THEOLOGIES OF ANCIENT GREEK RELIGION

Studied for many years by scholars with Christianising assumptions, Greek religion has often been said to be quite unlike Christianity: a matter of particular actions (orthopraxy), rather than particular beliefs (orthodoxies). This volume dares to think that, both in and through religious practices and in and through religious thought and literature, the ancient Greeks engaged in a sustained conversation about the nature of the gods and how to represent and worship them. It excavates the attitudes towards the gods implicit in cult practice and analyses the beliefs about the gods embedded in such diverse texts and contexts as comedy, tragedy, rhetoric, philosophy, ancient Greek blood sacrifice, myth and other forms of storytelling. The result is a richer picture of the supernatural in ancient Greece, and a whole series of fresh questions about how views of and relations to the gods changed over time.

ESTHER EIDINOW is Associate Professor in Ancient Greek History at the University of Nottingham. She has a particular interest in ancient Greek religion and magic. Her publications include Oracles, Curses, and Risk Among the Ancient Greeks (2007, rev. edn 2013), Luck, Fate and Fortune: Antiquity and its Legacy (2011) and Envy, Poison and Death: Women on Trial in Ancient Athens (2015). She has co-edited (jointly with J. Kindt) The Oxford Handbook of Ancient Greek Religion (2015).

JULIA KINDT is Associate Professor and Chair of the Department of Classics and Ancient History at the University of Sydney. Her publications include Rethinking Greek Religion (Cambridge, 2012) and Revisiting Delphi: Religion and Storytelling in Ancient Greece (Cambridge, 2016). She has co-edited (jointly with E. Eidinow) The Oxford Handbook of Ancient Greek Religion (2015) and is a member of the editorial board of the Journal of Ancient History and a senior editor of the Oxford Research Encyclopaedia of Religion.

ROBIN OSBORNE is Professor of Ancient History at the University of Cambridge and a Fellow of King’s College and of the British Academy. His work ranges widely over Greek history, archaeology and art history. His most recent books are Athens and Athenian Democracy (Cambridge, 2010), The History Written on the Classical Greek Body (Cambridge, 2011) and Greek History: The Basics (2014).
THEOLOGIES OF ANCIENT GREEK RELIGION

Edited by

ESTHER EIDINOW
University of Nottingham

JULIA KINDT
University of Sydney

ROBIN OSBORNE
University of Cambridge
CONTENTS

List of figures
Notes on contributors
Preface
Note on spellings and abbreviations

1 Introduction: what might we mean by the theologies of ancient Greek religion? 1
ESTHER EIDINOW, JULIA KINDT, ROBIN OSBORNE AND SHAUL TOR

2 The story of theology and the theology of the story 12
JULIA KINDT

3 Theologies of the family in Homer and Hesiod 35
BARBARA GRAZIOSI

4 Who’s afraid of Cypselus? Contested theologies and dynastic dedications 62
RENAUD GAGNÉ

5 Heraclitus on Apollo’s signs and his own: contemplating oracles and philosophical inquiry 89
SHAUL TOR

6 The ‘theology’ of the Dionysia and Old Comedy 117
ERIC CSAPO

7 Polytheism and tragedy 153
SIMON GOLDHILL

8 Gods and men in ancient Greek conceptions of lawgiving 176
HANNAH WILLEY
Contents

9 Popular theologies: the gift of divine envy          205
ESTHER EIDINOW

10 Sacrificial theologies                             233
ROBIN OSBORNE

11 Theologies of statues in Classical Greek art       249
MILETTE GAIFMAN

12 The gods in the Athenian assembly                   281
GUNTHER MARTIN

13 Plato and the secularisation of Greek theology     301
RICK BENITEZ

14 Providence and religion in Middle Platonism         317
GEORGE BOYS-STONES

15 Narratives of continuity and discontinuity         339
PETER VAN NUFELEN

Bibliography                                         359

Index                                                403
FIGURES

6.1 Attic black-figured column krater, Lydos, ca. 550 BCE. New York MMA 31.11.11. Image © The Metropolitan Museum of Art. page 120

6.2 Attic black-figured cup, ca. 560 BCE, Florence 3897. Courtesy of the Soprintendenza per i Beni Archeologici della Toscana. 121

6.3 Attic black-figured amphora, Swing Painter, 525–520 BCE, Christchurch 41/57. Courtesy of the James Logie Memorial Collection, University of Canterbury. 122


11.3a, b, c, d Calyx krater attributed to the Painter of the Birth of Dionysos, ca. 380 BCE. Amsterdam, Allard Pierson Museum no. 2579. Courtesy of Allard Pierson Museum, Amsterdam. 257


11.5 Plate attributed to Paseas, late sixth century BCE. New Haven, Yale University Art Gallery, 1913.169, attributed to Paseas. 260

11.6a Parthenon metope, North 25. Courtesy of Deutsches Archäologisches Institut Athens. 271

11.6b Parthenon metope, North 24. Courtesy of Deutsches Archäologisches Institut Athens. 271
List of Figures

11.7a Helen at the statue of Athena. Red-figured oinochoe related to the Heimarmene Painter, ca. 430 BCE. Vatican, Museo Gregoriano Etrusco no. 16535. Courtesy of Art Resource N.Y. 274

11.7b Menelaos encountering Eros and Aphrodite. Red-figured oinochoe related to the Heimarmene Painter, ca. 430 BCE. Vatican, Museo Gregoriano Etrusco no. 16535. Courtesy of Art Resource N.Y. 275
NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

RICK BENITEZ is Professor and Chair of Philosophy at the University of Sydney. He specialises in Plato, with current emphasis on myth, poetry, religion and hermeneutics.

GEORGE BOYS-STONES is Professor of Ancient Philosophy at Durham University. He is currently working on a new study of ‘Middle’ Platonism for the series Cambridge Source Books in Post-Hellenistic Philosophy.

ERIC CSAPO is Professor of Classics at the University of Sydney and has special interests in myth, ancient drama and theatre history. He has recently co-edited the volume *Greek Theatre in the Fourth Century BC* (2014).

ESTHER EIDINOW is Associate Professor in Ancient Greek History at Nottingham University. She has particular interests in ancient Greek religion and magic. Her publications include *Oracles, Curses, and Risk Among the Ancient Greeks* (2007, rev. edn 2013), *Luck, Fate and Fortune: Antiquity and its Legacy* (2011) and *Envy, Poison, and Death: Women on Trial in Classical Athens* (2015).

RENAUD GAGNÉ is Reader in Classics at the University of Cambridge and Fellow of Pembroke College. He works on early Greek poetry and Greek religion. He is the author of *Ancestral Fault in Ancient Greece* (2013) and co-editor of *Sacrifices humains: Perspectives croisées et représentations* (with Pierre Bonnechère, 2013) and *Choral Mediations in Greek Tragedy* (with Marianne Hopman, 2013).

MILETTE GAIFMAN is Associate Professor of Greek Art and Archaeology in the Departments of Classics and History of Art at Yale University. She is the author of *Aniconism in Greek*
Notes on contributors


SIMON GOLDFILL is Director of the Centre for Research in the Arts, Social Sciences and Humanities (CRASSH), Professor of Greek Literature and Culture and, from 2014 to 2019, John Harvard Visiting Professor at the University of Cambridge. He is a Fellow of King’s College, Cambridge. His many books include most recently Sophocles and the Language of Tragedy (2012), Victorian Culture and Classical Antiquity (2011) and The Buried Life of Things: How Objects Made History in Nineteenth-Century Britain (2014).

BARBARA GRAZIOSI is Professor of Classics at the University of Durham. She currently directs a major project funded by the European Research Council entitled Living Poets: A New Approach to Ancient Poetry. Her books include Inventing Homer: The Early Reception of Epic (2002), The Gods of Olympus (2013) and, with Johannes Haubold, The Resonance of Epic (2005) and Homer Iliad Book VI (2010).

JULIA KINDT is Associate Professor and Chair of the Department of Classics and Ancient History at the University of Sydney. She has a PhD in Classics from the University of Cambridge and an MA in Ancient History from the University of Munich. Her publications include Rethinking Greek Religion (2012) and Revisiting Delphi: Religion and Storytelling in Ancient Greece (2016). She has co-edited (jointly with Esther Eidinow) The Oxford Handbook of Ancient Greek Religion and is a member of the editorial board of the Journal of Ancient History and a senior editor of the Oxford Research Encyclopaedia of Religion.

GUNTHER MARTIN is an Early Career Professor at the University of Zurich. He has published Divine Talk: Religious Argumentation in Demosthenes and is currently working on a commentary on Euripides’ Ion and co-editing the new fragments of the historian Dexippus.
Notes on contributors

ROBIN OSBORNE is Professor of Ancient History at the University of Cambridge. His books include *The History Written on the Classical Greek Body* (2011), and he is the editor, with P. J. Rhodes, of *Greek Historical Inscriptions 404–323 B.C.* (2003) and *Greek Historical Inscriptions 478–404 B.C.* (forthcoming).

SHAUL TOR is Lecturer in Ancient Philosophy in the Classics and Philosophy Departments at King’s College London. His research focuses in particular on theology, religion and epistemology in early Greek philosophy. He has published papers in this area as well as on Pyrrhonian scepticism.

PETER VAN NUFFELEN is Professor of Ancient History at Ghent University, Belgium. His current research focuses mainly on Late Antiquity and, in particular, late ancient historiography. His most recent book is *Penser la tolérance durant l’antiquité tardive* (forthcoming).

HANNAH WILLEY is Lecturer in Ancient History at the University of Cambridge and a Fellow of Murray Edwards College. Her research focuses on various aspects of ancient Greek religion and society. She is currently working on a monograph on the interrelation of law and religion in the Greek city state.
This volume arises out of a conference in Cambridge on 11–13 July 2012, which was itself a product of conversations that the three editors had enjoyed, both separately and as a group, about the need to discuss more openly the theological ideas implicit as well as explicit within ancient Greek writing and practice.

Greek religion, we are repeatedly reminded, knew no dogma, no creed and no holy literature. Because of such obvious differences between ancient Greek religion and modern religions, scholarly efforts to establish the nature of Greek theological speculation have in the past been largely restricted to students of philosophy and tragedy. The bounded and relatively self-contained universe of these two genres seems to be more in line with the kind of theological discourse familiar to us from other religious contexts, most notably, perhaps, that of Christianity. It has been common, and strongly encouraged in certain traditions of Christianity, for a line to be drawn between the activity of Christian theology, which goes on behind closed doors in faculties of Divinity, and the activity of worshipping God, which, it is sometimes suggested, should not be unduly complicated by theological considerations. Given the political and other turmoil caused by disputes over the nature of Christ in the early Church, it is perhaps not surprising that Christians should have desired to restrict the impact of theological argument, but the embedding of this idea that worship of god can occur without issues of the nature of that god being raised is implausible. In terms of keeping the peace and avoiding schism or heresy-hunting, there is certainly no need to keep discussions of theology apart from discussions of religious practice when studying the ancient Greek world.

This book seeks to ask how the kind of reflection that informed the representation of divinity in the various contexts
of day-to-day worship and other contacts with the gods relates to the more explicit discussions in epic, tragedy and philosophy. In separate chapters the contributors seek to identify some of the basic theological assumptions and issues that form the background to both literary and philosophical theorising and to the range of religious practices known from ancient Greece. Behind all these considerations looms the much larger question of how the modern conception of ‘theology’ relates to the religious cultures of ancient Greece.

One major reason why scholars have been content to leave theology on one side is that investigating theology raises a number of difficult methodological issues. This book sets out to identify not only the existence of religious beliefs that have informed the representations and manifestations of the religious in Greek antiquity, but also the strategies in which such beliefs can be recovered. We aim to understand the manifold ways in which these and other representations of the religious draw on and participate in a much broader conversation in ancient Greece about the nature of the divine and its availability to human knowledge.

The wide-ranging chapters do not constitute a systematic discussion of all possible relevant activities or types of evidence, but they do aim to explore Greek discourse(s) about the nature of the divine as manifested in a variety of locations and forms, encompassing both the literary and material evidence. By bringing together scholars with an interest in ancient Greek religion as it evolved throughout Greek literature, drama, philosophy and the material evidence, we hope to bridge the gap between those areas of Greek theological discourse that have been well-researched and new and unmapped territory.

We are grateful to all who took part in the Cambridge conference, to contributors to this volume who have joined the project since and to Helen Flitton, Marianna Prizio, Kim Richardson and Michael Sharp.

Esther Eidinow
Julia Kindt
Robin Osborne

xvi
NOTE ON SPELLINGS AND ABBREVIATIONS

The transliteration of Greek names is a notorious problem. Familiar names are here Latinised, but less familiar names are not. We have tried to be consistent about the treatment of individual names but have not aimed at overall consistency.

Abbreviations of the names of Greek authors follow LSJ.
Abbreviations of the titles of classical journals follow L’Année philologique.

Other abbreviations


