

Index

- abortion, Thomson's *Violinist* case regarding, 34, 115–16
- act-by-act assessment of culpability, 133
- actus reus* (voluntary act requirement), 158–59
- aiding and abetting, conspiracy, and solicitation, 6, 20
- Airedale NHS Trust v. Bland* (UK, 1993), 128
- “already punished enough” claims, 202
- Alzheimer's disease and identity, 153–54
- amnesia, 147, 149, 156–57
- Barber v. Superior Court* (US, 1983), 127
- Beauchamp, Christine, 170, 177
- Behnke, Stephen, 154n33, 167, 170–71, 175
- Berman, Mitch, 213
- “blip” cases, 159–63
- Boorse, Christopher, 34
- Boozikee, Kevin, 173
- brainwashing, 159–63
- Brink, David, 98, 104
- Brute Time view of distributing retributive desert, 195–96
- camouflaging, 18, 50, 203
- capacity/choice theory versus character theory on excuses, 163–68
- causation of harm, 17, 59
- censure or stigma and retributive desert, 181
- character theory versus choice/capacity theory on excuses, 163–68
- child pornography, *de minimis* contributions to, 56–57
- choice/capacity theory versus character theory on excuses, 163–68
- circumstantial luck, 5
- coercive indoctrination, 161, 163
- Cogdon, Mrs., 175–76, 178
- compatibilism, 188
- complicity, doctrine of, 20
- conjoined twins, 173–74, 177n114
- consent
 - falsehoods and, 63
 - mistakes about proxies for, 62
 - “other law” mistake, consent of victim cases as, 62–64
- consequentialism, 58n94, 105, 106n33, 130, 196–97
- conspiracy, solicitation, and aiding and abetting, 6, 20
- constitutive luck, 5
- Cornford, Andrew, 25, 87–88
- culpability, 1–14, 213–14
 - act-by-act assessment of, 133
 - affirmative defenses, justifications, and excuses not regarded as, 8–9
 - basic thesis of, 1
 - causation of harm irrelevant to, 17
 - defendant's perspective and estimates as key determinant in, 2
 - determinants of, 2–3
 - duration of act affecting, 9–10
 - ignorance of law and, 11, 213 (*See also* ignorance of law)
 - incomplete attempts, nonculpability of, 5–6
 - justifying, excusing, mitigating, or aggravating facts affecting, 2, 8–9
 - moderate redistributivism and, 1
 - negligence, nonculpability of, 3–4, 45
 - persons who are culpable, 12–13 (*See also* deontological constraints; moral ignorance; multiple crimes)

- culpability (cont.)
 punishment issues, 14 (*See also* distributing retributive desert; identity; punishment issues)
 recklessness and, 3 (*See also* recklessness)
 results of acts, not affected by, 4–5, 133
 risking and, 11–12 (*See also* omission liability; proxy crimes; risking; risking others' riskings)
 single crime theory of, 7–8, 8n35, 83
 solicitation, conspiracy, and aiding and abetting, 6, 20
 vagueness of standard of, 83
 for violation of deontological constraints, 128–32
 cultural defense of moral ignorance, 105–7
- dangerousness as determination of incarceration as punishment, 199
- de minimis* risk contributions, 56–59
- defense justifications, 8
- degraded decision making, 134
- Delgado, Richard, 161
- deontological constraints (means principle/ permissibility of preventing optimistic wrongs), 13, 108–32, 213
 agent-relative permissions, 112n18, 113–15
 burden of proof and, 8n35
 choice given to preventer, 123–24
 consequentialism and, 106n33, 130
 culpability for violations thereof, 128–32
 distinguishing permissions, 124–25
 impermissible prevention of preventer, 120–23
 intentions of actors, significance of, 127–28
 moral blackmail and, 29
 preventing use as a means, 108–11, 115
 property rights and, 125–27
 reasons for permissibility of intervention, 111–15
 restricting and nonrestricting claims approach to, 117–20
 self-sacrifice, right to forgo, 32–38
 third-party interventions, 115–17
 threshold deontology, 105, 106n33
- deprogramming, 163
- desert. *See also* distributing retributive desert
 as intrinsically good, 183–86
 as noncomparative, 181
 assumption of risk and, 206–7
 self-defense and, 14, 21n6, 31, 37, 44, 201, 206
 suffering and, 181–83
- determinism, 188–89
- detrimental reliance, 45
- DID. *See* dissociative identity disorder
- Dillon v. Twin State Gas and Electric Company* (US, 1932), 51
- dissociative identity disorder (DID), 147, 169–78
 conjoined twins compared, 174n103, 177n114
 DSM-5 criteria, 169n79
 etiology of, 170
 existence/validity of, 169
 integration therapy for, 176–78
 judicial approaches to, 170–71
 “one body, multiple persons” view of, 171–74, 176–77
 “one (mentally ill) person” view of, 171, 175–76, 178
- distributing retributive desert, 14, 180–210, 214.
 See also suffering
 administrative issues, 195–98
 “already punished enough” claims, 202
 balance, restoration of, 185, 187
 creating or allowing crime in order to achieve intrinsic good of, 187–89
 culpability as basis for, 186
 dangerousness as determination of incarceration as punishment, 199
 ex ante suffering, 189, 198
 Existing Bad Person view of, 195n66
 incarceration as main method of punishment, 199
 intrinsic goodness of, 183–86
 means principle and, 187–94
 meshing with other distributions of benefits and harms, 198
 mode of, 195–96
 moral ledger approach to, 209n105
 as noncomparative, 181
 positive versus negative desert, 194n63, 196–98, 207–9
 prepunishment and determinism, 188–89
 reactive attitudes toward, 182
 resource constraints and choice among the deserving, 194n63, 196–98
 stigma or censure and, 181
 subjective experience of punishment and, 199
 taxation to support, 189–94
 timing of, 195–96
 unequal susceptibility to punishment, 198–99
- Double Jeopardy Clause, 90
- double prevention, 34, 113–14, 120
- Dresser, Rebecca, 151–53, 164
- Dressler, Joshua, 19n3, 162
- ducking, 34, 113–16
- due care principles, 45
- Duff, Antony, 26n21
- duration
 of act affecting culpability, 9–10
 omission liability and, 10, 79–81
 of punishment, 195–96
- duress, 9, 160

- euthanasia
 mercy killings, and criminalization of causally upstream acts, 50–51
 passive, 127–28
 Ewing, Ben, 143
ex ante suffering, 189
 excuses, character theory versus choice/capacity theory on, 163–68
 Existing Bad Person view of distributing retributive desert, 195n66
- falsehoods and consent, 63
 family members, legal duty to aid, 67
 Firth, Joanna, 201
 FitzPatrick, William, 102
 forcible medication of mentally ill patients to stand trial, 163n60
 free will and risking others' riskings, 23, 33n34
 freeriding, 59
 Frowe, Helen, 35–38, 129
 fugue states, persons in, 171–72, 176
 futile rescue, preventing, 55–56
- Guerrero, Alex, 97
- Harman, Elizabeth, 102–3
 harms
 causation of, 17, 51, 59
 de minimis, 56
 defined, 17, 51, 53
 mediated, 35–38
 risking (*See* risking; risking others' riskings)
- Hart, H. L. A., 39, 43, 183
 Hearst, Patty ("Tania"), 160–63
 Hensel, Abby and Brittany, 173
 Hitler, Adolf, 137–38, 141, 183
 honor killings and cultural defense of moral ignorance, 105–7
 Honoré, Tony, 39, 43
 Horder, Jeremy, 166
 Hurd, Heidi, 21n6, 22n7, 41–42, 45
 Husak, Douglas, 95–96, 99, 101, 107, 190, 202
 Husserl, Edmund, 185
- identity, 14, 147–79, 214. *See also* dissociative identity disorder; Relation R/R-relatedness
 Alzheimer's disease, 153–54
 amnesia, 147, 149, 156–57
 "blip" cases and brainwashing, 159–63
 character change, 149, 156, 164, 168
 children, 155–56
 conjoined twins, 173–74, 177n114
 excuses, character theory versus choice/capacity theory on, 163–68
 mass murderers and, 138
 memory of event, absence of, 168–69, 178
 moral responsibility and rational agency, 155–57
 passage of time between crime and conviction, 148–49
 philosophical accounts of personal identity, 149–55
 psychological connectedness/continuity over time, 150–51, 153–55, 167
 radical conversion, 156
 situations calling continuing personal identity into question, 148–49
 somnambulist homicides, 175–76
 voluntary act requirement (*actus reus*), 158–59
 idiosyncratic beliefs, actions, or conditions of
 innocent actors, 47–48
 ignorance, moral. *See* moral ignorance
 ignorance of law, 11, 213
 no mistake of law problems in culpability analysis, 10–11
 omission liability and, 81–82
 "other law" beliefs, 61–65
 proxy crimes and, 86–88
 In the End view of distributing retributive desert, 195–96
 incarceration as main method of punishment, 199
 incomplete attempts, nonculpability of, 5–6
 incorrigibility, 140
 indiscriminate evaluators, 156
 innocent actors, culpability for riskings of, 43–48
 integration therapy for DID, 176–79
- Jekyll and Hyde, 162
 Johnson, Eric, 39
- Kadish, Sandy, 23
 Kagan, Shelly, 56–57, 108n2, 183, 186
 Kant, Immanuel, 33n34, 46, 71
 Katz, Leo, 136
 Kershman, Stephen, 99
 Kingston, Barry, 165–66
Kirkland v. State (US, 1983), 172
 Klosko, George, 191
 Kolber, Adam, 199
 Kovarsky, Lee, 197n74
- Lee, Youngjae, 142
 legal duty to act, 66–71
 lesser evils justification, 8, 78, 90
 Levy, Neil, 99
lex talionis, 196
 liberty interests and risking others' riskings, 23–26, 43, 48n75
 "limits of the criminal law" questions, 2n3

- Locke, John, 33, 150n17
 Lomansky, Loren, 156
- Madoff, Bernie, 139
malum in se crimes, 81, 83, 88, 89n9, 213
 Mao Zedung, 137–38, 141
 Marine Corps basic training, as brainwashing, 160n53, 160
 mass murderers, 137–39
 mayhem, harm inflicted in, 54
 McMahan, Jeff, 111, 127
 means principle
 deontological constraints (*See* deontological constraints)
 distributing retributive desert and, 187–94
 mediated harms, 35–38
 medication, forcible, of mentally ill patients to stand trial, 163n60
Memento (film), 156–57
 memory of criminal event, absence of, 168–69, 178
 mental disability. *See also* dissociative identity disorder; moral ignorance
 amnesia, 147, 149, 156–57
 forcible medication of mentally ill patients to stand trial, 163n60
 fugue states, persons in, 171–72, 176
 psychopaths, 97–99
 merchants' culpability for risking others' riskings, 40–43
 mercy killings, and criminalization of causally upstream acts, 50–51
 mistake of law. *See* ignorance of law
 Modally Robust Act Consequentialism, 58n94
 mode, of retributive desert, 195–96
 moderate retributivism, 1, 100, 196
 Mogensen, Andreas, 108n2, 109–10, 114n27
 Moore, G. E., 185–86
 Moore, Michael
 on distributing retributive desert, 191
 on identity, 174, 176n11
 on moral ignorance, 96
 on risking others' riskings, 22n7, 23n11, 34, 41–42, 52
 moral blackmail, 27–32
 moral ignorance, 12, 95–107, 213
 cultural defense of, 105–7
 mistake of law/fact versus, 11
 as negligence, 102
 ordinary criminals and, 99–105
 of psychopaths, 97–99
 as recklessness, 100–1
 theoretical approaches to moral responsibility and, 95–97
 types of, 95
- moral knowledge/moral opportunities theory of multiple crimes, 142–44
 moral responsibility
 agents of crimes without, 9
 coexistence with culpability, 5
 DID, “one person” view of, 175–76, 178
 identity and, 155–57
 risking others' riskings, as moral question, 17
 theoretical approaches to, 95–97
 Morris, Herbert, 186
 Morse, Stephen, 19, 157n45
 multiple crimes, 133–44, 214
 character account of, 141–42
 degraded decision making in, 134
 Lee's theory of duties of convicted offenders, 141–42
 mass murderers, 137–39
 moral knowledge/moral opportunities theory of, 142–44
 more than one attempt at same crime, 133–37
 overlapping offenses, 137n6
 recidivism, 13, 139–41
 “three strikes” statutes, 140
 volume discounts, 13, 133–39
 multiple personality disorder. *See* dissociative identity disorder
 multiple punishments for single proxy crimes, 90–91
- negligence
 moral ignorance as, 102
 nonculpability of, 3–4, 45
 suffering for acts of, 182
 Nelkin, Dana, 104
 New, Christopher, 188–89
 Newton, Huey, 158–59, 175, 178
 nonrestricting claims, 117–20
- objective versus subjective experience of punishment, 199
 omission liability, 12, 66–82, 213
 ability to rescue victim, belief of actor in, 75, 79
 creation of peril and duty to render aid, 68–71
 culpability analysis, 72–79
 direct culpable harm of victim and, 81n37
 duration of perilous event, 10, 79–81
 excusing or justifying facts, 78–79
 futile rescue, preventing, 55–56
 ignorance of law and, 81–82
 increasing risk of peril versus simple omission to rescue, distinguishing, 71n22
 legal duty to act, 66–71
 lesser evils justification, 78

- moral blackmail and, 31
- peril, belief of actor in existence of, 74, 79
- risks faced in attempting rescue, belief of actor in, 75–79
- status relationship to person in peril, 67
- statutory commands to render aid, 68
- triggering responsibility, belief of actor in existence of, 73–74, 79
- of voluntary undertakers of professional duties (lifeguards, police, etc.), 67–68
- optimific wrongs, preventing. *See* deontological constraints
- “other law” beliefs, 10–11, 61–65
- overall proportionality, 139n8
- overdetermination, preemptive, 51–56
- overinclusive crimes, 87–88
- overlapping offenses, 137n6

- Parfit, Derek, 56, 149–53, 168, 177, 179, 185
- passive euthanasia, 127–28
- Penn, Kevin, 165
- People v. Kibbe* (US, 1974), 27
- People v. Newton* (US, 1970), 158–59, 175, 178
- personal identity. *See* identity
- persons who are culpable, 12–13. *See also*
 - deontological constraints; moral ignorance;
 - multiple crimes
- Pinkert, Felix, 58n94
- Pol Pot, 137
- preemptive crimes, 84n2
- preemptive overdetermination, 51–56
- prepunishment, 188–89
- promises, 23, 45–46, 147
- property interests
 - deontological constraints and, 125–27
 - “other law” mistakes and, 61–62
- proportionality and mass murderers, 138
- provocation, 9
- proxies for consent, mistakes about, 62
- proximate causation, 19
- proxy crimes, 12, 83–92, 213
 - as both over- and underinclusive, 49
 - camouflaging, 18, 50, 203
 - conduct as conclusive presumption of culpability, 88n9
 - consequentialism and, 131
 - dangers of, 89–90
 - definition of and rationale for, 83–84
 - ignorance of law and, 86–88
 - information-providing function of, 87–88
 - lesser evils justification, 90
 - measuring culpability for, 131
 - merchant culpability and, 42
 - misinterpretation of violations, 18, 49–50
 - mismatch between culpability and punishment, 84–86
 - multiple punishments for single acts, risk of, 90–91
 - in nonretributive punishment frame, 91–92
 - overinclusive crimes as, 87–88
 - preemptive crimes versus, 84n2
 - scofflaws, 85, 85n5, 86n6
 - single crime theory of culpability and, 7
 - psychological disconnection between culpable actor and person to be punished. *See* identity
 - psychopaths, 97–99
 - punishment issues, 14. *See also* distributing retributive desert; identity; multiple crimes
 - memory of criminal event, punishment in absence of, 168–69, 178
 - prepunishment, 188–89
 - proportionality and mass murderers, 138
 - of proxy crimes
 - measuring culpability for, 131
 - mismatch between culpability and punishment for, 84–86
 - multiple punishments for single acts and, 90–91
 - in nonretributive punishment frame, 91–92
 - recidivism, increasing punishment for, 139–41
 - subjective versus objective experience of punishment, 199
 - “three strikes” statutes, 140
- quality-adjusted life years (QALYs), 181, 199
- quality of will theory of moral responsibility/ignorance, 96–97
- Quong, Jonathan, 201

- rational agency and identity, 155–57
- reactive attitudes toward retributive desert, 182
- reason-responsiveness theory of moral responsibility/ignorance, 95–97
- recidivism, 13, 139–41. *See also* multiple crimes
- recklessness
 - actions toward but not amounting to, 6
 - culpability as matter of, 3
 - culpable riskings of causally downstream actors, 18, 25, 41
 - of merchants, 41
 - in moral responsibility, 100–1
 - proxy crimes, definition of and rationale for, 83–84
 - reliance of innocent actors on our (culpable) conduct and, 45
 - single crime theory of culpability and, 83
- redistributivism, moderate, 1

- redundancy, immunization of culpability through, 54
Regina v. Dudley and Stephens (UK, 1884), 129
Regina v. Smith (David) (UK, 1974), 61, 63–65
 Relation R/R-relatedness
 defined, 150, 179
 DID, integration therapy for, 177
 excuses, character theory versus choice/capacity theory on, 164, 167
 philosophical theories of identity and, 150–51, 153–55
 voluntary act requirement (*actus reus*) and, 159
 reliance of innocent actors on our (culpable)
 conduct, 44–47
 restricting claims, 117–20
 results of acts, culpability not affected by, 4–5, 133
 retributive desert, distributing. *See* distributing
 retributive desert
 retributivism, 1, 100, 196
 Rickless, Sam, 127
 risking, 11–12. *See also* omission liability; proxy
 crimes; risking others' riskings
 causation of harm and, 17, 59
 as determinant of culpability, 2
 ignorance of law/"other law" beliefs, 10–11, 61–65
 negligence (inadvertence to risk),
 nonculpability of, 3–4
 subjective and epistemic nature of, 2, 4
 risking others' riskings, 6, 11, 17–60, 213
 causation of harm and, 17, 59
 criminalization of causally upstream acts, 48–51
 culpable riskings of causally downstream actors,
 18–43
 increasing risks of another's wrongs, 19–32
 increasing risks of our own wrongs, 38–46
 merchants, 40–43
 moral blackmail and, 27–32
 proximate causation, 19
 self-sacrifice, right to forgo, 32–38
 situations leading to culpability, 21–26
 situations not leading to culpability, 32–40
 vulnerability of victims to downstream harms,
 creating, 27
 de minimis contributions, 56–59
 free will and, 23
 futile rescue, preventing, 55–56
 innocent actors, riskings of, 43–48
 liberty interests and, 23–26, 43, 48n75
 moral blackmail and, 27–32
 as moral question, 17
 preemptive overdetermination, 51–56
 self-sacrifice, right to forgo, 32–38
 in tort law, 21n6
 vulnerability of victims to downstream harms,
 creating, 27
 Rodin, David, 35n46
 Rosen, Gideon, 99
 Ross, W. D., 184
 R-relatedness. *See* Relation R/R-relatedness
 rule-based constraints. *See* deontological
 constraints
 Rummel, William, 142n15
 Ryberg, Jesper, 139n8
 Saks, Elyn R., 177n114
Sandstrom v. Montana (US, 1979), 88n9
Sassman v. Brown (US, 2015), 199n79
 Scanlon, Thomas, 45
 Schauer, Fred, 59
 Schechtman, Marya, 153
 scofflaws, 85n15, 85, 86n6
 Segev, Re'em, 109–11, 113n21, 129
 self-defense, 14, 21n6, 31, 37, 44, 201, 206
 self-sacrifice, right to forgo, 32–38
 Shiffrin, Seana, 45–46
 Simester, A. P., 25n14
 single crime theory of culpability, 7–8, 8n35,
 83
 Sinnott-Armstrong, Walter, 154n33, 167, 170–71,
 175
 SLA (Symbionese Liberation Army), 148, 159–62
 Soliah, Kathy (Sarah Jane Olson), 148–49, 163, 167,
 177
 solicitation, conspiracy, and aiding and abetting,
 6, 20
 somnambulist homicides, 175–76
 Sorensen, Roy A., 34, 188
 Stalin, Joseph, 137–38, 141
Star Trek, 148
State v. Grimsley (US, 1982), 172–73, 175
 stigma or censure and retributive desert, 181
 Strawson, Galen, 99
 subjective versus objective experience of
 punishment, 199
 suffering
 counted as punishment, 200–4
 as currency of retributive desert, 181–83
 ex ante, 189, 198
 intrinsic goodness of, 183–86
 negligence, for acts of, 182
 not counted as punishment, 205–7
 Sullivan, G. R., 166–67
 Symbionese Liberation Army (SLA), 148, 159–62
 Tadros, Victor
 on deontological constraints, 111
 on distributing retributive deserts, 182n4, 183n7,
 183–85, 189–94
 The Ends of Harm, 189
 on identity, 161n56, 166–67, 174n103

- on moral ignorance, 96
- on risking others' riskings, 23n12, 33
- Talbert, Matthew, 98
- Taurek, John M., 135
- taxation to support retributive desert, 189–94
- Temkin, Larry, 209n104
- terrorism
 - cultural defense of moral ignorance and, 107
 - risking others' riskings and, 25, 51
- Thomson, Judith Jarvis, 34, 115, 129
- threats, as crimes, 7n28
- "three strikes" statutes, 140
- threshold deontology, 105, 106n33
- timing
 - identity and passage of time between crime and conviction, 148–49
 - of retributive desert, 195–96
- Tomlin, Patrick, 183, 185, 195–96
- tort law, risking others' riskings in, 21n6, 52
- United States v. Fountain* (US, 1985), 20
- unreasonable reliance, 44
- vagueness of culpability standard, 83
- volume discounts, 13, 133–39. *See also* multiple crimes
- voluntary act requirement (*actus reus*), 158–59
- von Hirsch, Andreas, 25n14
- Wagon Mound* case (UK AC, 1967), 47
- Walén, Alec, 25n15, 32–33, 38, 114n27, 117–20
- Wasserstrom, David, 32
- Wellman, Christopher Heath, 189n36
- Wieland, Jan Willem, 103
- Wilkes, Kathleen, 170, 176–77
- Williams, Bernard, 29
- Zaibert, Leo, 183–86
- Zimmerman, Michael, 99