

AUTONOMOUS WEAPONS SYSTEMS

The intense and polemical debate over the legality and morality of weapons systems to which human cognitive functions are delegated (up to and including the capacity to select targets and release weapons without further human intervention) addresses a phenomenon which does not yet exist but which is widely claimed to be emergent. This ground-breaking collection combines contributions from roboticists, legal scholars, philosophers and sociologists of science in order to recast the debate in a manner that clarifies key areas and articulates questions for future research. The contributors develop insights with direct policy relevance, including who bears responsibility for autonomous weapons systems, whether they would violate fundamental ethical and legal norms, and how to regulate their development. It is essential reading for those concerned about this emerging phenomenon and its consequences for the future of humanity.

NEHAL BHUTA is Professor of Public International Law at the European University Institute, Florence, and Co-Director of the EU's Academy of European Law.

SUSANNE BECK is Professor of Criminal Law and Procedure, Comparative Criminal Law and the Philosophy of Law at Leibniz University Hanover.

ROBIN GEIß is Professor of International Law and Security at the University of Glasgow.

HIN-YAN LIU is Associate Professor at the Centre for International Law, Conflict and Crisis, Faculty of Law, University of Copenhagen.

CLAUS KREß is Professor of Criminal Law and Public International Law at the University of Cologne, where he is also Director of the Institute of International Peace and Security Law.

AUTONOMOUS WEAPONS SYSTEMS

Law, Ethics, Policy

Edited by
NEHAL BHUTA
SUSANNE BECK
ROBIN GEIß
HIN-YAN LIU
and
CLAUS KREß



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-15356-1 — Autonomous Weapons Systems
Edited by Nehal Bhuta , Susanne Beck , Robin Geiß , Hin-Yan Liu , Claus Kreß
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107153561

© Cambridge University Press 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2016

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-107-15356-1 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-316-60765-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

CONTENTS

<i>List of contributors</i>	<i>page</i>	viii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>		x
PART I Introduction		1
1 Autonomous weapons systems: living a dignified life and dying a dignified death		
CHRISTOF HEYNS		3
PART II Meanings of autonomy and human cognition under automation		21
2 Staying in the loop: human supervisory control of weapons		
NOEL SHARKEY		23
3 The autonomy of technological systems and responsibilities for their use		
GIOVANNI SARTOR AND ANDREA OMICINI		39
4 Human–machine autonomies		
LUCY SUCHMAN AND JUTTA WEBER		75
PART III Autonomous weapons systems and human dignity		103
5 Are autonomous weapons systems a threat to human dignity?		
DIETER BIRNBACHER		105

- 6 On banning autonomous weapons systems: from deontological to wide consequentialist reasons
 GUGLIELMO TAMBURRINI 122
- PART IV Risk, transparency and legal compliance in the regulation of autonomous weapons systems 143**
- 7 Judgment, liability and the risks of riskless warfare
 PABLO KALMANOVITZ 145
- 8 Autonomous weapons systems and transparency: towards an international dialogue
 SARAH KNUCKEY 164
- 9 A human touch: autonomous weapons, DoD Directive 3000.09 and the interpretation of ‘appropriate levels of human judgment over the use of force’
 DAN SAXON 185
- 10 Autonomous weapons systems: managing the inevitability of ‘taking the man out of the loop’
 GEOFFREY S. CORN 209
- PART V New frameworks for collective responsibility 243**
- 11 The obligation to exercise discretion in warfare: why autonomous weapons systems are unlawful
 ELIAV LIEBLICH AND EYAL BENVENISTI 245
- 12 Autonomy and uncertainty: increasingly autonomous weapons systems and the international legal regulation of risk
 NEHAL BHUTA AND STAVROS-EVDOKIMOS PANTAZOPOULOS 284

CONTENTS

vii

**PART VI New frameworks for individual
responsibility 301**

- 13 Autonomous weapons systems: new frameworks for
individual responsibility

NEHA JAIN 303

- 14 Refining responsibility: differentiating two types of
responsibility issues raised by autonomous weapons
systems

HIN-YAN LIU 325

PART VII Conclusion 345

- 15 Present futures: concluding reflections and open questions
on autonomous weapons systems

NEHAL BHUTA, SUSANNE BECK AND ROBIN
GEIß 347

Index 384

CONTRIBUTORS

SUSANNE BECK Professor of Criminal Law and Procedure, Comparative Criminal Law and Philosophy of Law, Leibniz University of Hanover

EYAL BENVENISTI Anny and Paul Yanowicz Professor of Human Rights, Tel Aviv University Faculty of Law, Whewell Professor, Cambridge University Faculty of Law

NEHAL BHUTA Professor of Public International Law, European University Institute

DIETER BIRNBACHER Professor of Philosophy, University of Düsseldorf

GEOFFREY S. CORN Professor of Law and Presidential Research Professor, South Texas College of Law

ROBIN GEIß Professor of International Law and Security, University of Glasgow Law School

CHRISTOF HEYNS Professor of Human Rights Law, University of Pretoria, and United Nations Special Rapporteur on extrajudicial, summary or arbitrary executions

NEHA JAIN Associate Professor of Law, University of Minnesota Law School

PABLO KALMANOVITZ Associate Professor of Political Science, Universidad de Los Andes, Bogotá

SARAH KNUCKEY Faculty co-director of the Human Rights Institute, Lief Cabraser Associate Clinical Professor of Law and Director of the Human Rights Clinic, Columbia Law School

CLAUS KREß Chair for German and International Criminal Law, Director of the Institute for International Peace and Security Law, University of Cologne

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

ix

ELIAV LIEBLICH Assistant Professor, Radzyner Law School,
Interdisciplinary Center (IDC)

HIN-YAN LIU Associate Professor, Faculty of Law, University of
Copenhagen

ANDREA OMICINI Professor of Computer Engineering, Department of
Computer Science and Engineering, University of Bologna

STAVROS-EVDOKIMOS PANTAZOPOULOS PhD Researcher, European
University Institute

GIOVANNI SARTOR Professor of Legal Informatics and Legal Theory,
European University Institute, and Professor in Legal Informatics,
University of Bologna

DAN SAXON Assistant Professor and Tutor of International
Humanitarian, Human Rights and Criminal Law, Leiden University
College

NOEL SHARKEY Emeritus Professor of Artificial Intelligence and Robotics
and Professor of Public Engagement, University of Sheffield, and
Chairman of the International Committee for Robot Arms Control

LUCY SUCHMAN Professor of Anthropology of Science and Technology,
Department of Sociology, University of Lancaster

GUGLIELMO TAMBURRINI Professor of Philosophy of Science and Logic,
Department of Electrical Engineering and Information Technologies,
University of Naples Federico II

JUTTA WEBER Professor of the Sociology of Media, Department of Media
Studies, University of Paderborn

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The editors gratefully acknowledge the financial support of the Thyssen Foundation, which provided core funding for the research workshop that culminated in this book. The workshop was convened on 24 and 25 April 2014, at the European University Institute in San Domenico di Fiesole, Tuscany, Italy. The project was also supported by the Academy of European Law of the European University Institute, the Global Governance Program of the European University Institute and through a grant from European University Institute's Research Council.

Anny Bremner, Joyce Davies and Valentina Spiga expertly managed the complex logistics of the project. Stacy Belden copy-edited the manuscript, and Anny Bremner greatly helped us in finalizing the text. Stavros Pantazopoulos corrected the text at the eleventh hour.

The editors also thank Elizabeth Spicer and Finola O'Sullivan of Cambridge University Press for their strong editorial support for this project from its inception. The cover art kindly provided by Dario Tironi is gratefully acknowledged.