

## ASSESSING CONSTITUTIONAL PERFORMANCE

From London to Libya, from Istanbul to Iceland, there is great interest among comparative constitutional scholars and practitioners about when a proposed constitution is likely to succeed. But what does it mean for a constitution to succeed? Are there universal criteria of success that apply across the board? Or is the choice of criteria entirely idiosyncratic? This edited volume examines the idea of constitutional success and shows the manifold ways in which it can be understood. It collects essays from political scientists, empiricists, philosophers and legal scholars that approach the definition of constitutional success from many different angles. It also brings together case studies from Africa, Europe, Latin America, the Middle East and Asia. By exploring a varied array of constitutional histories, this book shows how complex ideas of “constitutional success” play out differently in different contexts and provides examples of how “success” can be differently defined under different circumstances.

TOM GINSBURG is Leo Spitz Professor of International Law at the University of Chicago, where he also holds an appointment in the Political Science Department. He currently co-directs the Comparative Constitutions Project, an NSF-funded data set cataloging the world’s constitutions since 1789. His books include *Judicial Reputation: A Comparative Theory* (2015) (with Nuno Garoupa); *The Endurance of National Constitutions* (2009) (with Zachary Elkins and James Melton); and *Judicial Review in New Democracies* (2003). He is a member of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences.

AZIZ Z. HUQ is the Frank and Bernice J. Greenberg Professor of Law at the University of Chicago Law School. He was formerly director of the Liberty and National Security project at the Brennan Center for Justice and a senior consultant analyst for the International Crisis Group.

## COMPARATIVE CONSTITUTIONAL LAW AND POLICY

### *Series editors*

Tom Ginsburg, *University of Chicago*  
 Zachary Elkins, *University of Texas at Austin*  
 Ran Hirschl, *University of Toronto*

Comparative constitutional law is an intellectually vibrant field that encompasses an increasingly broad array of approaches and methodologies. This series collects analytically innovative and empirically grounded work from scholars of comparative constitutionalism across academic disciplines. Books in the series include theoretically informed studies of single constitutional jurisdictions, comparative studies of constitutional law and institutions and edited collections of original essays that respond to challenging theoretical and empirical questions in the field.

### *Books in the series*

*Constitutional Courts as Mediators* Julio Ríos-Figueroa  
*Perils of Judicial Self-Government in Transitional Societies* David Kosař  
*Engaging with Social Rights* Brian Ray  
*Making We the People* Chaihark Hahm and Sung Ho Kim  
*Radical Deprivation on Trial* Cesar Rodríguez-Garavito and Diana Rodríguez-Franco  
*Unstable Constitutionalism* Edited by Mark Tushnet and Madhav Khosla  
*Magna Carta and Its Modern Legacy* Edited by Robert Hazell and James Melton  
*International Courts and the Performance of International Agreements* Clifford Carrubba and Matthew Gabel  
*Reputation and Judicial Tactics* Shai Dothan  
*Constitutions and Religious Freedom* Frank Cross  
*Constitutionalism in Asia in the Early Twenty-First Century* Edited by Albert Chen  
*Social Difference and Constitutionalism in Pan-Asia* Edited by Susan H. Williams  
*Constitutions in Authoritarian Regimes* Edited by Tom Ginsburg and Alberto Simpser  
*Presidential Legislation in India* Shubhankar Dam  
*Social and Political Foundations of Constitutions* Edited by Denis J. Galligan and Mila Versteeg  
*Consequential Courts* Edited by Diana Kapiszewski, Gordon Silverstein and Robert A. Kagan  
*Comparative Constitutional Design* Edited by Tom Ginsburg

# Assessing Constitutional Performance

*Edited by*

**TOM GINSBURG**

University of Chicago

**AZIZ Z. HUQ**

University of Chicago



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-15479-7 — Assessing Constitutional Performance  
Edited by Tom Ginsburg, Aziz Huq  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York NY 10013

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781107154797](http://www.cambridge.org/9781107154797)

© Cambridge University Press 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2016

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

Ginsburg, Tom, editor. | Huq, Aziz Z., editor.

Assessing constitutional performance / edited by Tom Ginsburg, Aziz Huq.

New York : Cambridge University Press, 2016. | Series: Comparative constitutional law and policy | Includes bibliographical references and index.

LCCN 2016020960 | ISBN 9781107154797 (hardback)

LCSH: Constitutions. | Constitutional history. | Comparative law. | Constitutional law. |

BISAC: LAW / Constitutional.

LCC K3165 .A87 2016 | DDC 342—dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2016020960>

ISBN 978-1-107-15479-7 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-316-60835-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## Contents

<i>List of figures</i>	page ix
<i>List of tables</i>	x
<i>List of contributors</i>	xi
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xiii
INTRODUCTION	
<b>1 Assessing constitutional performance</b> <i>Tom Ginsburg and Aziz Z. Huq</i>	3
PART I DEFINING CONSTITUTIONAL PERFORMANCE	
<b>2 Hippocratic constitutional design</b> <i>Aziz Z. Huq</i>	39
<b>3 What is a good constitution? Assessing the constitutional proposal in the Icelandic experiment</b> <i>Hélène Landemore</i>	71
<b>4 When is a constitution doing well? The Alberdian test in the Americas</b> <i>Roberto Gargarella</i>	99
<b>5 Parties and constitutional performance</b> <i>Martin Shapiro</i>	134
PART II MANAGING SPECIFIC CONSTITUTIONAL CHALLENGES	
<b>6 Constitutional performance in transitions from military to civilian rule</b> <i>Ozan O. Varol</i>	145

7	<b>Constitutional permissiveness, constitutional restrictiveness, and religious freedom</b> <i>Hanna Lerner</i>	171
8	<b>Performance of constitutions: Transitional provisions</b> <i>Sumit Bisarya</i>	203
9	<b>Time and constitutional efficacy</b> <i>Zachary Elkins, Tom Ginsburg and James Melton</i>	233
10	<b>Competitive democracy and the constitutional minimum core</b> <i>Rosalind Dixon and David Landau</i>	268
PART III CASE STUDIES		
11	<b>Ambedkar's constitution: Promoting inclusion, opposing majority tyranny</b> <i>Martha C. Nussbaum</i>	295
12	<b>Assessing the Constitution of Kenya 2010 five years later</b> <i>James Thuo Gathii</i>	337
13	<b>The Arab Spring constitutions: For whose benefit?</b> <i>Zaid Al-Ali</i>	365
14	<b>Stability in flexibility: A British lens on constitutional success</b> <i>Erin F. Delaney</i>	393
	<i>Index</i>	421

## Figures

9.1 Theoretical effect of time on the efficacy of constitutional rights	<i>page</i> 240
9.2 Survival of constitutional rights entrenchment status	249
9.3 Effect of maturation	259
9.4 Effect of maturation on aspirational constitutional rights	260
9.5 Effect of maturation by judicial independence and regime type	262

## Tables

7.1 Permissive/restrictive constitutional arrangements and measures of democracy	<i>page</i> 187
7.2 Freedom of religion and freedom from religion in Indonesia, India, Israel and Turkey, 2012	192
9.1 De jure and de facto rights data	246
9.2 Description of control variables	252
9.3 Descriptive statistics	253
9.4 Main model estimates	254



## Contributors

**Zaid Al-Ali** is a Law and Public Affairs Fellow at Princeton University, on leave from the International Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance.

**Sumit Bisarya** is Senior Project Manager, Constitution Building, International Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance.

**Erin F. Delaney** is Associate Professor at the Northwestern University Pritzker School of Law and Associate Professor of Political Science at Northwestern University.

**Rosalind Dixon** is Professor of Law, University of New South Wales.

**Zachary Elkins** is Associate Professor, University of Texas at Austin, Department of Government.

**Roberto Gargarella** is Associated Senior Researcher, Chr. Michelsen Institute and National Scientific and Technical Research Council, Argentina.

**James Thuo Gathii** is the Wing-Tat Lee Chair in International Law, Loyola University Chicago School of Law.

**Tom Ginsburg** is Leo Spitz Professor of International Law, University of Chicago Law School; and Research Fellow at the American Bar Foundation.

**Aziz Z. Huq** is Frank and Bernice J. Greenberg Professor of Law, University of Chicago Law School.

**David Landau** is Mason Ladd Professor and Associate Dean for International Programs, Florida State University College of Law.

**Hélène Landemore** is Associate Professor of Political Science, Department of Political Science, Yale University.

**Hanna Lerner** is Associate Professor of Political Science, Tel Aviv University.

**James Melton** holds a PhD from the University of Illinois, Urbana Champaign.

**Martha C. Nussbaum** is Ernst Freund Distinguished Service Professor of Law and Ethics, Law School and Department of Philosophy, University of Chicago.

**Martin Shapiro** is James W. and Isabel Coffroth Professor of Law, University of California, Berkeley School of Law.

**Ozan O. Varol** is Associate Professor of Law, Lewis & Clark Law School.

## Acknowledgments

We are grateful to Deans Michael Schill and Thomas Miles of the University of Chicago Law School for their support of our work, and to Leila Blatt for superb research assistance in preparing the volume. Ginsburg thanks the American Bar Foundation and its director, Ajay Mehrotra. We also thank the participants and commentators in the conference we held in April 2015 on *Assessing Constitutional Performance*, including Michael Albertus, Nathan Brown, Jose Cheibub, Adam Chilton, Javier Couso, Katalin Dobias, Justin Driver, Amanda Greene, William Hubbard, Alexandra Huneecus, Madhav Khosla, Alison LaCroix, Jennifer Nou, Michael Seidman, Nick Stephanopolous, Geoffrey Stone and Mila Versteeg. Finally, we are grateful to Claire Kim for help in the production process. Their contributions remind us that scholarship, like constitutional performance, is a collective enterprise.