

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-15065-2 - To Whom Do Children Belong? : Parental Rights, Civic Education and Children's Autonomy

Melissa Moschella

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

TO WHOM DO CHILDREN BELONG?

Most people believe that parents have rights to direct their children's education and upbringing. But why? What grounds those rights? How broad is their scope? Can we defend parental rights against those who believe we need more extensive state educational control to protect children's autonomy or prepare them for citizenship in a diverse society? Amid heated debates over issues like sexual education, diversity education and vouchers, Moschella cuts to the heart of the matter, explaining why education is primarily the responsibility of parents, not the state. Rigorously argued yet broadly accessible, the book offers a principled case for expanding school choice and granting exemptions when educational programs or regulations threaten parents' ability to raise their children in line with their values. Philosophical argument is complemented with psychological and social scientific research showing that robust parental rights' protections are crucial for the well-being of parents, children and society as a whole.

Melissa Moschella is an Assistant Professor of Philosophy at The Catholic University of America. She speaks and writes for both scholarly and popular audiences on topics including marriage, parental rights, reproductive technologies, and religious freedom.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-15065-2 - To Whom Do Children Belong? : Parental Rights, Civic Education and
Children's Autonomy

Melissa Moschella

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-15065-2 - To Whom Do Children Belong? : Parental Rights, Civic Education and Children's Autonomy

Melissa Moschella

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

TO WHOM DO CHILDREN BELONG?

Parental Rights, Civic Education and
Children's Autonomy

MELISSA MOSCHELLA

The Catholic University of America



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-15065-2 - To Whom Do Children Belong? : Parental Rights, Civic Education and
Children's Autonomy
Melissa Moschella
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of
education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107150652

© Melissa Moschella 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2016

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Names: Moschella, Melissa, 1979–

Title: To whom do children belong? : parental rights, civic education,
and children's autonomy / Melissa Moschella.

Description: New York : Cambridge University Press, 2016. | Includes bibliographical
references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2015043636 | ISBN 9781107150652 (Hardback)

Subjects: LCSH: Education–Parent participation–United States. |

Parent and child (Law)–United States. | Children's rights–United States.

Classification: LCC LC225.3 .M67 2016 | DDC 371.19/2–dc23 LC record available at
<http://lccn.loc.gov/2015043636>

ISBN 978-1-107-15065-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy
of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication,
and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain,
accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-15065-2 - To Whom Do Children Belong? : Parental Rights, Civic Education and
Children's Autonomy

Melissa Moschella

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

To my family, especially my parents

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-15065-2 - To Whom Do Children Belong? : Parental Rights, Civic Education and
Children's Autonomy

Melissa Moschella

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-15065-2 - To Whom Do Children Belong? : Parental Rights, Civic Education and
Children’s Autonomy
Melissa Moschella
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CONTENTS

Acknowledgments ix

Introduction 1

Foundational premises 9

 Theory of value and normative ethics 10

 Obligation 14

 Rights 17

 Authority 18

1 Parent–child bonds, special obligations and parental authority 21

 Why not raise children communally? 23

 Insights from Aquinas and Aristotle 25

 Personal relationships and special obligations 29

 The biological parent–child relationship as a source of non-transferable obligations 34

 Parental obligations as personal obligations to raise one’s children 38

 Conclusion 45

2 Parental rights as conscience rights 49

 The right to integrity 50

 Integrity and parental rights 56

 Rights as spheres of authority 61

 Scope and limits of parental rights 63

 Parental authority over moral and religious education 64

 The family as analogous to a sovereign state 66

 When should the state intervene? 68

 A counterargument 69

 Conclusion 72

3 Parental rights and education for liberal democratic citizenship 74

 Three arguments for mandatory Rawlsian civic education 76

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-15065-2 - To Whom Do Children Belong? : Parental Rights, Civic Education and
Children’s Autonomy
Melissa Moschella
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

viii	CONTENTS
	Stephen Macedo’s civic liberalism 76
	Eamonn Callan on creating citizens 80
	Amy Gutmann on education for conscious social reproduction 82
	Liberalism and the protection of diversity 84
	The requirements of citizenship 90
	Public reason and liberal legitimacy 98
	Tolerating diverse understandings of citizenship 103
	Defining the boundaries of tolerance 108
	Conclusion 116
4	Parental rights and children’s autonomy 119
	Evaluating arguments for mandatory autonomy education 122
	A minimal threshold of autonomy as necessary for a good life 122
	Autonomy as instrumentally valuable for leading a good life 127
	Moral virtue, autonomy and the good life 129
	An Aristotelian account of the moral prerequisites for autonomy 133
	Application of the Aristotelian account to the issue of autonomy education 137
	Conclusion 144
5	Policy implications 147
	Overview 147
	Policy implications 153
	Exemptions and accommodations 154
	<i>Wisconsin v. Yoder</i> 154
	<i>Mozert v. Hawkins</i> 159
	Are exemptions unfair? 161
	Sexual education 167
	Public schools and school funding 172
	Conclusion 179
	<i>Bibliography</i> 181
	<i>Index</i> 191

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-15065-2 - To Whom Do Children Belong? : Parental Rights, Civic Education and Children's Autonomy

Melissa Moschella

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This book, which began as my doctoral dissertation, and which I have revised – indeed, for the most part rewritten – over the past several years, would not have been possible without the help of many individuals and institutions. I am pleased to take the opportunity to acknowledge at least some of these debts here.

I am grateful, first of all, to my graduate adviser and dissertation director, Robert P. George. His work and generous dedication to the truth as a scholar, teacher and public intellectual have served as an example and inspiration to me, and his advice during my years of graduate study and in the early years of my academic career has been an invaluable and ongoing source of guidance and encouragement. I am grateful to him, in particular, for challenging me in my intellectual life to plunge without fear into the deep and uncharted waters of philosophical inquiries to which I do not know the answer in advance. This work is, among other things, a response to that challenge.

I owe a special debt of gratitude also to the other two members of my dissertation committee, Melissa Lane and Anna Stilz. Both were extremely generous with their time, providing detailed feedback in person and in writing, and affirming the importance of my work despite their ultimate disagreement with my conclusions. To the extent that this book succeeds in engaging seriously with the best counterarguments to my position, it is due in no small part to their insightful criticisms and suggestions. I also thank Stephen Macedo for serving as the fourth reader of my dissertation, and for the critical feedback which pushed me to make my arguments sharper and more nuanced.

I am grateful to Princeton University for generously supporting my graduate studies, and to the University Center for Human Values for the graduate prize fellowship I received in my final year of graduate school. Mention should also be made of the members of Princeton's political theory community during my time there, especially Daniel Mark, as well as several students and professors in the Philosophy Department,

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-15065-2 - To Whom Do Children Belong? : Parental Rights, Civic Education and Children's Autonomy

Melissa Moschella

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

X

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

especially Sherif Girgis, who have made a rich contribution to my intellectual life, and from whom I have received helpful feedback on my work.

I am also indebted to the James Madison Program in American Ideals and Institutions for the post-doctoral research fellowship during which I began the long process of revising my dissertation in preparation for publication as a book, as well as the many members of the James Madison Society with whom I coincided while at Princeton, for their insightful and reassuring comments on my work, for their friendship and for their enjoyable and enriching conversation on a variety of subjects. Worthy of particular mention in this regard are Susan Hanssen – whose indomitable spirit, verve, wit and passionate commitment to the truth have reinvigorated and inspired me on many occasions – as well as Sara Henary, Zena Hitz and Gabrielle Girgis. I shared an office with Gabby during my fellowship, and her delightful company, conversation and friendship were – and continue to be – an invaluable source of support and encouragement on many levels.

The Myser Fellowship that I received from the University of Notre Dame's Center for Ethics and Culture afforded me the opportunity to devote much of the 2014–2015 academic year to completing my revisions on the manuscript. I am grateful to all of the faculty and staff associated with the Center during my time there, particularly John Keown, the Center's 2014–2015 Remick Fellow, for his advice, feedback and buoyant company. I am also indebted to many other members of the Notre Dame community, especially Michael Zuckert, who generously took the time to read and offer insightful comments on the penultimate draft of the manuscript, and Mary Keys, who has been an invaluable source of encouragement and advice, both practical and theoretical, since the project's inception.

I am grateful as well to my colleagues at The Catholic University of America's School of Philosophy for creating such a congenial, friendly and supportive working environment, in which I have felt at home since the very beginning of my time here.

Many others both within and beyond the academy have contributed to this project in countless ways. It would be impossible to name them all – and I apologize to anyone whom I have inadvertently neglected to include here – but a few deserve special mention. Esther Hudson, my graduate research assistant, helped me to prepare the final manuscript for publication, and I am grateful for her hard work. Eamonn Callan read an early draft of Chapter 4, and offered a number of helpful suggestions in

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-15065-2 - To Whom Do Children Belong? : Parental Rights, Civic Education and Children's Autonomy

Melissa Moschella

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

xi

an enjoyable email exchange. Over the course of several conversations, Sarah-Vaughan Brakman, Elizabeth Kirk and Christopher Tollefsen convinced me of the need to be more sensitive and nuanced in my discussion of adoptive parenthood – I hope that I have been successful in my attempt to heed their advice. Gerard Bradley and John Finnis provided insightful feedback on the draft of an article now published in *The American Journal of Jurisprudence*, parts of which (with permission) have been incorporated into this book. Ana Marta Gonzalez, whom I first got to know many years ago while I was an undergraduate at Harvard and she was a visiting professor, offered me the opportunity to present an overview of my argument for parental rights at a seminar sponsored by the University of Navarre's Institute for Culture and Society; our intermittent contact over the years has profoundly enriched my intellectual life in countless ways.

I am especially thankful to Moira Walsh, whose friendship and guidance on matters both personal and philosophical extend all the way back to my very first foray into philosophical inquiry as a high school senior. Without her prudent advice, sympathetic ear and patient encouragement, together with that of Gabriela Martinez, and, in the project's final stages, Margaret Garvey, I doubt that this project would ever have reached completion.

I owe the greatest debt to my family, especially my parents: it is to them that this work is dedicated, with much love.