Music and Culture in the Middle Ages and Beyond

It has become widely accepted among musicologists that medieval music is most profitably studied from interdisciplinary perspectives that situate it within broad culture contexts. The origins of this consensus lie in a decisive reorientation of the field that began approximately four decades ago. For much of the twentieth century, research on medieval music had focused on the discovery and evaluation of musical and theoretical sources. The 1970s and 1980s, by contrast, witnessed calls for broader methodologies and more fully contextual approaches that in turn anticipated the emergence of the so-called “New Musicology.” The fifteen essays in the present collection explore three interrelated areas of inquiry that proved particularly significant: the liturgy, sources (musical and archival), and musical symbolism. In so doing, these essays not only acknowledge past achievements but also illustrate how broad, interdisciplinary approaches to these sources continue to stimulate scholarly innovation.

Benjamin Brand received his Ph.D. from Yale University and has taught music history at the University of North Texas since 2006. He is the recipient of fellowships from the Villa I Tatti (Harvard Center for Renaissance Studies) and the American Academy in Rome.

David J. Rothenberg received his Ph.D. from Yale University and is Associate Professor of Music and Chair of the Department of Music at Case Western Reserve University, where he has taught since 2005. He is author of The Flower of Paradise: Marian Devotion and Secular Song in Medieval and Renaissance Music (Oxford, 2011) and co-editor, with Robert R. Holzer, of the Oxford Anthology of Western Music, Volume One: The Earliest Notations to the Early Eighteenth Century (Oxford, 2013).
Music and Culture in the Middle Ages and Beyond

Liturgy, Sources, Symbolism

Edited by

BENJAMIN BRAND
University of North Texas

DAVID J. ROTHENBERG
Case Western Reserve University
For Craig Wright
Contents

List of Figures  [page ix]
List of Tables  [xii]
List of Examples  [xiii]
Note on Contributors  [xv]

Introduction  [1]
BENJAMIN BRAND AND DAVID J. ROTHENBERG

PART I CHANT, LITURGY, AND RITUAL

1 Music and Liturgy in Medieval Capua  [13]
THOMAS FORREST KELLY

2 The Model Antiphon Series Primum quaerite in Hucbald's Office In plateis and in Other Post-Carolingian Chant: Theory Meets Practice  [28]
BARBARA HAGGH-HUGLO

3 Singing from the Pulpit: Improvised Polyphony and Public Ritual in Medieval Tuscany  [55]
BENJAMIN BRAND

4 Liturgy and Politics in Renaissance Florence: The Creation of the 1526 Office for St. Zenobius  [72]
MARICA S. TACCONI

LORENZO CANDELARIA

PART II ARCHIVAL AND SOURCE STUDIES

6 The Sources and the Sanctorale: Dating by the Decade in Thirteenth-Century Paris  [111]
REBECCA A. BALTZER
# Contents

7 Vernacular Contexts for the Monophonic Motet: Notes from a New Source  [142]  
   **Mark Everist**

8 Tradition and Innovation in Fourteenth-Century Instrumental Music: Evidence from Archival and Musical Sources  [158]  
   **Keith Polk**

9 Melchior or Marchion de Civilibus, *prepositus brixensis*: New Documents  [175]  
   **Margaret Bent**

10 Papal Musicians at Cambrai in the Early Fifteenth Century  [191]  
   **Alejandro Enrique Planchart**

11 Sixtus IV, the Franciscans, and the Beginning of Music Printing in Fifteenth-Century Rome  [207]  
   **Jane A. Bernstein**

**Part III Symbolism**

12 The Gate that Carries Christ: Wordplay and Liturgical Imagery in a Motet from ca. 1300  [225]  
   **David J. Rothenberg**

13 A Musical Lesson for a King from the *Roman de Fauvel*  [242]  
   **Anne Walters Robertson**

14 Preaching to the Choir? Obrecht’s Motet for the Dedication of the Church  [263]  
   **M. Jennifer Bloxam**

15 The Madonna Triptych: A Mystical Reading of Three Early Music Videos  [293]  
   **Andrew Tomasello**

*Bibliography*  [313]  
*Index*  [351]
Figures

1.1 Fragment 1 from a twelfth-century antiphoner in the Biblioteca Arcivescovile of Capua [page 16]

1.2 Fragment 2 from a twelfth-century antiphoner in the Biblioteca Arcivescovile of Capua [17]

2.1 The Model Antiphon *Quarta vigilia venit ad eos*, in Brussels, BR, MS 2751, fol. 51r. Photograph by Barbara Haggh-Huglo with permission from the Royal Library of Belgium [51]

3.1 Guglielmo’s Pulpit for the Cathedral of Pisa, Cagliari (1152–1162). (Alinari / Art Resource, NY) [61]

3.2 Nave of San Cristoforo of Barga (diocese of Lucca) (twelfth century). (Alinari / Art Resource, NY) [63]

3.3 Interior of San Miniato, Florence (late eleventh century). (Alinari / Art Resource, NY) [64]

4.1 Florence, Cathedral of Santa Maria del Fiore, North Sacristy: Giuliano da Maiano, *St. Zenobius with SS. Eugene and Crescentius*. (Reproduced by kind permission of the Opera di Santa Maria del Fiore, Florence) [78]

4.2 Florence, Palazzo della Signoria, Sala dei Gigli: Domenico Ghirlandaio, *St. Zenobius with SS. Eugene and Crescentius*. (Scala / Art Resource, NY) [80]

4.3 Florence, Archivio dell’Opera di Santa Maria del Fiore, Antiphonary Cod. M n. 25, fol. 130v: Frate Eustachio, *St. Zenobius with SS. Eugene and Crescentius*. (Reproduced by kind permission of the Opera di Santa Maria del Fiore, Florence) [82]

5.1 Bernardino de Sahagún, “Historia general de las cosas de Nueva España” (1577), Florence, Biblioteca Medicea Laurenziana, Palat. ms. 218, fol. 84v (detail) [90]


5.3 Map of Tenochtitlán in Hernán Cortés, *Praeclara Ferdinandi Cortesii de nova maris oceani Hispania narratio* (Nuremberg: Friedrich
List of Figures

5.4 Church of St. Hippolytus, Mexico City. Published in Iglesias y conventos de la Ciudad de México. Monografías Mexicanas de Arte (Mexico City: Departamento de Aprovisionamientos Generales; Dirección de Talleres Gráficos, 1920). Used by permission of the C. L. Sonnichsen Special Collections Department, University of Texas at El Paso [96]

5.5 Frontispiece of Bernardino de Sahagún, Psalmodia Christiana (Mexico City: Pedro Ocharte, 1583). Used by permission of the Nettie Lee Benson Latin American Collection, University of Texas Libraries, The University of Texas at Austin [101]

5.6 Diego Valadés, Rhetorica Christiana (Perugia: Pedro Jacobo Petruccio, 1579). Used by permission of the Nettie Lee Benson Latin American Collection, University of Texas Libraries, The University of Texas at Austin [106]

7.1 Charleville-Mézières, Médiathèque Voyelles, 78, fol. 110r [146]

7.2 Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, fonds français 12786, fol. 76v [148]

11.1 Colophon, Missale Romanum (1476). Photo courtesy of the Newberry Library, Chicago, Call no.: Inc 2265.5 [208]

11.2 Missale Romanum (1476), fol. 105v. Photo courtesy of the Newberry Library, Chicago, Call no.: Inc 2265.5 [219]

12.1 Mo, fol. 362r. Bibliothèque interuniversitaire de Montpellier. BU médecine. Photo credit: BIU Montpellier / IRHT (CNRS) [230]

12.2 Northwest Portal, Cathedral of Notre Dame, Paris (photograph by author) [238]


14.1 A bishop wearing the mitre baptizes a church while a choir sings. An assistant holds his crozier while another kneels beside him with the bucket of aspersional water. From an early sixteenth century missal from the Parisian Sainte-Chapelle. Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, MS fonds latin 8890, fol. 12r [265]

14.2 Arbor de arte sive modo predicandi. From a fifteenth-century German manuscript miscellaney. Munich, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, Clm 23865, fol. 19v–20r [275]
List of Figures


15.1 "La Isla Bonita" (1:29), where an asymmetric Madonna prays before an image of the Holy Family, one of many popular versions of a lithograph by German painter Fridolin Leiber (1853–1912), shown in Figure 15.2 [302]

15.2 [no caption] [302]
Tables

2.1 Chant Indexed by Bryden and Hughes with the *Initia* of Model Antiphons  [page 46]
2.2 Early Sources for the Model Antiphons used in Bailey’s Edition  [48]
3.1 The Tuscan Ordinals  [57]
3.2 Selected Pulpits of Medieval Tuscany  [60]
3.3 Performance of the Gradual and Alleluia according to the Tuscan Ordinals  [67]
4.1 The Office of St. Zenobius (Florence, Archivio dell’Opera di Santa Maria del Fiore, Antiphonary Cod. M n. 25, fols. 120r–147r)  [75]
6.1 Thirteenth-Century Additions to the Paris Calendar  [113]
6.2 Thirteenth-Century Changes in the Paris Calendar in Chronological Order  [119]
6.3 MS Sources for the Paris Mass in Approximate Order of Copying (includes only MSS used in this study)  [127]
6.4 MS Sources for the Paris Mass in Approximate Order of Sanctorales (includes only MSS used in this study)  [129]
6.5 MS Sources for the Paris Office in Approximate Order of Copying (includes only MSS used in this study)  [131]
6.6 MS Sources for the Paris Office in Approximate Order of Sanctorales (includes only MSS used in this study)  [133]
7.1 Compositions in Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, fonds français 12786, fols. 76r–77r  [154]
9.1 Documentary References to Melchior / Marchion de Civilibus  [185]
12.1 Readings and Responsorial Chants in the Ember Wednesday and Annunciation Masses in Parisian Usage  [236]
13.1 Translation and Sources of Motet *Servant regem / O Philippe [Ludowice] / Rex regum*  [244]
13.2 Translation and Sources of Responsory *Ecce apparebit* and its Verse *Apparebit in finem*  [246]
13.3 Proverbs 31: The “words of King Lemuel” and the “Good Wife”  [252]
Examples

2.1 Comparison of the Eight Model Antiphons with Hucbald's Matins Antiphons for the Office In plateis [page 34]

2.2 Comparison of the Model Antiphons with the Earliest (Prose) Office of St. Amand [40]

2.3 Comparison of the Model Antiphons with the Officia Attributed to Stephen of Liège and the Office of St. Theodericus Attributed to Hucbald [41]

2.4 Comparison of the Model Antiphon for the First Tone with Mass Propers in the First Tone [44]

2.5 The Model Antiphons Added to Brussels, BR, MS 2751 (B) and Montpellier, Bibliothèque Interuniversitaire, Faculté de Médecine, MS H 125 (MO) Transcribed by Barbara Hagh-Huglo [52]

3.1 Iam redeunt gaudia / Christe tu vita vera. Italic type indicates the prosula, roman type the canonical chant [70]

7.1 Reconstruction of (1141) Joliement vœil mon chant retraire [150]

8.1 Bel Fiore Dança (Faenza, Biblioteca Comunale, 117, fols. 89v–90r [= fols. 80v–81r]) [166]

12.1 Porta preminentie / Porta penitentie / Portas (Mo, fol. 362r–v) [228]

12.2 Respond of Gradual Tollite portas (Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale de France, MS Lat. 830, fol. 11r) [233]

12.3 The “portas” melisma in Sarum usage (London, British Library, MS Add. 12194, p.5) [241]

13.1 Tenor of Motet Servant regem, Compared to Chant Sources for Chant Segment Rex regum et dominus dominancium [258]

14.1a Obrecht, Laudemus nunc Dominum, Prima Pars. Summary of texts with textual and textural graph [270]

14.1b Obrecht, Laudemus nunc Dominum, Secunda Pars. Summary of texts with textual and textural graph [271]
List of Examples

14.2 Obrecht, *Factor orbis*, Prima Pars. Summary of texts with textual and textural graph [277]
14.3a Obrecht, *Factor orbis*, mm.1–8 [279]
14.3b Obrecht, *Laudemus nunc Dominum*, mm.1–8 [280]
14.4 Obrecht, *Laudemus nunc Dominum*, mm.48–58 [284]
14.5a Obrecht, *Laudemus nunc Dominum*, mm.32–45 [285]
14.5b Obrecht, *Laudemus nunc Dominum*, mm.120–27 [287]
14.6 Obrecht, *Laudemus nunc Dominum*, mm.162–73 [288]
Contributors

REBECCA A. BALTZER is Professor Emerita of Musicology at the University of Texas at Austin. Her research has focused on the music, notation, theory, and manuscripts of the Notre-Dame School and Ars Antiqua, as well as codicology, liturgy, chant, and liturgical books of medieval Paris.

MARGARET BENT is an emeritus Fellow of All Souls College, Oxford and a former president of the American Musicological Society. She has published widely on many aspects of late-medieval music. Her most recent book is *Magister Jacobus de Ispania, author of the Speculum musicae* (2015).

JANE A. BERNSTEIN, Austin Fletcher Professor of Music Emerita at Tufts University, is the author of *Music Printing in Renaissance Venice: The Scotto Press (1539–1572)*, winner of the 1999 Otto Kinkeldey Award from the American Musicological Society. She is currently working on a book on music print culture in sixteenth-century Rome.

M. JENNIFER BLOXAM went from her Ph.D. studies with Craig Wright at Yale University directly to Williams College, where she is now the Herbert H. Lehman Professor of Music. His lasting inspiration is reflected both in her scholarly fascinations (pre-Tridentine plainsong and sacred polyphony and their ritual context) and in her enthusiasm for undergraduate teaching.

BENJAMIN BRAND received his Ph.D. from Yale University and has taught music history at the University of North Texas since 2006. He is the recipient of fellowships from the Villa I Tatti (Harvard Center for Renaissance Studies) and the American Academy in Rome.

LORENZO CANDELARIA is an Associate Provost and Professor of Musicology at the University of Texas at El Paso. His research focuses on Catholic music cultures in Spain, Mexico, and the southwestern United States.

MARK EVERIST, Professor of Music at the University of Southampton, has written on the music of western Europe in the period 1150–1330, Opera in France in the nineteenth century, Mozart, reception theory, and
Notes on Contributors

historiography. The recipient of the Solie (2010) and Slim (2011) awards of the American Musicological Society, he was elected a fellow of the Academia Europaea in 2012, is the President of the Royal Musical Association, and was elected a corresponding member of the American Musicological Society in 2014.

BARBARA HAGGH-HUGLO, Professor of Music (Musicology) at the University of Maryland, College Park, is the author of more than ninety articles on medieval sacred music and music in Renaissance towns in France and the Low Countries and has edited books with source studies, as well as two offices for St Elizabeth of Hungary.

THOMAS FORREST KELLY is Morton B. Knafel Professor of Music at Harvard University. He entered the graduate program at Harvard in the same year as Craig Wright.

ALEJANDRO ENRIQUE PLANCHART is Professor Emeritus at the University of California. His main areas of research are Latin plainsong and the music of the fifteenth century.

KEITH POLK is Professor Emeritus at the University of New Hampshire. He has published numerous articles and several books primarily on patronage and instrumental music of the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries.

ANNE WALTERS ROBERTSON is the Claire Dux Swift Distinguished Service Professor of Music at the University of Chicago. She has written on fifteenth-century sacred polyphony, the fourteenth-century composer Guillaume de Machaut, French medieval liturgical music, ceremony and architecture, and music and mysticism.

DAVID J. ROTHENBERG received his Ph.D. from Yale University and is Associate Professor of Music and Chair of the Department of Music at Case Western Reserve University, where he has taught since 2005. He is author of The Flower of Paradise: Marian Devotion and Secular Song in Medieval and Renaissance Music (2011) and co-editor, with Robert R. Holzer, of the Oxford Anthology of Western Music, Volume One: The Earliest Notations to the Early Eighteenth Century (2013).

MARICA S. TACCONI is Professor of Musicology at the Pennsylvania State University. Her interdisciplinary research interests focus on the music, art, and culture of late medieval and early modern Italy.

ANDREW TOMASELLO is Associate Professor of Music at Baruch College (CUNY) and Deputy Chair for Music.