This book examines security in three cities that suffer from chronic violence: Rio de Janeiro, Brazil; Medellín, Colombia; and Kingston, Jamaica. In each, democratic states contend with subnational armed groups that dominate territory and play important roles in politics even as they contribute to fear and insecurity. Through a nested three-city six-neighborhood analysis of the role of criminal groups in governance, this research provides a deep understanding of the impact of crime on political experience. Neighborhoods controlled by different types of armed actors, operating in the same institutional context, build alliances with state officials and participate in political life through the structures created by these armed actors. The data demonstrate the effects criminal dominance can have on security, civil society, elections, and policymaking. Far from reflecting a breakdown of order, varying types of criminal groups generate different local lived political experiences.

Enrique Desmond Arias is Associate Professor in the Schar School of Policy and Government at George Mason University. He authored Drugs and Democracy in Rio de Janeiro and co-edited Violent Democracies in Latin America. He has published in Comparative Politics, the Latin American Research Review, Qualitative Sociology, Latin American Politics and Society, and Studies in Comparative International Development.
Criminal Enterprises and Governance in Latin America and the Caribbean

ENRIQUE DESMOND ARIAS
George Mason University
For Julia
Contents

List of Figures ix
List of Tables xi
Acknowledgments xiii

Introduction: Conflict and Governance Patterns in Latin America and the Caribbean 1

1 Constellations of Governance: Theoretical Approaches to Micro-Level Armed Regimes 19
2 Poverty, Popular Incorporation, and Armed Groups in Latin American and the Caribbean 39
3 The Structure of Micro-Level Armed Regimes 75
4 Security Systems in Areas Subject to Micro-Level Armed Regimes 107
5 Armed Groups, Civil Society, and Social Mobilization 139
6 The Impact of Armed Dominance on Elections 174
7 Policy Process Amid Armed Organizations 206

Conclusion: Things Change (and They Stay the Same): Understanding the Politics of Micro-Level Armed Regimes 239

Bibliography 253
Index 281
# Figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>Types of Micro-Level Armed Regimes</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Patterns of Local Armed Dominance in Medellín</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Patterns of Local Armed Dominance in Kingston</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>Patterns of Local Armed Dominance in Rio de Janeiro</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Tables

1. **Politics under Different Micro-Level Armed Regimes**
   - Page 31

2. **Frequency of Micro-Level Armed Regimes under Particular Incorporative Systems**
   - Page 44

2.1 **City Armed Control Patterns**
   - Page 73

2.2 **Historical Patterns of Armed Organizing**
   - Page 73

2.3 **Patterns of Armed Structures in Six Communities**
   - Page 103

3.1 **Security Outcomes in Medellín**
   - Page 116

3.2 **Security Outcomes in Kingston**
   - Page 126

3.3 **Security Outcomes in Rio de Janeiro**
   - Page 133

4.1 **Security Outcomes Paired Comparisons**
   - Page 135

5.1 **Civil Society in Medellín**
   - Page 152

5.2 **Civil Society in Kingston**
   - Page 158

5.3 **Civil Society in Rio de Janeiro**
   - Page 169

5.4 **Civil Society Paired Comparisons**
   - Page 171

6.1 **Elections in Medellín**
   - Page 184

6.2 **Elections in Kingston**
   - Page 193

6.3 **Elections in Rio de Janeiro**
   - Page 202

6.4 **Elections Paired Comparisons**
   - Page 204

7.1 **Policy and Governance in Medellín**
   - Page 221

7.2 **Policy and Governance in Kingston**
   - Page 227

7.3 **Policy and Governance in Rio de Janeiro**
   - Page 235

7.4 **Policy and Governance Paired Comparisons**
   - Page 236
Acknowledgments

This undertaking was only possible with the support of numerous individuals and institutions. Its completion is a testament to their support for this project.

In Brazil I held an affiliation with the former Insituto de Pesquisas do Estado do Rio de Janeiro (IUPERJ) which is now organized as the Instituto de Estudos de Sociais e Políticos within the Universidade do Estado do Rio de Janeiro. Renato Boschi, Adalberto Cardoso, and João Feres provided support during my time there. My research in Rio also received support from Pedro Strozenberg at the Instituto de Estudos da Religião. Haydee Caruso, Luke Dowdney, Luciane Patricio, Kleber Faria, Rosane Moraes Rego, and Def Yuri also offered support during my time in Rio.

In Colombia I maintained an institutional affiliation with the Instituto Nacional de Cultural y Historia. Maria Clemencia Ramirez and Diego Herrera Gomez, the directors during the time I undertook research, provided invaluable aid. Gipsy Escobar provided helpful contacts in Bogotá that opened doors in understanding Colombia more broadly and how Medellín fit into the wider national picture. Mauricio Romero, Maria Victoria Llorente, and Rodolfo Escobedo offered important insights into the study of violence in Colombia and an orientation to other scholars working on these issues in Bogotá and Medellín. Pedro Quintín Quílez helped in my efforts to understand Cali and make contacts with the academic community there. Iván Dario Ramirez offered assistance in building contacts into Medellín’s activist community. Jorge Giraldo and Gustavo Duncan also contributed to my understanding of Medellín and aided me in building contacts there. Damian Platt, an old friend from my days in Brazil, provided key contacts on the ground.

In Jamaica I held an affiliation at the University of the West Indies, Mona. Anthony Harriott provided intuitional support and an unparalleled orientation on Jamaican criminal justice issues. Basil Wilson, the former provost of John
Jay College, provided important early contacts and insights into Jamaica. Horace Levy offered me insights into grassroots activism in Kingston. Diana Thorburn helped immeasurably in situating me in the city and connecting me into different portions of the academic and political communities. John Rapley offered a thoughtful sounding board on a variety of issues.

This project would have, of course been impossible to develop without the encouragement of a rich and growing community of scholars working on violence in Latin America. Javier Auyero, Robert Gay, Leigh Payne, and Mauricio Font offered essential early support for this effort. As the project advanced, a number of others provided aid, comments, or encouragement. These include Adam Baird, Johana Birnir, Damion Blake, Jerry Davila, Diane Davis, Sidney Greenfield, Chris Haid, Ben Junge, Camino Kavanagh, Kees Koonings, Gary LaFree, Milli Lake, Ross Lippert, Eduardo Moncada, Markus-Michael Müller, Anthony Pereira, Rosane Moraes Rego, Corinne Davis Rodrigues, Dennis Rodgers, Mary Roldan, Jeffrey Rubin, Kathy Smarick, Richard Snyder, Hillel Soifer, David Smilde, Mark Ungar, Phil Williams, Harold Trinkunas, and Jackie Zahn.

The John Jay College of Criminal Justice and George Mason University have been my primary institutional affiliations during this project. At John Jay, Harold Sullivan and Jane Bowers, respectively the Chair of Political Science and Dean of the College when I carried out research for this project, offered critical institutional support. In particular I owe a great debt to Harold Sullivan for his long efforts to build a collegial department that supported faculty research. Joshua Frielich and Susan Kang, colleagues at John Jay, offered important support and commentary. At George Mason, Louise Shelley offered advice on the project when it was in its final stages. Kurt Birson aided in preparing the manuscript.

This project benefited from discussion and commentary that emerged from presentations at the Center for Latin American and Caribbean Studies at Brown University; the Center for Latin American Studies at Cornell University; the Roger Thayer Stone Center at Tulane University; the Naval Postgraduate School; the Institute Universitário de Pesquisas do Estado do Rio de Janeiro; the Pontificia Universidad Javeriana; Center for International Cooperation at New York University; the Sonderforschungsbereich Governance in Räumen begrenzter Staatlichkeit at the Freie Universität Berlin; the Program in Latin American Studies at Princeton University; the Center for Latin American Studies at the University of Florida; the Institute of Graduate Studies, Geneva; Carleton University; the Centro de Estudios de Seguridad Ciudadana at the Universidad de Chile; the Department of Political Science at the Pontificia Universidad Católica de Chile; the Instituto Tecnologico
Acknowledgments

Autonomo de Mexico; the Institute on Culture, Religion, and World Affairs at Boston University; the Teresa Lozano Long Latin American Studies Center at the University of Texas; the Matthew B. Ridgeway Center for International Security Studies at the University of Pittsburgh; the Núcleo de Estudos de Instituições Coercitivas at the Universidade Federal de Pernambuco, Recife; a plenary presentation at the Brazilian Studies Association; the Brazil Seminar at Columbia University; and the Bildner Center for Western Hemisphere Studies at the Graduate Center of the City University of New York.

The United States Fulbright Commission, the American Council of Learned Societies, the National Consortium for the Study of Terrorism and Responses to Terrorism, PSC-CUNY Research Fund, and the Harry Frank Guggenheim Foundation provided funding for this project. I am grateful for their support.

At Cambridge University Press, John Berger advanced this project with exceptional efficiency. I am also grateful to the production staff, including Lorenza Toffolon, Periassamy Kalaivani and Vinod Bindu for their aid in bringing this project to press. Finally, two anonymous reviewers provided important insights in improving the final manuscript.

This project was undertaken in extremely difficult environments where individuals live under daily threat of criminal or police violence. As a result there are numerous institutions and individuals that made invaluable contributions to this project but whom I cannot thank by name. Many took personal risks in talking to me about their experiences. Their thoughts, insights, and voices have guided my thinking and shaped this book. I cannot offer enough thanks for their collaboration and contributions. I can only hope that this book can aid in supporting their efforts and those of their allies in civil society and the political system to improve safety and living conditions in their communities.

Finally, none of this would have been possible without the support of my family. My parents Catherine and Enrique Arias have provided support over many years for my research. Lewise and Dick Busch also offered support during the course of research that greatly facilitated moving between New York, Medellin, and Kingston. My sons Cameron and Sebastian were born during the course of this research and have enriched my life in untold ways. Finally, this project would not have been possible without the extended and deep support of my wife Julia, to whom I dedicate this book.