

An Introduction to Decision Theory

Now revised and updated, this introduction to decision theory is both accessible and comprehensive, covering topics including decision making under ignorance and risk, the foundations of utility theory, the debate over subjective and objective probability, Bayesianism, causal decision theory, game theory, and social choice theory. No mathematical skills are assumed, with all concepts and results explained in nontechnical and intuitive as well as more formal ways, and there are now over 140 exercises with solutions, along with a glossary of key terms and concepts. This second edition includes a new chapter on risk aversion as well as updated discussions of numerous central ideas, including Newcomb's problem, prisoner's dilemmas, and Arrow's impossibility theorem. The book will appeal particularly to philosophy students but also to readers in a range of disciplines, from computer science and psychology to economics and political science.

MARTIN PETERSON holds the Sue and Harry Bovay Chair in the Department of Philosophy at Texas A&M University. He is the author of several books on decision theory, ethics, and risk, including *Non-Bayesian Decision Theory* (2008), *The Dimensions of Consequentialism* (Cambridge 2013), and *The Ethics of Technology* (2017).

An Introduction to Decision Theory

Second Edition

MARTIN PETERSON

Texas A&M University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryaganj, Delhi - 110002, India
79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107151598
DOI: 10.1017/9781316585061

© Martin Peterson 2009, 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First edition published 2009
Second edition published 2017

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-107-15159-8 Hardback
ISBN 978-1-316-60620-9 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>Preface</i>	page ix
<i>Preface to the Second Edition</i>	x
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Normative and Descriptive Decision Theory	3
1.2 Rational and Right Decisions	4
1.3 Risk, Ignorance and Uncertainty	5
1.4 Social Choice Theory and Game Theory	8
1.5 A Very Brief History of Decision Theory	10
2 The Decision Matrix	17
2.1 States	19
2.2 Outcomes	22
2.3 Acts	28
2.4 Rival Formalizations	31
3 Decisions under Ignorance	41
3.1 Dominance	42
3.2 Maximin and Leximin	44
3.3 Maximax and the Optimism–Pessimism Rule	47
3.4 Minimax Regret	50
3.5 The Principle of Insufficient Reason	54
3.6 Randomized Acts	57
4 Decisions under Risk	65
4.1 Maximizing What?	66
4.2 Why is it Rational to Maximize Expected Utility?	72
4.3 The Axiomatic Approach	75
4.4 The Allais Paradox	80
4.5 The Ellsberg Paradox	82

vi Contents

4.6	The St. Petersburg Paradox	84
4.7	The Pasadena Paradox	88
4.8	The Two-Envelope Paradox	91
5	Utility	97
5.1	How to Construct an Ordinal Scale	98
5.2	Von Neumann and Morgenstern's Interval Scale	101
5.3	Can Utility be Measured on a Ratio Scale?	113
5.4	Can We Define Utility Without Being Able to Measure It?	117
6	The Mathematics of Probability	124
6.1	The Probability Calculus	125
6.2	Conditional Probability	130
6.3	Bayes' Theorem	132
6.4	The Problem of Unknown Priors	134
7	The Philosophy of Probability	141
7.1	The Classical Interpretation	142
7.2	The Frequency Interpretation	144
7.3	The Propensity Interpretation	147
7.4	Logical and Epistemic Interpretations	149
7.5	Subjective Probability	151
8	Bayesianism and Pragmatic Arguments	174
8.1	Why Should We Accept the Axioms?	177
8.2	Must a Rational Preference be Transitive?	179
8.3	Must a Rational Preference be Complete?	183
8.4	Must a Rational Preference Satisfy the Independence Axiom?	190
8.5	Can Bayesians be Money Pumped?	194
8.6	Do Bayesians Put the Cart Before the Horse?	197
8.7	Non-Bayesian Decision Theory	200
9	Causal vs. Evidential Decision Theory	206
9.1	Newcomb's Problem	206
9.2	Causal Decision Theory	209
9.3	Evidential Decision Theory	211
10	Risk Aversion	220
10.1	Actuarial Risk Aversion	220
10.2	Aversion Against Utility Risks	225
10.3	Epistemic Risk Aversion	228

11 Game Theory I: Basic Concepts and Zero-sum Games	234
11.1 The Prisoner's Dilemma	236
11.2 A Taxonomy of Games	242
11.3 Common Knowledge and Dominance Reasoning	246
11.4 Two-Person Zero-sum Games	252
11.5 Mixed Strategies and the Minimax Theorem	254
12 Game Theory II: Nonzero-sum and Cooperative Games	263
12.1 The Nash Equilibrium	263
12.2 The Battle of the Sexes and Chicken	267
12.3 The Bargaining Problem	270
12.4 Iterated Games	274
12.5 Game Theory and Evolution	279
12.6 Game Theory and Ethics	281
13 Social Choice Theory	287
13.1 The Social Choice Problem	289
13.2 Arrow's Impossibility Theorem	292
13.3 Sen on Liberalism and the Pareto Principle	298
13.4 Harsanyi's Utilitarian Theorems	301
14 Overview of Descriptive Decision Theory	311
14.1 Observed Violations of the Expected Utility Principle	311
14.2 Prospect Theory	314
14.3 Violations of Transitivity and Completeness	316
14.4 The Relevance of Descriptive Decision Theory	318
<i>Appendix: Glossary</i>	323
<i>Further Reading</i>	329
<i>Index</i>	336

Preface

This book is an introduction to decision theory. My ambition is to present the subject in a way that is accessible to readers with a background in a wide range of disciplines, such as philosophy, economics, psychology, political science and computer science. That said, I am myself a philosopher, so it is hardly surprising that I have chosen to discuss philosophical and foundational aspects of decision theory in some detail. In my experience, readers interested in specific applications of the subject may find it helpful to start with a thorough discussion of the basic principles before moving on to their chosen field of specialization.

My ambition is to explain everything in a way that is accessible to everyone, including readers with limited knowledge of mathematics. I therefore do my best to emphasize the intuitive ideas underlying the technical concepts and results before I state them in a more formal vocabulary. This means that some points are made twice, first in a nontechnical manner and thereafter in more rigorous ways. I think it is important that students of decision theory learn quite a bit about the technical results of the subject, but most of those results can no doubt be explained much better than what is usually offered in textbooks. I have tried to include only theorems and proofs that are absolutely essential, and I have made an effort to prove the theorems in ways I believe are accessible for beginners. In my experience, this sometimes comes into conflict with the ambition to present technical material in the minimalist style usually preferred by experts.

Most of the technical results are presented in twenty “boxes” clearly separated from the main body of the text. In principle, it should be possible to read the book without reading the boxes, although they hopefully deepen the student’s understanding of the subject. I have also included over 100 exercises (and solutions), most of which should be fairly straightforward. Unlike other textbooks, no exercise asks the reader to prove some theorem

I did not bother to prove myself. Finally, the Appendix contains a glossary in which I try to briefly explain some of the key terms and concepts. I believe the glossary might be particularly useful for readers wishing to study only a selected number of the chapters.

A large number of people deserve my sincere thanks. First of all, I would like to thank all the students who have contributed their invaluable input to this project. I have done my best to improve the manuscript in accordance with the advice I have received. I am also deeply indebted to a number of fellow teachers and colleagues: Barbro Björkman, Joanna Burch Brown, John Cantwell, Stephen John, Elseijn Kingma, Holger Rosencrantz, and Per Sandin. I am also very grateful for valuable comments on the original proposal and draft manuscript given by four anonymous readers. Finally, I wish to thank Hilary Gaskin at Cambridge University Press, who suggested I should write this textbook. Without her enthusiasm and encouragement, this book would never have been written. The project proved to be both challenging and time-consuming but always highly enjoyable.

Preface to the Second Edition

In the eight years since the first edition was published I have received a large number of emails with mostly positive feedback, often accompanied by suggestions for improvements. Based on this helpful correspondence, I have decided to add a chapter on risk aversion (Chapter 10) to the second edition. I have also revised and updated the other chapters with new material. The chapters on pragmatic arguments and Bayesian decision theory have been merged into a single chapter (Chapter 8), and in the chapter on expected utility theory (Chapter 4) I have added about ten pages on the St. Petersburg and Pasadena paradoxes. The discussion of Newcomb's problem (in Chapter 9) has been updated with new examples, and the discussions of indefinitely iterated prisoner's dilemmas (in Chapter 12) and Arrow's impossibility theorem (in Chapter 13) have been somewhat extended. I have also added about forty new exercises.

I would like to thank my research assistant Robert Reed for helping me to 'translate' the text from British English to American English, and Dong An, Ben Eggleston, Jelle de Boer, Ismail Guler, Johan E. Gustafsson, Jack Hamilton, Karsten Klint Jensen, Luke Muehlhauser and Manel Pau for helpful feedback.