland, and Ors* [2014] IEHC 214, 23 April
 2014 151
- P. v. Chief Superintendent of the Garda National Immigration Bureau and ors* [2015]
 IEHC 222, 15 April 2015 145, 151, 312

Australia

- Ho v. The Queen; Leech v. The Queen* [2011] Supreme Court of Victoria – Court of
 Appeal 344, 11 November 2011 243
- The Queen v. Tang* [2008] High Court of Australia 39, 28 August 2008 241

Denmark

- A. v. National Police*, Sag 224/2013 Supreme Court of Denmark, 20 January 2014 125

TABLE OF LEGISLATION

International Treaties and Instruments

- 1890
 General Act of the Brussels Conference, 173 CTS 293 191
- 1904
 International Agreement for the Suppression of the White Slave Traffic, 1 LNTS 83 20
- 1910
 International Convention for the Suppression of the White Slave Traffic, 3 LNTS 278 20
- 1921
 International Convention for the Suppression of the Traffic in Women and Children, 9 LNTS 415 20
- 1926
 Convention to Suppress the Slave Trade and Slavery, 60 LNTS 253 189
- 1930
 Convention concerning Forced or Compulsory Labour (ILO No. 29), 39 UNTS 55 189
- 1933
 International Convention for the Suppression of the Traffic in Women of Full Age, 150 LNTS 431 20
- 1949
 Convention for the Suppression of the Traffic in Persons and of the Exploitation of the Prostitution of Others, 96 UNTS 271 21
- 1950
 European Convention on Human Rights ETS No. 005 3
- 1951
 Convention relating to the Status of Refugees, 189 UNTS 150 140, 143
- 1953
 Protocol amending the Slavery Convention, 182 UNTS 51 189

xxx

TABLE OF LEGISLATION

1956

Supplementary Convention on the Abolition of Slavery, the Slave Trade, and Institutions and Practices Similar to Slavery, 226 UNTS 3 189

1957

Abolition of Forced Labour Convention (ILO No. 105), 320 UNTS 291 211

1966

International Covenant on Economic, Social and Culture Rights, 993 UNTS 3 69

1969

American Convention on Human Rights, 1144 UNTS 123 235, 237

Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, 1155 UNTS 331 3, 103

1983

European Convention on the Compensation of Victims of Violent Crimes CETS No. 116 178

1984

Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, 1465 UNTS 85 341

1990

The International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families, 2220 UNTS 93 383

1996

European Social Charter (Revised) CETS No. 163 69

1997

Private Employment Agencies Convention (ILO No. 181), 2115 UNTS 249 379, 380

1998

Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court, 2187 UNTS 90 222

2000

United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, 2225 UNTS 209 1, 23, 75

Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the Sale of Children, Child Prostitution and Child Pornography, 2171 UNTS 227 34

Protocol against the Smuggling of Migrants by Land, Sea and Air, Supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Crime, 2241 UNTS 480 24

Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, Supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, 2237 UNTS 319 1, 24, 33, 75, 228, 298, 361

TABLE OF LEGISLATION

xxxii

2005

Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings, ETS No. 197 2, 27, 32, 74, 293, 322, 430

2011

Convention concerning Decent Work for Domestic Workers (ILO No. 189), 51379 UNTS 4 379

2014

Protocol to the Forced Labour Convention, 103rd ILC Session (11 June 2014) 37

EU Law

Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union [2016] OJ C 202/389 141

Council Directive 89/391/EEC of 12 June 1989 on the introduction of measures to encourage improvements in the safety and health of workers at work [1989] OJ L 183/1 275

Council Framework Decision 2002/584/JHA of 13 June 2002 on the European arrest warrant and the surrender procedures between Member States [2002] OJ L 190/1 33, 81

Directive 2003/88/EC of 4 November 2003 concerning certain aspects of the organization of working time [2003] OJ L 299/9 275

Directive 2004/80/EC of 29 April 2004 relating to compensation to crime victims [2004] OJ L 261/15 117, 172, 178, 180

Directive 2004/81/EC of 29 April 2004 on the residence permit issued to third-country nationals who are victims of trafficking in human beings or who have been the subject of an action to facilitate illegal immigration, who cooperate with the competent authorities [2004] OJ L 262/19 29, 89, 448

Directive 2004/114/EC of 14 December 2004 on the conditions for admission of third-country nationals for the purposes of studies, pupil exchange, unremunerated training or voluntary service [2004] OJ L 375/12 136

Directive 2008/104/EC of 19 November 2008 on temporary agency work [2008] OJ L 327/9 379

Directive 2008/115/EC of 16 December 2008 on common standards and procedures in Member States for returning illegally staying third-country nationals [2008] OJ L 348/98 111, 418

Directive 2009/52/EC of 18 June 2009 providing for minimum standards on sanctions and measures against employers of illegally staying third-country nationals [2009] OJ L 168/24 71, 86, 376

Directive 2011/36/EU of 5 April 2011 on preventing and combating trafficking in human beings and protecting its victims [2011] OJ L 101/1 30, 34, 75, 438

Directive 2011/95/EU of 13 December 2011 on standards for the qualification of third-country nationals or stateless persons as beneficiaries of international protection, for a uniform status for refugees and for persons eligible for subsidiary protection, and for the content of the protection granted (recast) [2011] OJ L 337/9 140

Directive 2012/29/EU of 25 October 2012 establishing minimum standards on the rights, support and protection of victims of crime [2012] OJ L 315/57 87

Directive 2013/33/EU of 26 June 2013 laying down standards for the reception of applicants for international protection (recast) [2013] OJ L 180/96 169, 404

Regulation No. 604/2013 of 26 June 2013 establishing the criteria and mechanisms for determining the Member State responsible for examining an application for international protection lodged in one of the Member States by a third-country national or a stateless person (recast) [2013] OJ L 180/131 (Dublin III Regulation) 170

Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union [2016] OJ C 202/47 14, 78

NATIONAL LEGISLATION

Albania	Criminal Code, Articles 110(a)–110(c) and Article 114(b)	343
Armenia	Criminal Code, Articles 131–133	343
Australia	Criminal Code Act 1995, Section 270; Section 271	241
Austria	Criminal Code, Article 104	342
Azerbaijan	Criminal Code, Article 106	342
Belgium	Criminal Code, Article 136	343
Bosnia and Herzegovina	Criminal Code, Article 185	342
Bulgaria	Criminal Code, Article 16(a); Section IX; Article 418	154, 343
Croatia	Criminal Code, Article 175	342
Denmark	Criminal Code, Articles 260 and 261	343
Estonia	Criminal Code, Article 133	343
France	Criminal Code, Article 225-13; Article 224-1-A; Article 225-14-2; Article 225-14-1	339, 342, 343, 348
Germany	Criminal Code, Article 233	72
Hungary	Criminal Code, Article 193	343
Iceland	Criminal Code, Article 227(a)	342
Italy	Criminal Code, Article 600	342, 348
Ireland	Employment Permits (Amendment) Act 2014, Section 3(d); Criminal Law (Human Trafficking) Act 2008 as amended by Criminal Law (Human Trafficking) (Amendment) Act 2013	343, 348, 375
Latvia	Criminal Code, Articles 153 and 154; Article 71	343, 344, 346
Lithuania	Criminal Code, Article 147	343
Macedonia	Criminal Code, Article 418	342
Moldova	Criminal Code, Articles 167 and 168	342, 343
Netherlands	Criminal Code, Article 273f	343

xxxiv	NATIONAL LEGISLATION
Northern Ireland	Human Trafficking and Exploitation Act 2015 118
Norway	Criminal Code, Article 225 342
Portugal	Criminal Code, Article 159 342
Romania	Criminal Code, Articles 190 and 191 342, 343
Russia	Criminal Code, Article 127(2) 342
Slovakia	Criminal Code, Article 179 343, 346
Serbia	Criminal Code, Article 390 342
Spain	Criminal Code, Article 177, para. 11; Article 607 bis 343, 344, 346
Sweden	Aliens Act (2005), Chapter 5, Section 15; Criminal Code, Chapter 4, Section 1(a); Act on Social Services; Act on Health and Medical Care 97, 115, 118, 343, 346
Switzerland	Criminal Code, Article 182; Article 264a 343, 344
The Czech Republic	Criminal Code, Article 232(a) 343
United Kingdom	Modern Slavery Act 2015; Legal Aid, Sentencing and Punishment of Offenders Act 2012, Schedule 1, Part 1, para. 32, as amended by Section 47, Modern Slavery Act 2015; Immigration Act 2014, Sections 21 and 22 71, 174, 386