

## INDEX

- A&A (Agents and Artefacts) meta-model, multi-agent systems and, 54–8
- accomplice liability, command responsibility principle and, 232–3
- accountability issues in AWS  
 deployment  
 behavioural uncertainty and, 288–90  
 command responsibility doctrine and, 233–8  
 lack of incentives for accountability, 145–6  
 liability principles and, 154–8  
 overview of, 12–15  
 role responsibility and, 340n.56  
 transparency of AWS development and, 179–83
- action decision and implementation  
 behavioural uncertainty of robotics and, 127–9  
 cognitive skills and, 44–8  
 Directive 3000.09 focus on, 206–8
- actus reus*  
 autonomous weapons systems  
 liability and, 68–72  
 liability of AWS manufacturers/developers and, 321–4  
 perpetration categories and, 308–10
- adaptation  
 autonomous weapons systems and potential for, 351–3  
 behavioural uncertainty of robotics and, 87–90, 127–9  
 cognitive-behavioural architecture, 48–51, 58–61  
 teleology and, 51–4
- adaptive tactical reasoning, military  
 ‘Think-Look-Move-Talk-Work’ domains and, 92–8
- Additional Protocol I (Geneva Convention)  
 Article 36, 159, 176–8, 179–83, 220–1, 227–9, 296–9, 379–81  
 Article 43, 235–7  
 Article 57(2) of, 65–8  
 future challenges in AWS  
 development and, 299–300  
 human dignity in, 377–8  
 Martens Clause and, 269  
 proportionality principle in, 149–54
- administrative law theory  
 circular debate on AWS and, 251–9  
 diagonal obligations toward combatants and, 278–82  
 harmonization of AWS standards and, 296–9  
 international humanitarian law and, 267–8  
 pre-bound discretion and, 269–75  
 sovereignty and, 264–7  
 war as governance and, 259–69  
 warfare scenarios and, 275–8
- advanced camera systems, legal and ethical issues in use of, 27–30
- AEGIS missile defence system, Iranian  
 airline disaster and, 192n.38
- aeroplanes  
 automatic control systems on, 186–9  
 as socio-technical systems, 40–4
- agency  
 independence in socio-technical systems and, 40–4

- laws of war and concepts of, 65–8
- multilevel autonomy and, 54–8
- refiguration of autonomous agency, 98–9
- responsibility gap and, 337n.49
- unlawful conduct of AWS and, 312–13
- agnatology, cultural production of ignorance as, 133
- algorithmic calculations
  - autonomy and responsibility issues and, 304–7
  - combating algorithms, 24n.3
  - human dignity and limits of, 377–8
  - instrumentalist discourse on AWS and, 254–5
  - law of armed conflict and, 372
  - practical reasoning *vs*, 146–54
  - pre-bound discretion and, 269–75
  - self-learning algorithms, 87–90
- ambiguity, automatic reasoning and neglect of, 32–4
- Anderson, Kenneth, 339–40
- Andersson, Jenny, 347–8
- animals, liability ascribed to, 341–4
- anticipation, cognitive function and, 44–8
- anti-personnel mines, 146–54
  - law of armed conflict obligations and, 213–14
  - pre-bound discretion principle and, 276–7
- ‘apotropaic gestures’, human dignity and, 112
- ‘appropriate levels of human judgment’ standard
  - in Directive 3000.09, 200–8
  - ‘use of force’ principle and, 185–208
- Arendt, Hannah, 348–9
- Arkin, Ronald, 130–1, 136–7, 147–8
- armed uninhabited vehicles, development of, 139–40
- Arquilla, John, 132, 136–7
- artificial intelligence
  - autonomy and responsibility in, 304–7
  - Enlightenment theory and, 79–84
  - law of armed conflict obligations and, 209–20
  - legal review requirements for AWS and development of, 227–9
  - support for, 132–7
  - symbol-processing approach in, 84–6
- artificial systems
  - adaptiveness of, 48–51
  - suicide in, 64–5
- Asaro, Peter, 111, 120, 122–4, 137–8, 147–8, 201–2, 256–60
- asymmetric conflict
  - AWS performance during, 369–74
  - war as governance and, 261–2
- ‘attempt-to-capture’ restrictions, autonomous weapons and, 231
- automated weapons systems, autonomous weapons systems *vs*, 58–61, 185n.2, 249n.15
- automatic processes
  - cognitive skills and, 44–8
  - controlled processes *vs*, 30–4
- automation
  - autonomy and, 100–2
  - human intervention and bias in, 35–6
- autonomous reasoning
  - autonomy and responsibility in, 304–7
  - behaviour-based robotics and, 87–90
  - command responsibility for development of, 233–8
  - law of armed conflict obligations and, 209–20
- autonomous weapons systems (AWS)
  - accountability issues and, 12–15, 154–8
  - ‘attempt-to-capture’ restrictions and, 231
  - vs* automatic weapons systems, 58–61, 185n.2, 249n.15
  - bans and moratoriums on, 122–41, 341–4, 378–9
  - child soldiers’ responsibility compared to liability concerning, 341–4
  - circularity of debate on, 251–9

- autonomous weapons systems (cont.)
- cognitive-behavioural architecture and, 48–58
  - command structure and use of, 209–20
  - contemporary society framework for, 361–5
  - decision making capability and, 23–7
  - deontological discourse about, 256–9
  - Directive 3000.09 definition of, 186–9
  - dual processing theory and, 30–4
  - evolution of, 4–5
  - fact-based legal assessments of, 165–75
  - ‘force multiplication’ effect and, 238–42
  - future potentiality of, 347–50
  - gaps in responsibility and liability concerning, 68–72
  - human control of, 10–12, 381–3
  - human dignity and, 105–21, 354–6
  - incentives for IHL compliance and, 158–62
  - independence, cognitive skills and cognitive architecture in, 58–61
  - individual vs collective responsibility and, 303–4
  - instrumentalist discourse on, 251–6
  - laws of armed conflict and, 65–8, 369–74
  - legal framework for debate on, 365–6
  - manufacturers/developers of, liability issues, 321–4
  - meaningful human control paradigm and, 381–3
  - military definition of, 77
  - multi-agent systems principles and, 54–8
  - personal vs task autonomy principles and, 124–7
  - philosophical definitions of, 124–7
  - political and moral debates over, 100–2
  - pre-bound discretion problem and, 269–75
  - prohibition of, international consequences related to, 209–20
  - proportionality principle and, 117–18, 231–2
  - quality of life threatened by, 116–18
  - rationale for development of, 6–7
  - reason vs algorithmic calculations in, 146–54
  - responsibilities for use of, 39–74
  - right to non-humiliation and use of, 114–16
  - semi-autonomous systems vs, 58–61, 249n.15
  - surrender window and, 280–2
  - technical vs substantive autonomy definitions and, 248–51
  - terminology concerning, 5n.4
  - transparency concerning, 175–83
  - uncertainty vs autonomy and, 284–300
  - use-of-force authority and, 230–1
  - variations in terminology and definition of, 166–7n.4
  - weapons review enhancement for, 379–81
- autonomy
- adaptiveness of artificial systems, 48–51
  - alternative visions of, 200–8
  - automation and, 100–2
  - behaviour-based robotics and, 86–90
  - cognitive skills and, 44–8
  - definitions of, 39–40, 186n.4
  - Directive 3000.09 focus on levels of, 194–6
  - in Enlightenment philosophy, 79–84
  - human–machine interface and, 75–102
  - independence and, 40–4
  - individual responsibility and, 327–30
  - in military robotics, 90–8
  - multilevel autonomy, 54–8
  - personal autonomy vs task autonomy definitions, 124–7
  - in philosophical traditions, 75–9
  - refiguration of agency and, 98–9
  - responsibility and, 62–5, 304–7
  - of soldiers’ decision-making capacity, 209–20

- technical vs substantive autonomy, 248–51
- teleology and, 52–3
- uncertainty in AWS and debate over, 284–8
- auto-teleonomic behaviour, adaptiveness of artificial systems, 48–51
- background assumptions, AWS epistemology and, 129–32
- Bales, Robert, 227–9
- Banks, Ian M., 64–5
- banning of autonomous weapons systems
- consequentialist reasons for, 137–41
  - epistemological principles and, 129–32
  - fact-based legal assessment of AWS and, 165–75
  - international dialogue on transparency for AWS and, 178–9
  - overview of reasons for, 122–41
- Barad, Karen, 75, 98–9
- basic rights, human dignity and, 108–13
- battle conditions. *See* combat conditions
- Beck, Susanne, 347–83
- ‘Behavior, purpose and teleology’ (Rosenblueth, Wiener and Bigelow), 81–4
- behavioural autonomy
- autonomous weapons systems and potential for, 351–3
  - combatant/non-combatant distinctions and, 129–32
  - emergent behaviour perspective, 304–7
  - environmental factors in uncertainty about, 127–9
  - machine learning and, 75–9
  - in robotics, 86–90
- behavioural competence, responsibility and, 62–5
- behavioural uncertainty, robotic and computer systems, 287–8
- Bekey, George A., 39–40
- belief-desire-intention (BDI) architecture, teleology and, 51–4
- Benvenisti, Eyal, 138n.30, 245–83, 288–90, 355–6
- Bhuta, Nehal, 284–300, 347–83
- bias, automatic reasoning and, 32–4
- Bigelow, Julian, 81–4
- bio-cybernetic science, 89–90
- Birnbacher, Dieter, 105–21, 131–2, 138n.30, 354–6
- blameworthiness
- gaps in, concerning autonomous weapons systems, 68–72
  - responsibility and, 62–5
- Bolton, Matthew, 100–2
- bright-line rule
- autonomy vs responsibility in robotics and, 304–7
  - obligations toward combatants and, 278–82
- Brimstone ‘fire and forget’ missiles, 147
- Brooks, Rodney, 86–90
- capability-independence, socio-technical infrastructure and, 44
- ‘capacity responsibility’, 335n.39
- caregiver robotics, 127–9, 155
- Castelfranchi, Cristiano, 39–40, 52–3
- causality
- automatic reasoning and, 32–4
  - behavioural uncertainty of robotics and, 127–9
  - control systems for AWS and, 313–15
  - cybernetics and, 81–4
  - functional responsibility and, 62–5
  - legal responsibility doctrine and, 304–7
  - liability for harm and, 64–5
- causal responsibility, AWS liability and, 336–41
- Chamayou, Grégoire, 356n.23
- Chemical Weapons Convention, 176–8
- child soldiers
- gaps in responsibility and liability in use of, 71–2
  - impunity and scapegoating in law concerning, 341–4

- circular debate concerning
  - autonomous weapons systems, 251–9
- circumstantial responsibility
  - control, predictability and foresight issues, 330–6
  - core issues in, 325–7
  - role and causal responsibility and, 338n.50
- citizenship, democratic decision-making and, 135–7
- civilians. *See also* non-discrimination of combatants and non-combatants
  - administrative power of warfare and, 261–2
  - autonomous weapons technology and, 27–30
  - bright-line rule concerning, 278–82
  - combatant/non-combatant distinctions and, 65–8, 235–7
  - ‘constant care’ requirement for military operations and, 267–8
  - distinction principle applied to, 65–8
  - gaps in responsibility and liability concerning, 68–72
  - gender, age, and race issues and, 75n.3
  - human dignity of, 113–16
  - legal assessment of AWS attacks and, 170–2
  - mens rea* principles and criminal liability of, 315–21
  - military necessity *vs* humanitarian concerns in protection of, 218n.24
  - pre-bound discretion and role of, 278–82
  - proportionality principle and loss of life among, 149–54
  - quality of life for, AWS as threat to, 116–18
  - state responsibility concerning, 264–7
- civil law
  - autonomous weapons systems liability and, 71n.58
  - liability of AWS manufacturers/developers and, 321–4
  - perpetration categories and, 308–10
  - transparency for autonomous weapons systems and, 183–4
- Civil War (US), battlefield conditions during, 206n.119
- Clark, John, 356n.23
- cloning, human dignity and, 108–13
- coactive design model,
  - human–machine interaction, 185–6, 203–6
- co-agency, laws of war and, 65–8
- cognitive-behavioural architecture
  - adaptiveness, 48–51
  - in autonomous weapons systems, 58–61, 73–4
  - autonomy and, 48–58
  - cybernetics and, 79–84
  - semi-autonomous weapons systems and, 60–1
  - teleology and, 51–4
- cognitive skills
  - adaptiveness and, 50–1
  - in autonomous weapons systems, 58–61, 73–4
  - autonomy and, 44–8
  - behavioural uncertainty of robotics and, 127–9
  - delegation to technological systems of, 47–8
  - law of armed conflict obligations and, 209–20
  - laws of war and autonomous weapons systems and, 65–8
  - locus of compliance validation and, 220–1
  - teleology and, 51–4
- collateral damage estimate
  - methodology
  - fact-based legal assessment of AWS and, 172n.15
  - instrumentalist discourse on AWS and, 254–5
  - proportionality principle and, 149–54
- collective responsibility. *See also* individual responsibility
  - deontological ethics and, 256–9

- individual responsibility *vs.*, 303–4  
instrumentalist discourse and, 251–6  
legal obligations concerning AWS and, 245–83  
pre-bound discretion and, 278–82  
team-based AWS development and, 328n.10  
uncertainty in AWS and, 290–9  
war as governance and, 259–69
- collision avoidance systems  
cognitive skills and, 44–8  
gaps in responsibility and liability concerning, 68–72  
independence of, 40–4
- combatant/non-combatant distinction.  
*See also* lawful combatant status  
autonomous weapons systems and, 100–2, 117–18, 327–30  
child soldiers and, 343n.67  
epistemology concerning AWS and, 129–32  
instrumentalist discourse on AWS and, 251–6  
law of armed conflict and, 223n.37, 235n.60  
‘combatant privilege’ principle, 230n.50
- combat conditions. *See also* warfare scenarios  
AWS adherence to LOAC and, 369–74  
circumstantial responsibility for AWS and, 333–6  
‘constant care’ requirement and, 267–8  
criminalization of irresponsible systems in, 341–4  
diagonal state-combatant obligations and, 280–2  
Directive 3000.09 concern over, 196–8  
epistemology concerning AWS and, 129–32  
executive actions in context of, 263–4  
‘force multiplication’ effect and, 238–42  
historical context for, 206n.119
- instrumentalist discourse on AWS and, 251–6  
law of armed conflict and, 209–20  
legal standards for robots and, 374–6  
robotic behavioural uncertainty and, 127–9
- combating algorithms, 24n.3  
command responsibility doctrine. *See also* superior/subordinate relationship  
accountability for AWS and, 157n.40  
‘appropriate levels of human judgment’ standard and, 200–8  
AWS unlawful conduct and, 312–13  
behavioural uncertainty of weapon systems and, 288n.12  
circumstantial responsibility and, 331–6  
control systems for AWS and, 313–15  
Directive 3000.09 and, 340n.58  
individual responsibility for AWS operation and, 327–30  
law of armed conflict and, 221–4, 230–8, 333n.32, 372  
*mens rea* principles and, 315–21  
military training and, 221–4  
revival of concept, 230–8  
role responsibility and, 338–9  
unlawful conduct of subordinates and, 310–12
- command structure  
accountability of AWS and design of, 156–8  
‘appropriate levels of human judgment’ standard and, 200–8  
circumstantial responsibility and, 331n.24  
collective responsibility and, 328n.10  
command responsibility doctrine and, 233–8  
Directive 3000.09 concern over, 196–8  
lawful combatant status and, 235–7  
soldiers’ subordination to, 221–4  
weapons technology and, 209–20

- common law, perpetration categories and, 308–10
- communications systems
  - historical context for, 206n.119
  - human–machine interactions and, 196n.63, 203n.98
- complementarity, pre-bound discretion and, 275–8
- completely autonomous machines, accountability issues with, 154–8
- compliance confidence principle. *See also* verification and validation procedures
- command responsibility doctrine and, 230–8
- law of armed conflict obligations and, 209–20, 224–9
- locus of compliance validation and, 220–1
- responsibility practices and, 360
- compliance with international humanitarian law
  - incentives for AWS compliance, 158–62
  - international dialogue on transparency for AWS and, 178–9
  - transparency of AWS technology and, 164–5
- components of AWS
  - multilevel autonomy of, 54–8
  - in socio-technical systems, 40–4
- compulsory insurance, autonomous weapons systems and limits on, 68–72
- computerized decision-making
  - evolution of, 4–5
  - weapons control through, 23–7
- computer programming
  - automation bias, human intervention in, 35–6
  - behavioural uncertainty in, 287–8
  - human target selection and, 35
  - international humanitarian law and limitations of, 147–8
  - restrictions on human veto of target selection and, 36
- conceptual responsibility
  - core issues in, 325–7
  - role and causal responsibility and, 336–41
- conceptual uncertainty, concerning autonomy, 284–8
- Conference on Autonomous Weapons (2014), 114–16, 120–1
- consequentialist theory
  - banning of AWS based on, 122–4, 137–41, 147–8
  - epistemic knowledge in AWS and, 130–1
  - human dignity and, 354–6
  - instrumentalist discourse on AWS and, 254
- ‘constant care’ standard
  - civilians and military operations and, 267–8
  - pre-bound discretion and, 269–75
- contemporary society, AWS in context of, 361–5
- contextual judgment, proportionality and, 149–54
- controlled processes, automatic processes *vs.*, 30–4
- control systems
  - accountability and, 12–15, 155–6
  - circumstantial responsibility for AWS and, 333–6
  - criminal responsibility doctrines and role of, 313–15
  - Directive 3000.09 on development of, 192–200
  - distribution of risk and, 159–62
  - fact-based legal assessments of AWS and, 165–75
  - human *vs.* computer functionality and, 23–7
  - machine autonomy and, 90–8
  - meaningful human control paradigm and, 381–3
  - military command structure and, 209–20
  - robotics research, 90–8
  - Sharkey’s levels of human control and, 77–8
  - transparency of AWS development and, 179–83

- Convention on Prohibitions or Restrictions on the Use of Certain Conventional Weapons Which May Be Deemed to Be Excessively Injurious or to Have Indiscriminate Effects (CCW), 178–83, 248–51, 284–8, 378–9, 381–3
- coordination models, multi-agent systems, 54–8
- Corn, Geoffrey S., 156–8, 206–8, 209–42, 278, 288n.12, 350–1, 360, 373–4
- Corten, Olivier, 160–1
- Council Directive (EC) 95/46, 266–7
- counter-insurgency/counter-terrorism movements, AWS deployment and, 169–70
- criminal liability. *See also* liability; responsibility
- accountability for AWS and, 156–8, 365–6
  - behavioural uncertainty and, 288–90
  - child soldiers and issues of, 341–4
  - command responsibility principle and, 232–3, 310–12
  - control systems for AWS and, 313–15
  - criminal responsibility doctrines and, 307–8, 357–8
  - future challenges to AWS and, 324
  - gap in, autonomous weapons systems and, 68–72
  - individual responsibility and, 303–4
  - manufacturers and developers of AWS and, 321–4
  - mens rea* principles and, 315–21
  - perpetration categories and, 308–10
  - unlawful conduct of AWS and, 312–13
- criminal responsibility. *See* criminal liability
- Cummings, Missy, 35–6
- cybernetics
- behaviour-based robotics and, 86–90
  - early history of, 75–9
  - Enlightenment theory and, 79–84
- cyber-warfare, moral symmetry/asymmetry concerning, 116–18
- data acquisition systems
- cognitive skills and, 44–8
  - fusion of information in, 186–9
- decision-making processes
- agnology concerning AWS and, 132–7
  - autonomous vs semi-autonomous weapons systems and, 60
  - autonomy and responsibility in, 304–7
- capacity of soldiers for, 209–20
- cognitive skills and, 44–8
- collective responsibility and, 245–8
- computerized decision making and, 262–3n.79
- deontological discourse on AWS and, 256–9
- Directive 3000.09 focus on, 192–200, 206–8
- division of, in military decisions, 312–13
- dual processing and, 30–4
- instrumentalist discourse
- concerning AWS and, 251–6
- legal framework for, 367–8
- moral responsibility for AWS and, 131
- pre-bound discretion and, 269–75
- responsibility gaps and, 339–40
- retention of human control in, 147–8
- state responsibility in, 264–7
- technical vs substantive autonomy and, 248–51
- de facto context
- command responsibility principle and, 310–12
  - control systems for AWS and, 313–15
- Defense Science Board (US Military), 39–40, 189–92
- coactive design model and, 203–6
- dehumanization, in autonomous weapons systems, 109–10
- de jure context
- command responsibility principle and, 310–12
  - control systems for AWS and, 313–15



- delegation of authority, pre-bound discretion and, 272n.133
- de lege ferenda* norm
- accountability for AWS and, 157n.40
  - international environmental law and AWS development, 291–3
- de lege lata* norm, accountability for AWS and, 157n.40
- deliberative processes
- Kahneman's theory concerning, 30–4
  - proportionality judgments and, 152–4
  - supervisory control of weapons and, 34–7
- democratic decision making
- moral debate over AWS and, 132–7
  - transparency of AWS and, 179–83
- Dennett, Daniel, 47–8
- deontological-dignitarian ethics
- debate on AWS and, 256–9
  - gaps in responsibility and liability in AWS and, 71–2
  - pre-emptive bans on AWS and, 122–4, 137–41
- Department of Defense (DoD) (US). *See also* Directive 3000.09, 'Autonomy in weapon systems' (US DoD, 2012)
- autonomous weapons research and, 23–7
  - definition of AWS by, 124–7
  - levels of autonomy in studies by, 78n.11
  - moratorium on AWS development, 245–8
- design failure, blameworthiness and, 62–5
- 'design stance', cognition and anticipation and, 47–8
- desires, values *vs.*, 52–3
- determinism philosophy, technical *vs.* substantive autonomy and, 248–51
- deterrence, war as governance and, 261–2
- diagonal state-combatant obligations, pre-bound discretion and, 278–82
- dignity, right to
- autonomous weapons systems and, 10–12, 105–21, 377–8
  - bans on AWS on basis of, 138n.30
  - human dignity concepts and, 105–7
  - inflationary tendencies, danger of, 108–13
  - inflationary tendencies concerning human dignity and, 108–13
  - integrative and open concept of, 105–7
  - intrinsic incompatibility of AWS with, policy implications of, 119–21
  - legal framework for concepts of, 368–9
  - meaningful human control paradigm and, 381–3
  - morality and, 110–12, 131–2
  - open-endedness of, 354–6
  - protection from humiliation and, 114–16
- Directive 3000.09, 'Autonomy in weapon systems' (US DoD, 2012), 58–61, 179–83, 185–208
- alternative concepts of autonomy in, 200–8
- 'appropriate levels of human judgment' standard and, 191–208, 245n.3
- coactive design model and, 203–6
- command responsibility and, 340n.58
- definitions and basic principles in, 186–9
- historical and military context for, 189–92
- legality of AWS and, 245–8
- LOAC compliance standards and, 224–9
- machine autonomy *vs.* human judgment and, 353–4
- policy and legal issues in drafting of, 192–200
- role responsibility and, 339–40
- vagueness in wording of, 186n.3

- discrimination principle, in
  - international law
  - in Directive 3000.09 guidelines, 198–200
  - ethics of AWS and, 122–4
  - state responsibility for AWS and, 296–9
- distance killing, humanitarian law and, 27–30
- distinction, principle of
  - control and testing of AWS and, 159–62
  - law of armed conflict and, 65–8
- distribution of risk
  - controls of AWS and, 159
  - responsibility gaps and, 358
- domestic law
  - AWS manufacturers/developers liability and, 321–4
  - mens rea* standards and, 315–21
- doubt, automatic reasoning and suppression of, 32–4
- Draft Articles on Prevention of Transboundary Harm from Hazardous Activities (ILC), 290–9
- Draft Principles on the Allocation of Loss in the Case of Transboundary Harm Arising out of Hazardous Activities (ILC), 290–9
- drone technology
  - adverse reactions to, 15–19
  - asymmetric dynamics of, 158–62
  - humanitarian impact of, 27–30
  - independence *vs* autonomy, 40–4
  - international dialogue on transparency for, 175–83
  - legal assessment of, 170–1
- due care principles
  - incentives for AWS compliance with IHL and, 158–62
  - pre-bound discretion and, 269–75
- due diligence principles
  - accountability for AWS and, 157n.40
  - international environmental law and AWS development and, 291–3
  - responsibility practices and, 360
  - robotics standards development and, 293–6
- due process
  - deontological discourse on AWS and, 256–9
  - war as governance and, 259–69
- ‘due respect’ principle, pre-bound discretion and, 269–75
- Duff, Antony, 320
- ‘dumb’ weapons systems, pre-bound discretion principle and, 276–7
- economic issues, control and testing of AWS and, 159–62
- ‘electronic person’ concept, 365–6
- embodiment, behaviour-based robotics and, 86–90
- emergent intelligence, behavioural autonomy of AWS and, 304–7
- emotional reaction, human dignity as, 112
- Enlightenment philosophers, autonomy and, 79–84
- environmental issues
  - adaptiveness of autonomous systems and, 48–51
  - behavioural uncertainty of robotics and, 127–9, 287–8
  - international legal principles concerning, 290–9
  - responsibility practices and, 360
- ‘epistemic cultures’, autonomous agency and, 98–9
- epistemological concepts
  - accountability for AWS and, 154–8
  - laws of war and, 65–8
  - moral basis for AWS moratorium and, 129–32
  - proportionality judgments and, 152–4
  - responsibility principles and, 62–5
- essentialism, technical *vs* substantive autonomy and, 248–51
- ethical governor architecture
  - development of, 130–1n.15
  - instrumentalist discourse on AWS and, 253–4n.35
- ethology, multi-agent systems and, 54–8

- European Convention on Human Rights, 267–8
- European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR), 267–8, 381–3
- European Parliament, international dialogue on transparency for AWS and, 178–9
- European Union (EU), robotics research funding by, 140–1
- ‘everything feasible’ principle, proportionality judgments and, 152–4
- evidence, automatic reasoning and exclusion of, 32–4
- ex ante* decisions
- effects of AWS and, 156–8
  - machine autonomy limitations and, 363–5
  - mens rea* standard and, 319
  - pre-bound discretion and, 273–5
  - proportionality principle and, 149–54
  - state responsibility and, 159–62
  - technical *vs* substantive autonomy and, 248–51
  - uncertainty in AWS technology and, 284–8
- executive action
- AWS in context of, 262–3
  - pre-bound discretion and, 269–75
  - war as governance and, 263–4
- experience-based learning
- AWS epistemology and, 129–32
  - behaviour-based robotics and, 87–90
- ex post* decisions, instrumentalist discourse and, 251–6
- F-16 fighter jet, automatic control systems on, 186–9
- F-35 fighter jet, data fusion on, 186–9
- face recognition systems, cognitive skills and, 44–8
- fact-based legal assessments of AWS, challenges facing, 165–75
- failure
- causality and, 62–5
  - Directive 3000.09 focus on, 198–200
  - locus of compliance validation and risk of, 220–1
- Falcone, Rino, 39–40
- fault, responsibility and, 62–5
- feedback, cybernetics and, 81–4
- feminist theory, autonomous weapons systems debate and, 100–2
- Ferzan, Kimberly, 317–18
- ‘fire-and-forget’ missile systems, 155, 190n.24
- flexible autonomy, Directive 3000.09 concept of, 194–6
- force, use of
- ‘appropriate levels of human judgment’ standard for, 200–8
  - autonomous systems for, 147
  - cognition and independence of AWS and, 58–61
  - context and authority for, 230
  - ethical and legal norms concerning, 3–4, 7–8
  - fact-based legal assessments of AWS and, 165–75
- forced situational awareness, military ‘Think-Look-Move-Talk-Work’ domains and, 92–8
- ‘force multiplication’ effect, 238–42
- foreseeability, principle of
- AWS manufacturers/developers liability and, 321–4
  - circumstantial responsibility for AWS and, 333–6
  - cognitive dimensions of autonomy and, 47–8
  - command responsibility doctrine and, 154–8, 234–5, 273–5
  - consequentialist discourse on AWS and, 147
  - law of armed conflict and, 235–7
  - mens rea* principles and, 315–21
  - ‘should have known’ theory and, 232–3
  - standardization of AWS deployment and, 293–6
- ‘friendly fire’ incidents, autonomous weapons systems and, 100–2, 189–92

- functional responsibility  
 autonomy of AWS and, 327–30  
 causal responsibility and, 336n.44  
 defined, 62–5  
 inappropriate functioning vs  
 malfunction, 356n.26  
 fusion process of information analysis,  
 186–9
- Gantz, Benny, 282  
 Garraway, Charles, 333–6  
 Geiß, Robin, 347–83  
 Geneva Conventions, child soldiers'  
 responsibilities under Additional  
 Protocols of, 341–4  
 Germany  
 meaningful human control paradigm  
 and, 381–3  
 perpetration categories in criminal  
 law in, 308–10  
 global destabilization, banning of AWS  
 and, 137–41  
 go-into-target projectiles, classification  
 of, 60  
 Goodwin, Charles, 98–9  
 go-onto-location-in-space projectiles,  
 classification of, 60  
 governance, war as, 259–69  
 government institutions. *See also* state  
 responsibility  
 administrative power of warfare and,  
 261–2  
 bans on AWS by, 169n.9  
 control and testing of AWS and,  
 159–62  
 international dialogue on transparency  
 for AWS and, 175–83  
 legal review requirements for AWS  
 and, 227–9  
 Grant, Ulysses S., 206n.120  
 Grossman, Vasily, 206n.119  
 Guardian sentry robot, 147  
 Gubrud, Mark, 58–61, 77
- hacking risks, Directive 3000.09 focus  
 on, 198–200  
 Hague Conventions (1899 and 1907)  
 lawful combatant status in, 235–7  
 Martens Clause and, 269  
 harm, legal liability for  
 accountability for AWS and, 154–8  
 artificial systems and, 64–5  
 AWS manufacturers/developers  
 liability and, 321–4  
 child soldiers' responsibilities and,  
 341–4  
 gaps in, concerning autonomous  
 weapons systems, 68–72  
 pre-bound discretion and, 271–2  
 transboundary harm in international  
 environmental law and, 290–9  
 'harpoon anti-Ship missile' system,  
 190n.24  
 Harpy anti-radar missile system, 147,  
 189–92  
 Hart, H. L. A., 269–75, 336  
 Hawley, J., 191–2  
 Heuss, Theodor, 107  
 Heylighen, Francis, 82–3  
 Heyns, Christof, 3–19, 109–10, 114–17,  
 119, 120–1, 138n.30, 256–9,  
 303–4, 371, 377–8  
 Hoerster, Norbert, 111–12  
 holistic judgment, proportionality and,  
 149–54  
 Holland, John, 48–51  
 Horowitz, Michael, 60  
*hors de combat* principle  
 administrative law and, 267–8  
 AWS epistemology and, 129–32  
 command responsibility and, 230  
 diagonal obligations toward  
 combatants and, 278–82  
 human control of AWS and, 27–30  
 instrumentalist discourse and, 251–6  
 justification for AWS moratorium  
 and, 129–32  
 legal standards for robots and, 374–6  
 war as governance and, 267–8  
 human autonomy  
 accountability issues with  
 autonomous weapons systems  
 and, 12–15  
 autonomous weapons systems and,  
 10–12  
 individual responsibility and, 327–30

- human autonomy (cont.)  
 law of armed conflict and framing of,  
 221–4  
 legal responsibility doctrine and,  
 304–7  
 meaningful human control paradigm  
 and, 381–3  
 morality of war and, 349–50  
 operator of AWS, responsibility of,  
 328n.11  
 programmers and operators of AWS,  
 individual responsibility of,  
 327–30  
 in socio-technical systems, 40–4  
 supervisory control of weapons  
 and, 34–7  
 human dignity. *See* dignity, right to  
 ‘human in the loop’ requirements,  
 AWS and role of, 266–7  
 humanitarian impact of autonomous  
 weapons  
 command responsibility doctrine  
 and, 233–8  
 legal and ethical issues concerning,  
 27–30  
 human judgment  
 ‘appropriate levels’ standard for,  
 200–8  
 autonomous weapons systems as  
 surrender of, 147–8  
 context-specific and holistic aspects  
 of, 149–54  
 dignity rights and, 368–9  
 Directive 3000.09 focus on, 191–200,  
 245n.3  
 fusion of information and, 186–9  
 instrumentalist discourse on AWS  
 and role of, 251–6  
 law of armed conflict obligations  
 and, 209–20  
 legal concepts of responsibility and,  
 367–8  
 locus of compliance validation and,  
 220–1  
 machine autonomy and, 350–4  
 meaningful human control paradigm  
 and, 381–3  
 military robotics and, 90–8  
 ‘mission command’ concept and,  
 238–42  
 responsibility gaps and, 339–40  
 technical vs substantive autonomy  
 and, 248–51  
 human–machine interaction  
 autonomies in, 75–102  
 autonomous weapons systems and,  
 27–30, 185–6  
 behavioural uncertainty of robotics  
 and, 87–90, 127–9  
 coactive design model for, 203–6  
 cognitive skills and, 44–8  
 cybernetics and, 79–84  
 dignity rights and, 368–9  
 Directive 3000.09 focus on, 186–9,  
 191–2, 194–6  
 laws of war and, 65–8  
 military robotics and, 90–8  
 philosophical assumptions  
 concerning, 75–9  
 proportionality judgments and,  
 149–54  
 target selection and engagement  
 and, 60–1  
 human rights law. *See also* basic rights  
 administrative law theory and,  
 267–8  
 autonomous weapons systems  
 and, 7–8  
 dignity rights and, 105–7, 113–16,  
 354–6, 377–8  
 fact-based assessments of AWS and,  
 166n.3  
 law of armed conflict and,  
 223n.37  
 legality of AWS and, 7–8, 166n.3  
 Human Rights Watch, 107, 119–21,  
 154–8  
 human–robot segregation policies,  
 behavioural uncertainty of  
 robotics and, 127–9  
*The Human Use of Human Beings*  
 (Wiener), 81–4  
 humiliation, right to protection from,  
 114–16  
 hybrid systems, laws of war and,  
 65–8

- ignorance, cultural production of,  
democratic decision-making  
concerning AWS and, 132–7
- ‘illusion of accuracy’, autonomous  
weapons systems and, 117–18
- imitation, behaviour-based robotics  
and, 87–90
- impunity  
child soldiers under international  
law and, 341–4  
circumstantial responsibility  
and, 341
- independence  
in autonomous weapons systems,  
58–61, 73–4  
autonomy and, 40–4  
cognitive skills and, 44–8
- indirect perpetration  
control systems for AWS and,  
313–15  
criminal responsibility and, 308–10  
unlawful conduct of AWS and,  
312–13
- indiscriminate attacks, autonomous  
weapons systems and dilemma of,  
210–11n.5
- individual responsibility  
autonomy and, 327–30  
child soldier’s and issues of, 341–4  
circumstantial vs conceptual  
responsibility distinction, 325–44  
command responsibility doctrine  
and, 312–13  
criminal liability and, 303–24  
*mens rea* standard and, 315–21  
role and causal responsibility and,  
336–41
- inflationary tendencies concerning  
human dignity, 108–13
- information analysis  
circumstantial responsibility for  
AWS and, 333–6  
cognitive skills and, 44–8  
cybernetics and, 81–4  
democratic decision-making and,  
132–7  
fact-based legal assessments of AWS  
and, 165–75  
fusion process for, 186–9  
international dialogue on  
transparency for AWS and,  
175–83  
risk regulation and forcing of,  
288–90  
symbol-processing artificial  
intelligence and, 84–6  
transparency of AWS technology  
and, 164–5
- infrastructure  
collateral damage from autonomous  
weapons and, 27–30  
gaps in responsibility and liability  
concerning destruction of, 68–72  
‘innocent agent’ principle, perpetration  
categories and, 308–10
- instrumentalist discourse  
legality of autonomous weapons  
systems and, 251–6  
pre-bound discretion and, 273–5
- intention  
automatic reasoning and, 32–4  
*mens rea* principles and, 315–21  
‘intentional stance’, cognition and  
anticipation and, 47–8
- interactive communication, military  
‘Think-Look-Move-Talk-Work’  
domains and, 92–8
- intergovernmental institutions,  
transparency for autonomous  
weapons systems and, 183–4
- International Committee for Robot  
Arms Control (ICRAC), 256–9
- International Committee of the Red  
Cross (ICRC), 374–6  
Commentary on the Additional  
Protocols, 147–8, 149–54  
human control of autonomous  
weapons and, 211n.7  
state responsibility for AWS and,  
296–9  
weapons review proposals and,  
379–81
- International Criminal Court (ICC),  
114–16  
command responsibility principle  
and, 310–12, 331–3

- International Criminal Court (cont.)  
 indirect perpetration principle in,  
 308–10
- International Criminal Tribunal for the  
 former Yugoslavia, 218n.24
- international humanitarian law (IHL)  
 administrative law and, 267–8  
 ‘appropriate levels of human  
 judgment’ standard and, 200–8  
 artificial intelligence capacity in,  
 209–20  
 autonomous weapons systems  
 deployment and, 7–8, 23–7,  
 145–6, 284–8, 369–74  
 bans on AWS and, 122–4  
 child soldiers’ responsibilities under,  
 341–4  
 combat conditions and, 218–20  
 deontological discourse on AWS  
 and, 256–9  
 in Directive 3000.09 guidelines,  
 198–200  
 due diligence principles and, 157n.40  
 ethical governor architecture and,  
 130–1n.15  
 fact-based legal assessments of AWS  
 and, 165–75  
 flexibility and adaptability of, 162–3  
 harmonization of AWS standards  
 and, 296–9  
 human judgment in, 350–1  
 incentives for AWS compliance with,  
 158–62  
 justice and, 259–60  
 legality of AWS and, 245–8  
*lex specialis* and, 275–8  
 limits of computer modelling  
 concerning, 147–8  
 machine autonomy vs human  
 judgment in, 351–3  
 moral decision making and, 131  
 pre-bound discretion and, 269–75  
 proportionality principle and,  
 149–54  
 surrender opportunities in, 280–2  
 transparency of AWS technology  
 and compliance with, 164–5,  
 175–83
- international institutions, transparency  
 of AWS development and role of,  
 179–83
- international law  
 child soldiers under, 341–4, 343n.68  
 environmental law and uncertainty  
 in AWS, 290–9  
 future challenges in AWS  
 development and, 299–300  
 human dignity in, 354–6  
 legal review requirements for AWS  
 and, 227–9  
 lethal force use in, 7–8  
 state responsibility in, 264–7  
 transparency of AWS technology  
 and, 175–83  
 weapons review enhancements and,  
 379–81
- International Law Commission (ILC),  
 environmental rules and  
 principles and, 290–9
- International Organization for  
 Standardization (ISO), 365–6  
 13482 Standard, 127–9  
 robotics standards development,  
 293–6
- ‘in-the-loop’ context  
 accountability issues and, 12–15  
 agency debate concerning AWS and,  
 100–2  
 algorithmic calculations and, 147–8  
 dimensions of autonomy and,  
 44–8, 73–4  
 human dignity and, 368–9  
 human supervisory control of  
 weapons and, 23–38  
 instrumentalist discourse and,  
 273–5  
 ‘kill chain’ metaphor concerning, 77  
 laws of war and, 65–8  
 machine autonomy in military  
 robotics and, 90–8  
 predetermined decision making and,  
 266–7, 269–75  
 semi-autonomous weapons and,  
 60–1, 170–2, 189–92  
 technical vs substantive autonomy  
 debate and, 248–51

- Iranian civilian airliner disaster, 192n.38
- Israel  
 autonomous weapons systems in, 189–92  
 extraterritorial applications of  
 administrative law in, 276n.147
- Jackson, Richard, 201, 207
- Jain, Neha, 156–8, 288–90, 303–24, 363–5
- Johnson, Deborah G., 299–300, 353–4
- Johnson, Gordon, 132, 136–7
- joint cognitive systems, laws of war and, 65–8
- Joslyn, Cliff, 82–3
- Jouvenel, Bertrand de, 347–8
- judgment. *See* human judgment
- jus ad bellum* principle  
 deterrence and, 262n.78  
 instrumentalist discourse concerning AWS and, 251–6
- jus in bello* principle  
 deterrence and, 262n.78  
 instrumentalist discourse on AWS and, 251–6
- justification for openness, transparency for AWS and, 179–83
- Kahneman, Daniel, 30–4
- Kalmanovitz, Pablo, 131, 145–63, 288–90, 328n.10, 355–6, 370, 373–4
- Kant, Immanuel, 10–12, 79  
 human dignity in philosophy of, 105–7, 110–12, 138n.30  
 instrumentalist discourse on AWS and ethics of, 253–4n.35
- killer robots  
 accountability issues concerning, 154–8  
 Human Rights Watch report on, 119–21  
 law of armed conflict obligations and, 209–20  
 political and moral debates concerning, 100–2  
 role and causal responsibility issues and, 337n.47  
 variations in terminology and definition of, 166–7
- Killing without Heart* (Riza), 100–2
- Knorr-Cetina, Karin, 98–9
- knowledge representation, symbol-processing artificial intelligence and, 84–6
- Knuckey, Sarah, 164–83, 360–1
- Krishnan, A., 155
- landmines. *See* anti-personnel mines
- Latour, Bruno, 98–9
- law enforcement  
 autonomous weapons systems and, 5–6, 8–9  
 meaningful human control principle and, 15–19
- lawful combatant status. *See also* combatant/non-combatant distinctions  
 autonomous weapons systems as, 327–30  
 child soldiers and issues of, 343n.67  
 command responsibility principle and, 233–8  
 law of armed conflict and, 221–4  
 pre-bound discretion and obligations toward, 278–82
- law of armed conflict (LOAC)  
 artificial intelligence and replication of human reasoning and, 209–20  
 AWS adherence to, 65–8, 369–74  
 child soldiers' criminal responsibility in, 341–4  
 civilians and, 113–16  
 command responsibility doctrine and, 221–4, 230–8, 333n.32  
 compliance with international humanitarian law and, 27–30  
 criminal liability and, 232–3  
 deontological discourse on AWS and, 256–9  
 diagonal obligations toward combatants and, 278–82  
 Directive 3000.09 principles and, 186–9



- law of armed conflict (LOAC) (cont.)  
 enablers of compliance confidence and, 224–9  
 ‘force multiplication’ effect and, 238–42  
 human dignity and, 377–8  
 lawful combatant status and, 221–4  
 legal standards for robots and, 374–6  
 liability of AWS under, 303–4  
 locus of compliance validation and, 220–1  
 pre-bound discretion and, 275–8  
 technological systems and, 65–8  
 war as governance and, 259–60  
 weapons review enhancements and, 379–81
- least-harmful means obligation, law of armed conflict and, 218n.24
- legal analysis  
 ‘appropriate levels of human judgment’ standard and, 203n.97  
 in Directive 3000.09, 192–200  
 fact-based assessment of AWS and, 165–75  
 legal standards for robots and, 374–6  
 LOAC compliance standards and, 224–9  
 of machine autonomy limitations, 363–5  
 transparency for AWS and, 179–83
- lethal force  
 in Directive 3000.09, 186–9  
 laws of war and application of, 65–8
- lex ferenda*, diagonal obligations toward combatants and, 278–82
- lex lata*  
 diagonal obligations toward combatants and, 278–82  
 international environmental law and AWS development, 291–3
- lex specialis*, pre-bound discretion and, 275–8
- liability. *See also* criminal liability  
 accountability for AWS and, 154–8, 162–3  
 command responsibility doctrine and, 223n.38  
 financial liability for AWS damages, 367–8  
 gaps in, 68–72  
 manufacturers/developers of AWS, 321–4  
 role responsibility and, 328n.10
- Lieber, Francis, 200–1n.88
- Lieber Code, 259–60
- Lieblich, Eliav, 138n.30, 245–83, 288–90, 355–6
- Liu, Hin-Yan, 71–2, 325–44, 357–8
- Luban, David, 159, 264–7
- MacCormick, Neil, 152–4
- machine autonomy  
 accountability issues and, 154–8  
 circumstantial responsibility and, 330–6  
 deontological discourse on AWS and, 256–9  
 dignity rights and, 368–9  
 evolution and inevitability of, 209–42  
 human judgment and, 350–4  
 in military robotics, 90–8  
 problems and limitations of, 363–5  
 proportionality judgments and, 149–54  
 responsibility in robotics and, 304–7
- machine bias  
 automatic reasoning systems and, 32–4  
 Directive 3000.09 focus on, 207  
 human intervention and, 35–6
- machine learning  
 autonomy in, 330  
 behavioural uncertainty of robotics and, 287–8  
 behaviour-based robotics and, 75–9  
 emergent intelligence perspective and, 304–7  
 international humanitarian law and limitations of, 147–8  
 paradox of autonomy and, 351–3  
 ‘mangle’ model of material agency, 98–9  
 manufacturers/developers of AWS liability of, 321–4

- role and causal responsibility of, 336–41
- Margalit, Avishai, 114–16, 159, 161, 264–7
- Martens Clause, 377–8
  - administrative law theory and, 269
  - ‘material agency’, ‘mangle’ model of, 98–9
- materiality
  - behaviour-based robotics and, 86–90
  - cybernetics and, 81–4
- Matthias, Andreas, 330
- McCann v. UK*, 267–8
- McGinnis, John, 255–6
- ‘meaningful human control’ principle
  - accountability issues with AWS and, 12–15
  - control of AWS and, 381–3
  - Directive 3000.09 and, 201–2
- mens rea*
  - command responsibility principle and, 232–3, 310–12
  - criminal responsibility of AWS and, 315–21
  - liability of AWS manufacturers/developers and, 321–4
  - perpetration categories and, 308–10
- mental state
  - autonomous weapons systems deployment and, 117–18
  - mens rea* standards concerning AWS liability and, 315–21
- metacognition, technical vs substantive autonomy and, 248–51
- metaphysics, human dignity in framework of, 107
- military applications of AWS
  - ‘constant care’ requirement and, 267–8
  - development of, 5–6
  - future of machine autonomy in, 90–8
  - gaps in responsibility and liability concerning, 68–72
  - law of armed conflict and, 209–20
  - political support for, 132
- military necessity principle
  - ‘appropriate levels of human judgment’ standard and, 200–8
  - bright-line rule and, 278–82
  - control and testing of AWS and, 159–62
  - definitions of, 200–1n.88
  - gaps in responsibility and liability and, 68–72
  - laws of war and, 65–8
  - military robotics and, 91n.63
- minimum information disclosure
  - principles, transparency for autonomous weapons systems and, 183–4
- ‘mission command’ concept, ‘force multiplication’ effect and, 238–42
- monitoring and verification bodies, transparency of AWS
  - development and role of, 179–83
- moral agency
  - autonomy and responsibility and, 304–7
  - child soldiers and issues of, 343n.67
  - human dignity and, 108–13
  - morality of war and, 349–50, 356–61
  - personal autonomy concept and, 124n.5
  - proportionality judgments and, 152–4
  - responsibility and, 62–5
  - in robotics research, 135–7
- moral buffer concept, human–machine interface and, 207n.126
- moratorium on autonomous weapons systems
  - epistemological concepts and, 129–32
  - fact-based legal assessment of AWS and, 165–75
  - future predictions concerning, 378–9
  - individual responsibility principles and, 341–4
  - international dialogue on transparency for AWS and, 178–9
  - overview of reasons for, 122–41
- multi-agent systems (MAS), concepts behind, 54–8
- multilevel autonomy, cognitive-behavioural architecture and, 54–8

- mutual risk principle, deontological  
discourse on AWS and, 256–9
- nature-inspired modelling, multi-agent  
systems and, 54–8
- negligence issues  
accountability for AWS and, 156–8  
behavioural uncertainty and, 288–90  
liability of AWS manufacturers/  
developers and, 321–4  
*mens rea* standards and, 315–21
- neural networks, adaptiveness of, 50–1
- new artificial intelligence  
behaviour-based robotics and, 86–90  
evolution of, 84–6
- Next Generation robotics, standards  
for, 293–6
- non-adaptive systems, environmental  
interaction with, 48–51
- non-combatant/combatant distinction.  
*See also* lawful combatant status  
autonomous weapons systems and,  
100–2, 117–18  
command responsibility doctrine  
and, 235n.60  
epistemology concerning AWS and,  
129–32  
instrumentalist discourse on AWS  
and, 251–6  
law of armed conflict and, 223n.37,  
235n.60
- non-determinism  
in AWS decision-making, 313–15  
multi-agent systems and, 54–8
- non-governmental organizations  
(NGOs)  
AWS standards and, 365–6  
fact-based legal assessment of AWS  
and, 168–9  
international dialogue on  
transparency for AWS and, 178–9
- non-state actors, war as governance  
and, 261–2
- Noorman, Merle, 353–4
- normative ethics  
fact-based legal assessment of AWS  
and, 165–75  
pre-bound discretion and, 275–8
- pre-emptive bans on AWS and,  
122–4, 137–41  
responsibility for AWS and, 357–8  
teleology and, 52–3
- Norvig, Peter, 39–40, 50–1
- Nuclear Non-Proliferation Treaty  
(NPT), 296–9
- Nuclear Suppliers Group (NSG), 296–9
- observe-orient-decide-act (OODA)  
loops  
accountability issues and, 12–15  
in Directive 3000.09, 194–6  
military robotics and, 90–8
- O’Connell, Mary Ellen, 147–8
- Omicini, Andrea, 39–74, 336n.44
- ‘opaque recklessness’ principle, 317–18
- ‘open-textured risk’  
future challenges regarding, 299–300  
standards for management of, 293–6
- operating philosophy and procedures,  
Directive 3000.09 analysis of,  
191–2
- Operation Iraqi Freedom, 189–92
- operators of AWS, individual  
responsibility of, 328n.11
- organizational independence, socio-  
technical infrastructure and, 44
- ‘out-of-the-loop’ context  
accountability issues and, 12–15  
inevitable removal of human role  
and, 209–42  
instrumentalist discourse and, 273–5  
pre-determined decision making  
and, 266–7, 269–75  
technical *vs* substantive autonomy  
debate and, 248–51
- Pagliari, Fabio, 52–3
- Pantazopoulos, Stavros-Evdokimos,  
284–300, 360
- Patriot missile system  
‘friendly fire’ incidents involving,  
100–2, 189–92  
time pressure on vetoes and errors  
by, 36
- peace, law of armed conflict and  
restoration of, 223n.37

- perpetrators
  - circumstantial responsibility and, 325–7
  - indirect perpetration, 308–10, 312–15
- per se AWS prohibitions
  - command responsibility doctrine and, 230–8
  - consequences of, 209–20
  - ‘force multiplication’ effect, 238–42
  - instrumentalist discourse and, 251–6
  - pre-bound discretion and, 273–5
  - ‘wider loop of weapons’ actions, 248–51
- personal autonomy (*p*-autonomy), definitions of, 124–7
- personal care robots, risk regulation for, 293–6
- personhood status
  - circumstantial responsibility for AWS and role of, 331–3
  - ‘electronic person’ concept, 365–6
  - human dignity and, 354–5n.21
- Phalanx close-in weapons system (US Navy), 147, 189–92
  - law of armed conflict obligations and, 214–15
- Phillips, Anne, 354–5n.21
- physical world interaction, military
  - ‘Think-Look-Move-Talk-Work’ domains and, 92–8
- Pickering, Andrew, 98–9
- Plans and Situated Actions* (Suchman), 84–6
- policy guidelines, in Directive 3000.09, ‘Autonomy in weapon systems’, 192–200
- political theory, human dignity in, 354–5n.21
- politics
  - ‘appropriate levels of human judgment’ standard and, 203n.97
  - control and testing of AWS and, 159–62
  - democratic decision-making concerning AWS and, 132–7
  - proportionality judgments and, 149–54
- Pollock, John, 52–3
- post-human theory, responsibility principles and, 357n.57
- practical reasoning
  - vs algorithmic calculations in AWS, 146–54
  - laws of war and issues of, 65–8
  - responsibility and, 62–5
- pre-bound discretion
  - autonomous weapons systems and, 269–75
  - criminal responsibility in AWS and, 313–15
  - diagonal obligations and, 278–82
  - warfare scenarios and, 275–8
- predetermined decision making, AWS and role of, 266–7, 269–75
- predictability, circumstantial responsibility for AWS and issues of, 333–6
- pre-emptive bans on AWS, technical and epistemological issues in, 122–4
- pre-programmed autonomous machines, accountability for AWS and, 154–8
- prisoner of war conventions
  - combatant/non-combatant distinctions and, 235n.60
  - lawful combatant status and, 233–8
- privacy, right to, human dignity and, 105–7
- procedural justice
  - war as governance and, 259–69
- process information, transparency of AWS development and, 179–83
- Proctor, Robert, 133
- procurement responsibility
  - command responsibility principle and, 232–3, 234–5
  - international legal framework for, 296–9
  - ‘mission command’ concept and, 238–42
- product liability, of AWS manufacturers/developers, 321–4

- 'professional vision' concept,
  - autonomous agency and, 98–9
- programmers for AWS
  - circumstantial responsibility and, 330–1, 333–6
  - individual responsibility of, 327–30
  - machine learning autonomy and influence of, 330
  - role and causal responsibility of, 337–8
- proportionality, principle of
  - air strikes and long-range attacks *vs* AWS deployment and, 119–21
  - 'appropriate levels of human judgment' standard and, 200–8
  - AWS deployment and, 117–18, 231–2
  - control and testing of AWS and, 159–62
  - Directive 3000.09 focus on, 198–200
  - epistemology concerning AWS and, 130
  - ethics of AWS and, 122–4
  - fact-based legal assessment of AWS and, 170–2
  - gaps in responsibility and liability and, 68–72
  - instrumentalist discourse on AWS and, 251–6
  - laws of armed conflict and, 65–8, 369–74
  - practical reasoning *vs* algorithmic calculations and, 149–54
  - state responsibility for AWS and, 296–9
- 'protect life' principle, 7–8
  - international humanitarian law and, 15–19
- psychological research
  - dual processing in, 30–4
  - on human decision-making, 23–7
- public law, AWS in context of, 365–6
- purpose-oriented behaviour
  - behaviour-based robotics and, 86–90
  - cybernetics and, 81–4
  - swarm intelligence and, 51–4
- quality of life, AWS as threat to, 116–18
- real-time communication systems,
  - command and control structure and, 196n.63, 203n.98
- 'reasonable attacker' test,
  - proportionality judgments and, 152–4
- reasonable doubt thresholds, machine autonomy and concept of, 351–3
- reasonableness concepts
  - control and testing of AWS and, 159–62
  - instrumentalist discourse on AWS and, 251–6
  - law of armed conflict adherence based on, 373–4
  - mens rea* standard and, 318–19
  - pre-bound discretion and, 269–75
  - proportionality judgments and, 152–4
- recklessness issues
  - accountability for AWS and, 156–8
  - command responsibility doctrine and, 310–12
  - liability of AWS manufacturers/developers and, 321–4
  - mens rea* standards and, 315–21
- Reflections on Violence* (Arendt), 348–9
- reflexive systems, teleology and, 54
- regimentation, teleology and, 52–3
- regulation of AWS
  - lack of incentives for, 145–6
  - risk management and, 288–90
- relationship building, transparency for AWS and, 179–83
- 'reliance-creep', pre-bound discretion and, 273–5
- remotely piloted aircraft systems,
  - adaptiveness of, 48–51
- representationalism, artificial intelligence and, 86–90
- research and development
  - Directive 3000.09 focus on, 196–8
  - temporal uncertainty in current research, 285–6
- responsibility. *See also* collective responsibility; criminal liability; state responsibility; individual responsibility

- autonomous weapons systems as
  - surrender of, 147–8
- autonomy and, 62–5, 304–7
- behavioural uncertainty and, 288–90
- child soldiers and issues of, 341–4
- circumstantial *vs* conceptual
  - responsibility distinction, 325–44
- criminal law doctrines of, 307–8
- division of, in military decisions, 312–13
- future development of AWS and
  - issues of, 356–61
- gaps in, 68–72, 337n.49, 358, 365–6
- instrumentalist discourse
  - concerning AWS and, 251–6
- legal framework for, 367–8
- mens rea* standards and, 315–21
- morality of war and, 349–50
- personal autonomy concept and, 124n.5
- in post-human theory, 357n.57
- role and causal responsibility, 336–41
- ‘responsibility practice’ concept, future AWS development and, 358–9
- responsible command. *See* command responsibility doctrine
- right to life, autonomous weapons systems and, 8–9
- risk creator concept, state responsibility to civilians and, 264–7
- riskless warfare, asymmetric dynamics of, 145–6, 158–62
- risk regulation. *See also* distribution of risk
  - accountability of AWS and, 155–6, 162–3
  - asymmetry of technical failure in AWS and, 355–6
  - distribution of risk and, 159–62
  - fact-based legal assessments of AWS and, 165–75
  - international environmental law and, 290–9
  - legal review requirements for AWS and role of, 227–9
  - locus of compliance validation and, 220–1
  - mens rea* standards and, 315–21
  - military command responsibility for, 209–20
  - ‘open-textured risk’ standards, 293–6
  - role responsibility and, 340n.56
  - uncertainty and, 155–6, 288–90
- Riza, M. Shane, 100–2
- RoboCup, research goals and politics and, 134–5
- Robotic Collaborative Technology Alliance (RCTA) FY2012 Annual Program Plan*, 92
- robotics research. *See also* killer robots
  - autonomy *vs* responsibility debate in, 284–8, 304–7
  - behavioural uncertainty in, 86–90, 287–8
  - communications systems and, 196n.63, 203n.98
  - contemporary trends and
    - applications of, 361–5
  - criminal liability issues and, 324
  - Directive 3000.09 focus on, 194–6
  - Enlightenment theory and, 79–84
  - environmental conditions and
    - robotic behaviour, 127–9
  - ethics of AWS and, 122–4
  - EU funding for, 140–1
  - fact-based legal assessments of AWS and, 165–75
  - future reflections on, 348–9
  - human dignity and, 109–10
  - legal standards for robots, 374–6
  - machine autonomy *vs* human judgment and, 351–3
  - military robotics, machine autonomy in, 90–8
  - moral symmetry/asymmetry in use of robots and, 116–18
  - personal *vs* task autonomy principles and, 124–7
  - political and moral issues in, 135–7
  - sentient machines, 248–51
  - soccer robotics and, 24–5
  - support for, 132

- robotics research (cont.)
  - symbol-processing artificial intelligence and, 84–6
  - temporal framing mechanism in, 133–4
- role responsibility, AWS liability and, 336–41
- The Role of Autonomy in DoD Systems*, 203–6
- Rome Statute, 114–16, 308–10
  - child soldiers' responsibilities under, 341–4
  - command responsibility doctrine and, 310–12
  - indirect perpetration principle under, 308–10
  - mens rea* principles and, 315–21
  - non-military superiors, criminal responsibility of, 333–6
- Rosenblueth, Arturo, 81–4
- Roxin, Claus, 308–10
- rule-making power, pre-bound discretion and delegation of, 272n.133
- rules of engagement (ROE), in Directive 3000.09, 186–9
- Russell, Stuart, 39–40, 50–1, 140–1
- safe, secure and adaptive movement, military 'Think-Look-Move-Talk-Work' domains and, 92–8
- Samsung SGR-A1 robotic platform, 126–7, 147
- Sartor, Giovanni, 39–74, 336n.44
- Saxon, Dan, 91n.63, 185–208, 353–4
- scapegoating
  - child soldiers under international law and, 341–4
  - circumstantial responsibility and, 341
- Scharre, Paul, 27–30, 60, 203–6
- Schmitt, Michael, 147–8, 149–54, 170–2, 235–7, 254–5, 273–5, 278–82
- Schulzke, Marcus, 312–13
- self-determination, autonomy and, 79
- self-guided behaviour
  - behaviour-based robotics and, 87–90
  - munitions classification and, 58–61
- self-learning algorithms, behaviour-based robotics and, 87–90
- self-regulation, systems theory and, 79–84
- self-risk, deontological discourse on AWS and, 256–9
- semi-autonomous weapons systems
  - autonomous weapons systems *vs.*, 58–61, 185n.2, 249n.15
  - definitions of, 186–9
  - Directive 3000.09 definition of, 186–9
  - pre-bound discretion and, 272n.133
  - SoSITE program and, 188n.2
- 'semi-innocent' agency
  - perpetration categories and, 308–10
  - unlawful conduct of AWS and, 312–13
- sender-receiver information model, cybernetics and, 81–4
- sense-think-act cycle, symbol-processing artificial intelligence and, 84–6
- sentientcy, in AWS, 248–51
- servo-mechanisms, cybernetics and, 82–3
- Shannon, Claude, 81–4
- Sharkey, Noel, 60–1, 77–8, 130, 139, 273–5, 304–7, 350–1
- 'should have known' principle
  - circumstantial responsibility for AWS and, 333–6
  - command responsibility and, 233–8
- situated robotics. *See* behaviour-based robotics
- situational awareness, military 'Think-Look-Move-Talk-Work' domains and, 92–8
- sliding autonomy, Directive 3000.09 concept of, 194–6
- soccer robotics, 24–5, 134–5
- social contract, collective view of war and, 260–1n.69
- social systems
  - contemporary trends in AWS and, 361–5
  - multilevel autonomy in, 54–8

- socio-technical infrastructure  
 functional failure in, 62–5  
 gaps in responsibility and liability concerning, 68–72  
 human–machine configuration and, 75–9  
 political and moral debates over, 100–2  
 technology deployment and, 40–4  
 soft power institutions, transparency of AWS and, 179–83  
 software engineering, multilevel autonomy in, 54–8  
 soldiers. *See also* superior/subordinate relationship  
 development and training of, 221–4, 233–8  
 law of armed conflict  
 characterization of, 209–20  
 pre-bound discretion and role of, 278  
 SoSITE program, 188n.2  
 South Korea, autonomous weapons systems in, 126–7, 147, 189–92  
 sovereignty, war as governance and, 264–7  
 Sparrow, Robert, 304–7, 341–4  
 standards development  
 control and testing of AWS and, 159–62  
 legal standards for robots, 374–6  
 LOAC compliance standards, 224–9  
 state responsibility  
 diagonal obligations toward combatants and, 278–82  
 future challenges in AWS  
 development and, 299–300  
 international environmental law and AWS development and, 291–3  
 legal framework for, 296–9  
 legal standards for robots and, 374–6  
 risk management and incentives for, 288–90  
 war as governance and, 264–7  
 stigmery, multi-agent systems and, 54–8  
 stochastic reasoning  
 autonomy and responsibility issues and, 304–7  
 multi-agent systems and, 54–8  
*Strafgesetzbuch* (SGB) (German Criminal Code), 308–10  
 strict liability  
 accountability for AWS and, 156n.36  
 autonomous weapons systems and limits on, 68–72  
 subject/object relations, agency and, 98–9  
 substantive autonomy principle, technological systems and, 248–51  
 Suchman, Lucy, 75–102, 353–4  
 Sullins, John, 304–7  
 superior/subordinate relationship  
 child soldiers' responsibilities and, 341–4  
 circumstantial responsibility for AWS and, 331–3  
 command responsibility doctrine and, 233–8, 310–12  
 military training and, 221–4  
 pre-bound discretion and role of, 278  
 role responsibility and, 338–9  
 unlawful conduct of AWS and, 312–13  
 supervised machine technology, accountability issues with, 154–8  
 supervisory control of weapons  
 'appropriate levels of human judgment' standard and, 200–8  
 deliberative processes, 34–7  
 Directive 3000.09 analysis of, 191–2  
 technical vs substantive autonomy and, 248–51  
 surgical precision paradigm, autonomous weapons systems and, 15–19  
 'surrender', diagonal state-combatant obligations and, 280–2  
 swarm intelligence  
 collectives behaviour and, 51–4  
 machine autonomy and, 330–1  
 SoSITE program and, 188n.2  
 symbiotic human–machine partnership, laws of war and, 65–8



- symbol-processing artificial intelligence, 84–6
- system theory, autonomy and, 79–84
- tactical effect of AWS, command responsibility for, 224–9
- Tamburrini, Guglielmo, 122–41, 155, 284n.3, 293–6, 350–1
- targeting capabilities  
of autonomous weapons systems, 8–9  
cognitive skills and, 44–8  
deliberative reasoning concerning, 34–5  
instrumentalist discourse and, 273–5  
supervisory control by humans over, 34–7
- target-recognition systems, adaptiveness of, 50–1
- target selection and engagement  
cognition and independence of AWS and, 58–61  
in Directive 3000.09, 186–9  
fact-based legal assessments of AWS and, 165–75  
human–machine interface and, 77  
law of armed conflict obligations and, 209–20  
legal assessment of AWS and, 170–1  
practical reasoning *vs* algorithmic calculation in, 147  
servo-mechanisms and, 81–4
- task analysis, human/computer comparisons, 27
- ‘task and purpose’ principle, LOAC compliance confidence and, 224–9
- task autonomy (*t*-autonomy), 124–7, 284n.3
- ‘technological imperative’, fact-based legal assessment of AWS and, 172–5
- technological systems  
autonomy of, 248–51, 284–8  
environmental risk in, 290–9  
fact-based legal assessment of AWS and development of, 172–5  
future reflections on, 348–9  
instrumentalist discourse on, 251–6  
legal review requirements for AWS and, 227–9  
limitations as human substitute, 209–20  
machine autonomy *vs* human judgment in, 353–4  
task autonomy and independence of, 40–4, 125n.6  
transparency of information, 179–83  
uncertainty in, 284–8  
utilitarian *vs* deontological debate concerning, 245–8  
‘telechiric machines’, 356n.23
- teleology  
cognitive-behavioural architecture and, 51–4  
cybernetics and, 79–84
- temporal framing mechanism  
control systems for AWS and, 313–15  
Directive 3000.09 guidelines and, 206–8  
ignorance production and, 133–4, 135–7  
machine autonomy and, 351–3
- temporal uncertainty, autonomy and, 285–6
- ‘Think-Look-Move-Talk-Work’ domains, military robotics and, 92–8
- Thurnher, Jeffrey, 147–8, 149–54, 170–2, 254–5, 273–5, 278–82
- Tomahawk missile system, human supervision of, 35–6
- tort law  
ascribing responsibility in, 342n.62  
AWS manufacturers/developers liability and, 321–4  
liability for harm in, 64–5  
transnational interdependence  
pre-bound discretion and, 269–75  
responsibility practices and, 360  
transboundary harm in international environmental law and, 290–9  
war as governance and, 264–7

- transparency for autonomous weapons systems  
 future challenges to, 183–4  
 international dialogue about, 175–83  
 overview of, 164–83  
 responsibility practices and, 360–1
- treaty law  
 sovereignty and, 264–7  
 transparency concerning AWS and, 175–83
- Tschwane Principles, 176n.26
- uncertainty  
 autonomous weapons systems and dimensions of, 284–8  
 future challenges in AWS development and, 299–300  
 international environmental law principles and, 290–9  
 risk management and, 288–90  
 robotics standards and, 293–6
- UNICEF Paris Principles, 341–4
- United Kingdom  
 ascribing responsibility in tort law of, 342n.62  
 autonomous weapons research in, 24–5  
 Brimstone ‘fire and forget’ missiles in, 147  
 definitions of AWS in, 186n.4  
 human control of autonomous weapons in, 37–8  
 meaningful human control paradigm and, 381–3  
 military necessity principle in, 200–1n.88
- United Nations Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 105–7
- United States  
 human control of autonomous weapons in, 37–8  
 meaningful human control paradigm and, 381–3
- United States Model Penal Code (MPC), 315–21
- unlawful combatant figure, 75n.3
- Unmanned Systems Integrated Roadmap* (DoD), 75, 76, 90–8
- Unmanned Systems Integrated Roadmap FY2011–2036* (DoD), 194–6
- unmanned weapons systems  
 Directive 3000.09 and development of, 192–200  
 international dialogue on transparency for AWS and, 178–9  
 legal assessment of, 170–1n.13  
 unpredictability of AWS deployment, moral asymmetry in, 117–18
- UN Secretary-General Advisory Board on Disarmament Matters, 178–9
- US Army Doctrinal Publication 6-0 (GDP 6.0), 238–42
- use-of-force authority. *See* force, use of
- US *Vincennes* incident, 192n.38
- utilitarian ethics, instrumentalist discourse on AWS and, 253–4n.35
- values, desires *vs.*, 52–3
- Veitch, Scott, 340–1
- verification and validation procedures. *See also* compliance confidence principle  
 Directive 3000.09 focus on, 194–6, 198–200  
 LOAC compliance confidence enablers and, 224–9  
 locus of compliance validation, 220–1
- victory, asymmetric conflicts and ambiguity of, 261–2
- Vienna Declaration of 1993 World Conference on Human Rights, 107
- violence, technology and, 348–9
- Von Bertalanffy, Ludwig, 79–84
- Walzer, Michael, 159, 161, 264–7, 349–50
- warfare scenarios. *See also* combat conditions  
 administrative power of warfare, 259–69  
 AWS epistemology and, 129–32  
 circumstantial responsibility for AWS and, 333–6

- warfare scenarios (cont.)  
 diagonal state-combatant obligations  
 and, 280–2  
 Directive 3000.09 concern over,  
 196–8  
 historical context for, 206n.119  
 law of armed conflict and, 209–20  
 legal standards for robots and, 374–6  
 pre-bound discretion and, 275–8  
 robotic behavioural uncertainty and,  
 127–9  
 Waxman, Matthew, 339–40  
 weapons review procedures, for AWS,  
 379–81
- weapons-specific treaties,  
 international dialogue on  
 transparency for AWS and,  
 175–83  
 Weber, Jutta, 75–102, 353–4  
 ‘what you see is all there is’ (WYSIATI)  
 terminology, automatic reasoning  
 and, 32–4  
 Wiener, Norbert, 79–84  
 Wilde, Oscar, 127–9  
 Wilke, Christiane, 75n.3  
 Williams, Glanville, 308–10  
*Yamashita* case, 232–3, 338–9